

1

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION
3 - - -
4
5 In the Matter of:
6 Regular Meeting
7 - - -
8 Grady L. Pettigrew
9 President, Presiding
10 - - -
11 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS
12 - - -
13
14 Monday, July 26, 2021
15 12:45 p.m.
16 City of Columbus
17 Civil Service Commission
18 77 North Front Street
19 Columbus, Ohio 43215
20 - - -
21 TRACI E. PEOPLES
22 PROFESSIONAL COURT REPORTER
23 - - -
24 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
 3040 Riverside Drive, Suite 125
 Columbus, Ohio 43221
 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Larry Price
4 Jennifer Lynch

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Beth Dyke
7 Carol Lagemann
8 Charday Litzy-Taylor
9 Liz Reed

10 ALSO PRESENT:

11 Wendy Brinnon
12 Brittany Price

13 - - -

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

30

31

32

33

34

35

36

37

38

39

40

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 July 26, 2021
3 12:45 p.m.

4 - - -

5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 26th day of
8 July, 2021, the Municipal Civil Service Commission
9 came for a regular meeting, Grady L. Pettigrew,
10 President. And, the parties appearing in person
11 and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth, the
12 following proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I call to order the
15 City of Columbus Municipal Civil Service Regular
16 Meeting for July 2021. We will be following the
17 published agenda.

18 The first item on the agenda is the
19 review and approval of the minutes from the June 28,
20 2021, regular meeting.

21 MR. PRICE: I move for the approval of
22 the minutes of the June 28, 2021, regular meeting.

23 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
"aye."

1 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Items No. 2 and 3,
3 none submitted for conference reviews or trial board
4 recommendations.

5 Item 4, request of the Civil Service
6 Commission staff to extend the current eligible list
7 for police officer for a period of one year, to
8 expire on November 23, 2022, or until replaced.

9 MS. REED: This is Liz Reed with the
10 Civil Service Commission, Executive Assistant
11 Director over testing.

12 And the reason we're asking for this is
13 the police officer selection process is in the midst
14 of an outside audit. The audit is being conducted
15 in response to Recommendation 13 of the Columbus
16 Community Safety Advisory Commission.

17 Additionally, the CSC is completing a
18 full job analysis of the police officer
19 classification.

20 CSC staff are recommending that this
21 police officer list extension -- are recommending
22 this eligible list extension to allow the time to
23 learn the results of the audit and the job analysis
24 and to implement recommendations before the next

1 full police officer testing process, which is
2 currently scheduled for the first quarter in the
3 beginning of next year, in 2022.

4 The Civil Service staff recommends a
5 one-year extension of the 2020 police officer
6 eligible list, with a new expiration date of
7 November 23, 2022, or when replaced by the new list.

8 MR. PRICE: I move to extend the current
9 eligible list for police officer, Job Code 3064, for
10 a period of one year, to expire on November 23,
11 2022, or until replaced.

12 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
14 "aye."

15 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

16 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.
17 Thank you.

18 Items 5, 6, 7, 8 and 9 will be joined
19 together.

20 MS. BRINNON: Correction to the agenda.
21 I'm sorry.

22 No. 5 will be a stand alone, 6 through 9
23 will be joined together.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All right.

1 Abilities" section was developed to include the
2 knowledge, skills and ability necessary for
3 successful performance of those duties.

4 Due to the type and level of work being
5 performed, the "Minimum Qualifications" require a
6 bachelor's degree and four years of compensation
7 experience, including job evaluation and market
8 pricing. A master's degree in public
9 administration, business administration, human
10 resources or another closely related field may
11 substitute for one year of the required experience.

12 Certification awarded by WorldatWork as a
13 Certified Compensation Professional, CCP, may
14 substitute for two years of the required experience.

15 Noting the level of education and
16 experience required, it is recommended that the
17 examination type be designated as noncompetitive,
18 which is consistent with other similar
19 classifications under the Columbus City Schools
20 Classified Index.

21 Is it further recommended that the
22 probationary period be assigned as 365 days, which
23 is consistent with the associated learning time and
24 in accordance with Civil Service Commission's

1 guidelines for classifications designated as
2 noncompetitive.

3 As proposed, the creation of the
4 classification Compensation Analyst will provide
5 Columbus City Schools with a job classification that
6 can assist in ensuring pay equity for the district
7 by: conducting market analysis; creating, revising
8 and maintaining salary schedules; staying informed
9 of compensation trends; and determining appropriate
10 pay levels for new and current employees.

11 It is therefore recommended that the
12 classification Compensation Analyst be created as
13 proposed.

14 MR. PRICE: I move to create the
15 specification for the classification Compensation
16 Analyst, assign a probation period of 365 days, and
17 designate the examination type as noncompetitive.

18 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
20 "aye."

21 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

23 Thank you.

24 So Items 6, 7, 8 and 9 will be joined

1 together, and I will note that they're all
2 nonrevision items.

3 Item 6, request of the Civil Service
4 Commission staff to approve the specification review
5 for the classification Neighborhoods Director, with
6 no revisions.

7 Item No. 7 is for the classification
8 Department Human Resources Officer, with no
9 revision.

10 Item 8 is for the classification Grant
11 Management Coordinator, with no revisions.

12 And Item 9 is for the classification
13 Human Resources Representative, with no revisions.

14 MS. DYKE: Hello. Beth Dyke, personnel
15 analyst with Civil Service Commission staff.

16 The review was completed for Items 6
17 through 9 as part of the Civil Service Commission's
18 best effort to review all classifications every four
19 to five years.

20 Based on feedback received, it was
21 determined that the current specifications still
22 accurately reflect the work being performed. It is
23 recommended that the specifications be approved,
24 with no revisions.

1 MR. PRICE: I move to approve the
2 specification review for the classifications
3 Neighborhoods Director, unclassified, with no
4 revisions.

5 I also move to approve the specification
6 review for the classification Department Human
7 Resources Officer, with no revisions.

8 I also move to approve the specification
9 review for the classification Grant Management
10 Coordinator, with no revisions.

11 I also move to approve the specification
12 review for the classification Human Resources
13 Representative, with no revision.

14 MS. LYNCH: I second the motion.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

19 Item No. 10 is the request of the Civil
20 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
21 for the classification Keep Columbus Beautiful
22 Manager.

23 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke again, Personnel
24 Analyst with the Civil Service staff.

1 Civil Service Commission staff received a
2 request from the Department of Public Service to
3 revise the specification for the classification Keep
4 Columbus Beautiful Manager.

5 The specification was last reviewed in
6 March 2021, in response to a classification action
7 request received from the department. Since that
8 time, discussions occurred with the department, and
9 it was determined that revisions to the "Minimum
10 Qualifications" section are necessary in order to
11 create a greater scope of qualifying experience,
12 and/or education.

13 It was also determined that the program
14 management experience would be more effective and
15 should be emphasized, rather than the supervisory
16 experience.

17 Therefore, it is proposed to revise the
18 minimum qualifications by additional program areas
19 to the existing list of qualifying program areas,
20 adding an experience substitution for the bachelor's
21 degree requirement, and removing the supervisory
22 experience requirement.

23 There are no other revisions at this
24 time, and it is recommended that the specification

1 be approved as proposed.

2 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
3 specification for the classification Keep Columbus
4 Beautiful Manager.

5 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
7 "aye."

8 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

9 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

10 Item No. 11 is request of the Civil
11 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
12 for the classification Medical Assistant.

13 MS. DYKE: The review of this
14 specification is part of the Civil Service
15 Commission's effort to review all specifications
16 every five years.

17 Minor revisions are proposed. In the
18 preferred vernacular, the department is referred to
19 as "Columbus Public Health." And in keeping with
20 this preference, it is proposed to revise the
21 reference to the department within an existing
22 "Example of Work" statement.

23 During this review, it was also
24 determined that an incumbent working within this

1 classification may need to be part of a public
2 health emergency response unit. Therefore, it is
3 proposed to add a statement stating so within the
4 "Examples of Work" section.

5 There are no other revisions at this
6 time, and it is recommended that the specification
7 be approved as proposed.

8 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
9 specification for the classification Medical
10 Assistant.

11 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
13 "aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

16 Item No. 12, request of the Civil Service
17 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
18 classification Forensic Scientist I.

19 MS. LAGEMANN: That will be joined with
20 13, 14 and 15.

21 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: I'm sorry.

22 Item 13 is for the classification
23 Forensic Scientist II;

24 14, Forensic Scientist III;

1 And 15 is the classification Crime
2 Laboratory Manager.

3 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
4 Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

5 The review of these classifications is
6 part of the Civil Service Commission's effort to
7 review all classifications every five years.

8 Forensic Scientist I, II and III no
9 longer visit crime scenes. Therefore, it is
10 proposed to remove this reference in the "Examples
11 of Work" section for those classes.

12 Within Forensic Scientist II, III, and
13 Crime Lab Manager, there is reference to specific
14 accreditation standards in the "Knowledge, Skills
15 and Abilities" section, and it is proposed to remove
16 the reference to the specific standards.

17 It is proposed to remove the "Guidelines
18 for Class Use" from the Forensic Scientist III,
19 because it is unnecessarily restrictive, given the
20 growth of the crime lab.

21 And within the Crime Lab Manager class,
22 two new abilities are proposed with regard to
23 communication and confidentiality, and one ability
24 be revised to better reflect the incumbent's

1 involvement in forensic testing.

2 It is recommended these specifications be
3 revised as proposed.

4 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
5 classification for Forensic Scientist I.

6 I also move to revise the specification
7 for the classification Forensic Scientist II.

8 And I also move to revise the
9 specification for the classification Forensic
10 Scientist III.

11 And I also move to revise the
12 specification for the classification Crime
13 Laboratory Manager.

14 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
16 "aye."

17 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

19 Items 16, 17, 18, and 19 are deferred.

20 And item 20 is the request of the Civil
21 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
22 for the classification EMS Education Manager.

23 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
24 Analyst with the Civil Service.

1 This action was from a class action
2 request of the Department of Public Safety, Division
3 of Fire.

4 Due to recruitment challenges of filling
5 the vacancy and changes in accreditation
6 requirements, the department requested us to revisit
7 the minimum qualifications and broaden them for a
8 bigger applicant pool.

9 In the past, accreditation standards
10 required the EMS program director, which we call an
11 EMS Education Manager, to be certified at an equal
12 or higher level of professional training than that
13 for which training was being offered. But in 2015,
14 this requirement was removed.

15 Therefore, because of this change in the
16 accreditation standards, and because the program run
17 by our program director requires significant
18 administrative work instead of instructing, we are
19 proposing to remove the instructor certification
20 from the minimum qualifications requirement.

21 In addition, the two paths for qualifying
22 are separated for clarity, and the experience
23 teaching is proposed to be reduced from four years
24 to three years.

1 And then, finally, within the "Examples
2 of Work" section, a minor addition of "EMS" is
3 proposed to clarify what medical director is being
4 referred to.

5 It is therefore recommend that the
6 classification EMS Education Manager be revised as
7 proposed.

8 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
9 specification for the classification EMS Education
10 Manager.

11 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

12 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
13 "aye."

14 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

16 Item No. 21 is the request of the Civil
17 Service Commission staff to revise the specification
18 for the classification Human Resources Analyst.

19 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Hi, again. Charday
20 Litzy-Taylor, Personnel Analyst with the Commission.

21 The review of this classification is part
22 of the Civil Service Commission's efforts to review
23 all classifications every five years.

24 After reviewing the feedback from current

1 incumbents and department representatives, some
2 revisions are proposed.

3 Based on the organizational structure of
4 the department, some human resource analysts may
5 have varying payroll and personnel
6 transaction-related responsibilities.

7 It is recommended that an addition be
8 made within the "Examples of Work" section to better
9 reflect the duties.

10 It is also recommended that one statement
11 be revised to provide clarity, and another statement
12 be removed to eliminate redundancy.

13 There are no other changes proposed to
14 the specification at this time.

15 MR. PRICE: I move to revise the
16 specification for the classification Human Resources
17 Analyst.

18 MS. LYNCH: Second the motion.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
20 "aye."

21 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

22 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

23 Item 22 is the residency hearing review,
24 none submitted.

1 And No. 23 is background removals.
2 Background removals disposition, the
3 agreement of all Commissioners is as follows:
4 Kerkulah Kudel, Police Officer, do not
5 reinstate;
6 Bryce Graves, Police Officer, do not
7 reinstate;
8 Kieran Smith, Police Officer, reinstate;
9 Miyal McDonald, Firefighter, do not
10 reinstate;
11 Alexander Waterman, Firefighter, do not
12 reinstate;
13 Caleb Marsh, Firefighter, reinstate;
14 Christopher Winterhoff; Firefighter,
15 reinstate;
16 Lucas Wheeler, Firefighter, do not
17 reinstate;
18 Tyron Norwood, Police Officer, do not
19 reinstate;
20 Henry Kruse, Police Officer, do not
21 reinstate;
22 Marcus Scales, Police officer, reinstate;
23 Kevin Mason, Firefighter, do not
24 reinstate;

1 Andre Smith, Firefighter, do not
2 reinstate;
3 Peyton Colwell, Firefighter, do not
4 reinstate;
5 Michael Erney, Firefighter, reinstate;
6 Joshua Sweet, Firefighter, reinstate;
7 Christopher Simon, Firefighter,
8 reinstate;
9 David White, Firefighter, reinstate;
10 Daniel Dillard, Police Officer, do not
11 reinstate;
12 David Stauder, Firefighter, reinstate;
13 And Zachary Dralle, Police Officer,
14 reinstate.
15 Item No. 23 -- 24, I should say -- is the
16 other administrative and jurisdictional reviews.
17 And we agreed on this?
18 MR. PRICE: Yes.
19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: By agreement by all
20 members of the Commission, the letter for Brandon
21 Hughes is approved and should be issued by the
22 director.
23 Similarly, or likewise, the letter for
24 Gregory Truck has been reviewed and approved by the

1 Commissioners, and the director should issue that
2 one as well.

3 With that, we have completed the agenda,
4 and our July meeting is adjourned.

5 (Signature ^ waived ^ not waived.)

6 - - -

7 And, thereupon, the meeting was
8 concluded at approximately 1:05 p.m.

9 - - -

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 26th day of July, 2021, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

TRACI E. PEOPLES
Professional Reporter and
Notary Public in and for
the State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: July 15, 2024

Grady L. Pettigrew, President

Date