

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Larry Price

4 PRESENTERS:

5 Beth Dyke
6 Tammy Rollins
7 Brenda Sobieck
8 Charday Litzy-Taylor

9 - - -

10 ALSO PRESENT VIA WEBEX:

11 Wendy Brinnon
12 Jaasiel Rubeck
13 Amy DeLong
14 Carol Lagemann

15 - - -

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 - - -

3 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 14th day of
4 December, 2020, the Municipal Civil Service
5 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.
6 Pettigrew, President. And the parties appearing in
7 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,
8 the following proceedings were had:

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. I will
10 call to order the City of Columbus, Ohio, Municipal
11 Civil Service Commission meeting for the December
12 month of 2020. We will be following the printed
13 agenda. And the first item on our agenda is review
14 and approval of the minutes from the November 16,
15 2020, regular meeting.

16 MR. PRICE: I move we approve the minutes
17 from the November 16, 2020, regular meeting.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

19 All in favor say, "Aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

22 The second item is a Trial Board
23 recommendation. Ms. Sobieck, you're going to give us
24 a recommendation, which is a review and approval of

1 the findings and recommendation of a Trial Board
2 hearing held on Monday, October 19, 2020, at
3 10:00 a.m., Freda Malone versus Columbus City
4 Schools, bus driver, discharged and Appeal
5 No. 20-BA-0002.

6 MS. SOBIECK: At this Trial Board hearing,
7 the board did recommend overturning the termination,
8 so we recommend that you accept that recommendation
9 that we made to the full commission.

10 MR. PRICE: I move we approve the findings
11 and recommendations of the Trial Board hearing held
12 on Monday, October, 19, 2020, at 10:00 a.m., Freda
13 Malone versus Columbus City Schools, bus driver,
14 discharged, Appeal No. 20-BA-0002.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

16 All in favor say, "Aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

19 We have the -- I guess it would be a good
20 time to add to the record something that's not on the
21 agenda. But since, Ms. Sobieck, you just
22 participated: There will be a printed letter that
23 you'll receive. And on behalf of the entire
24 Commission staff and the many employees of the City

5

1 of Columbus and myself, I want to take this moment to
2 officially recognize you for your service and
3 important contribution to the work of the Civil
4 Service Commission for these past 29 years.

5 Although typically completed without great
6 fanfare and awareness by most, the service the
7 Commission provides to the City organization as a
8 whole and the employees individually is critical to
9 ensuring the City's employment process is fair,
10 objective, consistent and accessible. As you know,
11 providing this caliber of service often requires a
12 Herculean effort by the many involved in this effort.

13 As such, please accept our thanks and
14 gratitude for the countless hours you have invested
15 over the years of public service and safety
16 examination development, background reviews,
17 administration, managing every level of safety,
18 certification and selection process, trial boards and
19 generally helping to make this organization the top
20 tier leader that it is. We couldn't have done it
21 without you.

22 As you retire at the end of this month,
23 may this and the next effort in your life be exciting
24 and certainly lead only to good things. We're

1 wishing you all the best, and thank you again for
2 your service. The letter will be included in your
3 file.

4 And for everyone, if you agree, say,
5 "Thank you, Brenda."

6 MR. PRICE: Thank you, Brenda.

7 MS. DYKE: Thanks Brenda.

8 MS. SOBIECK: Thanks, Brenda.

9 (Crosstalk.)

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I don't understand
11 the violation of child labor laws. You must have
12 been about 11 when you started.

13 MS. SOBIECK: That's actually my joke. I
14 usually say I was 12 when I started. Retiring sounds
15 too old to me.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Right. Well, thank
17 you.

18 Item No. 5 is request of the Civil Service
19 Commission staff on behalf of Columbus City Schools
20 to create --

21 MR. PRICE: Mr. Chairman, if I may, are we
22 skipping item No. 4?

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Oh, I'm sorry. That
24 was the reason. Yes.

7

1 Item No. 4: Request for the Civil Service
2 Commission staff to extend the current eligible list
3 for 16 classifications as identified on the attached
4 list.

5 MS. BRINNON: Grady, do you have the
6 correct agenda up?

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Did I miss it? I'm
8 sorry. I have it in the notebook. All right.

9 The next item should be the review and
10 approval of the 2021 Civil Service Commission
11 Hearing/Trial Board meeting schedule.

12 MR. PRICE: That's why we make a good
13 combination. I like your thinking.

14 I move we approve the 2021 Civil Service
15 Commission Hearing/Trial Board meeting calendar.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

17 All in favor say, "Aye."

18 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's approved.

20 Item No. 5 is the request of the Civil
21 Service Commission staff to reallocate designated
22 positions currently classified as Fleet Attendant,
23 Job Code 3744, to Fleet Attendant CDL, Job Code 3745
24 and to allow the affected employees to retain their

1 current classification status and seniority.

2 MS. ROLLINS: I'm Tammy Rollins, personnel
3 manager. This is a request to reallocate certain
4 positions in the Fleet Attendant classification to
5 the recently created Fleet Attendant CDL. In all
6 instances, the employees subject to this personnel
7 action have acquired the Commercial Driver's License
8 that allows them to legally drive the City's shuttle
9 buses.

10 This request to create this specialized
11 classification was in response to the department's
12 need to purchase and ultimately replace their fleet
13 of shuttle buses with ones that are ADA complaint.
14 The new ADA complaint buses were larger than the
15 current shuttle buses that had been driven, requiring
16 a CDL licensure in order to legally operate the
17 buses.

18 As we were creating this new
19 classification that would require the CDL, it was
20 discussed about a way to incentivize the employees to
21 go out and voluntarily get the CDL so that they would
22 be able to drive these buses and enable the
23 department to move forward seamlessly with their
24 shuttle plans as those vehicles became part of their

1 fleet. The proposed incentive would allow employees
2 who opted to voluntarily get the license to be
3 reallocated to the new class while keeping their
4 current seniority and status. So with the exception
5 of the larger vehicles that were being purchased, the
6 job itself remains the same.

7 The proposed incentive offers the employee
8 the ability to be reclassified to a higher class
9 without taking the civil service exam, without
10 serving a new probationary period, since all of these
11 particular employees had previously completed the
12 probationary period, and keeping their job seniority.
13 This was to be a one-time offer made to the current
14 Fleet Attendant employees that would provide both a
15 great benefit to both the employees and to the
16 department.

17 We are happy to say that we did have three
18 employees who did go out and voluntarily get the CDL.
19 These three employees are Jay Rogers, Jason Holt and
20 Mark Wilson. It is therefore requested that these
21 three employees be reallocated to the Fleet Attendant
22 CDL job classification and that these three employees
23 be allowed to retain their classification status and
24 seniority.

1 MR. PRICE: I move to reallocate
2 designated positions currently classified as Fleet
3 Attendant to Fleet Attendant CDL and to allow the
4 affected employees to retain their current
5 classification status and seniority.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

7 All in favor say, "Aye."

8 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

10 Item No. 6 is a request of the Civil
11 Service Commission staff on behalf of the City of
12 Columbus schools to revise the specification for the
13 classification Maintenance Service Coordinator and
14 retitle it to read Maintenance Service Supervisor,
15 Job Code 5615.

16 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Hi. Charday
17 Litzy-Taylor, personnel analyst with the Commission.
18 This action was initiated at the request of Columbus
19 City Schools. The district expressed a need for
20 revisions to the specification due to operational
21 changes. It is proposed that the classification be
22 retitled to read Maintenance Service Supervisor,
23 which more appropriately describes the primary
24 function of the classification moving forward. The

11

1 proposed definition reads as follows: "Under general
2 direction is responsible for the supervision of staff
3 and activities associated with the integrated
4 workplace management system for facility service
5 request."

6 Revisions are proposed to the examples of
7 work section to better reflect the duties associated
8 with the classification. Currently the minimum
9 qualifications require a bachelor's degree and three
10 years of experience in facilities maintenance
11 management. The proposed minimum qualifications
12 would require five years of experience working in
13 facilities maintenance or using facilities work order
14 management software. Additional post secondary
15 education may substitute for up to three years of the
16 required experience on a year-for-year basis.

17 As proposed, the minimum qualifications
18 provide a pathway for incumbents working in the
19 maintenance service representative classification to
20 qualify. Employees serving in this qualification
21 will occasionally need to drive a district owned
22 vehicle to complete assignments; therefore, it is
23 also recommended that a valid motor vehicle
24 operator's license be required.

1 One statement has been added to the
2 knowledge, skills and ability section. No other
3 changes are proposed at this time. It is therefore
4 recommended that the classification Maintenance
5 Service Coordinator be revised and retitled to read
6 Maintenance Service Supervisor as proposed.

7 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
8 specification for the classification Maintenance
9 Service Coordinator and retitle it to read
10 Maintenance Service Supervisor.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I second that
12 motion.

13 All in favor say, "Aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

16 Items 7 through 12 will be joined together
17 since they all are involved with no -- no revision of
18 the specifications under consideration.

19 Item No. 7: Request of the Civil Service
20 Commission staff to approve the specification review
21 for the classification Senior Executive Assistant U
22 with no revisions.

23 Item 8 is for the classification Executive
24 Assistant II with no revision. The ninth is the

13

1 classification Executive Assistant to the Mayor with
2 no revision.

3 10 is the IT Technical Support Manager
4 with no revision.

5 11 is the classification Executive
6 Assistant I with no revision.

7 And 12 is the classification of Automotive
8 Mechanic with no revision.

9 MS. DYKE: Hello. Beth Dyke, personnel
10 analyst with the Civil Service staff. The review of
11 the classifications for items Nos. 7 through 12 is
12 part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to
13 review all classifications every five years. Based
14 on feedback received, it was determined that the
15 current specifications still accurately reflect the
16 work being performed. It is recommended that the
17 specifications be approved with no revisions.

18 MR. PRICE: I move to approve the
19 specification review for the classification Senior
20 Executive Assistant Unclassified with no revisions.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second. I'm sorry.
22 You're going to go through them. I'm sorry.

23 MR. PRICE: Whichever way you want to. I
24 want to be --

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Go ahead. We need
2 them for the record. We need all of them for the
3 record.

4 MR. PRICE: I move to approve the
5 specification review for the classification Senior
6 Executive Assistant Unclassified with no revisions.

7 No. 8: I move to approve the
8 specification review for the classification Executive
9 Assistant II Unclassified with no revisions.

10 No. 9: I move to approve the
11 specification review for the Classification Executive
12 Assistant to the Mayor Unclassified with no
13 revisions.

14 No. 10: I move to approve the
15 specification review for the classification IT
16 Technical Support Manager with no revisions.

17 No. 11: I move to approve the
18 specification review for the classification Executive
19 Assistant I Unclassified with no revisions.

20 No. 12: I move to approve the
21 specification review for the classification of
22 Automotive Mechanic with no revisions. That's it.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second those -- the
24 motion.

1 And all in favor say, "Aye."

2 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

4 Item No. 13 is a request of the Civil
5 Service Commission staff to revise a specification
6 for the classification Executive Assistant to the
7 City Attorney Unclassified, Job Code 0787.

8 MS. DYKE: Hello. Beth Dyke, personnel
9 analyst with the Civil Service staff. The review of
10 this classification is part of the Civil Service
11 Commission's effort to review all classifications
12 every five years where applicable. Throughout the
13 specification, it is proposed to revise the reference
14 to "City Attorney Office" so that it now reads "City
15 Attorney's Office." Within the examples of work
16 section, it is proposed to add the word "the" within
17 an existing statement so that the statement reads
18 clearly.

19 There are no other proposed revisions at
20 this time. It is therefore recommended that the
21 revisions for the specification be approved as
22 proposed.

23 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
24 specification for the classification Executive

1 Assistant to the City Attorney Unclassified.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

3 All in favor say, "Aye."

4 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It's passed.

6 Item No. 14 is a request of the Civil
7 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
8 for the classification Civil Service Commission
9 Executive Director Secretary Unclassified, Job Code
10 0010.

11 MS. ROLLINS: Tammy Rollins. This
12 classification was on the five year schedule. Based
13 on this review, staff is recommending that the
14 specification be revised to reflect the renaming of
15 the Restoration Academy to The Edge Program. The
16 mission of this program, which is largely the same
17 program except for the renaming, and has the same
18 commission involvement as previously. This is the
19 only change proposed for this specification at this
20 time.

21 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
22 specification for the classification Civil Service
23 Commission Executive Director Secretary Unclassified.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

1 All in favor say, "Aye."

2 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

4 Item No. 15 is a request of the Civil
5 Service Commission staff to revise a specification
6 for the classification Assistant Director Fiscal
7 Unclassified, Job Code 0075.

8 MS. ROLLINS: The proposed revision before
9 you today is proposed to expand the use of this
10 classification to also include The Department of
11 Finance and Management. Currently the classification
12 is only used in Public Utilities and Public Service.
13 However, the Department of Finance and Management
14 represents the City's financial hub and authority.
15 Finance and Management provides the oversight and
16 direction to all other City departments on their
17 fiscal and financial matters.

18 Given the size and scope within the
19 finance and management use of this classification in
20 that department would be on par with its current use
21 in the departments of Public Utilities and Public
22 Service. It's therefore requested that this class be
23 revised as proposed to expand its use.

24 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the

1 specification for the classification Assistant
2 Director Fiscal Unclassified.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Second.

4 All in favor say, "Aye."

5 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

7 MS. ROLLINS: Thank you.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm sorry?

9 MS. ROLLINS: I was just thanking you.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

11 Item No. 16: No residency hearing reviews
12 are submitted.

13 Item No. 17: Background removals. The
14 background removal of Joseph Harvey, applicant
15 removed post examination result will be
16 reinstatement. We have no further -- no
17 administrative or jurisdictional reviews. And with
18 that we've completed the agenda, and we will be
19 adjourned until our January meeting.

20 Commissioner Price, if you can stay on
21 after the meeting is officially terminated, we can
22 deal with Director DeLong and see if there's any
23 other issues we need to prepare for.

24 MR. PRICE: Okay.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: With that, we are
2 officially adjourned.

3 - - -

4 And, thereupon, the meeting was adjourned
5 at 12:50 p.m.

6 - - -

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is
a true, correct and complete written transcript of
the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the
14th day of December, 2020, and transcribed from my
stenographic notes.

MARILYN K. MARTIN
Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio
and Registered Professional Reporter.

My Commission Expires October 15, 2021.

The Commissioners adjourned the special meeting at 12:50 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, President

Date