

1

1                   BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS  
2                   MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3   - - -

4       In the matter of:

5   Regular Meeting

6   - - -

7   Grady L. Pettigrew,

8   President, Presiding

9   - - -

10                   TRANSCRIPT OF VIDEOCONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

11   - - -

12   Monday, February 22, 2021  
13   12:35 p.m.  
  (Via WebEx)

14   - - -

15   MARILYN K. MARTIN, RPR

16   REGISTERED PROFESSIONAL REPORTER

17   - - -

18

19

20

21

22

23   ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.  
  1421 West Third Avenue  
  Columbus, Ohio 43212  
24   (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President  
3 Larry Price  
4 Jennifer Lynch

4 PRESENTERS:

5 Beth Dyke  
6 Tammy Rollins  
7 Charday Litzy-Taylor  
8 Laura Hausman  
9 Jennifer Hutchinson  
10 Michael Eccard  
11 Elizabeth Reed

9 - - -

10 ALSO PRESENT VIA WEBEX:

11 C. Amy DeLong  
12 Wendy Brinnon  
13 Jaasiel Rubeck  
14 Carol Lagemann  
15 Charday Litzy-Taylor  
16 Jennifer Shea  
17 Hugh Williams  
18 Bryan Turner

15 - - -

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1 P R O C E E D I N G S

2 - - -

3 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 22nd day of  
4 February, 2021, the Municipal Civil Service  
5 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.  
6 Pettigrew, President. And the parties appearing in  
7 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,  
8 the following proceedings were had:

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. I'll  
10 call to order the City of Columbus Municipal Civil  
11 Service regular meeting for February 22, 2021. We  
12 will be following the published agenda. And the  
13 first item on the agenda is review and approval of  
14 the minutes of the January 25, 2021, regular meeting.

15 MR. PRICE: I move that we approve the  
16 minutes from the January 25, 2021, regular meeting.

17 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor say,  
19 "Aye."

20 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The minutes are  
22 approved.

23 Item No. 2: Prehearing conference reviews  
24 unsubmitted. Item three: Trial board

4

1 recommendations unsubmitted. Item No. 4: Request of  
2 the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the  
3 specification review for the classification dentist  
4 with no revisions, job code 1596.

5 MR. PRICE: Are we not having anyone give  
6 us an update on it, or do I automatically move?  
7 Normally we have somebody give us an update.

8 MS. BRINNON: Beth Dyke, are you available  
9 to give us your presentation? Beth Dyke? Beth, can  
10 you hear us?

11 MS. DYKE: I'm sorry to interrupt. I  
12 can't hear anything at all.

13 MS. BRINNON: Yes.

14 MS. DYKE: Okay. I can present if you  
15 guys can hear me. This is Beth Dyke, personnel  
16 analyst with the Civil Service Commission staff. The  
17 review of this classification is part of the Civil  
18 Service Commission's best effort to review all  
19 classifications every five years. Based on feedback  
20 received, it was determined that the current  
21 specification still accurately reflects the work  
22 being performed. It is recommended that the  
23 specification be approved with no revision.

24 MR. PRICE: I move that we approve the

5

1 request of the Civil Service Commission staff to  
2 approve the specification review for the  
3 classification dentist with no revisions.

4 MS. LYNCH: I second the motion.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor say,  
6 "Aye."

7 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

9 Item five: We have no residency hearing  
10 reviews unsubmitted. Background removals: The only  
11 background removal is for Douglas Winks. And the  
12 recommendation that the Commission is adopting is do  
13 not reinstate.

14 And as to item No. 7 of the administrative  
15 jurisdictional reviews, the letter for Reginald  
16 Fagain is approved as submitted.

17 And with that, we can move to the yearly  
18 review -- or the review of the 2020 year. As to each  
19 reporting staff member, if you'll just simply  
20 identify yourself and the section that you're  
21 reporting on, we'll move from one to the other,  
22 starting with Tammy.

23 MS. ROLLINS: Good morning. I'm Tammy  
24 Rollins. I am the manager of the applicant employee

6

1 services unit which covers the personnel  
2 certification verification and then also the  
3 classification analysts. And I think, you know,  
4 looking back at 2020, I do think it's one for the  
5 record books. I'm happy to report we all survived  
6 and made it into 2021, and fingers crossed that 2021  
7 will be a little better for everyone.

8 Hiring in the city I will say for 2020 was  
9 very steady. There wasn't a stop. There wasn't  
10 really a slowdown. Probably most notable was that  
11 the hiring shifted.

12 We had certain departments that were very  
13 heavily needing to hire employees for the pandemic,  
14 especially in the health department, which  
15 immediately jumped into hiring hundreds of contact  
16 tracers. And now they're slowly shifting into having  
17 nurses available for vaccine clinics.

18 So there's definitely a noticeable shift  
19 in where the hiring took place, but the actual  
20 numbers themselves didn't feel like there was much of  
21 a decrease. The public utilities and public service  
22 are probably No. 2 and No. 3 departments in the  
23 hiring that was noticed.

24 The hiring -- I mean, just to put it in

7

1 perspective, in 2020 we hired, the City, 1,400  
2 employees. 1,152 of those employees were after the  
3 state of emergency. 956 of those employees were  
4 brand new to the City. So if each of those hires and  
5 appointments that were taking place -- I mean, that  
6 is job postings and minimum qualification reviews,  
7 backgrounds, the fingerprints to ensure that, you  
8 know, backgrounds were -- were good for employees.  
9 Paperwork was reviewed. Then, of course, all of that  
10 paperwork and transactions, you know, also needed to  
11 be filed.

12 This was -- You know, our schedule was  
13 largely remote and in person; so we had, you know, a  
14 variable schedule with each of our staff.

15 Departments: The HR staff also had very much of a  
16 variable schedule where they were in person certain  
17 days and remote. So this was massive coordination  
18 effort, just making sure that we -- everyone had the  
19 paperwork and the information to ensure that our  
20 hires were onboarded and, you know, ready for work  
21 when they needed to be there.

22 But I also want to say there was a massive  
23 communication. So, I mean, we couldn't have done it  
24 without coordination and just really being able to

8

1 communicate with the department staff so that  
2 everyone had the information they needed to do the  
3 work.

4 We also had, in 2020, 783 terminations;  
5 and 600 of that was post the state of emergency.  
6 And, again, that's really just the paperwork. But  
7 it's just to put -- you know, just the amount of  
8 paperwork that was flowing in because of the nature  
9 of being remote, I mean, a lot of that is -- you  
10 know, we were getting -- you know, scans of copies  
11 and copies of copies, and then we were getting the  
12 originals. So it was crazy; but we are here to talk  
13 about it, and hopefully no year will be as  
14 challenging as last year.

15 With regards to the class reviews, the  
16 analysts were able to complete 139 class reviews last  
17 year, which was really great because we were able to  
18 keep our benchmark where our class plan is 100  
19 percent up to date. So going into 2021 we are 100  
20 percent up to date. We completed 85 compliance  
21 reviews, six position audits and five class action  
22 requests.

23 And then still on top of all this,  
24 probably the biggest, the most time consuming,

9

1 probably the most important activity in all of 2020  
2 was we were implementing a new payroll system, which  
3 was Dayforce. We went live with Dayforce on  
4 September 20, 2020, a day that will -- has made its  
5 mark in my brain. I will never forget 9/20/2021.  
6 And, you know, that was implementation. Somehow we  
7 did this in less than a year, I mean, and it was  
8 crazy.

9 For some of you: Our prior payroll system  
10 had been implemented in the 1980s, so we had a ton of  
11 data that was just having to be converted into the  
12 new system. This was also -- It was important to  
13 review all of our processes and try to fit them into  
14 the Dayforce system, which was an out of the box, but  
15 it was comparable.

16 But it was really -- You know, we had to  
17 look at our processes and know which of our processes  
18 could be altered to make the processing more in line  
19 with Dayforce. And then a lot of our processes are  
20 grounded in civic charter; they're grounded in our  
21 rules; they're grounded in the contracts, in which  
22 case those processes don't really change. And so  
23 it's, you know, kind of making Dayforce [inaudible]  
24 those processes, looking at processes that could

10

1 change and trying to make changes to those processes.

2 And like I said, we did it. I don't ever  
3 want to have to do it again. Dayforce probably isn't  
4 my favorite system on the -- in the world, but the  
5 thought of doing this again is just crazy. So I  
6 think we will figure out a way to just keep working  
7 with it. And, again, we are, like I said, moving on  
8 into 2021. And hopefully 2020 will be will become a  
9 distant memory at some point.

10 But it was a very busy year; and I'm very,  
11 very proud of the team that I had. I've told --  
12 Almost all of us at some point were involved in the  
13 Dayforce implementation. And this was hard. I can't  
14 imagine doing it with anybody else than we -- who we  
15 had on our team. In many cases, we worked weekends,  
16 we worked evenings. I mean, we were constantly in  
17 communication with each other and discovering, you  
18 know, new things like, "We can do it like this" or  
19 "See what happens."

20 So it was kind of crazy, but like I said,  
21 we did it. And glad to have that piece of it over  
22 and moving into the next chapter of, you know, just  
23 making it all good.

24 That's all that I had for my piece.

11

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, we certainly  
2 are appreciative for your Herculean effort and that  
3 of your team. Thank you so much. And we're glad  
4 that 2020 is behind us also.

5 MS. LYNCH: Tammy, it's extremely  
6 impressive. I appreciate you.

7 MS. ROLLINS: Thank you.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Commissioner Price.

9 MR. PRICE: Yes. Thank you. Again, thank  
10 you for all your hard work. We know 2020 was a  
11 challenging year. But you said there were 1,400 new  
12 hires, of which 956 were brand new. Do you have the  
13 stats in terms of how many minority and women were  
14 hired out of that 1,400? And you may not have it  
15 with you now. But --

16 MS. ROLLINS: Yeah. I have those numbers.  
17 Sure.

18 MR. PRICE: I would be interested in those  
19 numbers also.

20 MS. ROLLINS: Okay.

21 MR. PRICE: Thank you.

22 MS. ROLLINS: You're welcome.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Is Jennifer next?

24 MS. HUTCHINSON: Good afternoon. Jennifer

12

1 Hutchinson, personnel administrative manager. I  
2 oversee the nonuniform testing unit. Although 2020  
3 did not play out according to plan, we have many  
4 accomplishments to share with you.

5 Every five years we conduct a thorough job  
6 analysis and examination review on a portion of our  
7 237 tested classifications. This helps us to gain an  
8 understanding of the classification and the  
9 knowledge, skills and abilities needed to perform  
10 those jobs. We use this information to create or  
11 revise an appropriate examination for the  
12 classification. This process involves research,  
13 questionnaires, meetings and sometimes observations.

14 It was more difficult this year because we  
15 weren't able to do anything in person, so we had to  
16 do all of it via email and a lot of WebEx meetings.  
17 This year the analysts also began digging deeper in  
18 their reports and their test plans. They focused on  
19 making positive changes to examinations to reduce  
20 adverse impact. Even with the changes to our  
21 processes, we completed 35 job analysis and  
22 examination review projects.

23 Civil Service acquired a new testing  
24 program called Excelsoft. Our team learned to use

13

1 the new software program and entered over 6,000 items  
2 from our current testing bank into Excelsoft.

3           Although we had to cancel 15 recruitments  
4 and/or examinations, we administered 26 regular  
5 examinations to 869 candidates. Most of them were  
6 after the shutdown and first required the  
7 implementation of COVID-19 precautions, such as  
8 inviting fewer candidates each session, disinfecting  
9 the test center after each examination and recording  
10 instructions to reduce face-to-face contact while  
11 candidates were being seated.

12           We reviewed 5,318 applications. We tested  
13 39 Rule 6 candidates, Rule 24 administrations. We  
14 administered equipment operator II over two days  
15 during the pandemic this past summer. Since this is  
16 a performance examination, it required a lot of  
17 detailed preparations because of the COVID  
18 precautions, and it ran smoothly.

19           We administered and graded 15 Columbus  
20 City Schools examinations for 186 of their  
21 candidates, and we created an examination for  
22 Columbus City Schools. We assisted the uniform  
23 safety team with test administrations. As a result  
24 of the pandemic, more test administrators were needed

14

1 for each test, and the uniform safety test team  
2 needed our support.

3 We worked with police during their  
4 recruitment of 911 emergency dispatcher. We  
5 participated in multiple information sessions and  
6 offered candidates several open house opportunities  
7 to come in and prepare for the examination. We also  
8 extended 15 eligible lists to assist departments in  
9 hiring when large administrations were not possible.

10 And that is the nonuniform testing team  
11 summary.

12 MS. BRINNON: Thank you, Jennifer.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you. And  
14 thank you for the work you and your team has done.

15 Who is next? Laura?

16 MS. HAUSMAN: Yes. My name is Laura  
17 Hausman, and I'm the public safety team's personnel  
18 administrative manager. 2020 was a year of change  
19 for our team. We began the year developing the  
20 highly competitive two phase police commander exam.

21 Phase one is a narrative response written  
22 exam, and phase two is an oral board exam. For  
23 scoring, CSC identified and secured six police  
24 assessors from outside the state of Ohio.

15

1 Flexibility and problem solving became the name of  
2 the game for this test. As a result of COVID and the  
3 civil unrest, CSC rescheduled the first phase of this  
4 exam two times. Each time we worked with the  
5 division and the FOP to get an agreement for  
6 rescheduling.

7           Once we finally administered both phases  
8 of the exams, two COVID quarantine candidates could  
9 not test. As a result, we held a unique  
10 administration in scoring. It was no easy task to  
11 contact, schedule and coordinate the remote scoring  
12 process for these two candidates. Our staff  
13 researched how the assessors could best view the  
14 candidates' video responses remotely and all  
15 simultaneously. Our team worked through it all.

16           For all examinations, CSC staff changed  
17 procedures and testing rooms to reduce germ spread.  
18 We partnered with the Health Department for approval  
19 of our COVID practices. For the fire promotional  
20 development and police promotional scoring of exams,  
21 the CSC brought over 33 subject matter experts to  
22 Columbus on seven different occasions.

23           Obtaining this was challenging due to  
24 civil unrest and COVID impacting travel and demands

16

1 within their home cities. Each fire test development  
2 week CSC struggled to find the out-of-state personnel  
3 willing and able to travel. These challenges  
4 resulted in delays and rescheduling of fire  
5 development processes.

6 Through all of this and with the  
7 nonuniform testing team's aid, CSC conducted  
8 prequalifying testing for entry level police officer  
9 and firefighter. CSC conducted the regularly  
10 scheduled four phase police officer exam. And per  
11 the public safety service director's office request,  
12 the CSC planned and tested the fire cadets, including  
13 the firefighter physical capabilities exam setup and  
14 teardown.

15 In 2020, our team accepted 3,560  
16 applications. Of those 1,553 were prequalification  
17 applicants; 1,521 were police officer applicants; 36  
18 were fire cadet applicants; 86 were promotional  
19 police candidates; and 364 were promotional fire  
20 candidates.

21 We also began using a brand new software  
22 system for testing that's called Excelsoft. We  
23 finished the development and then administered and  
24 scored the police commander exam and the four phase

17

1 police lieutenant exam. We also developed and  
2 administered the three phase fire a battalion fire  
3 chief exam. We developed the three phase fire deputy  
4 chief exam. We developed the first two phases of the  
5 fire lieutenant and fire captain exams. We  
6 researched and located an offsite exam venue and  
7 worked through testing protocols at an offsite  
8 location during COVID conditions.

9 The public safety testing team has  
10 dedicated and worked through numerous changes to  
11 ensure the tests would happen in 2020. Although  
12 considered nonessential employees, we spent much of  
13 the year working in person at our office due to  
14 the -- due to our exams developments, confidential  
15 nature, planning and replanning, setting up and  
16 administering the exams and hosting the exam  
17 development and grading sessions. As a result of our  
18 work, we established a diverse police officer list  
19 and added diversity to our firefighters.

20 That concludes my portion.

21 MS. BRINNON: Thank you, Laura.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you. But  
23 also -- doing it the first time is the challenge, but  
24 doing it the second time has got to be an even bigger

18

1 challenge. So thank you so much.

2 We have Liz Reed next?

3 MS. REED: Yes. Good afternoon,  
4 commissioners. I'm Liz Reed, and I'm responsible for  
5 leading the two testing teams. In addition to the  
6 work that each team completed during this  
7 particularly challenging year, we also made  
8 change -- made a change that positively impacts  
9 veterans and our recruiting efforts. We led the  
10 completion of several recommendations made by the  
11 Columbus Community Safety Advisory Commission.

12 In 2019, the two test teams formed a task  
13 force with the City's veterans liaison. Through this  
14 joint effort, we proposed a rule change that the  
15 commissioners approved in 2020. This change enabled  
16 soon-to-be veterans to qualify for the City's  
17 veterans points to be added to passing test scores.

18 On January 28, 2020, the Columbus  
19 Community Safety Advisory Commission published the  
20 report which enumerated and identified  
21 recommendations to ensure the Columbus Division of  
22 Police has the best training, policies and procedures  
23 to protect and serve our entire community. The  
24 Columbus Civil Service Commission identified and

1 acted on six that were within our scope of  
2 responsibility.

3 Recommendation 36: To increase the  
4 probationary period for new recruits by starting the  
5 period later in the process, preferably upon academy  
6 graduation. Civil Service staff completed this by  
7 informing state clerks of current CSC rules that  
8 allow for extension of probationary periods for an  
9 employee who does not perform the position's regular  
10 duties for an extended period. Since police officers  
11 during the academy cannot perform the primary duties  
12 of a law enforcement officer, the rule allows for the  
13 extension of the probationary period. Starting with  
14 a 2020 June class, these new hires signed waivers to  
15 acknowledge this probationary period extension.

16 Recommendation 12: Submit all testing  
17 materials to a third party cultural relevancy and  
18 implicit bias review. The CSC worked with our test  
19 consultant who is an esteemed industrial  
20 organizational psychologist. He created a diverse  
21 team of professionals, provided training and then  
22 conducted this thorough review with every aspect of  
23 the police officer tests and applicant facing  
24 materials. They offered six reports. The CSC staff

20

1 are now working on implementing these changes before  
2 the next testing process.

3 Recommendation 13: There should be an  
4 independent audit of the recruiting, testing process  
5 included in an annual report. The CSC identified a  
6 consultant capable of this audit. We first consulted  
7 with him to create an audit plan. He is now  
8 implementing this audit to be complete by the end of  
9 this year. This audit will provide 13 reports  
10 covering all 13 portions of the selection process and  
11 the selection process as a whole.

12 Recommendation 17: Maintain trained  
13 community -- I'm sorry. Maintain trained community  
14 members on the COPE pan. COPE is the Columbus  
15 Police -- is the Columbus Oral Police Exam that  
16 assesses police officer candidates for interpersonal  
17 relations and problem solving competencies. CSC  
18 worked with public safety to select and train  
19 community evaluators who served on the evaluation  
20 boards to assess police officer candidates.

21 COPE: COPE results are the -- are 100  
22 percent of the exam score for current 2020 police  
23 officer -- police officer candidates who are on the  
24 eligible list. As a result of this, we have 51

21

1 percent diversity in the top band of this list.

2 Recommendation 16: Provide cultural  
3 competency training for those scoring the Columbus  
4 Oral Police Exam. We partnered with the department  
5 of human resources and added this training to our  
6 COPE training sessions. Community evaluators, police  
7 officers, police sergeant and CSC analysts  
8 participated in this cultural competency training as  
9 part of the overall COPE training.

10 Recommendation 15: Add points for  
11 additional language fluency, competency skill set on  
12 testing. CSC contracted with Language Testing  
13 International who provided a validation study. And  
14 CSC staff surveyed to determine which languages are  
15 encountered the most -- or encountered most often by  
16 Columbus police officers. We have the results and  
17 will offer additional points to the police officer  
18 COPE scores during the next test administration for  
19 up to nine different languages.

20 The CSC continues to work on many of the  
21 recommendations made by the CCSAC and will continue  
22 to reimagine testing programs to ensure highly  
23 diverse and qualified lists of candidates from which  
24 departments will hire.

22

1                   And that's all I have for my report.

2                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I have a couple of  
3 questions. One, you said 51 percent diversity in the  
4 top bands. What are those top bands?

5                   MS. REED: So on the police officer list,  
6 when we create that, we establish three bands. Those  
7 bands are based on the results of the COPE score. Of  
8 course all candidates have to pass the other three  
9 phases as well. So the top band are the people who  
10 scored, in this case, 90 and above on the exam.  
11 So -- And when I say -- Are you asking also what  
12 we -- how we're defining diversity?

13                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: No, I wasn't. I was  
14 interested in: Does -- Are the top bands the 90, 80,  
15 70; or are they just simply the 90?

16                   MS. REED: Yeah. So the top band would be  
17 the 90. We're actually working on renaming those.  
18 Instead of calling them 70, 80, 90, band one, two and  
19 three. So in the top band, which was formerly known  
20 as the 90 band, we have 51 percent diversity --

21                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

22                   MS. REED: -- of the police officers.

23                   PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The second question  
24 is: How many languages do they have to encounter

23

1 here in the Columbus area?

2 MS. REED: Well, in the survey, what we  
3 did was we listed every language that was mentioned  
4 in the CPD's division policies and procedures, their  
5 directives. And then we also looked at every single  
6 language that was offered by LTI and created a survey  
7 to determine and essentially ask them how often they  
8 encounter any of these -- specifically which of these  
9 languages they encounter and how often they encounter  
10 those.

11 Of those languages, all -- There was a  
12 large -- I want to say there was over or close to 100  
13 languages listed, and police officers encountered  
14 most of those languages. So it was well over 50  
15 different languages. What we did --

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I remember --

17 MS. REED: Go ahead.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I remember when  
19 Columbus City Schools reported like 132 languages in  
20 our city.

21 MS. REED: And that does not surprise me.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Clearly some of  
23 those are very small numbers. But I was just curious  
24 as to what the police officers encountered.

24

1 MS. REED: So, yes. They're encountering  
2 most of those languages. I can send the survey  
3 results if you'd like.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I would. I would.

5 MS. REED: Okay.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you. And  
7 thank your team.

8 And next, I guess, do we have -- Is it  
9 Mike Eccard? Can you hear me?

10 (Discussion held off the record.)

11 MR. ECCARD: This is Mike Eccard. I  
12 normally do face you, Commissioner Lynch and you,  
13 Commissioner Price. Howdy. But I'm an old slimy  
14 face here at the commission. I've really got to work  
15 on photoshopping or something for these videos. I'm  
16 amazed. That's why I keep it off most of the time.

17 But this is good, to have this opportunity  
18 to get with you all. And you've heard a lot of good  
19 information. I think what's evident is we have a  
20 great staff here at the Commission. We really do.  
21 And with all of the challenges that 2020 brought us,  
22 I think just from what you've heard today and seen in  
23 the last several meetings you participated in, our  
24 staff has not missed a beat in terms of the quality

25

1 and quantity of the work that they put out. We've  
2 been able to meet the needs of our various  
3 stakeholders; and that's all attributed to the staff  
4 that we have, the people certainly that you've heard  
5 from today and many others in our various activities.

6 So Amy and I couldn't be more proud. We  
7 talk about that often. We consider ourselves truly  
8 blessed to have the people that we have on staff.  
9 And I look forward to a time where especially you,  
10 Commissioner Lynch, Commissioner Price, we'll be able  
11 to get to talk with some of these individuals on a --  
12 you know, live in person and see that they're not  
13 only top notch in terms of their professionalism but  
14 as persons too. And so hopefully that came out.

15 In planning for today, Amy and I thought  
16 it would be good to talk a little bit about the kind  
17 of supports, what I just said. The employee survey  
18 that was done here the last part of 2020 and the  
19 results of the Commission. And I think what I'd like  
20 to do, if you're okay, I've got a few things I want  
21 to share here. So hopefully we can do this. Are you  
22 able to see the Mayor's Equity Agenda?

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Yes.

24 MR. ECCARD: Great. All right. Well, I

26

1 wanted to provide you a little context. As you're  
2 probably aware, Mayor Ginther has established an  
3 equity agenda in order to identify key objectives he  
4 and our city organization are committed to obtain  
5 under his leadership. And those objectives you see  
6 before you: Reduced infant mortality in our black  
7 community, ensuring access to high quality  
8 prekindergarten, work to reduce evictions where we  
9 know black mothers are disproportionately impacted,  
10 increasing availability of affordable housing, create  
11 more opportunities for black owned and women owned  
12 businesses, to provide wide access to our city  
13 contracts and committing to fostering a culture of  
14 inclusion, ensuring workforce and suppliers reflect  
15 the rich diversity of Columbus.

16 The Commission's part in helping to  
17 advance the equity agenda centers around the last  
18 objective, committing to the fostering of a culture  
19 that's inclusive and a workforce that's reflective of  
20 our diversity.

21 The six efforts on this particular agenda  
22 item focus on achieving 30 percent measures in the  
23 next 30 months in workforce diversity, supplier  
24 diversity, executive leadership and boards and

27

1 commissions. The commission's efforts towards these  
2 goals will focus on two primary areas: One, ensuring  
3 a fair, equitable and accessible selection process  
4 for City jobs and, secondly, ensuring the Commission  
5 as an agency maintains an inclusive and diverse work  
6 environment for our staff.

7           You've heard from our management team  
8 today, the efforts we continue to take to ensure  
9 fair, equitable and accessible employment. So I'd  
10 like to take just a minute to share with you where  
11 we're at as an agency in terms of providing an  
12 inclusive and diverse work environment within the  
13 Commission.

14           As I mentioned earlier, in support of the  
15 mayor's agenda, the Office of Diversity and Inclusion  
16 did conduct a citywide employee survey as a first  
17 step in engaging employee perception of the work  
18 environment within the City. The slide that you're  
19 seeing now shows of the 65 employees of record at the  
20 time of the survey, 58.5 percent responded when asked  
21 to participate. While experts vary on definitive  
22 numbers, there is literature to suggest that for  
23 internal surveys, much like that was done by ODI,  
24 when you have a response rate of 50 percent or more,

28

1 you've actually got an excellent survey tool. So we  
2 were quite pleased with staff participation.

3 And I may just mention, you know, when I  
4 first saw that number, 65 employees, we have 36  
5 full-time employees. That includes you three  
6 commissioners. But we do have a significant number  
7 of individuals that work for us on a part time and  
8 temporary basis, especially when we're administering  
9 our large exams, primarily associated with our public  
10 safety testing. So I want to make sure -- you know,  
11 those 65 employees we make -- or the large number  
12 beyond the 36 full time, we may only encounter them,  
13 you know, two or three times a year. But they were  
14 included and provided the opportunity to respond  
15 based on their experiences. And as I said, we were  
16 real happy with the response rate of our particular  
17 staff, which was a high one.

18 For context, at the time of the survey,  
19 you can see we had a gender breakdown of 67.48  
20 percent female and 32.31 male and a race breakdown of  
21 approximately 65 percent white and just under 30  
22 percent nonwhite.

23 Sample content areas and associated  
24 questions are seen on the next two screens. So the

29

1 survey -- And this is not every area and certainly  
2 not every question, but I wanted to give you just a  
3 flavor of what kind of things were asked and provide  
4 you with some of our top response getters.

5 So work and job role: "My job allows me  
6 to utilize my strengths." 97 percent of respondents  
7 agreed with that.

8 "The people I work with treat me with  
9 respect." And 97 percent agreed with that. "

10 My work is valued by my department,"  
11 92 percent.

12 In terms of career growth, "I'm aware of  
13 professional growth and career development  
14 opportunities throughout -- offered to citywide  
15 training," 94 percent agreed.

16 "I have a clear understanding of career  
17 advancements available to me," 86 percent agreed.

18 "I see positive career growth and  
19 advancement with the City of Columbus," 81 percent.  
20 I'm going to talk about this in a minute here.

21 In terms of diversity, equity and  
22 inclusion, "I am paid equitably and fairly to others  
23 in my job class," 97 percent.

24 "I'm comfortable talking about my

30

1 background and cultural experience with my  
2 coworkers," 94 percent. Positive there.

3 And "My department provides an environment  
4 for free and open expression of ideas," 92 percent.

5 And the last area I wanted to touch on was  
6 leadership. "My manager/supervisor recognizes my  
7 efforts when I perform well," 97 percent.

8 "The manager/supervisor, they care about  
9 me as a person," a 90 percent favorable rating there.

10 "I can respectfully disagree with my  
11 supervisor or manager without fear of repercussion or  
12 retaliation," 97 percent.

13 And finally, "Suggestions I make to my  
14 supervisor/manager are taken seriously."

15 So -- Let me find it here. So as a  
16 management team, we were really pleased with our  
17 ratings overall. Let's look here. We had 93 percent  
18 overall satisfaction across all the focus areas,  
19 which was very good: 26 whites, 8 blacks responded.  
20 Our most positive survey responses were leadership at  
21 96 percent. And our least positive survey results --  
22 responses were career growth. And because we have  
23 only 36 full-time positions, promotional  
24 opportunities above the personnel analyst II level

31

1 just don't become available that often, especially  
2 when you have individuals who join staff, they  
3 appreciate what we do, they're highly satisfied with  
4 the work environment and pay, and then they end up  
5 staying with us for literally decades, of which I was  
6 one of that number. I'll be completing my 31st year  
7 with the Commission next month. Now, we have quite a  
8 few on staff like that.

9           It has been a wonderful place to work.  
10 And we have the opportunity to feel like we're making  
11 a difference and we're acknowledged positively by  
12 management and through pay. So when people come,  
13 they usually stay for a while. So while on the one  
14 hand it's a testament to a good workplace, it can be  
15 frustrating for those who are new to the organization  
16 and are wanting to move up a little more quickly than  
17 we have opportunities.

18           Since our management team realizes the  
19 challenge, we do work hard to provide staff with  
20 exposure and experience in any of our areas they may  
21 be interested in, so that when something does come up  
22 within the Commission or even another City  
23 department, they have a better idea of the work  
24 needed and the skills, et cetera. And while this

32

1 effort doesn't guarantee a promotion, it certainly  
2 communicates to staff that Director DeLong and the  
3 management team want to do all we can to help and  
4 support them in getting where they want to go as  
5 evidenced by the high leadership and management  
6 rating.

7 I do want to mention just antidotally, you  
8 know, while our promotional opportunities are  
9 sometimes limited here at the Commission, I do also  
10 think it's a testament to what we're doing at the  
11 agency when you consider so many -- we have a number  
12 of former Commission staff that now serve as  
13 departmental HR officers throughout the City. We've  
14 got guys at safety. We've got people in HR manager  
15 roles. We've got the deputy director of human  
16 resources in the department. So the City as an  
17 organization I think sees the value in what knowledge  
18 and skills and work ethics and processes staff take  
19 on while they're here at the Commission and has  
20 rewarded that by hiring many of our employees to  
21 upper level positions throughout the City.

22 So I know Director DeLong and I and the  
23 entire management team are committed to continuing  
24 identifying and implementing strategies where they're

33

1 appropriate that can provide for staff growth and  
2 advancement opportunities.

3 That pretty much -- I think that's it.  
4 Yeah. That's all I had. Are there any questions?  
5 If not, I'm done. And I'll turn it over to Amy.

6 DIRECTOR DELONG: I just wanted to say:  
7 I'm assuming that by these wonderful presentations,  
8 you can see how lucky I am to have such a wonderful  
9 staff to work with. There's never a time when I  
10 called them that they're not appreciative and  
11 understanding of the need of information that I'm  
12 asking for on top of their daily work that they do.

13 I think the survey was not a pleasant  
14 surprise, it was kind of expected based on just the  
15 open door communication we have here at the  
16 department. I think it was funny when she said I'm  
17 supposed to tell you that you need to do these  
18 things, but it looks like you're already doing them.  
19 So our director of our office of diversity and  
20 inclusion said, "How is your staff so diverse, and  
21 what have you done?"

22 And I said, "It's intentional." And I  
23 said, "We want a diverse staff, and we want that  
24 diversity of ideas and culture and understanding so

34

1 that when we're creating tests and being that face  
2 that is diverse that everyone sees as a part of the  
3 hiring process that we need to look like the  
4 community for which we're hiring." And I have a  
5 staff who is understanding of that, who works with me  
6 to do that and managers who are just incredible to  
7 work with to make sure that we're able to have those  
8 people who have the same mission, ideals and goals  
9 but look a variety, culturally and equitably like our  
10 community.

11 So we're very excited to continue to  
12 struggle through 2021 like we did in 2020 and still  
13 meet the goals because they are extremely dedicated  
14 to what we do. And that is it.

15 MS. LYNCH: Mr. Chairman and Amy and  
16 Michael, I just want to say thank you so much. It  
17 was interesting to see the results. I was actually  
18 going to say they were all in the 90s, and then  
19 Michael pointed out the career advancement at 87.  
20 But I worked in at the State and federal government  
21 for ten years of my life. And I think that what it  
22 affords you -- and I think Michael got to this too --  
23 that while there might not be career advancements in  
24 your specific division that you're in or your

35

1 department, that if you do a good job and are  
2 recognized, people will see that. There are other  
3 opportunities of promotion outside of that or even  
4 into the private sector at some point.

5           You know, I'll just give a brief example.  
6 My sister-in-law was at the PUCO for years in  
7 procurement and became very -- kept taking the  
8 classes to move up in that and then took that to the  
9 private sector. So it's -- She moved out of state,  
10 so it wasn't that she wanted to leave state  
11 government, but it was -- you know, it was just life  
12 changes. But I appreciate that, that sometimes, you  
13 know, people may feel that there's not an opportunity  
14 right there in your department. But it's good to see  
15 that other people are -- people have opportunities in  
16 other departments. So we really appreciate that  
17 presentation.

18           And very nice to see many of you as you  
19 were able to turn your video on. So thank you.

20           MR. PRICE: Mr. Chairman, if I may, I just  
21 want to echo Jen's comments. It's good to get  
22 reports that are very positive, especially in this  
23 day and time. We face a variety of challenges, as we  
24 all know, from whether it be police, whether it be

36

1 fire, whether it be in terms of mayor's office  
2 recruitment retention. So it's good to hear very,  
3 very positive.

4 My only question would be -- I have to ask  
5 it -- when you say 2020 review, is there a report put  
6 together in terms of things that you've shared,  
7 because I would like to echo some of this as I travel  
8 in a variety of environments, whether it be NAACP or  
9 Baptist Ministerial Alliance Association. It would  
10 be good to share some of this positive news.

11 DIRECTOR DELONG: Commissioner, we  
12 actually all have to put together an annual report  
13 that gets submitted to the mayor's office. We also  
14 have to submit it to SERB, so we will have that. But  
15 we'll make sure that -- because it can only be five  
16 pages and no graphics, we'll make sure we provide  
17 some of the graphics that Mike shared with you as  
18 well so you have the employee survey for our  
19 department as well.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I hope you can hear  
21 me. I can't see anything right now. I've been  
22 moving the mouse and doing everything, and it tells  
23 me to wait.

24 But one of the reasons for adopting this

37

1 annual report was the fact that civil service has a  
2 unique status of being blamed for all kinds of things  
3 that happen and don't happen, many of them being in  
4 the realm of department management and anticipating  
5 and what have you. So we enjoy having the reports of  
6 the work that's done because it's done on behalf of  
7 the citizens of Columbus, and we simply want to make  
8 sure there is the opportunity fair representation on  
9 that.

10 Amy has already told us that the  
11 commissioners will receive this information. But  
12 it's also important for those community contacts, as  
13 you mentioned, Commissioner Price, that they have  
14 access to the information because often what we see  
15 is misinterpretation. Many people see civil service  
16 as a gatekeeper that only keeps people out; and it  
17 doesn't truly reflect the work that's done, the  
18 professional commitment and certainly the benefit  
19 that the City of Columbus has in having a qualified  
20 and diverse workforce.

21 Is there anything else for today's  
22 meeting?

23 DIRECTOR DELONG: There's not from our  
24 standpoint. Thank you.



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is  
a true, correct and complete written transcript of  
the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the  
22nd day of February, 2021, and transcribed from my  
stenographic notes.

\_\_\_\_\_

MARILYN K. MARTIN  
Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio  
and Registered Professional Reporter.

My Commission Expires October 15, 2021.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Grady L. Pettigrew, President

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date