

2

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Grady L. Pettigrew, President
3 Jennifer Lynch
4 Larry Price

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Amy DeLong, Director
7 Carol Lagemann
8 Charday Litzy-Taylor
9 Tammy Rollins

10 ALSO PRESENT:

11 Wendy Brinnon
12 Brittany Price

13 - - -

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

3

1 THURSDAY MORNING SESSION
2 January 27, 2022
3 9:06 a.m.

4 - - -

5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 27th day of
8 January, 2022, the Municipal Civil Service

8 Commission came for a regular meeting, Grady L.
9 Pettigrew, President. And, the parties appearing in
10 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set forth,
11 the following proceedings were had:

12 - - -

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Good morning. I'll
14 call to order the City of Columbus, Ohio, Municipal
15 Civil Service Commission regular meeting for
16 January 2022. We are following the printed agenda.

17 The first item is the review and approval
18 of the minutes of the November 29, 2021, and
19 December 13, 2021, regular meeting.

20 MR. PRICE: I move for the approval of
21 the minutes from the November 29, 2021, and
22 December 13, 2021, regular meeting.

23 MS. LYNCH: Second.

24 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say

1 "aye."

2 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: They are approved.

4 Next is Item No. 4, request of the Civil
5 Service Commission staff, on behalf of the City of
6 Columbus, to create the specification for the
7 classification HR Data Management Analyst, assign a
8 probationary period of 365 days, and designate the
9 examination type as noncompetitive.

10 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Good morning. Charday
11 Litzy-Taylor, Personnel Analyst with the Commission.
12 The school district has determined that the HR
13 section in these classifications is responsible for
14 supporting all phases of HRIS system development and
15 management.

16 The proposed role requires functional and
17 technical knowledge of HR operations, HRIS system
18 parameters and capabilities, time and labor
19 reporting systems, and an understanding of
20 relational databases, which makes it distinct enough
21 to warrant the creation of the new classification.

22 By definition, the proposed HR Data
23 Management Analyst, working under general direction,
24 will be responsible for collaborating with the

1 district's human resources leadership, information
2 technology, and third-party vendors to support human
3 resources information system development,
4 management, and functionality.

5 The proposed "Examples of Work" and
6 "Knowledge, Skills and Abilities" sections were
7 developed to include those responsibilities
8 identified as important for the classification, as
9 well as the knowledge, skills and abilities needed
10 for successful performance of those duties.

11 Due to the types and levels of duties
12 being performed, the minimum qualifications require
13 a bachelor's degree and three years of experience in
14 a human capital management or human resource
15 information systems role using human resource
16 information systems.

17 Noting the level of education and
18 experience required, it is recommended that the
19 examination type be designated as noncompetitive.
20 This is consistent with other similar
21 classifications under the Columbus City Schools
22 Class Plan Index.

23 It is further recommended that the
24 probationary period be defined as 365 days, which is

1 consistent with the associated learning time and in
2 accordance with the Commission guidelines for
3 classifications designated as noncompetitive.

4 It is also recommended that the
5 classification be assigned to the Administrative
6 Professional Job Family within the Human Resources
7 Group and be assigned to the "Other Professional
8 Staff" EEO job category.

9 As proposed, the creation of the
10 classification HR Data Management Analyst will
11 provide Columbus City Schools with a job
12 classification that can support the enhancement of
13 the current HR information systems, as well as
14 implement new technology and data management
15 solutions necessary to meet the goals of the
16 district.

17 Therefore, it is recommended that the HR
18 Data Management Analyst be created as proposed.

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

20 MR. PRICE: Thank you, Charday.

21 I move to create the specification for
22 the classification HR Data Management Analyst,
23 assign a probation period of 365 days, and designate
24 the examination type as noncompetitive.

1 MS. LYNCH: Second.

2 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
3 "aye."

4 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

6 Item No. 5 is the request of the Civil
7 Service Commission staff to create the specification
8 for the classification Executive Director (Office of
9 the Mayor), and designate it to be part of the
10 unclassified service.

11 MS. ROLLINS: Good morning. This is a
12 request that we received from the Mayor's Office,
13 which was to create a classification that would
14 preside over a division within the Office of the
15 Mayor.

16 Currently, we have three divisions. We
17 have Diversity and Inclusion, CelebrateOne and
18 Education. So we don't have a specific
19 classification to preside over the divisions. So
20 they have used a hodgepodge of unclassified
21 positions that are available to the Mayor's Office,
22 none of which have been a really good fit. So the
23 proposed classification would provide the Mayor's
24 Office a classification that would be over one of

1 these divisions. The duties that were listed here
2 came from the Mayor's Office that basically would be
3 those responsibilities that typically somebody over
4 a division would be responsible for. We have,
5 obviously, Division Administrator classifications
6 for all of our other departments that have
7 divisions. We just haven't had one specifically in
8 the Mayor's Office.

9 These positions have all used a working
10 title of "Director." And so within the City's
11 nomenclature, "Director" implies appointing
12 authority, which these positions would not be the
13 appointing authority. However, "Executive Director"
14 in the City does not have that same significance.
15 And they're using this as a working title. So the
16 proposed title for the new classification, we're
17 suggesting that it be titled "Executive Director,"
18 specific to the Mayor's Office, so there is a
19 restriction that it can only be used in the Mayor's
20 Office. And it is tied to language in the City
21 Charter as an executive assistant within the Mayor's
22 Office.

23 The Guidelines For Class Use, again, kind
24 of specify the section of City Charter that this

1 classification would be tied to, but also further
2 state that this classification would not be an
3 appointing authority and that the lone appointing
4 authority for the Mayor's Office is the Mayor
5 himself.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: How will this
7 relate to the Chief of Staff that presently exists
8 in the Mayor's Office?

9 MS. ROLLINS: So Chief of Staff would --
10 I mean, currently, within the Mayor's Office, we
11 have 4001, which is the Mayor's Office. And so all
12 of the positions within the Mayor's Office would
13 remain 4001. But they have parcelled out
14 divisions, which are like 4002, 4005. And this is
15 the person that would be over, like, the -- this
16 would be the Education Director. But it's
17 specifically been identified in City Code now as a
18 division of the Mayor's Office. It's not a separate
19 and apart department.

20 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Gotcha.

21 MR. PRICE: If I may.

22 I was aware of the Diversity and
23 Inclusion and CelebrateOne and Education. I know
24 how all of those were created. So this makes sense.

10

1 Even when I was in the Mayor's Office, we really
2 didn't have structure. We were just kind of making
3 new departments up. So this is definitely something
4 that we needed.

5 I move to create the specification for
6 the classification Executive Director (Office of the
7 Mayor), unclassified, and designate it to be part of
8 the unclassified service.

9 MS. LYNCH: Second.

10 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
11 "aye."

12 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

14 Thank you.

15 Item No. 6 is the request of the Civil
16 Service Commission staff to create the specification
17 for the classification Inspector General
18 Investigator, assign a probation period of 365 days,
19 designate the examination type as noncompetitive,
20 and amend Rule XI accordingly.

21 MS. ROLLINS: This is a request that we
22 received to create an Inspector General Investigator
23 that would be housed within the new Department of
24 Inspector General, which operates under the Civilian

1 Police Review Board, and will have, as its mission,
2 responsibility of investigating allegations of
3 misconduct and/or excessive use of force by sworn
4 members of the Division of Police.

5 City Code recently passed legislation to
6 create the department, and authorized strength
7 legislation was passed so that this new department
8 will have an authorized strength of 10 full-time
9 employees. The composition of this department will
10 largely consist of the Inspector General, who is
11 the -- would be like the department director; the
12 investigator. So this is, you know, the people
13 actually going out and performing the investigation.
14 And then some administrative support staff within
15 the department.

16 The proposed classification would be
17 created to be that investigator within the
18 department that would be the one actually performing
19 the investigations that are charged to this
20 department.

21 We have no existing classification in the
22 City that does this particular work. I mean, this
23 is kind of new to the City.

24 For the other classifications, we

1 probably have classifications in the administrative
2 support that would work fine for them. But we don't
3 have anything like the investigator.

4 So in writing this specification, other
5 civilian police investigator jobs were reviewed from
6 other jurisdictions. Additionally, there is a
7 national association for civilian oversight of law
8 enforcement that had a lot of really good
9 information that a lot of the civilian oversight
10 boards are members. That was reviewed significantly
11 and provided a lot of details for the proposed
12 staff.

13 Additionally, once a proposed spec was
14 drafted, representatives from the City and members
15 of the Civilian Police Review Board had the
16 opportunity to provide feedback and comment on the
17 drafted specifications.

18 The "Examples of Work" and "Knowledge,
19 Skills and Abilities" largely came from work --
20 similar jobs from other jurisdictions. And, of
21 course, that NACOLE association had a lot of
22 information about core competencies that were
23 heavily used.

24 The proposed "Minimum Qualifications"

1 were largely modeled after similar jobs in Los
2 Angeles, California.

3 It is recommended that the probationary
4 period be 365 days and that the examination type for
5 this classification be noncompetitive.

6 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you.

7 MR. PRICE: Thank you, Tammy.

8 I move to create the specification for
9 the classification Inspector General Investigator,
10 assign a probationary period of 365 days, designate
11 the examination type as noncompetitive, and amend
12 Rule XI accordingly.

13 MS. LYNCH: I second the motion.

14 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
15 "aye."

16 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

18 Item No. 7 is a request of the Civil
19 Service Commission staff to create the specification
20 for the classification Equal Employment Opportunity
21 Specialist (Public Safety), assign a probationary
22 period of 365 days, designate the examination type
23 as noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

24 MS. ROLLINS: This is a request that we

1 received from the Public Safety Department to make
2 available to them a classification to perform the
3 EEO investigations.

4 Recently, it was determined in maybe the
5 last couple years that the EEO investigations would
6 be performed out of the Director's Office, rather
7 than in the Division itself. With that move, the
8 number of EEO investigations have risen dramatically
9 for the department, and it's been very difficult for
10 them to stay on top of all of them. They currently
11 have an assistant director who has been doing most
12 of these investigations. But it's been, you know,
13 really hard for one person or even two people to do
14 that.

15 We have had on the books an EEO officer
16 from years ago that is very much like what they
17 wanted. So hearing this new request, we looked back
18 historically. And we had on the books an EEO
19 Officer (Public Safety) that was a classification
20 that was created for the Department of Public
21 Safety. It was during a time when they were under a
22 court order. And that court order ended, and the
23 number of EEO investigations declined, and the
24 classification was vacant. It was eventually

1 abolished.

2 However, we are kind of right back to
3 where we were, minus the court order, where we are
4 seeing a lot of EEO investigations within the Public
5 Safety Department. And having a classification
6 dedicated to performing those EEO investigations
7 would be extremely helpful to them.

8 It is -- From talking to the department,
9 you know, right now it's felt that this particular
10 job will have a very heavy investigatory focus, just
11 because of the number of investigations currently
12 within the department. But they are hoping that
13 we'll eventually transition to a more proactive
14 stance and be more involved on the training side and
15 preventing some of the investigations from happening
16 in the first place.

17 For that reason, you know, it was decided
18 to not call this classification an investigator, but
19 an Equal Employment Opportunity Specialist where,
20 initially, they're going to be doing a lot of
21 investigations. But, like I said, eventually it
22 will have more of a training focus.

23 Must of the specification itself was
24 based on the prior classification that we had, with

1 some tweaks here and there based on feedback from
2 the department and, of course, including a lot more
3 of the training which hopefully we transition to
4 sooner than later.

5 It is recommended that the probationary
6 period for the classification be 365 days, and the
7 examination type be noncompetitive.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: When you mention
9 the issue of training, are you -- is it envisioned
10 that the specialist will be providing training in
11 the --

12 MS. ROLLINS: Division.

13 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: -- Division?

14 That won't be creating an issue for the
15 people who have filed a complaint or who are
16 pursuing some particular issue?

17 MS. ROLLINS: Not that I'm aware of. I
18 mean, this is -- I mean, right now, you know, it's
19 going to be heavily investigatory. But they are
20 planning on this person, with their expertise --
21 there may be one or two of these -- that their
22 expertise will be useful in ensuring training when
23 the investigatory piece, you know, starts to
24 decline. We're hoping it's nonexistent.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: In your work on
2 this, did you learn, or was it disclosed, that there
3 will be increased training in the academy and in the
4 ongoing, continuing training and education in the
5 department on the issues related to equal
6 employment?

7 MS. ROLLINS: We did not talk about it
8 tremendously, other than, you know, initially the
9 thought was, for this classification, like the prior
10 classification, when investigations ceased, will
11 this classification also cease. And the thought was
12 that they felt that there was going to be a
13 continual need to have an EEO specialist in the
14 department for when there are issues or there are
15 questions or there is particular training, you know,
16 needed; that the expertise of this particular person
17 would be able to provide that.

18 MR. PRICE: If I may?

19 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Yes.

20 MR. PRICE: To follow up on the question.
21 So right now there is a backlog of cases that need
22 to be investigated; so, therefore, the priority
23 right now in creating this is to investigate.
24 Correct?

1 MS. ROLLINS: Yes.

2 MR. PRICE: Once -- The thought or
3 presumption is that, once those cases are
4 investigated, that backlog will decrease, and then
5 this person will shift into training. And I want to
6 make sure I'm clear on this question. So once that
7 training starts, not only would those potentially
8 going through, the class of recruits, but also those
9 police officers who are presently police officers,
10 would that be part of his job? Or, should I say,
11 that's ongoing?

12 MS. ROLLINS: I believe so. I believe
13 so.

14 I mean, the focus is that, I mean, that
15 there is -- I mean, I think there is some training
16 being done, but probably not enough training. And
17 as they're working through these cases, especially
18 as they're seeing more of these, as more and more
19 employees are comfortable coming forward knowing
20 that these investigations are being performed in the
21 Director's Office, they will have a lot more
22 knowledge about where the training is lacking. So
23 they're going to be able to utilize some of the
24 information they're gaining from these

1 investigations to know, you know, the training that
2 they are currently getting, where -- what is
3 missing. And there's going -- and then, you know,
4 they will be able to transition to kind of fill
5 those holes. And it may be, you know -- I mean, I
6 don't know. But I'm just imagining that, I mean, it
7 could be, you know, they're contracting out for some
8 of this training. But it's like this would be the
9 specialist that's kind of overseeing kind of the EEO
10 for the department and recognizing where there are
11 holes and how to fill those holes. But definitely
12 going from, right now, very reactive, to more of a
13 proactive place with regards to the EEO.

14 MR. PRICE: Mr. Chair, if I may.

15 So, again, just for clarity sake, the
16 priority will be to deal with the -- to investigate
17 the backlog --

18 MS. ROLLINS: Yes.

19 MR. PRICE: -- and make sure that that
20 is, indeed, caught up for those complaints or
21 whatever it may be? And then, from there, shifting
22 into the training aspect of it?

23 MS. ROLLINS: Yes.

24 MR. PRICE: Thank you.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: One of the
2 things -- and when you're communicating this and our
3 response -- What we've seen over the years is that
4 equal employment issues have changed. They have
5 included different groups of people who weren't even
6 a part of the court order. They have included
7 different issues as to how people are treated. And
8 one of the things that I would hope is that this
9 would be a person who would be alerting the chain of
10 command as to the issues that are arising, not just
11 what we have seen before, how females were treated.
12 But we now have many other issues. And, certainly,
13 one of the things that I know from the legal
14 profession, are the alerts. "A court in Colorado
15 has done this. You may need to know it." And so I
16 hope that's a part of what they're planning.

17 MR. PRICE: I move to create the
18 specification -- Thank you, sir.

19 I move to create the specification for
20 the classification Equal Employment Opportunity
21 Specialist (Public Safety), assign a probationary
22 period of 365 days, designate the examination type
23 as noncompetitive, and amend Rule XI accordingly.

24 MS. LYNCH: Second.

1 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
2 "aye."

3 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

4 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

5 Item No. 8 is the request of the Civil
6 Service Commission staff to revise the
7 classification Inspector Supervisor, retitle it to
8 read "Building Inspection Supervisor," and amend
9 Rule XI accordingly.

10 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, Personnel
11 Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.

12 This action arose out of a class request
13 from the Department of Building and Zoning.

14 It is proposed for Inspection Supervisor
15 to be retitled Building Inspection Supervisor and
16 for some clarifying descriptors to be added to the
17 definition to illustrate that this is with regard to
18 inspections that are enforcing Ohio building codes.

19 It is therefore recommended that the
20 classification of Inspection Supervisor be revised
21 and retitled Building Inspection Supervisor, and
22 Rule XI amended accordingly.

23 MR. PRICE: Thank you, Carol.

24 I move to revise the classification

1 Inspection Supervisor, retitle it to read "Building
2 Inspection Supervisor," and amend Rule XI
3 accordingly.

4 MS. LYNCH: Second.

5 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
6 "aye."

7 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.
9 Thank you.

10 We have no residential hearings.

11 On the background removals, with the
12 consensus of the Commission:

13 Remel Barbee, reinstate;

14 Benjamin Cooper, reinstate;

15 Quincy Nelms, reinstate;

16 Paul Saunders III, reinstate;

17 As to the applicants removed post-exam:

18 Bryan Turner, reinstate;

19 Elijah Wilson, do not reinstate.

20 The only remaining item on the agenda for
21 today is the election of the president going
22 forward. I have had the honor and privilege of
23 serving in that position for 15 years. However, my
24 pending retirement will be effective in February,

1 and we need to select a new president.

2 So at this time, I would like to move and
3 recommend the appointment of Commissioner Larry
4 Price to the Civil Service Commission President
5 position, to be effective February 5, 2022.

6 Do I have a second?

7 MS. LYNCH: Second.

8 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: All in favor, say
9 "aye."

10 THE COMMISSION MEMBERS: Aye.

11 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: It is approved.

12 This is a bit of a joke. In the third
13 grade, I lost an election for class president
14 because I did not vote for myself. I never did that
15 again.

16 DIRECTOR DeLONG: Grady, can I have a
17 minute before you close, please?

18 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Absolutely.

19 DIRECTOR DeLONG: Thank you.

20 Amy DeLong, Director of the Civil Service
21 Commission.

22 Today is an important day because we want
23 to recognize our Commission president, Grady L.
24 Pettigrew, on his retirement from the Commission

1 after 22 years of exemplary service and leadership.
2 Therefore, on behalf of the Mayor, the entire
3 Commission staff, and any of the employees of the
4 City of Columbus, and myself, we want to take this
5 moment to officially recognize you for your service
6 and important contribution to the work of the
7 Commission over the past 22 years.

8 Through your distinguished service and
9 leadership overseeing the usual workings of the
10 Commission, you have guided its ongoing efforts to
11 ensure properly focused, transparent and equitable
12 City employment opportunities through many projects
13 over the last 22 years.

14 Because of these efforts and their
15 positive outcomes, the Columbus Civil Service
16 Commission continues to be a leader and go-to
17 organization for other jurisdictions throughout the
18 country regarding our classification and testing
19 programs.

20 As such, please accept our thanks and
21 gratitude for the countless hours you invested over
22 the years in the job class reviews, the background
23 reviews, the appeals hearings and generally helping
24 make this organization the top-tier leader that it

1 is. We couldn't have done it without you, Grady.
2 And let me tell you, we have all benefited from your
3 professional and personal influence that you have
4 had on our lives, and we want to wish you the best
5 in this next and exciting chapter.

6 Thank you.

7 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Thank you so much.

8 MR. PRICE: If I may say a few words.

9 I have had the opportunity -- I didn't
10 know what I was getting into when the Mayor asked me
11 to become part of the Civil Service Commission. I
12 wasn't quite sure. But I was pleasantly surprised.
13 My history as a former State Rep, a former Special
14 Assistant to the Mayor, a former aide to a
15 Congressman, I've benefited because I've been in the
16 business where I have had to deal with community and
17 issues. And I've had to raise issues, even as chair
18 of the NAACP, Criminal Justice. And I state it as a
19 background to say that I was pleasantly surprised,
20 because it's not usual for me to raise questions and
21 to challenge. And you were always open.

22 I would call you first. And you would
23 say, "Price, what do you want to do? You want to
24 hold up the background checks? You want to hold up

1 the background checks?"

2 I would say, "Yeah. I got a question
3 about this particular one."

4 Your wisdom, your guidance, your
5 leadership -- I am humbled to follow you. I hope
6 that I can do as good of a job as you have done over
7 the last 15 years but, specifically, this last year
8 in grooming me. I teasingly tell folks I felt like
9 Robin, and he was Batman and I was riding that side
10 piece.

11 And Commission says, "We're going through
12 this door." And I was going through this door.

13 Well, unfortunately, now I have to be in
14 that seat. But I could not have had a better
15 mentor, a better leader, and, most of all, a better
16 friend. So I thank you.

17 PRESIDENT PETTIGREW: Well, thank you,
18 all. I have certainly been very much committed to
19 the Civil Service Commission. And I am pleased to
20 hear the reports that you've seen that commitment.

21 I also know that civil service is used as
22 something to compliment under certain circumstances
23 and something to criticize when people want to blame
24 someone other than themselves. And this team has

1 borne that very well. And I know you're looking
2 forward to the next challenge and the next
3 challenge.

4 I'm so pleased with the composition.
5 Commission Price has been -- has spent his whole
6 life in the community. It happened to be different
7 communities, but that gives him awareness and
8 contact with issues and people who are going to
9 influence what you address going forward.

10 And Commissioner Lynch is new, but
11 certainly mature in the fact that consensus is
12 important, but you've got to do the work. I don't
13 care.

14 If any of the employees who bring
15 discipline matters here don't believe that, that
16 you've got to do the work -- but I'm comfortable
17 with the fact that this team knows that you've got
18 to do the work.

19 So it is the next chapter, and I'm
20 pleased to have been here. I'm honored to have been
21 here. And I appreciate the fact that you have given
22 me respect and certainly challenge in that time.

23 So thank you. Press on. Stay strong.
24 And be blessed.

1 We are adjourned.

2 - - -

3 And, thereupon, the meeting was
4 concluded at approximately 9:36 a.m.

5 - - -

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 27th day of January, 2022, and transcribed from my stenographic notes.

TRACI E. PEOPLES
Professional Reporter and
Notary Public in and for
the State of Ohio

My Commission Expires: July 15, 2024

Larry Price, President

Date