

GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, February 4, 2020

4:00 p.m.

111 N. Front Street, Hearing Room 204

Commissioners Present: Charissa W. Durst, Jeff Ferriell, Karen McCoy, Ned Thiel

Commissioners Absent: James Panzer, Anthony Hartke, Brent Foley.

City Staff Present:

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:06 p.m. (Commissioner Durst)
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, February 25, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center);
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Tuesday, March 3, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center);
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF (None Present)
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Tuesday, January 7, 2019
MOTION: Thiel/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
Thiel/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

APPEALS APPLICATIONS

1. GV-20-02-009

40 East Whittier Street

Thomas Robinson (Applicant)

Continue application #GV-20-02-009, 40 East Whittier Street, to allow the applicant time to revise the application and submit additional materials.

Commission Rehearing

- Substantial Economic Hardship -Denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness will result in a substantial economic burden on the applicant because the applicant cannot reasonably maintain the property in its current form.
- Unusual and Compelling Circumstance –No reasonable means of saving the property from deterioration, demolition, or collapse other than the applicant’s proposal exists.

Demolition and New Garage

- Demolish existing 1-car wood framed garage.



- Construct a new 1-car wood framed garage with same size foot print (16'x21') in a similar location to the existing garage at the rear of the site.
- Materials for the new garage would be consistent with those of the house.

MOTION: Thiell/Ferriell (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Andrew Dodson 588 S Third Street German Village Society	GVS does not support the demolition of the garage.

Commissioner Comments

- Applicant's proposal was not the only solution since a contractor provided a quote to repair the garage.
- There is opportunity to repair and maintain the current garage.
- The applicant should get a second opinion from a preservation architect's assessment/estimate to figure out what materials could be saved.

STAFF RECOMMENDED APPLICATIONS

2. GV-20-02-010

393 East Livingston Avenue

Northstar Realty –Tom Brigdon (Applicant)

Recommend approval of application #GV-20-02-010, 393 East Livingston Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Variance Request

- To allow residential use within existing C-4 district, allowing both floors to be utilized as a residence.
Note: Applicant is to submit signage for two designated parking spaces to the Historic Preservation Office for future review and approval.

MOTION: Theill/Ferriell (4-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. GV-20-02-011

113 Thurman Avenue

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Approve application #GV-20-02-011, 113 Thurman Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Installation of HVAC Unit

- HVAC unit and mountings will be removed from the rear of the house and placed on the ground on the north side of the garage, revised site plan to be provided to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.

MOTION: Thiell/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED.

4. GV-20-02-012

576-578 South Fifth Street

Brian and Crystal Santin (Applicant)

Approve application #GV-20-02-012, 576-578 South Fifth Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Replace Roof

- Replace all existing main, east, and west dormer asphalt shingle roofs with Ecostar Beveled Edge Empire slate with 7" exposure.
- Color will be Freeport federal to match existing slate on home.
- All sloped roof surfaces (new and existing) will have the Ecostar faux slate.

MOTION: Theill/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED.

5. GV-20-02-013

662 S Grant Avenue

Greenscapes Landscape Co. –Marc Aubry (Applicant)

Approve application #GV-20-02-013, 662 S Grant Avenue, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Landscaping

- Existing City walk to be repaired and replaced with matching brick with limestone curbing added along bed edges.
- Plantings in the front yard will mirror appearance of neighboring property on the south. These plants will include a serviceberry and weeping Japanese maple among other plantings noted on the submitted site plan.
- Cedar fence and 6' gate surrounding backyard to replace existing.
- Decorative cedar structure to hide trash cans and bike.
- Replace path into back yard with brick, matching the City walk.
- Replace back patio with bluestone with a brick border, per submitted site plan.
- Beds in the back yard would be prepared for future plantings.
- New planting beds along sidewalk will be held back 18" from the curb, revised site plan to be provided to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- New limestone at the existing wrought iron fence will be aligned with the face and top of the existing plinths.
- New privacy gate and trash enclosure will be located 6'-0" from the front of the house, or as far back as to not obstruct the neighbor's window, revised site plan to be provided to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Bluestone pavers in backyard will be installed on a crushed gravel base.

MOTION: Theill/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED.

6. GV-20-02-014

862 South Third Street

Greenscapes Landscape Co. –Marc Aubry (Applicant)

Approve application #GV-20-02-014, 862 South Third Street, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Landscaping

- Existing City walk to be repaired and replaced with matching brick with limestone curbing added along bed edges.
- Front plantings will be updated, per the submitted site plan.
- Back patio will be replaced, seat walls and piers to be added, per submitted site plan.
- Masonry pool will be installed.
- Trees and shrubs will be planted along edge beds, per submitted site plan.
- Side steps on south elevation to be repaired.
- Rear patio covered with landmark ceramics porcelain tile (Frontier 20 Sky) and limestone stairs, per submitted site plan.
- New planting beds along sidewalk will be held back 18" from the curb, revised site plan to be provided to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.
- Planting bed in front of the house will have a limestone return at the north side.
- The hydrangea proposed in the planting bed in front of the house will be replaced by a boxwood.
- The pavers between the southeast and southwest corners of the house along the side will be brick to match the front.
- The patio piers are 30" above the patio, which is two (2) steps (14") above grade, not three (3).
- The loose pavers in the backyard are the same as the patio pavers but will be set in sand.

MOTION: Thiell/Ferriell (4-0-0) APPROVED.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW APPLICATIONS

7. GV-20-02-015

120 Thurman Avenue

Ben Shenigo (Applicant)

Conceptual Review

New Parking spot

- Creation of a curb cut on Thurman Avenue.
- Proposed driveway would extent approximately 34'-6" from the curb.
- The parking area would be approximately 10'-6" wide.
- Driveway to include brick pavers.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- A parallel parking space is between 22' to 24' long, not the 18' shown on the submitted site plan. Therefore, one on-street parking space would be lost with a new curb cut.
- Historic character of the neighborhood was that there weren't curb cuts.
- Maintain streetscape the way it is and having a car parked next to a house is not part of it.
- Proposed curb cut would affect the historic fabric.
- Driveway would be an increased risk to pedestrian; area has high pedestrian traffic with Thurman being a busy street.
- Car parked in space would become part of front lawn.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants are not required to attend)

• GV-20-02-001

878 S. Third St.

Travis Massey (Applicant), Luke Werhan, (Owner)

Approve Application #GV-20-02-001, 878 S. Third St., as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Door

- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb (sliding glass door in rear of home facing east).
- New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite: [] wood, [X] fiberglass, or [] metal. Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides. Exterior and hinged sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be painted. Interior and keyed sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be either painted or stained.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

Install New Storm Door

- Install a new, white clad storm door on the south side of the home.
- Cut sheet and color chip for the new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of the door.

- **GV-20-02-002**
512 City Park Ave.
Bello Giardino landscaping (Applicant), Ms. Ferst, (Owner)
Approve Application #GV-20-02-002, 512 City Park Ave., as submitted, with all clarifications noted.
Remove Existing Driveway and Install New Driveway
 - Remove existing driveway apron brick and store, excavate out, pour in new concrete 6" deep, add sand ½" deep, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
 - Place existing brick within driveway apron of the exact same size and dimension as the existing in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards; like-for-like.

- **GV-20-02-003**
475 South Third Street
Metropolitan GV, LLC c/o Metropolitan Partners (Owner)
Approve Application #GV-20-02-003, 475 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Temporary Banner
 - Install one (1) new 4'0" x 8'0" banner, per the submitted rendering.
 - Banner to be attached to existing fence, per the submitted photograph.
 - Banner to be installed for no more than six months from the date of issuance of COA GV-20-02-003.

- **GV-20-02-004**
716 Mohawk Street
Travis Massey (Applicant), Herb Wehner (Owner)
Approve Application #GV-20-02-004, 716 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Door
 - Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb (double sliding patio door in rear of home facing west).
 - New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite: [x] wood, [] fiberglass, or [] metal. Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
 - Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides. Exterior and hinged sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be painted. Interior and keyed sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be either painted or stained.
 - Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain. Will be painted to match existing.

- **GV-20-02-005**
692 Mohawk Street
Emily O'Banion (Owner)
Approve Application #GV-20-02-005, 692 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Privacy Fence
 - Install new 6' wood privacy fence in same location as existing fence per submitted design and work order/siteplan. Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **GV-20-02-006**
587-589 City Park Avenue
Able Roof (Applicant)/ Amy Hamm (Owner)
Approve Application GV-20-02-006, 587-589 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.
Install New Flintlastic Flat Roof
 - Remove any/all EPDM, and/or rolled roofing down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.

- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new Flintlastic single-ply roofing membrane on left side dormer in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings. **Color to be "Colonial Slate".**
- Re-install any/all deteriorated and damaged roof capping from parapet wall, any required replacement capping is to match existing with sample to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal flashing with new metal flashing of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Roof Shingles (as needed)

- Remove asphalt shingles on the main roof by front chimney, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

- ☐ CertainTeed
- ☐ GAF

Style:

- Carriage House (dimensional)
- Slateline (dimensional)

Color:

- ☐ Stonegate Gray
- ☐ English Gray Slate
- ☐ Weathered Slate

[X] Certain Teed

- ☐ GAF
- ☐ Owens Corning
- ☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

- Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)

[X] Nickel Gray

- ☐ Nickel Gray
- ☐ Estate Gray
- ☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Reflash Chimney

- Front chimney to be reflashed

• **GV-20-02-007**

123 Lansing Street

Chris and Jennifer Tipton (Owner)

Approve Application #GV-20-02-007, 123 Lansing Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Existing Curb Section and Install New

- Remove the existing, deteriorated concrete curb section and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, concrete curb section of the exact same size and dimension as the existing in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards; like-for-like.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, brick public and service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new brick in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **GV-20-02-008**

257 Blenkner Street

Pro Exterior by APCO (Applicant)/ Sam Shamansky (Owner)

Approve Application GV-20-02-008, 257 Blenkner Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the kitchen, living room, middle bedroom, rear bedroom, master bath, and bath/ laundry per window brochure as per City Staff site visit determination.
- Install new, Marvin Ultimate Clad Doublehung Windows Next Generation 2.0. in Ebony color, all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

• **GV-20-02-009**

888 Mohawk Street

Able Roof (Applicant)/ Jim Matyas (Owner)

Approve Application GV-20-02-009, 888 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

- ☐ CertainTeed
- ☐ GAF

Style:

- Carriage House (dimensional)
- Slateline (dimensional)

Color:

- ☐ Stonegate Gray
- ☐ English Gray Slate
- ☐ Weathered Slate

[X] Certain Teed

- ☐ GAF
- ☐ Owens Corning
- ☐ Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

- Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)

[X] Nickel Gray

- ☐ Nickel Gray
- ☐ Estate Gray
- ☐ Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. OLD BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURNMENT: MOTION: Ferriell/Theill (4-0-0) ADJOURNED (5:29 p.m.)