

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION  
HEARING MINUTES  
Thursday, February 20, 2020  
4:00 p.m.**

**111 North Front Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 204**

**Commissioners Present:** Jackie Barton, Clyde Henry (Chairperson), Joseph McCabe, Erin Prosser

**Commissioners Absent:** Steward Gibboney, Dan Morgan

**City Staff Present:**

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:01 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, March 12, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center), Third Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, March 19, 2020 – 111 N. Front Street (Michael B. Coleman Government Center); Second Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF (no staff present)
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, January 16, 2020.  
MOTION: McCabe/Barton (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Prosser/Barton (3-1[McCabe-abstain]-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**1. HR-20-01-006**

**777 Kimball Place**

**Steve Baldwin (Applicant)**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**ASB Property Group, LLC./Steve Baldwin (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application # HR-20-01-006 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

**HR-20-01-006a**

Approve Application #HR-20-01-006a, 777 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted.

New Garage

- Build new 20' x 20' two-car, frame garage, per submitted drawings.



- Exterior to be Restoration Smooth Double, 4 ½” vinyl siding; “Colonial White.”
- Two standard size overhead doors.
- Roofing to be Owens Corning 3-tab shingles; “Estate Gray.”
- Corner boards to be 1x4. Overhangs to be 12” on all elevations.
- One steel service door to be half-lite, single panel steel door, per submitted cut sheet.

MOTION: Prosser/Barton (4-0-0) APPROVED

#### **HR-20-01-006b**

Continue Application # HR-20-01-006b, 777 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, in regard to a new fence, walkway, and rear porch enclosure, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 19, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) CONTINUED

#### Commissioner Comments:

- The proposed style and size of the new fence is typical of previous approvals. Provide a site plan showing the location of the proposed fence, including any gates.
- The Commission would prefer to see the existing wood siding retained and repaired on the second floor of the rear porch.
- The 1 x 12 horizontal trim should be located at the bottom of the existing second floor section of the porch (at the existing floor division).
- The drawings should show existing framing that is being retained on the second floor.
- Existing window sizes on the second floor should remain the same.
- A CMU foundation is okay. Consider a split face finish or sandstone color. Provide a physical sample and photos of how it would coordinate with the existing foundation of the house.
- Include existing steps on the elevation drawings.
- Provide a cut sheet for the hand railing.
- Make sure that every elevation drawing matches with the floor plans.
- The siding on the new/bottom section should not be the exact same profile and reveal as the historic second story siding.

#### **NEW APPLICATIONS**

#### **2. HR-20-02-007**

**250 East Town Street**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**250 E Town St LLC (Applicant/ Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant and Owner, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Recommend Approval of Application # HR-20-02-007, 250 East Town Street, 250 E Town St, LLC, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- To Designate the Market-Mohawk Center, 250 East Town Street, as Columbus Register Property # **79**, per C.C. 3117.06, 3117.061, and 3117.063.
- Architect: Eberts & Storkel
- Architectural Classification: New Formalism
- Historic Function: Market/meeting space
- Date of Construction: 1969-1970
- Period of Significance: 1969-1970
- Boundary: All of parcels #010-008173 and #010-008350
- Eligible under Criterion E: The property is closely and publicly identified with an event, or series of events, which has influenced the historical, architectural, or cultural development of the city, state, or nation.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL

Commissioner Comments:

- Consider how words such as “slum” and “blight” are used in the narrative of the nomination.
- Consider whether or not the parking lot should be included in the boundary for the Columbus Register nomination. Including the parking lot would require approval of any work within the parking lot by the Historic Resources Commission.
- The courtyard should be included within the boundary.

**3. HR-20-02-008**

**667 Linwood Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**EZ Pro/ Erez Hagiell (Applicant), EZ Properties LLC (Owner)**

*Following discussion, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-20-02-008, 667 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, in regard to a new dormer that was built prior to review and approval, , and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 19, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- The dormer was built without review by the Commission and without permits.
- If built appropriately, a dormer could be supported in this location.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) CONTINUED

**4. HR-20-02-009**

**633 Linwood Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Michael P. Herman (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-20-02-009, 633 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted.

Repair/Rebuild Front Terrace

- Remove existing Perma-stone faced concrete block, closed/privacy railings on front terrace.
- Existing stone foundation of terrace to be repaired with existing stones.
- Build new, concrete block closed/privacy railings with stone veneer, per submitted product sample.
- Reinstall original limestone cap. Replace broken section of limestone cap with new limestone.

Note: Approval is based on the existing conditions of this particular property. Rebuilding of the terrace walls will be replacement, like-for-like, of an existing, non-conforming condition. At such time in the future if an entire front porch is proposed, the design and materials will need to be consistent with any/all applicable standards and guidelines.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (4-0-0) APPROVED

**5. HR-20-02-010**

**684 Wilson Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Jessica Meyer (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application #HR-20-02-010, 684 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted.

New Garage

- Build a new, frame, 22' x 22', two-car garage, per submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be triple, 3x12, Restoration smooth vinyl siding.
- Corner boards –wood 1x4; Service Door and Overhead Door trim – wood 1x4.

- Soffit to be wood with 12" overhangs on all elevations.
- Roofing to be from the Approved Roofing Shingles list, with metal ridge roll. Shingle choice to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.
- Single service door to be two-panel, half-lite, fiberglass door, per submitted product cut sheet.
- Single, 16' overhead door to be carriage style with hardware. Cut sheet to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.
- Any exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, prior to installation.

Note: A single door is being approved based on the narrowness of the alley and limited turning radius.

MOTION: Prosser/Barton (4-0-0) APPROVED

## CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

### 6. **HR-20-02-0011**

**373-375 W. Rich Street**

**CASTO (Applicant)**

Rehab / 373 W. Rich Street

- Remove interior floors, walls, roof, and other miscellaneous structure in their entirety.
- Construct new floor structure and mezzanine within existing masonry walls, including an open-air roof deck.
- Reconstruct and reinforce masonry façade. Install new garage doors and exposed structural steel.
- Remove existing plaster coating and repair east, south/rear, and west exterior masonry walls.
- At open-air areas, existing masonry walls to be reduced in height from three stories to two stories.

Rehab / 375 W. Rich Street

- Add structural support to existing, exterior masonry walls.
- Remove and replace some concrete slab, as needed.

New Connector, Patio Areas, & Parking

- Remove existing catwalk structures between the two buildings and build a new, two-story connector glazed structure.
- Create new, raised, outdoor patio and monumental stair at the southeast corner of Rich and Cherry streets.
- Create new, outdoor patio, amenity area, private tenant entry, and roof patio egress on south side.
- Surface parking lot to include 15 spaces, which will require a variance from 87 required spaces.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Henry opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:*

### Commissioner Comments

#### Commissioner Henry:

- Noted that the current condition of the building is a result of neglect by the owner, who has owned the building for decades. This was confirmed by the Applicant at the February 13<sup>th</sup> business meeting.
- This is basically a request for demolition, so the rules for demolition should apply on this project.
- These are probably some of the most important historic buildings in the City, because they survived the flood.
- There are lots of ways to engineer something. Consider investigating some other engineering possibilities, such as the large, structural caissons that were poured in the center of the building, which are very sturdy.
- Would not be opposed to taking the walls down to the window level, numbering all the materials, and then reconstructing again with a new roof. That's something the Commission has approved before.
- Noted that a building might not be retained on the National Register if too much historic fabric is removed.
- The Commission has approved murals in other areas, but only if removable, heat applied murals.

Commissioner Prosser:

- This is the only warehouse building that survived the 1913 flood.
- Asked if there is an opportunity to have a third floor that is not occupied but where the external walls are retained. This could retain the historic form of the building.
- The Standard for Demolition (3116.14) is really quite high. A structural engineers report would be required to get to the point of demolition. The Commission cannot approve demolition based economics.
- Thinks it is important to preserve this building with another use. If it remains in the hands of the current user, it's going to disintegrate.
- For future submittals, clearly define on drawings/renderings exactly what areas are to be retained and what areas are proposed for demolition.

Commissioner McCabe:

- Wood framing can be replaced with new wood framing.
- Be sure to look closely at CC 3116.14 (Standards for Demolition) and make sure you meet the criteria for demolition.
- This building is not only on the Columbus Register, but also on the National Register, so it is very important.
- Does not necessarily oppose all demolition. The degree of demolition proposed is altering the mass and volume of the building, which is significant. There may be some compromise in the middle. The neighborhood continues to loose historic fabric, so would hate to see an entire story lost.
- Appreciates that some of the façade and other details are proposed to be retained. Try to continue along that path.
- Thinks some of the proposed patterning and textures on the walls are not appropriate treatments for historic buildings.
- The connector is new construction that is probably needed and is appropriate.
- Appropriate replacement materials for all historic fabric, such as the small pane windows, will need to be carefully considered.
- Noted that a single-story "Flatiron" section used to exist at the corner entrance of the west building. It could be a cool commercial space if this space was recreated – or create a patio or stair space in the same form.
- Would want to see the Rich Street elevation preserved and then acknowledging the massing in some way.

Commissioner Barton:

- Noted that the Commission has to hold developers to the same standards for demolition as they do residential home owners. The budgets are different, but the requirements are the same.
- The Commissions' purview is to look at the guidelines and the significance of the building, and that's it.
- Agrees that engineering for a building can be looked at in different ways. It can be important for the structural engineer to know the direction a certain project needs to move in. In this case, the direction of retaining historic fabric. That's the direction the Commission has to aim for before we can ever start discussing demolition.
- Does not have an issue with murals as long as they are not permanent.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **HR-20-02-001**

**675 Oakwood Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Vance Valentine (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application HR-20-02-001, 675 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Install New Doors

- Remove the existing plywood on the rear door and the non-original side door, per the submitted photos.
- Install new, fiberglass, two-panel Craftsman doors in both locations, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Install new, aluminum storm doors in both locations, per the submitted product cut sheets.

- **HR-20-02-002**  
**52 West Royal Forest Blvd.** **Old Beechwold Historic District**  
**Greg Georgia (Applicant/Owner)**  
Approve Application HR-20-02-002, 52 West Royal Forest Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:  
Install Awnings
  - Install five (5) new, Sunbrella woven acrylic awnings, per the submitted photos and specifications.
  - Awnings to be shed style with scalloped edges. Frames to be aluminum with mill finish or galvanized steel.Modify Existing Pergola
  - Install a flat, rubber roof on the existing pergola, to prevent further decay of exposed wood.
  
- **HR-20-02-003**  
**1821 Bryden Road** **Bryden Road Historic District**  
**Aracelis Rivera (Applicant/Owner)**  
Approve Application HR-20-02-003, 1821 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:  
Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / House & Garage
  - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house and the garage, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
  - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
  - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
  - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
  - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
  - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Certain Teed, (standard 3-tab), "Nickel Gray."
  - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
  - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
  - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
  
- **HR-20-02-004**  
**1639 Bryden Road** **Bryden Road Historic District**  
**Grasp Investments, LLC (Owner)**  
Approve Application HR-20-02-004, 1639 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:  
Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
  - Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
  - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
  - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
  - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
  - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
  - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning, (standard 3-tab), "Estate Gray."

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **HR-20-02-005**

**366-382 N. Twentieth Street**

**Macon Hotel/Individual Listing**

**Yhezkel Levi (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application **HR-20-02-005**, 366-382 N. Twentieth Street, Macon Hotel/Individual Listing, for renewal of expired COA # 17-4-6 (Expired: March 27, 2018), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Stabilize Building Structure Complete

Remove Non-contributing, Non-original, Shed Roof

- Remove the deteriorated, non-contributing, non-original, metal shed roof from the northeast elevation and dispose of all debris per City Code.

Remove Ivy, Stucco, & Graffiti—All Elevations

- Remove any/all ivy and vegetation from all elevations and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Remove all non-original, non-contributing, and inappropriate stucco parging from all elevations and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a graffiti removal patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x 2') section of the northeast wall and schedule review with the Historic Preservation Officer. Following H. P. O. approval of the cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer’s recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- “The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings”).

Tuckpoint—All Elevations

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness.
- All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and tuck point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”)
- Replace any/all missing and deteriorated brick with new or used brick of the same color, texture, and size as necessary; like-for-like.

Repair Brick Walls & Piers

- Examine all brick walls and structural brick piers on all elevations and repair per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- New and/or used brick to match the original brick in color, dimensions, and style as closely as possible; like-for-like.

Re-roof Complete

- Remove the existing roof and rafters down to the plate and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Construct a new rafter and roof system with pre-engineered roof trusses placed twenty-four inches on center (24” o. c.) and per City Code.
- Measured roof truss drawing to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Officer with slope and framing details indicated for final review and approval in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission prior to installation of the new roofing system.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.

Historic Resources Commission - Minutes

February 20, 2020

8

- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	English Gray Slate Weathered Slate
Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray
GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	Nickel Gray
Celotex	(standard 3-tab)	Heritage Gray Slate Gray
Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	Estate Gray
Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs. Metal ridge roll to run the complete length of all roof ridges (i.e. flush with the eave/soffit fascia) and painted “Tinner's Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “gray” to match the new shingle color as closely as possible.

Prepare & Paint Exterior—Complete

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the building for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer’s specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing; like-for-like. Finish Paint color chips to be submitted to the historic Preservation Officer for final review and approval prior to applying the finish paint(s).
- It is recommended that all exterior paint have conditioner added:
  - i. Any/all alkyd or oil base primer and finish paint to have Flood Products ‘Penetrol’ or similar conditioner and
  - ii. Any/all latex or water base primer and finish paint to have Flood Products ‘Emusibond’ or ‘Flotrol’ or similar conditioner product added per manufacturer’s specifications.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

- At the request of HPO staff, the Commission briefly discussed replacement of existing historic garage doors with new, overhead garage doors. Staff provided information about 60-62 E Northwood Avenue as an example.
- The Commission agreed that replacing historic garage doors with operable doors is appropriate because a garage that is used is more likely to be maintained. New doors may be steel, rather than wood, but should mimic the design of the historic doors as closely as possible.

**XII. ADJOURN**

MOTION: Barton/Prosser (4-0-0) ADJOURNED (5:37 pm)