

Office of the Director
111 N. Front St., 8th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-7795
(614) 645-6675 (FAX)

Planning Division
111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8664

Downtown Commission
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)
Urban Design Manager
(614) 645-8404
djthomas@columbus.gov

DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

Tuesday, October 22, 2019 - 8:30 AM

111 N. Front Street, Michael B. Coleman Government Center
Hearing Room (Second Floor)

I. Attendance :

Present: Otto Beatty, Jr. (Vice-Chair); Tedd Hardesty;; Mike Lusk; Jana Maniace;
Danni Palmore; Tony Slanec

Absent: Robert Loversidge ;Steve Wittmann

City Staff: Daniel Thomas; Luis Teba, ?

II. Approval of the September 24, 2019 Downtown Commission Meeting Results

Motion to approve, ML, TH (6-0)

0:50

III. Conceptual Review

Case #1 19-10-1C

1:36

Location: The area is defined by Belle Street to the east, Capital Street to the north,
Chapel Street to the south and the railroad tracks to the west

Applicant: Columbus Downtown Development Corporation (CDDC)

Property Owners: CDDC (99 year lease from City of Columbus)

Attorney: Matt Lutz

Design Professionals: See attached document for a complete listing of design
professionals

Request:

Introduction of development and design team; conceptual presentation and review
development schedule

Discussion: DJT – introduction and location. Guy Worley (CDDC). Context and
prior approvals: Scioto Mile; National Veterans Memorial and Museum; Dorian
Green; addition of the American Museum of Natural History to COSI. Opportunity to
create a world-class, mixed-use development. Vision of what this development will
be. Phase 1 boundaries – Belle, Capital, railroad and Chapel. Full build out (26
acres) – 8 to 10 years, 1,800 residential units, 2,000,000 sf office, 400 hotel rooms,
200,000 sf retail. Phase 1 – 3 residential buildings (550 units); office building
(540,000 sf); initial 180 key hotel; 45,000 sf of retail. 11, 10, 10, 8 and 6 story
buildings. 1,400 space parking garage. Creating density. Daimler office building,
Rockbridge Hotel, Residential. Views and perspectives (towards downtown skyline)
shown.

Team of developers. Amy Taylor – amount of undeveloped land so close in is a rare
opportunity. Would rather be right than quick. New neighborhood, district. Moving

westward from other successful projects on the Scioto Peninsula. Excellent views to downtown and river with density. Connectivity to river running and biking paths. Success in Franklinton moving east, gateway working in two directions. Will also act as a job center, which is one of the Mayor's goal (2,000,000 sf of office). First floor retail opportunities and even rooftop. Creating a sense of place. Introducing developers. Darren Keptner (residential) – Indianapolis based but doing projects all over the Midwest. Specializing in urban infill, mixed-use development. Public-private partnerships. Three buildings – 500 residential units. Setting the bar for luxury standpoint, size and amenities. Rooftop pool, sky deck, views to the city. 14,000sf of retail on first level, other elsewhere – activating street. Second floor connection from parking to residences to meet luxury expectations. Building is primarily masonry. Expectation is that these will be rental. People moving back into the city core like the flexibility. OB – sought clarification as to the streets.

DP – great project but am looking for a little more architectural diversity. I'm seeing windows and blocks. AT – scoped down to renderings showing better street views. Retail on Belle St. that will loop around the sides. Belle St. will be rebuilt to have a much more enhanced finished. A lot of terracing looking towards downtown, which is not boxy at all. Architectural articulation on roofs. JM – why is the hotel sited in the middle? AT – we believe that the hotel would be a central core element. We are thrilled to have a hotel developer of the caliber of Rockbridge.

Chris Rock (Rockbridge) – hotel. Central core to create a social hub of activity. Creating a mews (running north – south) Sawtooth building – neighborhood market. Retail, underneath terrace building. First phase – 197 hotel rooms. Signature restaurant and coffee shop on first floor. Retail. Second floor primarily meeting space. Rooftop bar with fantastic views. Parking will be provided via the parking garage. There will be valet drop-off. The back side of the hotel will have different massing and treatment to break up the mass.

Bob White Jr. (Daimler) – office – 240,000 sf of new Class A office, 8 - stories. Fronts Belle St., relates to mews. Lots of glass in addition to stone and masonry. 30,000 sf floor plate. Open, collaborative type space. Balconies. Relationship to hotel and activities. Possibly upscale the fitness component of hotel.

AT – parking garage – 1,200 to 1,400 space. 5 to 6 stories. Borders the railroad, west of Starling St. Will accommodate all users of development. Will be counter cyclical in terms of time. Two separate parking structures divided by State St.

Schedule – start next spring including road infrastructure. Parking in the fall of next year. Completion in June 2022. OB – looks terrific. TH – coordination of team. We're all hopeful that the retail will work. Is there confidence in the 45,000 sf? Do you build flexibility into that? AT – we are confident, particularly with the developers. We are raising the first floor height to accommodate retail on the first floor. DP – this area will demand some of the highest rent in the city? AT – we will also be providing 20% affordable housing. This is a strong push from Mayor Ginther.

DP – is there any link or synergy with what is going on in Franklinton to the west? AT – this is a link between downtown and Franklinton. Working closely with Public Services who are designing the streets that there is a link with Franklinton and a flow. JM – maybe a collaborative hub between this project and Franklinton. AT – we are talking about this. Supporting local, the arts. DJT – mention of East Franklinton Review Board and a suggestion to be briefed on what is going on there.

OB – good meetings about diversity with local contractors over in the South High. AT – this has already been done here as well. Participation in small business conference. DJT – No “official” approval is given for conceptual reviews, but on the basis of the comments. OB – in other words

everybody would vote yes. TH – we’d be totally fine if you would coming in with the hotel one month, offices the next. OB – the cooperation between the various entities is great. DP – you’ve come back with a fantastic team.

Results: No vote taken. Favorable review awaiting submission of specific components.

IV. Request for Certificate of Appropriateness

Case #2 19-10-2D

43:42

Address: 322 W. State Street

Applicant: RBH Acquisition LLC

Property Owners: Columbus Downtown Development Corporation (CDDC) 99-yr lease holder

Attorney: Bricker & Eckler

Design Professionals: EMH&T (Civil); Johnson Nathan Strohe, architects (Denver) / Tobias Strohe

Request:

Demolition of 322 W. State St. CC3359.05(C)1)

This case relates directly to Case #1. 322 W. State St. is on the site of the proposed hotel in Phase 1 of the Scioto Peninsula development.

Discussion: A – One story building was constructed in 1968. 4,000sf. TH – not aware of any historical significance. Move approval for demolition. JM – 2nd.

Results: Motion to approve demolition (6-0)

Case #3 19-10-3

Address: 56 S. Grant Ave. (Unassigned address)

46:56

Applicant: Jonathan D. Riewald, The Pizzuti Companies

Property Owner: Capital University

Attorney: Michael T. Shannon, Underhill & Hodge LLC

Design Professionals: David M. Goth, Lupton Rausch Architecture + Interior Design
Tim Rosenthal, MKSK, Landscape Architecture

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for mixed use, largely apartments, with retail and structured parking

This project was conceptually reviewed in May 2019. See attached Results.

Discussion: JR – consistent with what was presented in May. Further advancement and refinement. Extension of Library Park project. 6 – story mixed use building: 148 market rate apartments; 106 structured parking; 5,000 sf ground floor retail along S. Grant Ave.; heavy landscaping and site improvements both on property and in R.O.W. Will complete Oak St. and fill a void in urban fabric.

DG – context – adjacent to 11-story Seneca, to the south renovation of low scale apartments. Grant Ave. is still largely commercial. Some step back on the east side. Transition in scale between Seneca and Library Park. Deep sculptural cuts in the base for activation opportunities on tight

Grant sidewalk. Abstract metal landscape grill. Some photographic qualities – recreating Greta Garbo and John Gilbert. Harder residential above. Brick and massing moving in and out to break up scale. Oak Street is more residential, breaking down massing and materials relating to pedestrian scale. Grant / Oak corner important area – work cooperative – coffee shop. Oak with garden spaces. Upper portions also support this breakdown. Metal frame balcony pieces echoing old fire escapes. Also opportunities for greenery – vines. OB – likes planting. Utilizing Oak Street’s topography for garden areas. Fencing at sidewalk. OB – I assume that there will be plenty of lighting for safety reasons. Material samples brought – 4 different types of brick. OB – stresses the height of fence – a lot of traffic down this street. Be concerned about safety. JR – important point – safety and engaging pedestrians – try to not have too much of a barrier, perhaps 5 ft. We are also studying the lighting. TH – look at Gay St. – Neighborhood Launch as a precedence. Street lights will also be added. Cumulative “roofs” will help bring more people to area. DP – I used to live in this area, keep safety in mind.

TR – site improvements. Working with City on Grant improvements. Following Streetscape Standards. Building setback allows for free standing planters. Grant and Oak will have new Esplanade light. There will be new street lighting on Oak. Tree planting and other materials specified.

JM – wondering about glazing with the recesses on Grant. DG – the floor height is high and there is a lot of glazing. TH – these streets are dimensionally challenging, you are setting some good precedencies on how to deal with these throughout downtown. Not just with the streetscape but also with pulling back the building. ML - I realize you are giving up leasable space to do that.

OB- would encourage railing already shown (as opposed to flat). ML – move to approve, DP – 2nd.

Results: Move to approve (6-0) Attention to Oak Street fencing (height and design) and lighting advocated.

V. Review of Details of Prior Approved Projects

Case #4 19-10-4

1:14:47

Address: 50 N Washington

Applicant and Design Professional: Frank Weaver, Natalia Lebedin - WSA Studio

Realm Collaborative – Landscape Architecture – Carmen Russo

Property Owner: State Auto Insurance Companies, Art Hersey

Request:

Review of details for parking garage and campus development. For structured parking largely approved at the May 2019 meeting.

This was conceptually reviewed in February. At that time, the demolition of 555 Boone St., a warehouse and vehicular maintenance building, was approved and a CoA issued. In May, a Certificate of Appropriateness for the new garage was approved by the Commission with the stipulation that there be a return with specifics on landscaping, lighting, materials and colors. This submission also includes information on projection methods.

Discussion: DJT - Permit Plans have been submitted. Details related to signage have also been distributed. Maintenance building has been demolished. CR – Discovery Trail has discovered a new route designed by NBBJ and MS Consultants. Pathway to get to the Jefferson Ave. Historic District. Deferential to Art Museum across the street. Potential for art pieces. Plans at this time

have not looked at the R.O.W. adjacent to the plaza – still working on Discovery Trail and with City on potential mid-block crossing to Art Museum. Auto court, terrace and plaza still intact. Materials shown. – relates to materials already used on Gay Street improvements. Pre cast walls flanking and defining plaza space. Plant materials discussed. London Plane trees along Washington saved. Hardware discussed – benches, bollards, etc. Site lighting identified. CoGo station has been relocated.

NL – signage presented. Perforated metal. Monument sign along Washington will be edge lit. Associate parking signage. Shop drawings distributed. Garage is designed to be accessible to the public and flexible in terms of occupation throughout week and weekend. Projector capability from State Auto HQ to screen on garage. State Auto will be in charge of the programming of the projection. DJT – the maintenance building had a mural painted by CCAD students of an Aminah Robinson mural. Intent was to bring art back to the new garage. Discussion with coordination with Museum and with CCAD. Kyle Anderson – State Auto – we only intend for this to be art – nothing commercial. Materiality of the garage shown. CR – the Discovery Trail will reinforce this. There is a whole art component. NL – there will be some LED lighting on the garage.

Our anticipated completion date is the end of next year (2021). TH – move to approve additional detail, DP – 2nd.

Results - motion to approve (6-0).

Case #5 19-10-5

Address: 600 E. Broad Street

1:35:00

Applicant and Design Professional : Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design / co: Carly Maggio

Property Owner: JDS Companies

Request:

Approval of Details related to largely approved 4-story apartment building with ground level parking

At their July 23, 2019 meeting the Downtown Commission approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for this project with the stipulation that the applicant:

- *bring back details on landscaping*
- *how to dress up the Broad St. façade*
- *discuss with the City forester the street trees on Broad St.*

Discussion: DJT – two large London Plane trees in front of site on Broad St. CM – detailed landscape plan handed out. TH – fulfills desired detail. CM – use of native plants. Low maintenance but also with street trees. Complements architecture. I like the idea of a naturalized expression. My only caution, especially in the first few years, is the maintenance of a lot of plant bed – weeding and watering – a reasonable commitment is necessary. JB – looking for year round color and growth. DJT -Broad St. façade treatment shown – Options A & B. CM – owners explored numerous options. They will be lit in different ways. A – customs letter that will be backlit – use of mesh that is being used elsewhere. B – full neon treatment. Both need to be seen through the two trees. ML – which of the two options do you prefer? A – the mesh (Option A). JB – we also looked at other options, including art mural. Broad St. at this end still remains largely vehicular. Still want to animate the façade. JM – Option A is preferable because it brings

in some of the material used elsewhere in building, part of the design. TH – softer backlit. A – trees will be kept. We did talk to the City (John Evans – Recreation and Parks).

Tom Worley – Social Justice Park – Cleveland Ave. to I-71 is really a green strip, with the exception of State Auto’s HQ. We were given permission to Allow for a planter strip (5’-6” wide) at Cleveland. I doubt that a 12’ sidewalk would be needed down here either. Consider a planter strip (5.5’). CM – there will also be some landscape area adjacent to the building on Broad. We are working with R.O.W. and Recreation and Parks about the planting strip. We are working on a Drawer E plan. The current trees don’t comply with the new standards but they are willing to allow them. There might be some other changes. TH – the whole public R.O.W. thing is a Public Service decision regarding treatment. DJT – Public Service follows the 150 ft. frontage measurement as far as applicability. Resistance by developers, particularly on fringe of downtown and on certain streets. There is an appeal process for deviation which then goes back to the Downtown Commission for non-binding recommendation back to Public Services. TH – it may not be clear in the Streetscape Standards about street transitions such as Broad with tree lawns. DJT – Public Service has had issues with trying to implement.

TH – move to approve, DP – 2nd.

Results Move to approve (6-0)

Case #6 19-10-6

Address: 554 E. Main Street

Applicant and Design Professional: Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design / co: Carly Maggio

Property Owner: JDS Companies / Brian Wilmers

Request:

Approval of landscape details related to otherwise approved 4-story apartment building with ground level parking

This was conceptually presented in May and for final review last month. A number of additional details were requested: 1.) landscape plan; 2.) fencing; 3.) canopy details; and 4.) lighting. All were approved with the exception of the landscaping.

*At their July 23, 2019 meeting the Downtown Commission approved the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for this project with the stipulation that the applicant **bring back details on landscaping.***

Discussion: DJT – same landscape treatment as prior case. Approval voted on in prior case.

Results – Move to approve

VI. Business / Discussion

Public Forum

Harrison Smith Award – program at the Metropolitan Club – December 11

November and December meeting dates

- *Wednesday*, November 20
- *Wednesday*, December 18

Business Meeting – per request of Chair

- Tuesday, December 3
8:30 to 10 am
111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center)
Room 312
- Topical (Graphics)
- Staffing
- Procedural (Timing and deliverance of packets)

Personnel Changes

- Michael H. Stevens, Interim Director
- Daniel Thomas, retiring in January
- Luis Teba coming on

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last notification July 18, 2019

Ad Mural – ***Bold & Italics***

1. A19-9-17 555 W Goodale - Temporary Banner
2. ***A19-9-18M - 154 N Third N - Cigna – Outfront***
3. A19-9-19 400 E Mound – Graphics
4. ***A19-9-20M - 60 E Spring St - Pink – OB***
5. ***A19-9-21M - 100 E Gay - NCH Mental – OB***
6. ***A19-9-22M 65 S Fourth-NCH Mental Health – OB***
7. A19-9-23 589 W Nationwide - Temporary Banners for Crew Stadium
8. A19-9-24 414 E Broad - Awning – Copy
9. A19-9-25 60 E Spring - Site Compliance
10. A19-9-26 50 Jefferson Ave - Site Improvement – HRC
11. ***A19-9-27M - 274 S Third - NCH Mental H – OB***
12. ***A19-9-28M - 106 N High - Ballet Met – OB***
13. ***A19-9-29M - 66 S Third - YMCA – OB***
14. A19-10-1 41 S High - Roofing – Copy
15. A19-10-2 64 E Broad – Reno
16. A19-10-3 205 S High – Sign
17. A19-10-4 Temp Sign - 17 S High - Charity Newsies
18. A19-10-5 111 N High – Banner for apartment rentals
19. ***A19-10-6M 260 S Fourth-Coors – OB***
20. A19-10-7 33 W Spring – COTA Station Nominal Reno
21. ***A19-10-8M 265 Neil - Visit Pa- OB***
22. A19-10-9 150 S High - DGXColumbus Reno
23. A19-10-10 271 Mt Vernon - Cell Antenna

Next regular meeting will be on November 20, 2019, the *third Wednesday* of the month (four weeks away).

If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 614-645-8404.

2:10:03