

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
3 - - -
4
5 In the Matter of:
6 Regular Meeting
7 - - -
8 Grady L. Pettigrew
9 President, Presiding
10 - - -
11 TRANSCRIPT OF VIDEOCONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS
12 - - -
13
14 Monday, March 29, 2021
15 12:30 p.m.
16 (Via Webex)
17 - - -
18 TRACI E. PEOPLES
19 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER
20 - - -
21 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
22 1421 West Third Avenue
23 Columbus, Ohio 43212
24 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Jennifer Lynch
4 Larry Price

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Beth Dyke
7 Charday Litzy-Taylor
8 Jennifer Shea

9 ALSO PRESENT:

10 Amy DeLong, Director
11 Wendy Brinnon
12 Jaasiel Rubeck

13 - - -

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 March 29, 2021
3 12:30 p.m.

4 - - -

5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 29th day of
8 March, 2021, the Municipal Civil Service Commission
9 came for a regular meeting, Grady L. Pettigrew,
10 President. And, the parties appearing in person
11 and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the
12 following proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 MS. BRINNON: Okay. It is 12:30, and the
15 recording has begun.

16 I would just like to read a statement
17 regarding the public meeting guidelines, and then
18 Commissioner Pettigrew will begin.

19 This Civil Service Commission regular
20 meeting is a public meeting and is being held
21 virtually. In order to comply with guidelines
22 regarding virtual public meetings, any person who is
23 speaking must also be visible on video.

24 Commissioners, please leave your video on
during the entire meeting.

1 If you are presenting, you may leave your
2 video off until it's your turn.

3 All others attending, please turn your
4 video off.

5 If a technical issue should occur, the
6 meeting will be stopped in order to resolve. In
7 addition, this meeting is being recorded.

8 Thank you.

9 And, Commissioner Pettigrew, you may
10 begin.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. I will
12 call to order the Civil Service Commission regular
13 monthly meeting for March 29, 2021. We will be
14 following the printed and published agenda.

15 The first item is the review and approval
16 of the minutes of the February 17, 2021, special
17 meeting, and the February 22, 2021, regular meeting.

18 MR. PRICE: I move for approval of the
19 minutes from the February 17, 2021, special meeting,
20 and the February 22, 2021, regular meeting.

21 MS. LYNCH: I second that.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
23 "aye."

24 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: The minutes are
2 approved.

3 Item No. 2 would be the -- Oh, I'm sorry.
4 Do we have the vote on the record?

5 All right. Then the minutes are
6 approved.

7 The second item is the prehearing
8 conference reviews.

9 The first one is Tyrone Berger v.
10 Columbus City Schools;

11 And the second one, John Holycross
12 v. City of Columbus.

13 MS. SHEA: Good afternoon. Jennifer
14 Shea, Civil Service Commission staff.

15 Prior to discussing each prehearing
16 conference separately, I wanted to just let you know
17 that during both conferences, each party presented
18 their witness list; so that way the commission can
19 subpoena the witnesses. And we have asked the
20 parties to let us know if there will be any changes
21 to that.

22 I can also let you know that, for both of
23 these hearings, the parties prefer virtual hearings.
24 And so they were made aware of the commission's

1 expectations related to evidence, that any evidence
2 that is to be presented should also be shared on the
3 screen at the time of presentation. And then we've
4 asked for any digital audio or video evidence to be
5 given to us ahead of time so that we have time to
6 prepare and work out any kinks that might occur.

7 As it relates to Tyrone Berger v.
8 Columbus City Schools, that is a Trial Board hearing
9 that will be presided over by Commissioner
10 Pettigrew. That is scheduled for April 29th, at
11 10:00 a.m.

12 This was previously scheduled for
13 March 31st; however, the parties have requested an
14 extension, and that extension was granted.

15 The issue to be decided is a termination
16 or discipline case. And so we will be asked at the
17 Trial Board to make a decision as to that
18 termination.

19 The parties anticipate the total time to
20 take for the hearing to be 2 1/2 hours.

21 As it relates to John Holycross, which is
22 versus the City of Columbus, this is a full
23 commission hearing that is scheduled for April 21st
24 at 10:00 a.m. And the parties in that case

1 anticipate about a 2 1/2- to 3-hour hearing.

2 If there aren't any questions, that's all
3 of the information that was discussed at both of
4 those prehearing conferences.

5 Thank you.

6 MR. PRICE: Mr. President, if I may, just
7 for my clarity's sake and my calendar's sake. So
8 both of those hearings are --

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: On the Tyron
10 Berger?

11 I'm sorry?

12 MR. PRICE: I guess my question was, just
13 for clarity, on both those hearings being on the
14 21st and the times again, if I may.

15 MS. SHEA: Sure. No problem.

16 The full commission hearing of John
17 Holycross is scheduled for April 21st at -- to begin
18 at 10:00 a.m.

19 MR. PRICE: Okay.

20 MS. SHEA: The Tyron Berger hearing is
21 with the City -- Columbus City Schools. And that is
22 April 29th. However, Commissioner Pettigrew is
23 presiding over that hearing, and then the other two
24 members of the Trial Board will be myself and

1 Jennifer Hutchison from Civil Service staff.

2 MR. PRICE: Okay. Thank you.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. The biggest
4 issue, you're going in and out.

5 So on Tyron Berger, when you were saying
6 that date, at least my audio went out. So would you
7 repeat that one, please? I have the 21st at
8 10:00 a.m. for the full Commission Trial Board.

9 MS. SHEA: Sure. Mr. Berger's hearing is
10 April 29th, to begin at 10:00 a.m.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: And that one is
12 Tyrone Berger v. Columbus City Schools.

13 MS. SHEA: That is correct. It is a
14 Trial Board hearing with Columbus City Schools.

15 Can everybody hear me okay?

16 MS. LYNCH: I can hear you.

17 I am curious, though. So for the 29th,
18 Commissioner Price and myself are not -- we don't
19 need to join the hearing; is that correct?

20 MS. SHEA: That is correct. Commissioner
21 Price and Commissioner Lynch will join on the 21st
22 only.

23 MS. LYNCH: Okay.

24 MR. PRICE: If I may add, for my

1 purposes, I like to sit in on them. Because when we
2 do them by ourself, trust me, you might want to look
3 at one before you do your first one. When you're
4 the only Commissioner.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm having problems
6 with the continued audio. It's going up and down,
7 in and out.

8 So first thing, do we need to have part
9 of that repeated?

10 The first one was Tyrone Berger
11 v. Columbus City Schools. Anyone need any more
12 information on that one?

13 (No audible response.)

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. And
15 then the second one is a full commission hearing,
16 John Holycross v. City of Columbus. And that one is
17 April 21st at 10:00 a.m.

18 MS. SHEA: Correct.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Anyone need
20 anything further on that one?

21 (No audible response.)

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. And
23 thank you for the reviews.

24 Item No. 3, Trial Board recommendations,

1 there are none submitted this month.

2 No. 4 is the request of the Civil Service
3 Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City
4 Schools, to create the specification for the
5 classification ESL Interpreter/Translator, designate
6 the examination type as competitive, and assign a
7 probationary period of 180 days.

8 "ESL" being English as a second language,
9 I assume.

10 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Yes. Absolutely.

11 Charday Litzy-Taylor, Personnel Analyst
12 with Civil Service Commission.

13 This action was initiated at the request
14 of Columbus City Schools. The District expressed a
15 need for a classification that would be responsible
16 for providing language support for Columbus City
17 Schools personnel and non-English speaking parents
18 and guardians of students within the District.

19 That District created an ESL, English as
20 a second language, program to provide interpretation
21 and translation services for district families and
22 staff. This federally funded program consists of a
23 call center, with dedicated phone lines for families
24 to call for assistance in Spanish, Somali, Nepali,

1 French and Arabic.

2 There is currently an online request
3 process for staff in the District to request
4 document translation and interpreters for calls,
5 conferences, disciplinary hearings and meetings.

6 Currently, the District has been using
7 the Instruction Assistant classification to fill
8 interpreter and translator positions within the ESL
9 call center. However, after reviewing information
10 provided by the ESL department, it was determined
11 that the scope of work is distinct enough to warrant
12 a separate ESL classification.

13 By definition, the proposed ESL
14 Interpret/Translator, working under general
15 supervision, will be responsible for providing oral
16 and written translation of communication,
17 correspondence, forms, manuals and other
18 instructional and educational materials from the
19 English language to a designated second language.

20 The proposed "Examples of Work" section
21 was developed to include those responsibilities
22 identified as important for the classification.

23 The "Minimum Qualifications" section was
24 designed to reflect the qualifications required for

1 a successful performance of the job.

2 And the proposed "Knowledge, Skills and
3 Abilities" section was developed to include the
4 knowledge, skills and abilities expected of a
5 successful ESL Interpreter/Translator.

6 Noting the level of education and
7 experience required, it is recommended that the
8 examination type be designated as competitive, which
9 is consistent with other classifications under the
10 Columbus City Schools Class Plan Index.

11 It is further recommended that the
12 probationary period be assigned as 180 days, which
13 is consistent with the associated learning time.

14 As proposed, the creation of the
15 classification ESL Interpreter/Translator will
16 provide the District with a job classification that
17 can help to ensure meaningful and effective
18 communication for District personnel and non-English
19 speaking families.

20 It is therefore recommended that the
21 classification ESL Interpreter/Translator be created
22 as proposed.

23 MR. PRICE: I move, on behalf of Columbus
24 City Schools, to create the specification for the

1 classification ESL Interpreter/Translator, designate
2 the examination type as competitive, and assign a
3 probationary period of 180 days.

4 MS. LYNCH: I second that motion.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
6 "Aye."

7 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Commissioner Lynch,
9 do I have your vote?

10 MS. LYNCH: Yes.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Aye?

12 MS. LYNCH: I voted aye.

13 Sorry.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is then
15 accepted.

16 Item Nos. 5 through 9 are joined together
17 as items which require no revisions.

18 Item No. 5, request of the Civil Service
19 Commission staff to approve the specification review
20 for the classification Student Intern I, with no
21 revisions.

22 Item No. 6 is the review of the
23 specification for the classification Student
24 Intern III, with no revisions.

1 Item No. 7 is for the classification
2 Dental Hygienist, with no revisions.

3 Item No. 8 is for the classification
4 Heating Ventilation and Air Conditioning Technician,
5 with no revisions.

6 And Item No. 9 is for the classification
7 Heating Ventilation and Air Conditioning Supervisor,
8 with no revisions.

9 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke, Personnel Analyst
10 with the Civil Service staff.

11 The review of the classifications for
12 Items 5 through 9 is part of the Civil Service
13 Commission's efforts to review all classifications
14 every five years.

15 Based on feedback received, it was
16 determined that the current specifications still
17 accurately reflect the work being performed. It is
18 recommended that the specifications be approved with
19 no revisions.

20 MR. PRICE: I make a motion to approve
21 the specification review for the classification
22 Student Intern I, with no revisions.

23 I make a motion to approve the
24 specification review for the classification Student

1 Intern III, with no revisions.

2 I make a motion to approve the
3 specification review for the classification -- the
4 specification review for the classification Dental
5 Hygienist, with no revisions.

6 I make a motion to approve the
7 specification review for the classification Heating
8 Ventilation and Air Conditioning Technician, with no
9 revisions.

10 I make a motion to approve the
11 specification review for the classification Heating
12 Ventilation and Air Conditioning Supervisor, with no
13 revisions.

14 MS. LYNCH: I second the -- of all -- Can
15 I do it in a block? Because that was a handful of
16 motions.

17 MR. PRICE: Right. That's why I was kind
18 of hesitating after the first one, because I was
19 doing them one at a time.

20 MS. LYNCH: Jenny or Amy?

21 Amy, you're muted. Sorry.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, you'll

23 second --

24 MS. DeLONG: You need to --

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: -- the motion if --

2 MS. DeLONG: I'm sorry. One at a time.

3 MS. LYNCH: So one at a time?

4 MR. PRICE: Okay. All right. That's why
5 I was quiet at first on the first one, you know.

6 Okay. Can -- Do you want me to do it
7 again?

8 MS. DeLONG: You can.

9 MR. PRICE: Okay. Good. That's why I
10 stopped after that first one.

11 Okay. Again, I make a motion, on behalf
12 of Columbus City Schools, to create the
13 specification for the classification -- am I right?
14 That's correct; right?

15 No, I'm sorry. No, it's not. I got it.

16 I make a motion to approve the
17 specification review for the classification Student
18 Intern I, with no revisions.

19 MS. LYNCH: I second that motion.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
21 "aye."

22 MS. DeLONG: I'm not being clear.

23 You'll go through all of those, Larry;
24 then she can approve the motion in one. So you'll

1 go through and -- like you have in the past, and say
2 "Student Intern I, Student Intern III." You'll go
3 through and say each one of those so it's for the
4 record.

5 MR. PRICE: Okay. So Jenn then needs --
6 Jenn needs to know what she needs to say for her
7 motion, I think. Because I read all of them, and
8 then I think her question was how does she address
9 that.

10 Jenn, is that correct?

11 MS. LYNCH: Yes. So he already read
12 through them all. So can I just say I second the
13 motion of all of those changes?

14 MS. DeLONG: Yes.

15 MR. PRICE: Okay.

16 MS. DeLONG: Yes. I'm sorry. I thought
17 you were going back to him. And I'm like, "No,
18 we're good."

19 MR. PRICE: That's what I thought.

20 MS. LYNCH: Oh, great. Okay.

21 Well, I second the motion.

22 MR. PRICE: Motions.

23 MS. LYNCH: Motions. I second the
24 motions.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
2 "aye."
3 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.
4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Commissioner Lynch,
5 do we have you?
6 MS. LYNCH: Yes. Aye.
7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I didn't hear you.
8 They are approved.
9 Item No. 10 is -- I'm sorry?
10 MS. DeLONG: Beth Dyke, you're up.
11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm sorry, Amy.
12 All I heard is you calling my name.
13 MS. DeLONG: You're good. We're waiting
14 on Beth Dyke at this point.
15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, yeah, but I
16 haven't introduced the 10th item, though.
17 MS. DeLONG: Okay.
18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Right?
19 MS. DeLONG: Yes.
20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: 5 through 9 have
21 been approved. We are ready for No. 10.
22 Item No. 10, request of the Civil Service
23 Commission staff to review the specification for the
24 classification Keep Columbus Beautiful Manager.

1 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke again, Personnel
2 Analyst with Civil Service staff.

3 In response to a request from the
4 Department of Public Service, minor revisions of
5 this specification are proposed to the "Examples of
6 Work" Section.

7 The recommendations are made so that the
8 classification will better align with national
9 guidelines set forth by the Keep America Beautiful
10 program. The proposed revisions are also being
11 recommended in order to assist the department in
12 meeting the City's sustainability goals.

13 It is proposed to revise existing
14 statements to highlight and specify the work being
15 done in support of sustainability initiatives and
16 goals.

17 Additionally, it is proposed to add a
18 statement to simplify the task of researching
19 programs, which is done to enable the department in
20 reaching sustainability goals and to provide related
21 program information and recommendations to the
22 administrator.

23 There are no other proposed revisions at
24 this time. It is therefore recommended that the

1 revisions for the specification be approved as
2 proposed.

3 MR. PRICE: I make a motion to approve
4 the hiring -- uh-oh. I'm sorry.

5 I make a motion to revise the
6 specification for the classification Keep Columbus
7 Beautiful Manager.

8 MS. LYNCH: I second that.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
10 "aye."

11 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

12 MR. PETTIGREW: It is approved.

13 Item No. 11 is the request of the Civil
14 Service Commission staff to impose a hiring
15 moratorium on the specification for the
16 classification Fleet Attendant.

17 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Charday Litzy-Taylor,
18 Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

19 Currently, there are two employees
20 serving in this classification. With the creation
21 of the Fleet Attendant CDL classification back in
22 October 2019, there are no intentions to hire into
23 the original Fleet Attendant classification going
24 forward.

1 It is therefore recommended that a hiring
2 moratorium be imposed on the Fleet Attendant
3 classification. Once the classification is vacated,
4 it will be recommended for abolishment.

5 MR. PRICE: I make a motion to approve a
6 hiring moratorium for the classification Fleet
7 Attendant.

8 MS. LYNCH: I second that.

9 MR. PRICE: I don't think he heard you.

10 MS. LYNCH: I second the motion.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
12 "aye."

13 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

15 The remaining items on our agenda are the
16 background removals.

17 And as to River Oates, do not reinstate.

18 MR. PRICE: You --

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Ezekiel Brock --

20 MS. DeLONG: You skipped No. 12.

21 MR. PRICE: Yeah, No. 12.

22 MS. DeLONG: It's on a second page.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Residency hearings?

24 MS. DeLONG: Right before that.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Oh, I'm sorry.
2 Request of the Civil Service Commission
3 staff to impose a hiring moratorium on the
4 specification for the classification Parking Meter
5 Repairer.

6 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This classification
7 has two employees currently as well.

8 Due to advancement in parking meter
9 technology and servicing, the department does not
10 see a need to have a dedicated Meter Repairer
11 classification in the Class Plan Index.

12 It is therefore recommended that a hiring
13 moratorium be imposed on the Parking Meter Repairer
14 classification. Once this classification is
15 vacated, it will be recommended for abolishment.

16 MR. PRICE: I make a motion to impose a
17 hiring moratorium on the specification for the
18 classification Parking Meeting Repairer.

19 MS. LYNCH: I second the motion.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
21 "aye."

22 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

24 No items under the residency hearing,

1 No. 13.

2 No. 14, background removals:

3 River Oates, do not reinstate.

4 Ezekiel Brock will be continued until
5 April's meeting for consideration and decision.

6 MR. PRICE: President Pettigrew?

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Yes.

8 MR. PRICE: Okay. Just -- I did a little
9 more research. I did a little more research, and
10 I'm comfortable with removal of both of those items,
11 after having done a little more research.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, the other
13 issue we had is Commissioner Lynch had not seen that
14 one.

15 MR. PRICE: Okay. That makes sense.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: That was really the
17 biggest reason we held it over.

18 MR. PRICE: Good. I agree.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: There was no
20 disagreement with the two of us.

21 MR. PRICE: Okay. Makes sense.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay?

23 MR. PRICE: Yes.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right. Then

1 Item No. 15 is Other Administrative/Jurisdictional
2 Reviews.

3 And the issue is on the letter prepared
4 by the Director regarding review and approval of the
5 dismissal of the appeal filed 3/10/21, regarding the
6 demotion of a former police chief, Thomas Quinlan.
7 And that letter is approved as written. Therefore,
8 it can be distributed.

9 I had a question. I didn't know what the
10 basis for it was. What was the standing of Deputy
11 Chiefs Gregory Bodker and Jennifer Knight to raise
12 this issue? Was it on behalf of the Department?

13 MS. DeLONG: I think that's the problem.
14 They didn't have any standing. They were acting
15 upon themselves.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. All right.

17 MS. DeLONG: They both felt like he
18 should not be able to --

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Okay. That
20 explains it to me. Because we never had anything, I
21 think, where they sign off on -- just signing
22 themselves in their position.

23 Okay. But, at any rate, the letter is
24 appropriate as a response to that.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 29th day of March, 2021, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

TRACI E. PEOPLES
Professional Reporter and
Notary Public in and for
the State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: July 15, 2024

Grady L. Pettigrew, President

Date