

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
AGENDA
May 21, 2020
4:00 p.m.**

111 North Front Street, Room 204 (Hearing Room)

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, June 11, 2020 – 111 North Front Street, 3rd Floor, Room 313
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, June 18, 2020 – 111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – [Thursday, February 20, 2020](#)
- VII. APPROVAL OF STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF REPORT

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. [HR-20-05-011](#)
[1478 Bryden Road](#) **Bryden Road Historic District**
Elaine Paris (Owner)
Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
 - Remove all slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) "Estate Gray."
 - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

2. [HR-20-05-014](#)
[100 Arcadia Avenue](#) **North High School/Individually Listed Property**
Marous Brothers Construction (Applicant) **Columbus City Schools (Owner)**
This is Phase II of an ongoing rehabilitation project.
- Installation of a pair of Chillers at rear of building. Associated piping to be run at ground level.
 - Convert a portion of the existing walks from brick pavers to concrete, and repair of paver walks to remain
 - Repair existing concrete walks, curbs, ramp, and stairs.
 - Repair existing stone stair treads and stringers (rebuild, clean, & re-grout).
 - Clean masonry fence and replace damaged and missing bricks with salvaged brick pavers.
 - Install railings at exterior stairs and ramps.
 - Replace existing concrete accessible side walk ramp to meet City of Columbus standards.
 - Remove barbed wire at top of existing fence. Existing fence to remain intact with only selective fence removal in limited areas.
 - Relocation & reduction of existing bleachers.
 - Modification & repair (reseeding/ regrading) of existing athletic field for continued use.
 - Painting of existing flag pole bases to remain.
 - In select areas, where foundation walls are exposed, limited waterproofing and regrading of adjacent landscape will be performed.
 - Grind a pair of exiting tree stumps to below grade, cover with topsoil, and seed areas.

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

3. [HR-20-02-008](#)
[667 Linwood Avenue](#) **Old Oaks Historic District**
EZ Oro/ Erez Hagiel (Applicant), EZ Properties LLC (Owner)
A new dormer was built on the north slope of the roof, prior to review and approval. A code order has been issued.
New Dormer
- Request to retain the existing dormer on the north slope of the roof, as built prior to review and approval.
 - Dormer includes 12” overhang, with vinyl soffit proposed.
 - Exterior cladding to be vinyl with 1x smooth cedar trim.
 - Includes two, one-over-one, double-hung sash windows.

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. [HR-20-03-006](#)
[565 East Town Street](#) **East Town Street Historic District**
Charles E. Eitel/ Deborah Thompson (Applicant)
All equipment has been installed.
Heat Pump Units
- Retain the three (3) Mitsubishi MXZ series heat pump outdoor units, as installed.
5. [HR-20-03-014 \(CONCEPTUAL\)](#)
[530 E Rich Street](#) **East Town Street Historic District**
Schiff Capital (Applicant) Michael Schiff (Owner)
Demolition
- Proposed demolition of portions of rear sections of both houses and the connector between the houses.
 - Demolition of the concrete block addition and the two garages.
- Renovation and Construct New Rear Addition
- Renovation of the two historic houses.
 - Construct new rear addition with 30 dwelling units.
 - Exterior materials to include brick and stone.

- New structure to be four stories with a loft.
- Site to include 30 parking spaces.

6. **HR-20-03-013 (CONCEPTUAL)**

62 W. Beechwold Boulevard

Old Beechwold Historic District

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)

Enclose Existing Garage

- Enclose existing garage door opening on rear/north elevation.
- Remove existing overhead door, and infill with a new door and windows with wood panel below, per the submitted site plan.
- The door on the west elevation would be removed and infilled with a new window to match the existing.

Construct New Detached Garage

- Construct a new 2-car garage measures 24'x22'.
- North and west elevations to be siding with stone on the south and east elevations, per submitted elevations.

7. **HR-20-05-012**

373-375 West Rich Street

Lubal Manufacturing/Individually Listed Property

CASTO (Applicant)

Demolition / 373 W. Rich Street

- Remove the third story of 373 W. Rich Street on all elevations, upward from the continuous stone sill beneath the third floor windows on the facade.

Alterations / 373 W. Rich Street

- Façade - Retain second story window openings and install new windows.
- Façade - Retain storefront window openings and install new windows.
- East Elevation – One window opening to remain following demolition.
- South Elevation – Install new garage door and pedestrian openings. Infill two window openings.
- West Elevation – Create new openings at ground level.
- West Elevation – Retain second story window openings and install new windows.
- West Elevation – Partially covered by new connector.

Alterations / 375 W. Rich Street

- Façade - Retain second and third story window openings and create four (4) new window openings.
- Façade – Create two (2) new garage-type door openings.
- East Elevation – Create four (4) new door openings at ground level. Infill four (4) window openings.
- East Elevation – Partially covered by new connector.
- South Elevation – No changes to door/window openings.
- West Elevation – Infill two (2) openings.

New Connector, Patio Areas, & Parking

- Create new, outdoor patio, amenity area, private tenant entry, and roof patio egress on south side.
- Surface parking lot to include 15 spaces, requiring a variance from 87 required spaces. Six bike spaces.
- Install new, raised outdoor seating areas and steps along west wall of 373 and façade of 375 W. Rich.
- Remove existing catwalk between buildings, and construct new, two-story connector.

The following is from the February 20, 2020 HRC minutes:

Commissioner Henry:

- *Noted that the current condition of the building is a result of neglect by the owner, who has owned the building for decades. This was confirmed by the Applicant at the February 13th business meeting.*
- *This is basically a request for demolition, so the rules for demolition should apply on this project.*
- *These are probably some of the most important historic buildings in the City, because they survived the flood.*
- *There are lots of ways to engineer something. Consider investigating some other engineering possibilities, such as the large, structural caissons that were poured in the center of the building, which are very sturdy.*
- *Would not be opposed to taking the walls down to the window level, numbering all the materials, and then reconstructing again with a new roof. That's something the Commission has approved before.*
- *Noted that a building might not be retained on the National Register if too much historic fabric is removed.*

- *The Commission has approved murals in other areas, but only if removable, heat applied murals.*

Commissioner Prosser:

- *This is the only warehouse building that survived the 1913 flood.*
- *Asked if there is an opportunity to have a third floor that is not occupied but where the external walls are retained. This could retain the historic form of the building.*
- *The Standard for Demolition (3116.14) is really quite high. A structural engineers report would be required to get to the point of demolition. The Commission cannot approve demolition based economics.*
- *Thinks it is important to preserve this building with another use. If it remains in the hands of the current user, it's going to disintegrate.*
- *For future submittals, clearly define on drawings/renderings exactly what areas are to be retained and what areas are proposed for demolition.*

Commissioner McCabe:

- *Wood framing can be replaced with new wood framing.*
- *Be sure to look closely at CC 3116.14 (Standards for Demolition) and make sure you meet the criteria for demolition.*
- *This building is not only on the Columbus Register, but also on the National Register, so it is very important.*
- *Does not necessarily oppose all demolition. The degree of demolition proposed is altering the mass and volume of the building, which is significant. There may be some compromise in the middle. The neighborhood continues to lose historic fabric, so would hate to see an entire story lost.*
- *Appreciates that some of the façade and other details are proposed to be retained. Try to continue along that path.*
- *Thinks some of the proposed patterning and textures on the walls are not appropriate treatments for historic buildings.*
- *The connector is new construction that is probably needed and is appropriate.*
- *Appropriate replacement materials for all historic fabric, such as the small pane windows, will need to be carefully considered.*
- *Noted that a single-story "Flatiron" section used to exist at the corner entrance of the west building. It could be a cool commercial space if this space was recreated – or create a patio or stair space in the same form.*
- *Would want to see the Rich Street elevation preserved and then acknowledging the massing in some way.*

Commissioner Barton:

- *Noted that the Commission has to hold developers to the same standards for demolition as they do residential home owners. The budgets are different, but the requirements are the same.*
- *The Commission's purview is to look at the guidelines and the significance of the building, and that's it.*
- *Agrees that engineering for a building can be looked at in different ways. It can be important for the structural engineer to know the direction a certain project needs to move in. In this case, the direction of retaining historic fabric. That's the direction the Commission has to aim for before we can ever start discussing demolition.*
- *Does not have an issue with murals as long as they are not permanent.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

8. [HR-20-03-011](#)

[1221 Bryden Road](#)

Bryden Road Historic District

Scott Baker (Applicant)

Porch Repair

- Remove and replace damaged rafters and trim, as needed.
- Remove front porch columns, and install new columns, per submitted cut sheet.
- Existing first and second story porch railings to be retained, and repaired, as needed. Any replacement materials to match existing.
- Paint all wood to match the existing color scheme.

9. [HR-20-05-015](#)
[517 Park Street / AC Hotel](#) **North Market Historic District**
Jones Sign Co. Inc. (Applicant) **Park & Spruce Acquisitions, LLC (Owner)**
New Signage
- Install new signage, including several internally illuminated wall or projecting signs, a non-illuminated placard, and window vinyl.
10. [HR-20-03-010](#)
[673 South Champion Avenue](#) **Old Oaks Historic District**
675 Champion Avenue Trust/Tim Dye (Applicant)
Build New Garage
- Create a new curb cut at Newton Street, per submitted site plan.
 - Construct a single story, two-car garage with single, overhead door.
 - Garage to measure 20'x20' with smooth vinyl siding; 1 x 4 corner boards and door trim; 1 x 6 fascia and lintel over garage door.
 - Shingles to be from approved roofing shingles list, with metal ridge roll.
11. [HR-20-05-013](#)
[935 East Broad Street](#) **18th & East Broad Street Historic District**
Madeline Pesavento/Women's Care Centers (Applicant)
New Signage
- Install two (2) new ground signs on the front lawn, per submitted photos and renderings.
 - Signs to be double-sided aluminum, 6' W x 2.66' H (approx. 12.5 sf) and approximately 5' H.
 - Signs to be located on adjacent parcels, indicating building location and parking location.
12. [HR-20-05-016](#)
[624 Oakwood Avenue](#) **Old Oaks Historic District**
Raymond & Kari Kinczyk (Owners)
New Garage
- Build new, 24' x 24', frame garage, per submitted drawings.
 - Cladding to be Restoration Smooth vinyl siding, with 1x4 wood trim.
 - Garage to have one (1) 16' overhead garage door on alley side, and one (1) 9' overhead garage door facing onto rear yard.
 - One pedestrian door to face onto rear yard (Craftsman style, smooth fiberglass).
 - Shingles to be Owens Corning 3-tab, "Estate Gray."
 - Install 10 x 10 concrete pad on west side of the garage.
13. [HR-20-05-017](#)
[59 E. Oakland Avenue](#)
Lee J. Rumora/Architect (Applicant)
New Dormer
- Install new dormer on west slope of roof to provide access to finished third floor space.
 - Soffit to be tongue-and-groove wood. Dormer cheeks to include 4" wood siding with wood corner boards to match existing.
 - Two (2) six-over-one, double-hung sash windows to match façade dormer. Window cut sheet to be submitted.

STAFF APPROVALS

- **HR-20-05-001**
696 South Champion Avenue **Old Oaks Historic District**
Iroabuchi Arum (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-001, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
New Pergola
 - Install a new 14' x 10' concrete patio in rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
 - Install a new, cedar pergola on the concrete slab, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.

- **HR-20-05-002**
734 South Champion Avenue **Old Oaks Historic District**
Randy Youkum (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-002, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Windows (Full Frame Replacement)
 - Remove non-original, windows on the third floor of the west and south elevations
 - Remove the entire existing windows to the studs/rough opening. (sashes, jambs, exterior sill and brick mold).
 - Install a complete new window (sashes, jambs, and exterior sill and brick mold).
 - New windows to be Trimline aluminum-clad wood, per the submitted window schedule dated March 26, 2020.
 - All window exteriors to be white to match existing. All trim to be wood flat stock, painted white to match existing. Windows on south elevation to retain existing original trim.Restore Window Opening
 - Restore the original window opening on the front/west elevation of the bay that is located on the south elevation of the house.
 - Install new Trimline double-hung window, per the submitted window schedule.
 - Window exterior to be white. Trim to be white, wood flat stock with decorative cornice and sill to match existing windows.

Note: Restoration of the window opening is based on a ca. 1925 photo of the house.

Replace Shakes in Gables
 - Remove cedar shake shingles on the west facing gables and the south facing gable and replace with decorative cut cedar shingles.
 - New shingles to be round and arrow style, patterned to match the two existing areas of the house.
 - Gables will be painted Sherwin Williams “Rookwood Antique Gold” (SW 2614).

- **HR-20-05-003**
230 W. Royal Forest Blvd. **Old Beechwold Historic District**
Cox Tree Service (Applicant) **Nancy Morcos (Owner)**
Approve Application HR-20-05-003, 230 W. Royal Forest Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
Tree Removal
 - To avoid damage to property and to insure public safety, remove the existing, mature Beech tree (Fagus Grandifolia) located in the rear yard, per the submitted photos and arborist’s report.
 - The approximately 80 ft. tall tree has major stem defect (stem rot) and currently leans towards house.
 - A new Beech tree or other native species is to be planted in an appropriate location on the property.

- **HR-20-05-004**
620 East Town Street **East Town Street Historic District**
Greg Kitzmiller/Great Impressions Signs and Designs (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-004, 620 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
New Ground Sign
 - Install one (1) new ground sign on the front lawn of the apartment building, per the submitted photos and shop drawing.
 - Double-faced ¾” MDO sign to measure 30” high x 48” wide.
 - Sign face to be painted “White” with “Black” vinyl lettering.
 - Two 4 x 4, pressure treated posts to be painted “White.”
 - Post covers and post caps to be PVC.
 - Top of posts not to extend more than 5’ above grade.

- **HR-20-05-005**
711 South Ohio Avenue **Old Oaks Historic District**
Jones Home Transformations (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-005, 711 South Ohio Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
Parking Pad
 - Remove existing concrete parking pad.
 - Add new parking pad to rear (west) of property to be accessed off of Granger Alley.
 - Parking pad will be 21’ by 20’ poured concrete with, per submitted site plan.

- **HR-20-05-006**
1053 Bryden Road **Bryden Road Historic District**
Jennifer Moore (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-006, 1053 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
Exterior Painting
 - Prepare all previously painted exterior masonry surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Previously painted brick walls to be Sherwin Williams (SW6002) “Essential Gray.”
 - Trim (previously painted stone window/door sills, lintels, and wood trim) to be darker gray with white and dark blue/gray accents. Final paint color chips to be submitted for HPO file.
 - Wood porch columns and railings to be “White” to match existing.

- **HR-20-05-007**
1251 Bryden Road **Bryden Road Historic District**
Central Community House (Applicant)
Approve Application HR-20-05-007, 1251 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.
Install Cluster Mailbox
 - Install a new cluster mailbox adjacent to the front service sidewalk, per the submitted photos, sketch plan, and product cut sheet.
 - Color to be “Dark Bronze.”

• **HR-20-05-008**

777 Kimball Place

Steve Baldwin (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

ASB Property Group, LLC./Steve Baldwin (Owner)

Approve Application HR-20-05-008, 777 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Rear Sleeping Porch

- Remove existing, non-original, wood support posts.
- Install new 2” x 12” pressure treated header boards lag bolted to new 8”x8” posts, per submitted drawings.
- Add horizontal boards on the exterior of the existing porch railings, to cover the top and bottom of the balusters.
- Paint colors for 2nd floor sleeping porch to be “Colonial White” with (SW6992) “Inkwell” trim. Posts and railings to be painted “Colonial White.”

Exterior Painting/House

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color for wood trim to be (SW6992) “Inkwell.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Install New Concrete Steps

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete front porch steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete steps in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• **HR-20-05-009**

762 Bryden Road

Ellen Chung (Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

Approve Application HR-20-05-009, 762 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Replace Multi-Lite Doors

- Remove the existing, wood, multi-lite double doors on the rear of the historic garage addition, per submitted photos.
- New doors to be Pella, three-quarter lite, simulated divided lite doors with sidelites, per submitted product cut sheet.

Note: The existing doors are fitted within the original automobile door openings.

• **HR-20-05-010**

765 Bryden Road

Zane M. Liston, Sr. (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Approve Application HR-20-05-010, 765 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Privacy Fence

- Install new privacy fence on east side and rear of house, per the submitted photos and site plan.
- Fence to be of similar design and construction as neighboring fence, per submitted photos.
- Maximum 72" height, constructed of pressure treated lumber.

- Location to be three feet inside property line along Allen Ave and approximately thirty feet inside rear property line.
- Existing mature trees and shrubs on Allen Avenue will remain.

Note: West side of property has existing privacy fence owned by neighboring property.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

XII. ADJOURN