

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3 - - -

4

5 In the Matter of:

6 Regular Meeting

7 - - -

8 Grady L. Pettigrew

9 President, Presiding

10 - - -

11 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

12 - - -

13

14 Monday, February 24, 2020
15 12:43 p.m.
16 City of Columbus
17 Civil Service Commission
18 77 North Front Street
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215

20 - - -

21 TRACI E. PEOPLES
22 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER

23 - - -

24 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
 1421 West Third Avenue
 Columbus, Ohio 43212
 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:
2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Stefanie L. Coe
4 Delena Edwards (by phone)

5 PRESENTERS:
6 Charday Litzy-Taylor
7 Brenda Sobieck

8 ALSO PRESENT:
9 Amy DeLong
10 Wendy Brinnon
11 Jaasiel Rubeck

12 - - -

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
February 24, 2020
2 12:43 p.m.

3 - - -

4 P R O C E E D I N G S

5 - - -

6 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 24th day of
7 February, 2020, the Municipal Civil Service
8 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.
9 Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in
10 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,
11 the following proceedings were had:

12 - - -

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I will call to
14 order the City of Columbus Municipal Civil Service
15 regular meeting for February 2020. We will be
16 following the printed agenda.

17 The first item is review and approval of
18 the minutes of the January 27, 2020, regular
19 meeting.

20 MS. COE: I move to approve the minutes
21 from the January 27, 2020, regular meeting.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

23 All in favor, say "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

2 The next item -- action item is review of
3 the prehearing conferences.

4 MS. SOBIECK: I am Brenda Sobieck, with
5 the Commission staff.

6 The first one is -- and I'm probably
7 going to get the name wrong -- but Chawndalya Tubbs
8 v. Columbus City Schools. And it is scheduled for
9 Monday, March 30th.

10 The school district has three witnesses.
11 And the union has two witnesses. And they think
12 that one should be fine for an afternoon. Actually,
13 we should be starting at 11:00 on that one.

14 The second one is Freda Malone v.
15 Columbus City Schools. This is a bus driver. The
16 school district has three witnesses and one -- or,
17 I'm sorry -- yes, three witnesses, and one witness
18 for the union -- or the appellant. It is actually
19 just the appellant herself.

20 So this -- There is an outside attorney
21 for this; however, they think they can be done
22 within four hours. So we're fine with the
23 afternoon.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. Whose is

1 that?

2 MS. SOBIECK: The attorney is O'Malley.

3 And I can't remember his first name.

4 THE COURT: No, I just meant --

5 MS. COE: It's mine.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: -- which
7 commissioner.

8 MS. SOBIECK: Which commissioner?

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Yes.

10 MS. SOBIECK: Stefanie.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

12 MS. COE: And I can't start early that
13 day.

14 MS. SOBIECK: Oh, okay. Yeah. I think
15 we'll be okay. This attorney said he's very quick
16 with his questioning.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I think we've heard
18 that before.

19 MS. SOBIECK: I know.

20 MS. COE: I could start -- I could start,
21 like, at 11:00. But I can't start at, like, 9:00 or
22 9:30.

23 MS. SOBIECK: Oh, okay.

24 MS. COE: So if there was a desire to

1 start at, like, 11:00, I could do that.

2 MS. SOBIECK: Okay.

3 MS. COE: But I could not do first thing
4 in the morning.

5 MS. SOBIECK: Okay. We can look it over
6 a little bit. You know, they estimated two hours
7 total for the school district and an hour and a half
8 for . . .

9 MS. COE: I would think we could do it in
10 the afternoon. Unless they do something out of the
11 ordinary, we should be fine.

12 MS. SOBIECK: Yeah, based on the
13 witnesses.

14 MS. COE: Yes.

15 MS. SOBIECK: Okay.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. The
17 next action item is the election of Commission
18 president.

19 MS. COE: I move to reelect Grady as
20 president of the Commission.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.
22 Seconded.

23 MS. BRINNON: Delena, would you second
24 the motion for --

1 MS. EDWARDS: Yes. Absolutely.

2 You're fading in and out a little bit.

3 MS. BRINNON: Yeah. I can't get it any
4 closer.

5 MS. EDWARDS: That's okay.

6 I second the motion.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
8 "aye."

9 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

10 MS. EDWARDS: It's on speaker.

11 MS. BRINNON: Okay. We're good.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The next two items
13 are joined; that is, the request of Civil Service
14 Commission staff to approve the specification review
15 for the classification City Forester, with no
16 revisions; and the classification Firing Range
17 Assistant, with no revisions.

18 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor,
19 Personnel Analyst with the Commission. The reviews
20 of these classifications are part of the Civil
21 Service Commission's effort to review all
22 classifications every five years.

23 After reviewing questionnaires and having
24 discussions with Department representatives, it was

1 determined that the current specifications still
2 adequately describe the work being performed;
3 therefore, it is recommended that the specifications
4 be approved with no revisions.

5 MS. COE: Thank you.

6 I move to support the request of the
7 Civil Service Commission staff to approve the
8 specification review for the classification City
9 Forester, as well as Firing Range Assistant, with no
10 revisions.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

12 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
14 "aye."

15 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

17 Next is the request of the Civil Service
18 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
19 classification Keep Columbus Beautiful Manager.

20 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This review is also
21 part of the Commission's effort to review all
22 classifications every five years.

23 Two additional statements are proposed to
24 better reflect the knowledge, skills and abilities

1 necessary for successful performance of the duties
2 associated with this classification. It is
3 recommended that some knowledge of environmental
4 issues and ability to operate a computer and utilize
5 related software be added.

6 No other revisions are proposed at this
7 time.

8 MS. COE: Thank you.

9 I move to support the request of the
10 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
11 specification for the classification Keep Columbus
12 Beautiful Manager.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

14 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

19 Next is the request of Civil Service
20 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
21 classification Rental Services Coordinator.

22 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This review is also
23 part of the Commission's effort to review all
24 classes every five years.

1 It is recommended that reference to
2 athletic complexes be removed from the "Examples of
3 Work" section. These permitting functions, as they
4 relate to athletic complexes, are no long handled by
5 rental services. They are now handled by the sports
6 section.

7 No other revisions are proposed.

8 MS. COE: Thank you.

9 I move to support the request of the
10 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
11 specification for the classification Rental Services
12 Coordinator.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

14 MS. EDWARDS: I second.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

19 As to the background removals, Delena,
20 what is the one you're concerned about?

21 MS. EDWARDS: It is the very last one,
22 Eric Rodriguez.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay.

24 Then as to the applicants removed

1 pre-examination:

2 Shanta Cruthird, reinstate;

3 Kishawna Jackson, do not reinstate;

4 Mohammad Toha, reinstate.

5 As to the applicants removed

6 post-examination:

7 Dylan Thompson, do not reinstate;

8 Benjamin Reis, do not reinstate;

9 Donovan Bever, reinstate;

10 Orlando Rodriguez, do not reinstate;

11 Kyle Dotson, reinstate;

12 Peter Bell, do not reinstate;

13 Dakota Sexton, do not reinstate;

14 Devan Kline, reinstate.

15 Eric Rodriguez, what's your concern on

16 that one, Delena?

17 MS. EDWARDS: I wasn't able to find -- to

18 get to a -- well, not identifying cocaine use on his

19 history. But I cannot find -- there were two

20 issues, as I understand it. One was whether he used

21 it at a party. And he didn't list it because he

22 didn't know. And he still doesn't know if he used

23 cocaine at the party. Because cocaine was there, it

24 was important to say that. But, frankly, he was so

1 drunk he doesn't remember much of anything about
2 that night.

3 But they then pointed out that he failed
4 to mention -- the party was in 2016, by the way.
5 And they point out he failed to mention his use in
6 2012. That, I don't see it. I don't see -- I guess
7 I missed it. But I'm not -- but I'm not seeing
8 that.

9 MS. COE: I don't think he states 2012 in
10 his statement. But he says "I do admit to omitting
11 the cocaine use during the PHS," in the first
12 sentence of the second paragraph.

13 MS. EDWARDS: Right. And then he
14 explains that he didn't -- that he omitted it
15 because he doesn't know if he used it.

16 MS. COE: I think that's the second
17 incident, in 2016.

18 MS. DeLONG: Yes.

19 MS. CODE: So there's two incidents.
20 He's describing the 2012 incident without the date
21 in the first part of the paragraph, and then he
22 says, "I did admit to discussing the cocaine in
23 2016." Two different things.

24 MS. EDWARDS: Yeah, I know it's two

1 different things. I'm trying to find it. Where --
2 Did I write it down someplace? Shoot. Okay. I
3 just need a second. Yeah, I think that was a -- I'm
4 trying to pull up his statement again. Okay.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: On page 4.

6 MS. EDWARDS: I'm sorry. It's taking
7 me -- Okay. I apologize.

8 MS. DeLONG: I think the issue is --

9 MS. EDWARDS: The first sentence on --

10 MS. DeLONG: -- when he applied the first
11 time --

12 MS. EDWARDS: -- in the second paragraph.

13 MS. DeLONG: -- he admitted to it. And
14 then when he applied this time, he thought nobody
15 would know, and he didn't. So he was dishonest on
16 his application as much as anything.

17 MS. EDWARDS: "I do admit" -- "I admit to
18 omitting at the time" --

19 MS. DeLONG: The omission the second time
20 through, that he ever used it, I think that is why.

21 MS. EDWARDS: (Inaudible cross-talk.)

22 MS. COE: It's in the polygraph summary
23 phase. Item 1 says: "Honesty, falsification. The
24 applicant admitted to omitting his cocaine use on

1 the PHS prior to his preinterview."

2 MS. EDWARDS: Okay. I'm good. Okay.

3 All right.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: And they're also --

5 they just completed --

6 MS. DeLONG: Usually if they lie on the
7 application, it doesn't even matter. Is that right?

8 MS. EDWARDS: The language he's using, I
9 mean, it doesn't say 2012.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. But on the
11 summary, there is the language --

12 MS. EDWARDS: There's different language.
13 You know, how many parties of -- Yeah. Okay.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

15 Then, with that, Eric Rodriguez, do not
16 reinstate.

17 With that, we have completed the agenda,
18 and we are adjourned. Thank you.

19 MS. EDWARDS: Okay. Thank you.

20 - - -

21 And, thereupon, the meeting was
22 concluded at approximately 12:54 p.m.

23 - - -

24

1

2

3

4

5

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 24th day of February, 2020, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 12:54 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date