

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS  
MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

- - -

In the Matter of:

Regular Meeting

- - -

Larry Price

President, Presiding

- - -

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

- - -

Monday, January 30, 2023  
12:31 p.m.  
City of Columbus  
Civil Service Commission  
77 North Front Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

- - -

CHRISTY M. HEANEY

PROFESSIONAL REPORTER

- - -

ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.  
3040 Riverside Drive, Suite 125  
Columbus, Ohio 43221  
(614) 326-0177



- 1      APPEARANCES:
- 2      COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:
- 3           Larry Price, President
- 4           Jennifer Lynch
- 5           Dawn Tyler Lee
- 6      PRESENTERS:
- 7           Amy DeLong
- 8           Charday Litzy-Taylor
- 9           Carol Lagemann
- 10           Maggie Bier
- 11           Tammy Rollins
- 12      ALSO PRESENT:
- 13           Wendy Brinnon

- - -



1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION  
2 January 30, 2023  
3 12:31 p.m.

4 - - -

5 PROCEEDINGS

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 30th day of  
8 January, 2023, the Municipal Civil Service  
9 Commission came on for regular meeting, Larry  
10 Price, President. And the parties appearing in  
11 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set  
12 forth, the following proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: All right. I'll call  
15 to order the City of Columbus, Ohio, Municipal  
16 Civil Service Commission, regular meeting,  
17 January 30, 2023. We are following the printed  
18 agenda.

19 Item 1: Review and approval of the  
20 minutes from the December 19, 2022, regular  
21 meeting.

22 Chair will entertain a motion to approve.

23 MS. LYNCH: I move to approve the minutes  
24 from the December -- December 19, 2022, regular  
meeting.



1 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

2 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly  
3 moved and seconded.

4 Those in favor say "aye."

5 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

6 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

7 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

8 Motion passes.

9 Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews:

10 Nathaniel Alexander versus Columbus City  
11 Schools, head custodian - termination. Trial board  
12 scheduled for February 14, 2023, at 10 a.m.  
13 Appeal No. 22-BA-0013.

14 Taj Brown versus Columbus City Schools,  
15 childcare attendant - termination. Trial board is  
16 scheduled for March 2, 2023, at 10 a.m.  
17 Appeal No. 22-BA-0014.

18 Good morning, Amy.

19 MS. DELONG: Good morning. I am Amy  
20 DeLong; and I am here to present for Jen Shea, who  
21 is on vacation this week. As you can see, we have  
22 two upcoming hearings.

23 The first is, as you said, Nathaniel  
24 Alexander versus Columbus City Schools. The



5

1 pre-hearing conference was held on January 13 in  
2 the -- in the matter of Nathaniel versus Columbus  
3 City Schools regarding his termination from the  
4 position of head custodian.

5 Counsel for both parties attended,  
6 submitted witness lists and discussed procedures  
7 for documented and any other -- or any video or  
8 audio evidence. All witnesses have already been  
9 subpoenaed.

10 The trial board hearing is set for  
11 Tuesday, February 14 at 10 a.m. with Commissioner  
12 Price presiding. Both parties plan to call four  
13 witnesses each, and the estimated time for the --  
14 is four hours to conduct the hearing.

15 A pre-hearing conference was also  
16 scheduled on January 13 for Taj Brown regarding her  
17 termination from the position of childcare  
18 attendant. Counsel for both parties attended,  
19 submitted witness lists, also discussed the  
20 procedures and evidence to be presented. All  
21 witnesses have been subpoena.

22 The trial board hearing is scheduled for  
23 March 2, 10 a.m. with Commissioner Dawn Tyler Lee  
24 presiding. The appellant plans to call four

6



1 witnesses; Columbus City Schools plans to call  
2 three witnesses, and we plan for approximately 3.5  
3 hours to conduct that hearing.

4 And that is it.

5 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. How many hours  
6 on mine, Nathaniel?

7 MS. DELONG: Four.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: Four. Okay. For  
9 informational purposes only, correct?

10 MS. DELONG: Yeah.

11 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. Thank you.

12 Any questions?

13 Okay. Thank you.

14 Item No. 3: Request of the Civil Service  
15 Commission staff on behalf of Columbus City Schools  
16 to revise the specification for the classification  
17 Maintenance Plumber Supervisor, Job Code 5632.

18 And the chair will take a point of  
19 personal privilege to say to Charday, first of all,  
20 good afternoon.

21 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Good afternoon.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: And second of all,  
23 Charday presented at a community meeting last week  
24 that I attended; and she did an excellent job. I



1 was very proud of her. She represented -- That's  
2 right. She represented Civil Service Commission.

3 What I liked about it was that not only  
4 was she presenting, but she was personable and  
5 people were interacting with her. They really got  
6 what she was saying.

7 So I thought that was very reflective on  
8 not only her, but on the Commission as a whole.  
9 So, again, kudos to you and continue to -- continue  
10 to reach out. As I think all three commissioners  
11 would agree, community -- All of us have community  
12 relations background. So we know how important it  
13 is to touch the community. So, again, job well  
14 done.

15 Commissioners, any comments?

16 MS. LYNCH: None from me.  
17 Congratulations.

18 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. All right.

19 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Good afternoon and  
20 thank you. Charday Litzy-Taylor, personnel analyst  
21 with the Civil Service Commission staff. This  
22 action was initiated at the request of Columbus  
23 City Schools.

24 It is recommended that the State of Ohio



1 plumbing contractor's license and the State of Ohio  
2 automatic sprinkler and standpipe systems  
3 certificate requirement be removed from the minimum  
4 qualifications.

5               Since these are not contractor positions  
6 and maintenance, repair and design work specific to  
7 the sprinkler and standpipe systems are outsourced  
8 to an outside vendor, the State of Ohio plumbing  
9 contractor's license and the automatic sprinkler  
10 and standpipe system certificate are not applicable  
11 to this classification.

12              Removing these certifications will enable  
13 the district to recruit and hire candidates with  
14 the required years of applicable experience.

15              There are no other revisions proposed at  
16 this time.

17              PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

18              Any questions, Commissioners?

19              MS. LYNCH: No.

20              PRESIDENT PRICE: There would be no  
21 questions.

22              Chair will entertain a motion to approve.

23              MS. LYNCH: I move to revise the  
24 specification for the classification Maintenance



1 Plumber Supervisor, Job Code 5632.

2 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly  
4 moved and seconded.

5 All those in favor say "aye."

6 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

7 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

9 Motion carries.

10 Item 4: Request of the Civil Service  
11 Commission staff on behalf of Columbus City Schools  
12 to revise the specification for the classification  
13 Human Resources Representative.

14 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: This action was also  
15 initiated at the request of Columbus City Schools.

16 It is recommended that a full  
17 substitution be added allowing human resources  
18 experience in a human resources office, company,  
19 firm or department be allowed to substitute for the  
20 educational requirement on a year-for-year basis.

21 It is the intention of the district that  
22 this classification serve as a promotional  
23 opportunity for employees serving in the Human  
24 Resources Assistant I and Human Resources Assistant



1 II job classifications.

2               However, as currently written employees  
3 in these classifications without a degree would not  
4 qualify. With the proposed changes, it is also  
5 recommended that the Human Resources Representative  
6 be removed -- or be moved to the administrative  
7 support job family within the payroll and personnel  
8 group and be placed in series with Human Resources  
9 Assistant I and Human Resources Assistant II as the  
10 senior classification.

11              The proposed revisions provide a clear  
12 career path for current human resources assistant  
13 employees and gives the district the ability to  
14 recruit and hire external candidates who have the  
15 years of applicable experience but may not have the  
16 college degree.

17              There are no other revisions proposed at  
18 this time.

19              PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Charday.

20              Any questions from the commissioners?

21              There would be no questions. Chair will  
22 entertain a motion.

23              MS. LYNCH: I move to revise the  
24 specification for the classification Human Resource



11

1 Representative, Job Code 5757.

2 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly  
4 moved and seconded.

5 All those in favor say "aye."

6 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

7 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: All those opposed?

9 Ayes have it. Motion carries.

10 MS. LITZY-TAYLOR: Thank you.

11 PRESIDENT PRICE: Item 5: Request of the  
12 Civil Service Commission staff on behalf of  
13 Columbus City Schools to merge the specification  
14 for the classification Safety and Security  
15 Specialist II into Safety and Security Specialist  
16 I, revise and retitle it to read Safety and  
17 Security Specialist and change the probationary  
18 period to 180 days; is that right?

19 MS. BIER: Correct.

20 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. Charday moved on  
21 me.

22 MS. BRINNON: Maggie.

23 PRESIDENT PRICE: Maggie.

24 MS. BIER: Good afternoon. Maggie Bier,



1 personnel analyst with the Civil Service  
2 Commission.

3 This review was initiated at the request  
4 of Columbus City Schools as a result of the new  
5 bargaining agreement between Columbus City Schools  
6 Board of Education and OAPSE Local 581.

7 After review of these two classifications  
8 and communications with district representatives,  
9 it was determined that there is no difference in  
10 the duties being performed between these two  
11 classifications.

12 Therefore, it is proposed that the Safety  
13 and Security Specialist II be merged into Safety  
14 Specialist -- Safety and Security Specialist I and  
15 be retitled to read Safety and Security Specialist.

16 It is recommended to add monitoring into  
17 the definition in order to better reflect the work  
18 being performed. Within the example of work  
19 section, several revisions are proposed in order to  
20 reflect duties of both classifications.

21 Regarding the minimum qualifications  
22 section it is recommended that wording -- that  
23 wording changes be made in order to provide further  
24 clarity.



1                   It is also proposed to revise the  
2   language regarding the possession of a valid motor  
3   vehicle operator's license to read valid driver's  
4   license.

5                   Lastly, it is recommended that the  
6   probationary period be changed from 365 days to 180  
7   days per the language within the bargaining  
8   agreement between OAPSE Local 581 and the Board of  
9   Education.

10                  There are no other changes proposed.

11                  PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Maggie.

12                  Questions from commissioners?

13                  Now I'll entertain a motion to approve.

14                  MS. LYNCH: I move to merge the  
15   specification for the classification Safety and  
16   Security Specialist II into Safety and Security  
17   Specialist I, revise and retitle it to read Safety  
18   and Security Specialist and to change the  
19   probationary period to 180 days.

20                  MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

21                  PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
22   seconded.

23                  All those in favor say "aye."

24                  MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.



1 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

2 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

3 Motion carries.

4 MS. BIER: Thank you.

5 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Maggie.

6 Items 6, 7 and 8 will be combined.

7 Good afternoon, Carol.

8 MS. LAGEMANN: Hello.

9 PRESIDENT PRICE: Request of the Civil  
10 Service Commission staff -- I'm sorry.

11 Item 6: Request of the Civil Service  
12 Commission staff to revise the specification for  
13 the classification Recreation Assistant Manager.

14 Item 7: Request of the Civil Service  
15 Commission staff to revise the specification for  
16 the classification Aquatics Supervisor (Year  
17 Round).

18 Item 8: Request of the Civil Service  
19 Commission staff to revise the specification for  
20 the classification Aquatics Supervisor (Seasonal).

21 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, personnel  
22 analyst with Civil Service Commission, presenting  
23 on behalf of Linda Loften and myself.

24 The request for Civil Service Commission



15

1 staff to revise these three specification  
2 classifications was initiated by a request from the  
3 Department of Rec and Parks.

4 The expectation is the proposed changes  
5 will aid the aquatic section to be better able to  
6 train lifeguards for the annual pool opening push  
7 in the spring.

8 This responsibility used to fall solely  
9 to the recreation assistant managers in aquatics  
10 but is now going to be expected of the more  
11 numerous aquatic supervisor incumbents.

12 It's proposed to revise the minimum  
13 qualification section to require incumbents in  
14 these three classifications to obtain the lifeguard  
15 instructor certification, which is the one that  
16 allows them to certify lifeguards, by the end of  
17 the probationary period. The Aquatic Supervisor  
18 will continue to require the lifeguard  
19 certification at the time of hire.

20 In addition, those that will be teaching  
21 swim lessons will be required to have the water  
22 safety instruction or the basic swim instruction  
23 certifications in order to teach the swim lessons.  
24 And these certificates are not required at time of



1 hire but should be obtained prior to teaching the  
2 lessons.

3 Finally, an "or" section within the  
4 minimum qualification is proposed to be deleted as  
5 the American Red Cross no longer offers a lifeguard  
6 certification that does not include CPR and first  
7 aid components.

8 There are no other changes proposed.

9 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

10 Questions from the commissioners?

11 I have one.

12 MS. LAGEMANN: Uh-huh.

13 PRESIDENT PRICE: Is this -- I'm -- It's  
14 my understanding there was a shortage of lifeguards  
15 last year for the City. Is this in response to  
16 that, to make sure that we have more?

17 MS. LAGEMANN: Quite possibly. The  
18 expectation is that they should be able to at least  
19 train more of the lifeguards in a quicker fashion  
20 and then get them on board sooner, so --

21 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. I saw several  
22 heads nodding in the back, so I assume. Okay.  
23 Great. Great. Because I know there was a shortage  
24 last year, so -- Thank you.



17

1                   The chair will entertain a motion to  
2   approve.

3                   MS. LYNCH: I move to revise the  
4   specification for the classification Recreation  
5   Assistant Manager.

6                   I move to revise the specification for  
7   the classification Aquatics Supervisor.

8                   And, finally, I move to revise the  
9   specification for the classification Aquatics  
10  Supervisor.

11                  MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

12                  PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
13  seconded.

14                  All those in favor of the motions clarify  
15  by saying "aye."

16                  MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

17                  MS. LYNCH: Aye.

18                  PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

19                  Motions carry.

20                  Item 9: Request of the Civil Service  
21  Commission staff to revise the specification for  
22  the classification Golf Professional.

23                  MS. LAGEMANN: Again, Carol Lagemann,  
24  personnel analyst with Civil Service, presenting on



1     behalf of Linda Loftin and myself.

2                 The request for us to revise the Golf  
3     Professional classification was initiated by the  
4     Department of Recreation and Parks.

5                 It's proposed to remove the experience  
6     requirement from the minimum qualifications. After  
7     removing the requirement, there's still an  
8     appropriate progression represented in the three  
9     class series that includes golf assistant  
10    professional, golf professional and golf program  
11    manager.

12                And additionally, an applicant that has  
13    the Class A membership, which is required to get  
14    into this classification, will still have to have  
15    had golf-related experience due to both the PGA and  
16    LPGA requiring that kind of experience to obtain  
17    the Class A membership in their organizations.

18                So there are no other changes proposed.

19                PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Carol.

20                Questions from commissioners?

21                Hearing none the chair will entertain a  
22    motion to approve.

23                MS. LYNCH: I move to revise the  
24    specification for the classification Golf



1 Professional.

2 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
4 seconded.

5 All those in favor say "aye."

6 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

7 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

9 Motion carries.

10 Item 10.

11 Maggie's back.

12 MS. BIER: Hello.

13 PRESIDENT PRICE: See, when I put my head  
14 down to read and I come back up, there's a  
15 different person sitting there. Okay. Maggie.

16 Item 10: Request of the Civil Service  
17 Commission staff to create the specification for  
18 the classification Traffic Management Revision  
19 Assistant Administrator, assign a probationary  
20 period of 365 days, designate the examination type  
21 as noncompetitive and amend Rule XI accordingly.

22 MS. BIER: Good afternoon. Maggie Bier,  
23 again, personnel analyst with the Civil Service  
24 Commission.



1                   The request for the Civil Service  
2   Commission to create the classification Parking  
3   Management Assistant Division Administrator was  
4   initiated by a class action request from Public  
5   Service.

6                   Through discussions with representatives  
7   from Public Service, it was determined there is a  
8   need for a classification to provide an extra -- an  
9   additional layer of management that is not part of  
10   a bargaining unit within the Division of Traffic  
11   Management since the division itself is managed by  
12   three Engineer IV's and one planning manager, who  
13   directly reports to the division administrator.

14                  By definition, the proposed Parking  
15   Management Assistant Division Administrator, under  
16   administrative direction, is responsible for  
17   assisting the planning, coordinating and directing  
18   the engineering activities of the Traffic  
19   Management Division.

20                  The examples of work and knowledge,  
21   skills and ability sections were developed to  
22   include those statements that were identified as  
23   important for the proposed classification.

24                  The minimum qualification section was



21

1 developed to reflect the qualifications necessary  
2 for successful performance of the job as well as to  
3 align with similar administrator classifications  
4 within the City classification plan.

5 It is recommended that the probationary  
6 period be assigned as 365 days, which is consistent  
7 with other classifications responsible for  
8 supervisory work, and the administration of a major  
9 section.

10 It is further recommended that the  
11 examination type be designated as noncompetitive.  
12 This is consistent with the class plan for  
13 classifications performing this level and scope.

14 It is also recommended that this  
15 classification be assigned within the executive job  
16 family within the class plan and the  
17 official/administrator, EEO/DOJ job category.

18 It is, therefore, recommended that  
19 this -- the classification Parking Management  
20 Division Assistant Administrator be created as  
21 proposed and amend Rule XI accordingly.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Maggie.

23 Any questions from commissioners?

24 Hearing none the chair will entertain a



1 motion to approve.

2 MS. LYNCH: I move to create the  
3 specification for the classification Traffic  
4 Management Division Assistant Administrator, assign  
5 a probationary period of 365 days, designate the  
6 examination type as noncompetitive and amend  
7 Rule XI accordingly.

8 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

9 PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
10 seconded.

11 All those in favor say "aye."

12 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

13 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

15 Motion carries.

16 Item 11.

17 MS. ROLLINS: Good afternoon.

18 PRESIDENT PRICE: Request of the Civil  
19 Service Commission staff to create the  
20 specification for the classification Public Health  
21 Administrator (Public Health Innovation), assign a  
22 probationary period of 365 days and designate the  
23 examination type as noncompetitive and amend  
24 Rule XI accordingly.



23

1                   Good afternoon, Tammy.

2                   MS. ROLLINS: Good afternoon.

3                   Tammy Rollins. This is a request that we  
4   received from the Columbus Public Health. They  
5   were requesting that we create a classification to  
6   administer the programs and activities housed under  
7   the center for Public Health Innovation, which was  
8   formed in 2020.

9                   This center was essentially created to  
10   combat the health disparities and to break down the  
11   barriers to equity experienced by city residents  
12   due to racism.

13                  In order to properly emphasize the  
14   significance of this work, Columbus Public Health  
15   would like to formally recognize this  
16   classification and this work to be on equal footing  
17   with the other administrators within the public  
18   health department; and some of those other  
19   organizational areas are like environmental health,  
20   clinical health, family health.

21                  And so it would be -- I mean, their  
22   organizational chart has their major administrator  
23   levels, all -- all titled as administrators; and  
24   they all participate in executive management teams.



24

1 And they wanted the administrator over the CPHI to  
2 have that same title and presence in these meetings  
3 as their other administrators.

4 The definition would essentially be the  
5 Public Health Administrator would be responsible  
6 for the administration of the Center for Public  
7 Health Innovation. The incumbent of this  
8 classification would serve as the chief -- chief  
9 health equity officer.

10 The proposed minimum qualifications was  
11 modeled after qualifications of other public health  
12 administrators as far as level of experience  
13 required. The type of experience that the  
14 department would specifically be looking at was  
15 written to include diversity, equity, and/or  
16 conclusion within a public health field.

17 So coming into the job, you would have  
18 that particular experience; but the level of  
19 experience would be similar as the other  
20 administrators to which this position would have  
21 equal footing.

22 It is proposed that the classification  
23 have a probationary period of 365 days and the  
24 examination type be designated as noncompetitive.



1 This is consistent across the board with other  
2 administrator classifications in the health  
3 departments.

4 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Tammy.

5 Questions from commissioners?

6 Okay. Hearing none the chair will  
7 entertain a motion to approve.

8 MS. LYNCH: I move to create the  
9 specification for the classification Public Health  
10 Administrator, assign a -- a probationary period of  
11 365 days, designate the examination type as  
12 noncompetitive and amend Rule XI accordingly.

13 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly  
15 moved and seconded.

16 All those in favor say "aye."

17 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

18 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

19 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

20 All opposed?

21 Motion carries.

22 Item 12: Request of the Civil Service  
23 Commission staff to abolish the specification for  
24 the classification Active Living Institute



1 Administrator and -- and amend Rule XI accordingly.

2 MS. ROLLINS: This classification was  
3 created in 2008 with a very specific need in mind  
4 that no longer exists. In fact, the classification  
5 has been vacant since July 2018.

6 The department is now in agreement to  
7 move forward with the proposed abolishment of this  
8 classification as there's no future need for it as  
9 it is written.

10 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. Thank you.

11 Any questions from commissioners?

12 Hearing none chair will entertain a  
13 motion to approve.

14 MS. LYNCH: I move to abolish the  
15 specification for the classification Active Living  
16 Institute Administrator and amend Rule XI  
17 accordingly.

18 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

19 PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
20 seconded.

21 All those in favor say "aye."

22 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

23 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

24 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.



1 Motion passes.

2 Item 13: Request of the Civil Service  
3 Commission staff to revise the classification of  
4 Refuse Collection Operations Coordinator.

5 MS. ROLLINS: This, too, is a request  
6 that we received from the Department of Public  
7 Service.

8 Part of this request was asking that we  
9 take a look at the experience substitution within  
10 the minimum qualifications to see if they could be  
11 modified somewhat to be -- to allow for a greater  
12 applicant pool.

13 So as we were looking at the  
14 substitution, I mean, there's some agreement with  
15 what the department was saying. Right now the  
16 current substitution allows for managerial  
17 experience to substitute for the bachelor's degree  
18 on a year-for-year basis, which means that with the  
19 current substitution in place, applicants would  
20 have to have eight years of managerial experience  
21 if they didn't have the bachelor's degree.

22 Eight years of managerial experience  
23 is -- is more typical and probably even higher than  
24 what we have for a lot of our division



1 administrators, which tend to be around the five  
2 years of managerial experience.

3               So we -- Basically, we're looking at the  
4 qualifications and how we could write this  
5 experience substitution; and it was agreed that  
6 allowing administrative or supervisory experience  
7 within a solid waste management organization could  
8 substitute for that experience. So it's not the  
9 same level of managerial.

10              And reality is, I mean, the  
11 administrative level experience is more  
12 commensurate with what you would get with a  
13 bachelor's degree type -- type program. The  
14 department was very happy with that, and that is  
15 the proposal.

16              There are no other proposed changes to  
17 the spec.

18              PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Tammy.

19              Any questions from commissioners?

20              Hearing none -- Hearing none the chair  
21 will entertain a motion to approve.

22              MS. LYNCH: I move to revise the  
23 classification of Refuse Collection Operations  
24 Coordinator.



1 MS. TYLER LEE: Second.

2 PRESIDENT PRICE: Been properly moved and  
3 seconded.

4 All those in favor say "aye."

5 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

6 MS. LYNCH: Aye.

7 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

8 Motion passes.

9 Item 14: Background removals.

10 Applicants removed postexam:

11 Amaya Camarena, police officer, do not  
12 reinstate.

13 Arthur Pietrangelo, police officer, do  
14 not reinstate.

15 Other Administrative Jurisdictional  
16 Reviews:

17 22-BA-0012: Review and approval to  
18 dismiss the appeal filed December 6, 2022,  
19 regarding a notice of appeal for Shakikta Moorner.

20 Nature of appeal: One day suspension, Academic  
21 Youth Support Advocate, Appeal No. 22-BA-0012.

22 Before closing today's meeting, I would  
23 like to announce that the next regular Civil  
24 Service Commission meeting will be held at the



1 Michael B. Coleman Government Center, Room 204, on  
2 February 27, 2023.

3 And one more comment, again, to our  
4 director, Amy, and to staff. It is my  
5 understanding and shared with us that we had a  
6 very, very successful meeting Saturday, over 300 --  
7 400. I knew it. Over 400 participants.

8 Again, on behalf of -- of commissioners,  
9 and they're definitely free to speak, this outreach  
10 that we're doing is very, very important. We want  
11 to make sure that people understand what we do, how  
12 we do it, and why we do it. So, again, the staff  
13 is to be commended.

14 Any thoughts from the commissioners?

15 MS. TYLER LEE: You covered it. Thank  
16 you.

17 MS. BRINNON: Just one point of  
18 clarification --

19 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay.

20 MS. BRINNON: -- if I may for the other  
21 administrative and jurisdictional reviews.

22 Just a note that the Commission did  
23 approve the dismissal. You read the -- the subject  
24 line, but we didn't actually state what we were



31

1     doing.

2                     So we are -- you -- you are approving --

3                     PRESIDENT PRICE:   Okay.   Do we need to  
4     take a vote on it?

5                     MS. BRINNON:   No, you don't need to vote.

6                     PRESIDENT PRICE:   Okay.

7                     MS. BRINNON:   I just need to know that  
8     the action was to approve the dismissal.

9                     PRESIDENT PRICE:   Yeah.   Review and  
10    approval to dismiss, that part?

11                    MS. BRINNON:   So it's to dismiss and the  
12    director is okay to distribute the letter as  
13    written.

14                    PRESIDENT PRICE:   Okay.   The director is  
15    given -- changed the language a little bit -- given  
16    permission to distribute the letter as written.

17                    MS. BRINNON:   As written, yes.

18                    PRESIDENT PRICE:   Okay.   Thank you.

19                    With that we have completed the agenda,  
20    and we are now adjourned.

21                                       - - -

22                    And, thereupon, the meeting was  
23    concluded at approximately 12:59 p.m.

24                                       - - -



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the digitally recorded proceedings in this matter and transcribed by me to the best of my ability on the 13th day of February, 2023.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Christy M. Heaney  
Professional Reporter  
Notary Public in and for  
the State of Ohio.

My Commission Expires: March 25, 2026.

_____ Larry Price, President	_____ 02/27/2023 Date
---------------------------------	-----------------------------