

1

1

BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS

2

MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3

- - -

4

In the Matter of:

5

Regular Meeting

6

- - -

7

Larry Price

8

President, Presiding

9

- - -

10

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

11

- - -

12

Monday, February 28, 2022

13

12:30 p.m.

14

City of Columbus

15

Civil Service Commission

16

77 North Front Street

Columbus, Ohio 43215

17

- - -

18

SUSAN L. COOTS, RPR

Registered Professional Reporter

19

- - -

20

21

22

ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.

23

3040 Riverside Drive, Suite 125

24

Columbus, Ohio 43221

(614) 326-0177

2

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Larry Price, President
3 Jennifer Lynch

4 PRESENTERS:

5 Jennifer Shea
6 Beth Dyke
7 Margaret Bier
8 Tammy Rollins

9 ALSO PRESENT:

10 Wendy Brinnon

11 - - -

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

3

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 February 28, 2022
3 12:30 p.m.

4 - - -

5 P R O C E E D I N G S

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 28th day of
8 February, 2022, the Municipal Civil Service Commission
9 came for a regular meeting, Larry Price, President.
10 And the parties appearing in person and/or by counsel,
11 as hereinafter set forth, the following proceedings
12 were had:

13 - - -

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: Good afternoon.
15 I'll call to order the City of Columbus,
16 Ohio, Municipal Civil Service Commission regular
17 meeting for February 2022. We are following the
18 printed agenda.
19 The first item is review and approval of the
20 minutes of the January 27th, 2022, regular meeting.
21 MS. LYNCH: I move for the approval of the
22 minutes from the January 27th, 2022, regular meeting.
23 PRESIDENT PRICE: I second.
24 All in favor, say "Aye."
MS. LYNCH: Aye.
PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.
They are approved.
Next is item No. 2, pre-hearing conference
reviews.
MS. SHEA: Thank you.
We have three Trial Board prehearing
conference reviews that occurred in the month of
February. They are all with Columbus City Schools.
So just to give some overview of general
information first, and then I'll talk about each
specific Trial Board hearing as it relates to date and
commissioner assignments.

4

1 Overall, with all three of these pre-hearing
2 conferences, all of the parties were notified to the
3 general information that we usually provide, which is,
4 you know, at the time, COVID restrictions, as those --
5 if they change within the City, we will let the
6 parties know.

7 So, basically, what that means is that we
8 made sure to inform the parties to inform their
9 witnesses that we're still operating under the mayor's
10 executive order requiring masks and that we will still
11 have hearings in person.

12 We discussed whether or not there was audio
13 or visual evidence, and, if so, that the parties
14 needed to get that information to us as soon as
15 possible, and also just generally how to provide any
16 exhibits that were going to be coming before the
17 commission.

18 So the first pre-hearing conference review
19 is for Jason Williams versus the Columbus City
20 Schools. It is a termination of a truck driver
21 position. And this -- I'm sorry. This Trial Board
22 date is set for May 16th of this year at 10:00 a.m.
23 This is assigned to Commissioner Price.

24 The parties indicated that a total of three
25 to four hours would be needed for this hearing, and
26 that is due to a witness list of four witnesses for
27 Columbus City Schools alone, plus one to maybe two
28 witnesses for the Appellant.

29 The second pre-hearing conference that we
30 conducted this month is for Cynthia Strader; she was
31 also a truck driver. This is for a five-day
32 suspension imposed by Columbus City Schools. This
33 Trial Board is assigned to Commissioner Lynch, and it
34 is set for April 7th to begin at 10:00 a.m.

35 Each party indicated that they would need
36 approximately an hour and a half to present their
37 case, with a total of three hours for the hearing
38 approximately. Each side indicated that they plan to
39 call three witnesses.

40 And then, finally, we have Valina LaPaugh,
41 a secretary, and was suspended for four days, imposed
42 by Columbus City Schools. This is also assigned to
43 Commissioner Lynch.

44 The Trial Board date is May 5th of this year
45 to begin at 10:00 a.m. And the parties collectively
46 approximated that this hearing would last about three
47 and a half to four hours max.

48 Columbus City Schools has two witnesses to

5

1 present. The Appellant did not submit a witness list
2 because they indicate they don't have any witnesses to
3 be subpoenaed. Based on how the hearing goes that
4 day, they may decide to call the Appellant as a
5 witness, but that be will be an in-time decision based
6 on how the hearing is going.

7 That is what we have thus far coming up for
8 Trial Boards that have been assigned.

9 I don't have anything else to report.

10 Do you have any questions?

11 MS. LYNCH: I do not.

12 PRESIDENT PRICE: I do not.

13 Thank you, Ms. Shea. That's informational
14 only.

15 Next item is No. 3. Review and approval of
16 the Full Commission Hearing results for John Holycross
17 versus City of Columbus, Firefighter Discharged. The
18 hearing was held Thursday, January 27th, 2022, at
19 9:30 a.m. Appeal No. 20-CV-0004.

20 MS. SHEA: Thank you. Jennifer Shea, Civil
21 Service Commission staff.

22 This was a Trial Board, as Commissioner
23 Price indicated, that was called for a full commission
24 hearing.

25 And as way of brief background, this case
26 originated in 2020 and had ultimately been continued
27 multiple times -- or the hearing date had been
28 continued multiple times.

29 For the last scheduled hearing date, the
30 Appellant's attorney indicated that his client was not
31 available because his client had been incarcerated and
32 would not be available for the foreseeable future.

33 Prior to that last hearing date that the
34 hearing was scheduled for, the commission, through
35 Executive Director DeLong, indicated that Appellant
36 would not be granted any more continuances of this
37 matter just due to the length of how long this case
38 had pended with the commission.

39 Therefore, the case was called before a full
40 Commission Hearing Panel, and it was the collective
41 decision of the commissioner that the request for the
42 continuance was not granted and the commission
43 dismissed this case based on that information.

44 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Ms. Shea.

45 MS. LYNCH: I move for the approval of the
46 findings of the Full Commission Hearing result for
47 John Holycross versus City of Columbus, Firefighter,
48 Discharged, hearing held Thursday, January 27th, 2022,

6

1 at 9:30 a.m. Appeal No. 20-CA-0004.

PRESIDENT PRICE: I second.

2 All in favor, say "Aye."

MS. LYNCH: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: Findings are approved.

4 Next to No. 4 and 5 to be presented
together.

No. 4 is the request of the Civil Service
5 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
classification Community Clinical Counselor, retitle
6 it to read Community Clinical Counselor (Violence
Intervention), and amend Rule XI accordingly. Job
7 Code 1758.

No. 5 is a request of the Civil Service
8 Commission staff to revise the specification for the
classification Social Worker, retitle it to read
9 Community Clinical Counselor (Social Services), and
amend Rule XI accordingly. Job Code 1767.

10 MS. DYKE: Thank you. Beth Dyke, Personnel
Analyst with Civil Service staff.

11 Civil Service staff received a request from
a human resources officer from Columbus Public Health
12 requesting the specifications for the classifications
Community Clinical Counselor and Social Worker be
13 retitled and undergo minor revisions.

Discussions occurred with the department
14 representative with regards to changes occurring
within the social work field as the work has become
15 increasingly more involved with counseling.

As such, it is proposed to retitle
16 Social Worker to read Community Clinical Counselor
(Social Services). Additionally, it is proposed to
17 revise the minimum qualifications by adding to the
existing qualifying licensure, "Possession of a valid
18 State of Ohio license as Professional Clinical
Counselor, Professional Counselor, and Licensed
19 Independent Social Worker." These proposed additions
will provide the needed flexibility for the department
20 in hiring an appropriately licensed professional for
the specific vacancy.

21 One minor revision is also proposed to the
"Examples of Work" section to update the language
22 used.

23 Since the creation of the classification for
Community Clinical Counselor in April of 2021, the
department has had some time to use the
24 classification. This classification was enacted so
that incumbents would work with public safety teams in

7

1 order to better address the root causes of and assist
with violence in the community.

2 Consideration has been given to the current
3 use of the classification, and so it is proposed that
4 the specification for the classification be retitled
to read Community Clinical Counselor (Violence
Intervention).

5 It is further proposed to revise the
"Minimum Qualifications" section by adding a
6 substitution allowing for a Master's degree to
7 substitute for the one year of required experience.
This substitution allows for an additional qualifying
pathway to employment.

8 Additionally, due to the nature of the work
9 associated with the classification, it is proposed to
add a special note section clarifying that the
10 incumbent may be required to work in hazardous
situations with public safety officials and don body
armor or other Personal Protective Equipment.

11 These proposed revisions maintain
12 consistency with regards to the current use of the
classification and operational structure of Columbus
Public Health.

13 There are no other changes proposed to the
14 specifications at this time. It is, therefore,
recommended that the specifications be revised and
retitled as proposed and Rule XI amended accordingly.

15 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. Any questions?

16 MS. LYNCH: No.

17 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. I have one. And
I think this is well overdue considering what has been
going on in our community, so I think it is to be
applauded.

18 My question is, you mentioned Master's
degree or one year of experience. Is that or?

19 MS. DYKE: The Master's degree would
substitute for the required one year of experience.

20 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. So is there
something here that allows them to have X amount of
21 years of experience versus having a Master's degree
or --

22 MS. DYKE: Yes.

23 PRESIDENT PRICE: That's what I wanted to
clarify.

24 MS. DYKE: Yes, there is. Currently -- If
you don't mind me looking back here at the
specification.

PRESIDENT PRICE: No problem.

8

1 MS. LYNCH: It's an "and," not "or."
PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay.

2 MS. LYNCH: I was curious when you --
PRESIDENT PRICE: So it's an "and."

3 MS. DYKE: It's the licensure and one year
of experience. So the substitution would allow for
4 the Master's degree to replace the one year of
experience. But the licensure is still required
5 because of the professional level of the work.
PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay.

6 MS. LYNCH: I move to approve the revision
to the specification for the classification Community
7 Clinical Counselor, retitle it to read Community
Clinical Counselor (Violence Intervention), and amend
8 Rule XI accordingly; and to approve the revision of
the specification for the classification of Social
9 Worker, retitle it to read Community Clinical
Counselor (Social Services), and amend Rule XI
10 accordingly.

PRESIDENT PRICE: I second.
11 All in favor, say "Aye."
MS. LYNCH: Aye.

12 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.
They are approved.

13 MS. DYKE: Thank you.
PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Ms. Dyke.

14 No. 6 is a request of the Civil Service
Commission staff to impose a hiring moratorium on the
15 specification for the classification Active Living
Institute Administrator, Job Code 0760.

16 MS. BIER: Thank you. Maggie Bier,
Personnel Analyst with the Civil Service Commission.
17 The Active Living Institute Administrator
classification was last reviewed in August 2017.
18 There are currently no incumbents serving in this
classification located in Columbus Public Health since
19 July 2018. While the department is not interested in
abolishing at the moment, it was decided a hiring
20 moratorium would be agreeable with a proposed
abolishment at the next review.

21 It is, therefore, recommended that a hiring
moratorium be imposed on the Active Living Institute
22 Administrator classification.

PRESIDENT PRICE: Any questions?
23 MS. LYNCH: No.

24 I move to approve the hiring moratorium on
the specification Active Living Institute
Administrator.

9

1 PRESIDENT PRICE: I second.
 All in favor, say "Aye."
2 MS. LYNCH: Aye.
 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye. It is approved.
3 Thank you, Ms. Bier.
 PRESIDENT PRICE: No. 7 is a request of the
4 Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
specification for the classification Inspector General
5 Investigator, Job Code 3000.
 MS. ROLLINS: Tammy Rollins.
6 So it was just a short month ago that the
Inspector General classification was approved for
7 creation. At that time, the Inspector General had not
yet been announced; and since then, she has been
8 announced, and she's had an opportunity to review the
specification. Based on her review and expert
9 knowledge in the field, there were a couple of
proposed revisions that I'm presenting today.
10 These proposed revisions are within the
"Minimum Qualifications" section, and, essentially,
11 it's reducing the five years of experience to three
years of experience, adding that the insurance field
12 would be a viable field to recruit for candidates
based on the investigatory work that can happen within
13 the insurance field, and then allowing a substitution
that would allow years of experience to substitute for
14 the Bachelor's degree on a year-for-year basis.
 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay.
15 MS. LYNCH: I move to approve the revision
to the specification Inspector General Investigator.
16 PRESIDENT PRICE: I second.
 All in favor say, "Aye."
17 MS. LYNCH: Aye.
 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.
18 It is approved. Thank you, Tammy.
 MS. ROLLINS: Thank you.
19 PRESIDENT PRICE: No. 8, we have no
Residential Hearings.
20 No. 9. On the background removals with
consensus of the commission, applicants removed
21 pre-examination:
 Jenna Dunahm, police officer, reinstate.
22 Nicole Olson, police officer, reinstate.
 Cody Engleman, firefighter, reinstate.
23 Joseph Feasel, firefighter, reinstate.
 Bianca Inman, firefighter, reinstate.
24 Tjuan Peeples, firefighter, reinstate.
 Patrick Thornton, firefighter, reinstate.

10

1 Rachel Ebbert, firefighter, reinstate.
Eric Spohn, firefighter, reinstate.
2 Shane Hart, firefighter, reinstate.
Applicants Removed Post-Examination:
3 James Aubrey, III, police officer, do not
reinstatement;
4 Mohammad Ahmed, police officer, do not
reinstatement.
5 David Maddox, police officer, do not
reinstatement.
6 Joshua Sweet, firefighter, reinstate.
The remaining item on the agenda is the
7 other Administrative and Jurisdictional Reviews.
After having reviewed the letters of appeals
8 filed for Kahlililla Owens, Timothy Bowe, and
Robert Raab, are dismissed. The letters are approved
9 as written and the Director is authorized to
distribute the letters.
10 With that, we have completed the agenda and
we are adjourned.
11 Thank you. - - -
12 And, thereupon, the proceedings were
concluded at 12:52 a.m. - - -
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1 C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

2

3 I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a
4 true, correct and complete written transcript of the
5 proceedings in this matter, taken by me on the 28th
6 day of February, 2022, and transcribed from my
7 stenographic notes.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

SUSAN L. COOTS, RPR
Registered Professional
Reporter and Notary Public in
and for the State of Ohio.

My Commission Expires: January 10, 2025

Larry Price, President

Date