

1                   BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS  
2                   MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3                                   - - -

4

5       In the Matter of:

6                                   Regular Meeting

7                                   - - -

8                                   Grady L. Pettigrew

9                                   President, Presiding

10                                  - - -

11                                 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12                                  - - -

13

14                                   Monday, January 27, 2020  
15                                   12:32 p.m.  
16                                   City of Columbus  
17                                   Civil Service Commission  
18                                   77 North Front Street  
19                                   Columbus, Ohio 43215

20                                  - - -

21                                   TRACI E. PEOPLES  
22                                   PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23                                  - - -

24

25                                 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.  
26                                   1421 West Third Avenue  
27                                   Columbus, Ohio 43212  
28                                   (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President  
3 Stefanie L. Coe  
4 Delena Edwards

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Richard Cherry  
7 Amy DeLong  
8 Laura Hausman  
9 Jennifer Hutchinson  
10 Carol Lagemann  
11 Tammy Rollins  
12 Brenda Sobieck

13 ALSO PRESENT:

14 Wendy Brinnon  
15 Jaasiel Rubeck

16 - - -

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION  
January 27, 2020  
2 12:32 p.m.

3 - - -

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 - - -

6 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 27th day of  
7 January, 2020, the Municipal Civil Service  
8 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.  
9 Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in  
10 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,  
11 the following proceedings were had:

12 - - -

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I call to order the  
14 Municipal Civil Service Commission meeting for  
15 January. And we'll be following the printed agenda.

16 The first item is review and approval of  
17 the minutes of the December 16, 2019, regular  
18 meeting.

19 MS. COE: I move to approve the minutes  
20 from the December 16, 2019, regular meeting.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

22 All in favor, say "aye."

23 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

1                   We have -- The next action item is under  
2 Item No. 5. And we will continue that to the end of  
3 today's agenda.

4                   Item No. 6, request of the Civil Service  
5 Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City  
6 Schools, to retitle the classification for the  
7 specification Plumber Supervisor to read Maintenance  
8 Plumber Supervisor.

9                   MS. LAGEMANN: Hello. Carol Lagemann,  
10 Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

11                   Per request of Columbus City Schools, we  
12 are proposing to add the word "maintenance" to the  
13 title for each of these, consistent with other  
14 classifications in their classification plan. There  
15 are no other changes proposed.

16                   MS. COE: Are we just asking on 6 right  
17 now? Or 6 and 7?

18                   MS. LAGEMANN: Oh, apologies. You could  
19 combine them.

20                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

21                   Then, for 7, it is the request of the  
22 Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of  
23 Columbus City Schools, to retitle the specification  
24 for the classification Plumber to read Maintenance

1 Plumber.

2 MS. COE: I move to support the request  
3 of the Civil Service Commission staff to retitle the  
4 specification for the classification Plumber  
5 Supervisor to read Maintenance Supervisor, as well  
6 as the classification Plumber to read Maintenance  
7 Plumber.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

9 All in favor, say "aye."

10 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

12 Items 8 through 13 are joined together,  
13 and they are all items with no revisions.

14 Item 8, request of the Civil Service  
15 Commission staff to approve the specification review  
16 for the classification Debt Management Coordinator,  
17 with no revisions;

18 Item 9, the classification Purchasing  
19 coordinator, with no revisions;

20 Item 10, the classification Accountant I,  
21 with no revisions;

22 Item 11, the classification  
23 Accountant II, with no revisions;

24 Item 12, the classification Canine Master

1 Trainer, with no revisions; and,

2 Item 13, the classification Summer

3 Worker, with no revisions.

4 MR. CHERRY: Good afternoon. Richard  
5 Cherry, Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service  
6 Commission.

7 The review of these classifications is  
8 part of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to  
9 review all classifications every four to five years.

10 After consulting with department  
11 representatives, it was determined that no changes  
12 are necessary at this time.

13 MS. COE: Thank you.

14 I move to support the request of the  
15 Civil Service Commission staff to approve the  
16 specification review for the classifications Debt  
17 Management Coordinator, as well as Purchasing  
18 Coordinators, Accountant I, Accountant II, Canine  
19 Master Trainer, and Summer Worker, with no  
20 revisions.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

22 All in favor, say "aye."

23 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

1                   Item No. 14 is the request of the Civil  
2 Service Commission staff to revise the specification  
3 for the classification Public Health Assistant  
4 Commissioner, Administrative Services.

5                   MR. CHERRY: Again, the review of this  
6 classification was -- oh, not "again."

7                   This classification -- The review of this  
8 classification was initiated by the Civil Service in  
9 an effort to create educational consistency within  
10 the City of Columbus Class Plan Index as it relates  
11 to minimum qualifications.

12                   Public Health Assistant Commissioner,  
13 Administrative Services, is a high-level executive  
14 job and, at this level, candidates must have years  
15 of relevant experience. And requiring a specific  
16 college major within a degree program serves only to  
17 eliminate quality candidates with a degree major  
18 that is not one of the qualifying ones listed.  
19 Therefore, it is recommended that the specific major  
20 be removed from the bachelor's and master's degree  
21 requirements.

22                   There are no other changes.

23                   MS. COE: Thank you.

24                   I move to support the request of the

1 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
2 specification for the classification Public Health  
3 Assistant Commissioner, Administrative Services.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

5 All in favor, say "aye."

6 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

8 Items No. 15 through 17 are joined.

9 Item 15, request of the Civil Service

10 Commission staff to revise the specification for the  
11 classification Water Protection Specialist I;

12 Item 16, the classification Water

13 Protection Specialist II; and,

14 Item 17, the classification Water

15 Protection Coordinator.

16 MR. CHERRY: Now, again, the review of  
17 these classifications are part of the Civil Service  
18 Commission's efforts to review all classifications  
19 every four to five years.

20 It is recommended that the "Examples of  
21 Work" section for all three specifications be  
22 revised to include duties that are currently being  
23 performed and to rearrange the order of the existing  
24 examples to include the more critical duties toward

1 the top of the list.

2           For the I and II level classifications,  
3 it is recommended that a valid Ohio Boater Education  
4 Certificate be required by the completion of the  
5 probationary period. This is because the State of  
6 Ohio -- according to the State of Ohio, anyone who  
7 was born on or after January 1, 1982, is required to  
8 possess the Ohio Boater Education Certificate in  
9 order to operate any boat that is more than ten  
10 horsepower. However, new employees coming into this  
11 classification may not possess this certificate, nor  
12 are they expected to have it the first day of the  
13 job. Therefore, it is recommended to give those  
14 individuals time to obtain the certificate by  
15 allowing them the completion of the probationary  
16 period to get it.

17           For the II and Coordinator levels, there  
18 are some positions that may be required to spray or  
19 oversee the spraying of pesticides, or others that  
20 may need to provide or oversee arborist functions.

21           Therefore, it is recommended that the  
22 "Minimum Qualifications" section also include "some  
23 positions may require possession of a valid  
24 Commercial Pesticide Applicator License issued by

1 the Ohio Department of Agriculture, and some  
2 positions may require possession of a valid Arborist  
3 Certificate issued by the International Society of  
4 Arborists."

5 The remaining recommended changes to the  
6 "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" section for the  
7 specifications are minor and are to include more  
8 current language to reflect the technological  
9 aspects of the job.

10 MS. COE: Thank you.

11 I move to support the request of the  
12 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the  
13 specification for the classifications Water  
14 Protection Specialist I, Water Protection  
15 Specialist II, and Water Protection Coordinator.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

17 All in favor, say "aye."

18 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

20 Item No. 18 is the request of the Civil  
21 Service Commission staff to impose a hiring  
22 moratorium on the specification for the  
23 classification Water Service Technician I.

24 MR. CHERRY: This classification is used

1 exclusively by the Department of Public Utilities,  
2 Water Division. There are currently no incumbents  
3 serving in this classification.

4 Now that the department is moving towards  
5 an automated watering system, there is no longer a  
6 need for utilizing a Water Service Technician. One  
7 in this classification is responsible for reading  
8 water meters -- metering devices and planning meter  
9 routes. However, the department is hesitant to  
10 request this classification be abolished, as they  
11 may find a need for it in the future.

12 Therefore, it is recommended that, at  
13 this time, a hiring moratorium be imposed on the  
14 Water Service Technician I classification.

15 MS. COE: Thank you.

16 I move to support the request of the  
17 Civil Service Commission staff to impose a hiring  
18 moratorium on the specification for the  
19 classification Water Service Technician I.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

21 All in favor, say "aye."

22 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

24 Item 19 is the residency hearing reviews.

1                   Next is background removals,  
2 post-examination:

3                   Alex Hardy, do not reinstate. Jordan  
4 Dunlea, do not reinstate.

5                   And as for Item 20 [sic], the  
6 administrative jurisdiction review, the matter is  
7 approved as the exhibit.

8                   With that, we will recess on Item No. 5,  
9 Presentation of Civil Service Commission 2019.

10                  We will stand in recess.

11                  (Recess taken.)

12                  (Commissioner Edwards joins the  
13 meeting.)

14                  PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: We're going to  
15 reconvene our January 27th meeting. And the Item  
16 No. 5 that we recessed for is the Presentation of  
17 the Civil Service Commission 2019 Accomplishments  
18 presented by Director and staff.

19                  MS. DeLONG: Good afternoon. I am Amy  
20 DeLong. Today I have asked my staff managers to  
21 come in and do a year-end review for 2019. And I'm  
22 going to let them proceed from here.

23                  MS. ROLLINS: Good afternoon. So I have  
24 many of the classification team. And in 2019, the

1 team completed nearly 300 projects that are  
2 classification- or position-based projects. In  
3 total, these resulted in 189 Commission actions,  
4 which were presented to you.

5 And with some of the abolishments that we  
6 also did this year, our class plan is now down to a  
7 record low of 643 classes. So that's been something  
8 we've been working towards and trying to get the  
9 number lower. So we're very happy with that.

10 With regards to position audits, we  
11 completed 84 compliance reviews. So compliance  
12 reviews are randomly selected positions in the City.  
13 So it's roughly 2 percent of the eligible population  
14 of full-time positions, taking out unclassified.  
15 And it's an opportunity to go out, talk to  
16 employees, and just get a general idea if they're  
17 properly classified or not. If not, it gets  
18 deferred to an audit for a more in-depth  
19 investigation as to what the duties are being  
20 performed.

21 So this came about -- we used -- We  
22 always did positions audits. But a position audit  
23 is requested when there's a suspicion of  
24 misclassification. So in order to have a better,

1 more well-rounded number as to exactly what is the  
2 status of the City's positions, we began doing this  
3 random generated number of positions.

4 So this year, we reviewed 84 positions.  
5 We received 16 position audit requests. Of these  
6 positions, only six were misclassified.

7 And one of our biggest accomplishments  
8 this year -- this is one that I've worked on for  
9 probably the last five years -- this year was, we  
10 really needed to get our position control system  
11 live. This was a system that we developed back  
12 in -- well, our original go-live date was January 1,  
13 2000. And then we had an update in 2002. And it's  
14 been relatively stable since then, but the platform  
15 that it was developed on is no longer supported, so  
16 we've begun the process of getting it updated.

17 So I've worked on this for five years.  
18 The team helped considerably this year for us to go  
19 live with our new electronic position control  
20 system.

21 And, with our electronic position control  
22 system, we came up with a new logo that I especially  
23 like. And I've been selling this on the City. This  
24 is EPC, and the bird in the nest. And the nest

1 represents the position. All nests in the City are  
2 allowed one bird. That's our employees.

3 And, in talking to the departments, just  
4 as a reminder, "It's really important that you have  
5 your nest built before we start recruiting an  
6 employee. And when we're recruiting our employees,  
7 we're not going to recruit an ostrich to sit in the  
8 chicken's nest. We really want to find the employee  
9 that fits the nest that we have built for the bird."

10 So that was a huge accomplishment.

11 And then, also, towards the latter part  
12 of this year, we've also begun the process of  
13 working on the implementation of a new payroll  
14 system. I am trying very hard to remain positive.  
15 This is going to be a team effort. Both Carol  
16 Lagemann, myself and Beth Bailey from the  
17 verification team will be working steadily on the  
18 Ceridian Dayforce. And we are hoping to go live  
19 with it next year. So . . .

20 MS. COE: I'm curious. Like, the new  
21 payroll system, I'm assuming someone else is  
22 responsible for the system, but you're trying to  
23 figure out how to get the Civil Service components  
24 to work?

1 MS. ROLLINS: Exactly.

2 So the Auditor's Office is leading the  
3 project, and we have team leads. We're a team lead  
4 for Civil Service. Technology is involved. And  
5 then we also have three of our bigger departments  
6 also involved on the -- especially the time clock,  
7 time and attendance.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

9 MS. ROLLINS: Thank you.

10 MS. HUTCHINSON: Jennifer Hutchinson,  
11 Personnel Administrative Manager.

12 The nonuniform testing unit is  
13 responsible for handling at-vacancy testing when  
14 requested by a City department. The recruitment  
15 involves opening and posting for a filing period,  
16 reviewing applications, sending notices and  
17 administering the exams, grading the exams, and  
18 writing a report.

19 In 2019, we received a record 85  
20 requests. This resulted in the review of over  
21 15,800 applications, the testing of 4,081  
22 candidates, and the administration of eight  
23 performance exams. In total, we had 109 days of  
24 testing in our test center and 13 days of offsite

1 testing.

2 We utilized new software to try online  
3 testing and also offered Saturday and evening  
4 testing for one of our large recruitments, which was  
5 Payroll Benefits Clerk.

6 Through our Rule 6, or individual,  
7 testing, we handled another 96 recruits.

8 We also administered 43 examinations for  
9 Columbus City Schools over 27 days.

10 In addition to all of our testing, the  
11 analysts on the team completed 48 job analyses and  
12 examination reviews.

13 Our neighbor -- Our community liaison  
14 remains busy in the community, attending job fairs,  
15 Neighborhood Pride events and high school career  
16 days. She began to utilize self-delivery to notify  
17 the public of information and announcements. And  
18 she also continues to offer testing clinics to  
19 departments upon request, as well as to the public.

20 And, in addition to that, we also created  
21 a testing clinic video. And that is now available  
22 on our website.

23 And that's the summary of nonuniform.

24 MS. HAUSMAN: I'm Laura Hausman. I am

1 the Personnel Administrative Manager of the Public  
2 Safety Testing Team.

3 2019 was a busy year for the Civil  
4 Service Commission Uniform Testing Team. The team  
5 administered entry-level exams for firefighter and  
6 police officer, as well the promotional exams for  
7 fire lieutenant, fire captain and police sergeant.

8 In all, the team tested 3,663 candidates,  
9 resulting in the placement of 1,140 candidates to  
10 eligible lists. As a result of the testing, 15,895  
11 notices were sent to candidates, and 24,350 computer  
12 answer sheets were scanned.

13 In addition to our testing, in March of  
14 2019, the team relocated from 750 Piedmont Road to  
15 the Jerry Hammon Building on 1111 East Broad Street.  
16 There was a considerable amount of work that went  
17 into preparing for the move, since the move has --  
18 since the team had been at the Piedmont location for  
19 15 years.

20 After the move occurred, many adjustments  
21 to exam instructions and test day logistics were  
22 necessary due to the layout and security protocols  
23 in the new location.

24 Along with the new location also came new

1 oral board suites, which included all new  
2 technology. The team pilot-tested the new  
3 technology to ensure its new utilization for the  
4 oral board exams, and fixes were made as a result.

5 For the entry level firefighter exam, the  
6 move meant that the physical portion of the exam,  
7 which is called the "firefighter mile," was to be  
8 administered in a separate location. The move of  
9 the firefighter mile required the team -- that the  
10 exam had to be revalidated due to the difference in  
11 the friction produced by the different type of  
12 flooring at the new location.

13 The move of the firefighter mile to the  
14 training academy called for additional changes in  
15 security measures, practices and procedures.

16 All of these challenges were met with  
17 fairly new staff members on the team. Four of the  
18 nine full-time members have two or fewer years of  
19 full-time experience with the Commission.  
20 Additionally, midway through the year, the team's  
21 manager was promoted, and I was promoted into the  
22 manager role.

23 In 2019, the members of uniform testing  
24 team gained in both knowledge and experience. We

1 look forward to producing quality exams for the City  
2 of Columbus in 2020.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Tell me about this  
4 friction on the flooring.

5 MS. HAUSMAN: For the firefighter, we  
6 test them on physical capabilities.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Right.

8 MS. HAUSMAN: And so some of the events  
9 have to do with dragging -- like dragging a hose or  
10 dragging a dummy that would simulate pulling a  
11 person out of a house. So they're timed. And if  
12 you have sort of like a smooth surface versus a  
13 carpeted surface, it would make a difference in the  
14 amount of time candidates would get to perform that  
15 task -- the cut points of the task.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: So in the past, you  
17 were operating on what sort of surface?

18 MS. HAUSMAN: We were at Piedmont, which  
19 has carpet, but it was real short carpet, much like  
20 this, and pretty worn carpet.

21 And then at the fire training academy,  
22 we're in a gym. But in order to keep the floor from  
23 getting damaged, we have a sort of -- kind of a --  
24 it's polyurethane or something. There's a cover on

1 the floor. So it's kind of like a plastic on the  
2 floor. So it's just different flooring. And it  
3 makes a difference in the drag and the friction.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. Friction. I  
5 should have paid more attention in physics class.

6 MS. HAUSMAN: It makes it easier or  
7 harder to pull.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. Thank you.

9 MS. SOBIECK: I'm Brenda Sobieck. I'm  
10 going to briefly talk about the uniform  
11 certification section.

12 So for the academy classes, in 2019, we  
13 assisted public safety and police and fire in hiring  
14 80 new firefighters and 90 new police officers. We  
15 had two fire academy classes of 40. And we had two  
16 police academy classes, one of 40 and one of 50.

17 And we did have one change to the  
18 background standards in 2019. We will review the  
19 standards again this year. We do that every year  
20 just -- and review them with the departments and  
21 divisions.

22 And then the last topic I wanted to talk  
23 about is the medical contracts. We're responsible  
24 for the contract and payments and funding of the

1 medical and psychological services for preemployment  
2 for police officers.

3 So our medical contract expires at the  
4 end of February. And so we went through the request  
5 for proposals process.

6 And it's notable that we are changing the  
7 contractor for the first time in many years. I  
8 mean, it's more than 20 years that we've used one  
9 hospital locally. We are switching to Mount Carmel.  
10 So we are in the process right now of meeting with  
11 them and setting up the procedures and determining  
12 how everything is going to work. They were slightly  
13 lower in price, but the benefit is that candidates  
14 will be able to do all of their testing in one  
15 location. So it's very -- a lot more convenient.  
16 Currently, they did their medical exam, and then  
17 they had to drive to the university to do the stress  
18 test. So we think that will make it a little nicer  
19 and free parking and things for the candidates.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

21 MS. SOBIECK: So that's all that changed  
22 for this year.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

24 Well, so everybody else was just a

1 witness to the presentation?

2 MS. DeLONG: They wanted to make sure  
3 their managers didn't say anything bad.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, you know the  
5 mission of Civil Service. And what we're very  
6 pleased to observe and to actually hear is the  
7 documentation on this good job that's being done.  
8 The mayor wasn't with us at the Christmas party this  
9 year, but last year I told him, on behalf of  
10 everyone here, that he could be proud of the  
11 Commission employees. And that's still a true  
12 statement today.

13 So thank you very much for coming and  
14 reporting to us. We look forward to seeing you in  
15 February.

16 We're adjourned.

17 - - -

18 And, thereupon, the meeting was  
19 concluded at approximately 1:11 p.m.

20 - - -

21

22

23

24

1

2

3

4

5

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 27th day of January, 2020, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

*The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:11 p.m.*

\* \* \*

---

*Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President*

---

*Date*