

Office of the Director
111 N. Front St., 8th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-7795
(614) 645-6675 (FAX)

Planning Division
111 N. Front St., 3rd Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-9040
(614) 645-8664

Downtown Commission
Daniel J. Thomas (Staff)
Urban Design Manager
(614) 645-8404
dithomas@columbus.gov

DOWNTOWN COMMISSION RESULTS

Wednesday, November 20, 2019 - 8:30 AM

111 N. Front Street, Michael B. Coleman Government Center
Hearing Room (Second Floor)

I. Attendance

3:43 :

Present: Otto Beatty, Jr. (Vice-Chair); Tedd Hardesty; Robert Loversidge; Mike Lusk; Jana Maniace; Danni Palmore; Tony Slanec

Absent: Steve Wittmann

City Staff: Daniel Thomas; Luis Teba, Dan Morehead, Zach McCandish

II. Approval of the October 22, 2019 Downtown Commission Meeting Results

Motion to approve DP, JM (7-0)

III. Request for Certificate of Appropriateness

Case #1 19-11-1

4:20

Address: John H. McConnell Blvd. (245 Parks Edge Place)

Applicant: Nationwide Realty Investors / Brian Ellis

Property Owner: 245 Parks Edge Place LLC

Design Professionals: Columbus Architectural Studio – c/o: Danial Hanes

MKSK – Landscape Architecture & Planning / Jeff Pongonis

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for 10-story condominium

Discussion: DJT – introduced the case. This will be the last part of Park’s Edge, blending the brick of Burnham Square and the glass and concrete of Park’s Edge.BE – about 22 years ago since the master plan of the Arena District; this is a milestone – getting near completing the original portion and expanding it to the north and west. Now the Arena District is about 220 acres, up from the original 72.

BE - Parks Edge 3 is transition / blend between Parks Edge and Burnham Sq. in terms of both scale and architecture (materials). Video animation run. Landscaping and streetscaping will be a continuation of Arena District patterns. We have a significant commitment to landscaping. Brick walls and sidewalks. Pedestrianly connectivity thru the entire site. JM - question about lighting. JP – pedestrian level lighting as well as ambient lighting.

DH – we are also going in for a cover to the already built parking garage. BE – the garage was built to accommodate all 3 phases of the garage. 50 units, 5 units a floor – four facing the Commons, one unit facing west. Average unit is 2100 sf. The biggest is 3000 sf, the smallest 1,700. DH - Some units with direct access off of

street. Bridge over to the garage. Public entrance is off to the north, underneath pedestrian bridge. DP – visitor parking in the area is already an issue. Is parking on the street public? How many parking spaces per unit? BE – a number of options from a visitor’s standpoint including large 1,000 + garage at Neil Ave. Also metered parking around Burnham Sq. Residents will have, on average 1.5 spaces per unit. JP – everyone at grade level has a patio with concrete terrace. Trash room on the NW corner of building.

RL – this seems to be the final piece of the puzzle, I’m happy to see one of the last gravel parking lots go. This is a handsome building. JM – I like the way you are tying things together.

Neighbors, mostly from Burnham Square, to the north, voiced the following concerns the new proposal: ● was out of scale (10 stories as opposed 8); ● incompatible in material – brick only on the first two floors as opposed to all brick as in Burnham Square and the rest of the Arena District; ● would affect the relationship with McFerson Common; ● would exacerbate an already visitor parking deficiency in the area; ● would affect sun on the pool on the top of the parking garage; ● would affect the relationship of coming back to the city from the suburbs; ● did not provide enough on-site parking; ● the location of the trash system

BE – we are pleased with what we’ve come up with. We feel we’ve addressed the transition. Many of the commercial building in the district have higher floor heights and are close to the 10 story height of this building. The swimming pool will only have blockage in off seasons and in the morning. In the summer the sun will be higher and most use will be in the afternoon from the west. Plus the pool is on the top of a 5 story parking structure. This was always going to be a building site. Trash will be done internally to the building and by small truck haulers.

OB – we respect the input of the public. What is it that you would like to see? Reduce size of building? Collectively – yes. BE – as for parking, we are not deceiving anyone and we monitor it closely. We feel that we are adequately meeting demands. RL – this building was part of the overall master plan and is not inconsistent with what we looked at. JM – swimming pool – by noon this new building would not be a problem, especially in the summer. BE – we do sun studies.

RL – I appreciate everyone coming and the public concern. I understand the nature of change, particularly in an urban setting where there is a public review element. I welcome this proposal and I think it will be a good addition. The transitional element is good as is the streetscape. I would move approval. DP – 2nd.

Results: Motion to approve building, b pedestrian bridge to garage and cover of portion of roof of the garage (7-0)

Case #2 19-11-2

37:50

Address: 200 Vine Street (Bound by Spruce on the north, Neil on the west, and Vine on the south)

Applicant and Property Owner: Nationwide Realty Investors / Brian Ellis

Design Professional: Lupton Rausch Architecture / Jim Samuelson
MKSK – Landscape / Jeff Pongonis

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for 4-story office

Discussion: BE – this gravel parking lot has been there a long time and will go away. Working with the old Hamilton Parker site, formerly a brick yard. Vine St. has been pushed through. A big

opportunity to take the Arena District to the north. This becomes something of a gateway. Entire new site – 4 story office, 132,000 sf, (33,000 sf

floor plates). Columbus HQ for Chipotle – 500 jobs from Denver. A 600 space parking garage to support. Residential to complement. 24 / 7 use of garage. Residential (150 units) still has issues related to utilities (electric lines) and will come in some other time. DJT – animation will show graphics facing Spruce St. Don't know the status of review of this part of application. BE – general gateway feature, taking cue of graphics across from Battelle Plaza (Front St. garage). Right now these are placeholders. Animation shown (with music).

RL – site is being brought down in elevation to Neil? BE – Yes and that is a bit of a challenge with the elevation change from Kilbourne. There will be a landscaped retain wall along Neil. The streetscape along Neil will be consistent with the improved Arena landscape to the south. TH – there is also a landscaped retaining wall at Flats on Vine.

JP – landscape. Consistent treatment throughout. The parking court does not connect to the garage. It's more of a drop off. Access to the garage is off of Kilbourne. We're working with ODOT to do some landscape screening – mounding, grading and landscape material near the I-670 on ramp. Spruce St. will stay one-way east bound. RL – Vine St. has quite a gap between the street and building – is there a reason? A – has a lot to do with grade transitions. It also has to do with R.O.W. location. JM – with the landscape setbacks is there an opportunity, as it relates to gateways, for some public art? SW or NW corners? Could be a dramatic statement. BE – we'll study that. Desire for gateway and a sense of arrival. JM lighting? BE – yes. JS – lighting at piers and at base of building. Curved glass signature at NW corner and great views to downtown to the south. TS – move for approval, JM – 2nd.

Results: Motion to approve (7-0)

Case #3 19-11-3

54: 00

Address: Kilbourne Street

Applicant: Nationwide Realty Investors

Property Owner: NWD HP, LLC

Design Professional : Columbus Architectural Studio - c/o: Danial Hanes

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for 5-story structure parking garage

Discussion: DH – Parking structure, very similar to other structures in the Arena District. Both openness and brick. Glass entry stair tower. Will serve both the Chipotle Office and the apartments. BE – the garage will have horizontal floors against the apartments for direct connection.

OB – have we had other parking garages with the large graphics? DH – Similar to the Front St. , , garage, which was done almost 20 years ago. BE – we wanted to borrow the same type of idea and put it in a place that is very visible, accentuating the gateway. The appearance of the Front St. garage was improved by the graphics and it also added energy. The top of the garage will say “Arena District”, and it should have special lighting. DP – will you be coming back with this signage? If it is changed, would you be coming back again? BE – I think the answer to that is yes, what we are not clear about is jurisdiction. We are close to ODOT. We are trying to determine who has approval. RL – it would require, at least, approval from the Downtown Commission. BE – we

will work thru this. DP – what I see is great and exciting. BE – I would like to show this conceptually, that the overall design is acceptable. TH – also make certain that the landscape resolution fits into that. BE – we are thinking that these will be static. TS – are these ad murals and ad mural locations? BE – we are still trying to determine that. We would like to have flexibility. In this case, it shows the anchor tenants to the Arena District. Maybe Chipotle. We have some questions we have to address.

RL – right now, we approve the location. We no longer approve content. I am kind of skeptical about this one. The garage is okay, but I'm concerned about the graphics. Right now what you have doesn't look very creative, not like the one at Front and Nationwide with its swooping look and clock. I don't think a video screen would work. This looks like stuff plumped on the side of the building. You could do better than this. I don't think I'm objecting to the concept. I think you could be more creative. BE – we have more to do with this. We definitely want this to be a gateway feature. I don't have a problem with bringing this component back. I appreciate that you say you support the concept. I would like to get started on the overall garage. OB – we need to be careful on how we craft the motion. JM – the Arena District is an entertainment district. I-670 can see it as well as residents from the north. A – I don't think you'll be able to see much from over the highway. RL – I'll move approval of the garage and the landscaping with the provision that the whole signage package come back at a future date. TH – 2nd.

Results: motion to approve of the garage and the landscaping with the provision that the whole signage package come back at a future date (7-0).

Case #4 19-11-4

1:03:30

Address: 182 E. Long Street

Applicant: Kevin Jones, Jr. & Jeff Borrer / Connect Realty

Design Professionals: Sandvick Architects, Inc. (Cleveland); red architecture + planning

Property Owner: Del Monte Holdings III LLC

Request:

Certificate of Appropriateness for renovation of an existing two-story vacant commercial building.

The property was placed on both the National Register of Historic Places and Columbus Register of Historic Properties in February 2019. The proposal will also need a CoA from the Historic Resources Commission.

Discussion: DJT – contextual briefing – when both this and the adjacent building were threatened. The Greater Columbus Arts Council will be moving into this building. JB – will follow SHPO. All windows will be replaced with Pella. Store front glass replacement. Restoration of entire brick front façade. Will be back for signage. Was for, a long time ago, automobile motor sales. Part 2 historic application has been done. DP – does renovation include sidewalk? – it looks pretty ratty. JB – at the time, I don't think it's within scope. Will find out. JM – east elevation. KJ – combination of panelized system and storefront. RL – will the ramp be kept or will something else be done? JB – unoriginal wood threshold will be removed. TH – move for approval, DP – 2nd.

Results: Motion to Approve (7-0)

Case #5 19-11-5

1:10:50

Address: 180 E. Broad Street

Property Owner: 180 E. Broad St., LLC c/o Debi Pair
TerraFunding Continental Plaza LLC

Applicant: Hexion Corporation c/o John Garner

Attorney: Douglas Johns, Esq

Design Professional: DaNite Sign Co. / Michael Cox

Request:

Corporate signage on skyscraper: 1.) mid-level logo (sign) covering vent; and 2.) sign above entrance on first floor CC3359.05(C)1).

This was conceptually reviewed in September. See Results from that meeting.

Discussion: DJT – the signage proposal is at the same location but it has been reduced in size and the backing is a mesh to allow air to flow thru it. The back lit white panel has gone away. MC – a mechanical engineering Co. was hired to evaluate the air flow. The new proposal has an expanded metal mesh background. The new background is more neutral. RL – this is much better. You could make it smaller, but you have done what we asked. How does the lower level sign work – are they out on struts? MC – the projection must be 8 to 10 inches to clear the window washing apparatus. “Continental Plaza” will be replaced by the address. TH – I like the evolution of it. MC – the mesh will be 66% open. RL – motion to approve, DP – 2nd.

Results: Approved (7-0)

Case #6 19-11-6

1:17:30

Address: 195 E. Main Street

Property Owner: Harlow Apartments LLC

Applicant: DaNite Sign Company / Jennifer Bender

Request:

Approval of signage for 195 E. Main Street (The Harlow) CC3359.05(C)1). Signage includes :

1. A large painted wall graphic (19'-4"W x 6'-10¹/₄"H) on the 4th thru 6th floor reading “HARLOW Apartments on Main”.
2. Cut aluminum wall sign on the first floor, 11'-6"H x 10"W reading “HARLOW”.

The building, designed by Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design, was approved by the Downtown Commission in June 2018.

Discussion: DJT – Under construction now, architect Jonathan Barnes. JB – smaller blade sign is entry way, sign. For the larger sign, the owners are seeking one of two options to choose. Wanted to have the sign go up by November. Painting would be difficult until April or May. Paint is preferred. RL – we really don't have the details. JB – they would be routed and painted on pins.

RL – why not just do a vinyl temporary banner prior to painting? I like the idea of painted sign on building that is largely paint already. I don't think the aluminum is within the existing character of the building. I'm not inclined to approve that option. MC – the aluminum sign would not look that much different from the painted one – they would both be white. TH – I agree with Bob. JB – the sign would not be lit. RL - motion to approve the painted large sign and the blade sign. Come back with details of the aluminum option with details if owners chose to pursue that option. JM – 2nd.

Results: - motion to approve the painted large sign and the blade sign. Come back with details of the aluminum option with details if owners chose to pursue that option. (7-0)

IV. Business / Discussion

1:32:30

Public Forum

Harrison Smith Award –

- Columbus Metropolitan Club – Wednesday, December 11

December meeting date - *Wednesday*, December 18

Business Meeting – per request of Chair

- Tuesday, December 3
8:30 to 10 am
111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center)
Room 312
- Topical (Graphics)
- Staffing
- Procedural (Timing and deliverance of packets)

Staff Certificates of Appropriateness have been issued since last notification July 18, 2019

Ad Mural – ***Bold & Italics***

1. ***A19-10-11M - 64 E Broad - Burlington – OB***
2. ***A19-10-12M - 35 W Spring- AEP-Lamar***
3. A19-10-13 350 N High - Hyatt Monument
4. A19-10-14 440 W Nationwide - Retaining Wall
5. A19-10-15 285 Cozzins - AssuredPartners Sign
6. A19-10-16 215 W Vine Lot Split – EMHT
7. A19-10-17 295 E Long - Normandy Signage
8. A19-10-18W 266 N Fifth – Waiver
9. A19-10-19 165 N Fifth - Leasing Banner
10. A19-10-20 355 McConnell - Blue Jackets Graphic
11. A19-10-21 223 E Town - Woodbury sign Rev
12. A19-10-22 80 E Rich - Leasing Banner
13. ***A19-10-23M 8 E Long NatwdChildrens – OB***
14. A19-10-24 200 E Town - Ext Reno-Landscape
15. ***A19-10-25M 65 S Fourth- CMA Prizzuti – OB***
16. ***A19-10-26M - 100 E Gay - AEP – OB***
17. ***A19-11-1M 265 Neil - AEP- OB***
18. ***A19-11-2M - 88 E Broad - Alaska Airlines- Lamar***
19. A19-11-3 30 N High - Scientology Graphics – Copy
20. A19-11-4 57 E Gay – Roof
21. ***A19-11-5M - 64 E Broad - AEP - OB***

Next regular meeting will be on December 18, 2019, the *third Wednesday* of the month (four weeks away).

If you have questions concerning this agenda, please contact Daniel Thomas, Urban Design Manager, Planning Division at 614-645-8404.

1:40:30