

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION  
HEARING MINUTES**

**Thursday, May 21, 2020**

**4:00 p.m.**

**111 North Front Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 204**

**Commissioners Present:** Jackie Barton, Steward Gibboney, Clyde Henry (Chairperson), Joseph McCabe, Erin Prosser

**Commissioners Absent:**

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck, James Goodman, Lara Baker-Moorish

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:00 p.m.
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Thursday, June 11, 2020 – Virtual Hearing via Webex
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – 4:00 p.m., Thursday, June 18, 2020 – Virtual Hearing via Webex
- IV. SWEAR IN OF STAFF (no staff present)
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES, Thursday, February 20, 2020.  
MOTION: Barton/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS – The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Prosser/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**1. HR-20-05-011**

**1478 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Elaine Paris (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application # HR-20-05-011, 1478 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

**Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof**

- Remove all slate on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.



- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing asphalt shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) "Estate Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

**2. HR-20-05-014**

**100 Arcadia Avenue**

**Marous Brothers Construction (Applicant)**

**North High School/Individually Listed Property**

**Columbus City Schools (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application # HR-20-05-014, 100 Arcadia Avenue, North High School/Individually Listed Property, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Installation of a pair of Chillers at rear of building. Associated piping to be run at ground level.
- Convert a portion of the existing walks from brick pavers to concrete, and repair of paver walks to remain
- Repair existing concrete walks, curbs, ramp, and stairs.
- Repair existing stone stair treads and stringers (rebuild, clean, & re-grout).
- Clean masonry fence and replace damaged and missing bricks with salvaged brick pavers.
- Install railings at exterior stairs and ramps.
- Replace existing concrete accessible side walk ramp to meet City of Columbus standards.
- Remove barbed wire at top of existing fence. Existing fence to remain intact with only selective fence removal in limited areas.
- Relocation & reduction of existing bleachers.
- Modification & repair (reseeding/ regrading) of existing athletic field for continued use.
- Painting of existing flag pole bases to remain.
- In select areas, where foundation walls are exposed, limited waterproofing and regrading of adjacent landscape will be performed.
- Grind a pair of exiting tree stumps to below grade, cover with topsoil, and seed areas.

MOTION: McCabe/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**3. HR-20-02-008**

**667 Linwood Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**EZ Oro/ Erez Hagiel (Applicant), EZ Properties LLC (Owner)**

*Following presentation of the staff report, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # HR-20-02-008, 667 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, in regard to a new dormer that was built prior to review and approval, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 18, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Barton/McCabe (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**4. HR-20-03-006**

**565 East Town Street**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Charles E. Eitel/ Deborah Thompson (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the attorney for the applicants, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application # HR-20-03-006, 565 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Heat Pump Units

- Retain the three (3) Mitsubishi MXZ series heat pump outdoor units, as installed.
- The PVC covers are to be painted to match the existing brick, or switched out with PVC covers of a brick color, to match existing brick.

MOTION: Gibboney/Barton (5-0-0) APPROVED

**5. HR-20-03-014 (CONCEPTUAL)**

**530 E Rich Street**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Schiff Capital (Applicant) Michael Schiff (Owner)**

Demolition

- Proposed demolition of portions of rear sections of both houses and the connector between the houses.
- Demolition of the concrete block addition and the two garages.

Renovation and Construct New Rear Addition

- Renovation of the two historic houses.
- Construct new rear addition with 30 dwelling units.
- Exterior materials to include brick and stone.
- New structure to be four stories with a loft.
- Site to include 30 parking spaces.

*Following presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Henry opened the discussion and Commission members offered comments to the applicants:*

Commissioner Comments

Commissioner Gibboney:

- The proposed design for the addition is distinguished from the existing buildings, but consider using a softer color palette to make the addition “fade away.”
- The historic structures should be the most important element of the project.

Commissioner Henry:

- Also has concerns about the color. Consider a less contrasting color.
- Has concerns about the overhangs, as proposed. The overhangs should be deeper to match neighborhood buildings.

Commissioner Prosser:

- The historic buildings should be at the forefront.
- Has concerns about the whiteness of the gable. It has a suburban feel. Try to make it less prominent.
- Agrees that the overhangs need to be extended.

Commissioner McCabe:

- The new construction needs to be compatible with the neighborhood along the alley as well as along the street.
- The new construction should fade away behind the historic houses.

Commissioner Barton:

- The new construction feels very suburban for this neighborhood.
- Has concerns about the lack of eaves and the flatness of the façade.
- Agrees it should fade away behind the historic buildings.
- Pleased to see two historic buildings restored.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**6. HR-20-03-013**

**62 W. Beechwold Boulevard**

**Old Beechwold Historic District**

**Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, this application was moved from Conceptual Review to New Application. The following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approve Application # HR-20-03-013, 62 W. Beechwold Boulevard , Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Enclose Existing Garage

- Enclose existing garage door opening on rear/north elevation.
- Remove existing overhead door, and infill with new windows with wood panel below, per the submitted site plan.
- The door on the west elevation would be removed and infilled with a new window to match the existing.

Construct New Detached Garage

- Construct a new 2-car garage measuring 24'x22'.
- North and west elevations to be siding with stone on the south and east elevations, per submitted elevations.
- Final details, drawings, and product cut sheets to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

**7. HR-20-05-012**

**373-375 West Rich Street**

**Lubal Manufacturing/Individually Listed Property**

**CASTO (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the Applicants and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # HR-20-05-012, 373-375 West Rich Street, Lubal Manufacturing/Individually Listed Property, in regard to rehabilitation of the two buildings, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 18, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review. The Commission recommends a special meeting to be scheduled prior to the June 18<sup>th</sup> hearing, if possible.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission is excited for the buildings to be provided a new life and use.
- Much of what is being proposed demonstrates creative solutions.

- Attempts should be made to preserve the entire façade of 373 W. Rich Street. Creative solutions should be sought.
- More wood should be preserved on the façade.
- The massing of 373 W. Rich Street should be preserved in some manner. Need to present an acknowledgement of the mass and form, not necessarily four walls.
- Infilling of window and door openings does not meet the Columbus Register Guidelines.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**8. HR-20-03-011**

**1221 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Scott Baker (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approval Application # HR-20-03-011, 1221 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Porch Repair

- Remove and replace damaged rafters and trim, as needed.
- Remove front porch columns, and install new columns.
- Existing rosettes on the neck of the capitals to be retained and reused, or matched with new rosettes to match existing as closely as possible.
- Final details and cut sheets to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Existing first and second story porch railings to be retained, and repaired, as needed. Any replacement materials to match existing.
- Paint all wood to match the existing color scheme.

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (5-0-0) APPROVED

**9. HR-20-05-015**

**517 Park Street / AC Hotel**

**North Market Historic District**

**Jones Sign Co. Inc. (Applicant)**

**Park & Spruce Acquisitions, LLC (Owner)**

*Following presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Continue Application # HR-20-05-015, 517 Park Street / AC Hotel, North Market Historic District, in regard to new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 18, 2020 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: McCabe/ Barton (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**10. HR-20-03-010**

**673 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**675 Champion Avenue Trust/Tim Dye (Applicant)**

*Application withdrawn by Applicant prior to the May 21<sup>st</sup> HRC hearing.*

**11. HR-20-05-013**

**935 East Broad Street**

**18<sup>th</sup> & East Broad Street Historic District**

**Madeline Pesavento/Women's Care Centers (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approval Application # HR-20-05-013, 935 East Broad Street, 18<sup>th</sup> & East Broad Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Signage

- Install one (1) new ground sign on the front lawn.
- Sign to be double-sided aluminum, measuring a maximum of 48" x 48".
- Sign to include business name, logo, address, and general services provided.

Note: A larger sign is being approved because the location along a four-lane street is auto-oriented as well as pedestrian-oriented.

MOTION: Prosser/Gibboney (5-0-0) APPROVED

**12. HR-20-05-016**

**624 Oakwood Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Raymond & Kari Kinczyk (Owners)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approval Application # HR-20-05-016, 624 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Garage

- Build new, 24' x 24', frame garage, per submitted drawings.
- Cladding to be Restoration Smooth vinyl siding, with 1x4 wood trim.
- Garage to have two (2) overhead garage doors on alley side, and one (1) 9' overhead garage door facing onto rear yard.
- One pedestrian door to face onto rear yard, per submitted cut sheet.
- Shingles to be Owens Corning 3-tab, "Estate Gray."
- Install 10 x 10 concrete pad on west side of the garage.

MOTION: Gibboney/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

**13. HR-20-05-017**

**59 East Oakland Avenue**

**Northwood Park Historic District**

**Lee J. Rumora/Architect (Applicant)**

*Following presentation by the applicant, and additional discussion and review, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded, with the following clarifications, as indicated.*

Approval Application # HR-20-05-017, 59 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

New Dormer

- Install new dormer on west slope of roof to provide access to finished third floor space.
- Soffit to be tongue-and-groove wood. Dormer cheeks to include 4" wood siding with wood corner boards to match existing.
- Two (2) six-over-one, double-hung sash windows to match façade dormer. Window cut sheet to be submitted.

MOTION: McCabe/Prosser (5-0-0) APPROVED

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **HR-20-05-001**

**696 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Iroabuchi Arum (Applicant)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-001, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

New Pergola

- Install a new 14' x 10' concrete patio in rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Install a new, cedar pergola on the concrete slab, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.

• **HR-20-05-002**

**734 South Champion Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Randy Youkum (Applicant)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-002, 734 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Windows (Full Frame Replacement)

- Remove non-original, windows on the third floor of the west and south elevations
- Remove the entire existing windows to the studs/rough opening, (sashes, jambs, exterior sill and brick mold).
- Install a complete new window (sashes, jambs, and exterior sill and brick mold).
- New windows to be Trimline aluminum-clad wood, per the submitted window schedule dated March 26, 2020.
- All window exteriors to be white to match existing. All trim to be wood flat stock, painted white to match existing. Windows on south elevation to retain existing original trim.

Restore Window Opening

- Restore the original window opening on the front/west elevation of the bay that is located on the south elevation of the house.
- Install new Trimline double-hung window, per the submitted window schedule.
- Window exterior to be white. Trim to be white, wood flat stock with decorative cornice and sill to match existing windows.

Note: Restoration of the window opening is based on a ca. 1925 photo of the house.

Replace Shakes in Gables

- Remove cedar shake shingles on the west facing gables and the south facing gable and replace with decorative cut cedar shingles.
- New shingles to be round and arrow style, patterned to match the two existing areas of the house.
- Gables will be painted Sherwin Williams "Rookwood Antique Gold" (SW 2614).

• **HR-20-05-003**

**230 W. Royal Forest Blvd.**

**Old Beechwold Historic District**

**Cox Tree Service (Applicant)**

**Nancy Morcos (Owner)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-003, 230 W. Royal Forest Blvd., Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Tree Removal

- To avoid damage to property and to insure public safety, remove the existing, mature Beech tree (*Fagus Grandifolia*) located in the rear yard, per the submitted photos and arborist's report.
- The approximately 80 ft. tall tree has major stem defect (stem rot) and currently leans towards house.
- A new Beech tree or other native species is to be planted in an appropriate location on the property.

• **HR-20-05-004**

**620 East Town Street**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Greg Kitzmiller/Great Impressions Signs and Designs (Applicant)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-004, 620 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

New Ground Sign

- Install one (1) new ground sign on the front lawn of the apartment building, per the submitted photos and shop drawing.
- Double-faced ¾" MDO sign to measure 30" high x 48" wide.
- Sign face to be painted "White" with "Black" vinyl lettering.
- Two 4 x 4, pressure treated posts to be painted "White."
- Post covers and post caps to be PVC.
- Top of posts not to extend more than 5' above grade.

- **HR-20-05-005**  
**711 South Ohio Avenue** **Old Oaks Historic District**  
**Jones Home Transformations (Applicant)**  
Approve Application HR-20-05-005, 711 South Ohio Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.  
Parking Pad
  - Remove existing concrete parking pad.
  - Add new parking pad to rear (west) of property to be accessed off of Granger Alley.
  - Parking pad will be 21' by 20' poured concrete with, per submitted site plan.
  
- **HR-20-05-006**  
**1053 Bryden Road** **Bryden Road Historic District**  
**Jennifer Moore (Applicant)**  
Approve Application HR-20-05-006, 1053 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.  
Exterior Painting
  - Prepare all previously painted exterior masonry surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
  - Previously painted brick walls to be Sherwin Williams (SW6002) "Essential Gray."
  - Trim (previously painted stone window/door sills, lintels, and wood trim) to be darker gray with white and dark blue/gray accents. Final paint color chips to be submitted for HPO file.
  - Wood porch columns and railings to be "White" to match existing.
  
- **HR-20-05-007**  
**1251 Bryden Road** **Bryden Road Historic District**  
**Central Community House (Applicant)**  
Approve Application HR-20-05-007, 1251 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.  
Install Cluster Mailbox
  - Install a new cluster mailbox adjacent to the front service sidewalk, per the submitted photos, sketch plan, and product cut sheet.
  - Color to be "Dark Bronze."
  
- **HR-20-05-008**  
**777 Kimball Place** **Old Oaks Historic District**  
**Steve Baldwin (Applicant)** **ASB Property Group, LLC./Steve Baldwin (Owner)**  
Approve Application HR-20-05-008, 777 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.  
Repair Rear Sleeping Porch
  - Remove existing, non-original, wood support posts.
  - Install new 2" x 12" pressure treated header boards lag bolted to new 8"x8" posts, per submitted drawings.
  - Add horizontal boards on the exterior of the existing porch railings, to cover the top and bottom of the balusters.
  - Paint colors for 2<sup>nd</sup> floor sleeping porch to be "Colonial White" with (SW6992) "Inkwell" trim. Posts and railings to be painted "Colonial White."Exterior Painting/House
  - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
  - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.



- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color for wood trim to be (SW6992) "Inkwell."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Install New Concrete Steps

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete front porch steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete steps in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• **HR-20-05-009**

**762 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Ellen Chung (Owner)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-009, 762 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Replace Multi-Lite Doors

- Remove the existing, wood, multi-lite double doors on the rear of the historic garage addition, per submitted photos.
- New doors to be Pella, composite, three-quarter lite, simulated divided lite doors with sidelites, per submitted product cut sheet.

Note: The existing doors are fitted within the original automobile door openings.

• **HR-20-05-010**

**765 Bryden Road**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Zane M. Liston, Sr. (Applicant)**

Approve Application HR-20-05-010, 765 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted with any/all clarifications, as noted.

Privacy Fence

- Install new privacy fence on east side and rear of house, per the submitted photos and site plan.
- Fence to be of similar design and construction as neighboring fence, per submitted photos.
- Maximum 72" height, constructed of pressure treated lumber.
- Location to be three feet inside property line along Allen Ave and approximately thirty feet inside rear property line.
- Existing mature trees and shrubs on Allen Avenue will remain.

Note: West side of property has existing privacy fence owned by neighboring property.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURN**

MOTION: Gibboney/McCabe (4-0-0) ADDOURNED (5:59 p.m.)