

1

1 BEFORE THE CITY OF COLUMBUS
2 MUNICIPAL CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION

3 - - -

4 In the Matter of:

5 Regular Meeting

6 - - -

7 Larry Price

8 President, Presiding

9 - - -

10 TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

11 - - -

12

13 Monday, October 30, 2023
14 12:29 p.m.
15 City of Columbus
16 Civil Service Commission
17 77 North Front Street
18 Columbus, Ohio 43215

19 - - -

20 CHRISTY M. HEANEY

21 PROFESSIONAL REPORTER

22 - - -

23

24 ANDERSON REPORTING SERVICES, INC.
 3040 Riverside Drive, Suite 125
 Columbus, Ohio 43221
 (614) 326-0177

1 COMMISSION MEMBERS PRESENT:

2 Larry Price, President
3 Dawn Tyler Lee
4 Mark Hatch

5 PRESENTERS:

6 Beth Dyke
7 Lynda Lofton
8 Maggie Bier
9 Carol Lagemann

10 ALSO PRESENT:

11 Wendy Brinnon

12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24

1 MONDAY AFTERNOON SESSION
2 October 30, 2023
3 12:29 p.m.

4 - - -

5 PROCEEDINGS

6 - - -

7 BE IT REMEMBERED THAT, on the 30th day of
8 October, 2023, the Municipal Civil Service
9 Commission came on for regular meeting, Larry
10 Price, President. And the parties appearing in
11 person and/or by counsel, as hereinafter set
12 forth, the following proceedings were had:

13 - - -

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: I'll call to order the
15 City of Columbus, Ohio, Municipal Civil Service
16 Commission, regular meeting, October 30, 2023. We
17 are following the printed agenda.

18 Item 1: Review and approval of the
19 minutes from the September 25, 2023, regular
20 meeting and October 16, 2023, special meeting.

21 Chair will entertain a motion.

22 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
23 Item No. 1: Review and approval of the minutes
24 from the September 25, 2023, regular meeting and
October 16, 2023, special meeting.

1 MR. HATCH: Second.

2 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
3 moved and seconded.

4 All those in favor say "aye."

5 MR. HATCH: Aye.

6 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

7 PRESIDENT PRICE: All those opposed?

8 Motion passes.

9 Item 2: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews,
10 none submitted.

11 Item 3: Trial Board Recommendations,
12 none submitted.

13 Items 4, 5, 6, 7 and 8 shall be combined.

14 Item 4: Request of the Civil Service
15 Commission staff to approve the specification
16 review for the classification City Clerk with no
17 revisions.

18 Item 5: Request of the city -- city
19 service commission staff to approve the
20 specification review for the classification Deputy
21 City Clerk with no revisions.

22 Item 6: Request of the city service --
23 I'm sorry -- Civil Service Commission staff to
24 approve the specification review for the

1 classification Citywide Web Coordinator with no
2 revisions.

3 Item 7: Request of the Civil Service
4 Commission staff to approve the specification
5 review for the classification Employee Assistance
6 Program Manager with no revisions.

7 Item 8: Request of the Civil Service
8 Commission staff to approve the specification
9 review for the classification Crime Analyst
10 Supervisor with no revisions.

11 Good morning, Beth.

12 MS. DYKE: Good morning -- Or good
13 afternoon.

14 PRESIDENT PRICE: Good afternoon.

15 MS. TYLER LEE: My fault.

16 PRESIDENT PRICE: That was already --

17 MS. DYKE: Beth Dyke, personnel analyst
18 with the Civil Service staff. The review of these
19 classifications is part of the Civil Service
20 Commission staff's effort to review all
21 classifications every five years.

22 Based on feedback received, it was
23 determined that the current specification still
24 accurate -- accurately reflect the work being done.

1 It is recommended that the review of the
2 specifications be approved with no revisions.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
4 commissioners?

5 Hearing none, Chair will entertain
6 motions.

7 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
8 Item No. 4: Request of the Civil Service
9 Commission staff to approve the specification
10 review for the classification of City Clerk.

11 Agenda Item 5: Deputy City Clerk.

12 Agenda Item 6: Citywide Web Coordinator.

13 Agenda Item No. 7: Employee Assistance
14 Program Manager.

15 And Agenda Item No. 8: Crime Analyst
16 Supervisor, all with no revisions.

17 MR. HATCH: Second.

18 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
19 moved and seconded.

20 All those in favor say "aye."

21 MR. HATCH: Aye.

22 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

24 All opposed?

1 Motions pass.

2 Item 9: Request of the Civil Service
3 Commission staff to revise the specification for
4 the classification Health Education Program
5 Planner.

6 MS. DYKE: Yes. Beth Dyke, again,
7 personnel analyst. The review of this
8 classification is part of the Civil Service
9 Commission staff's effort to review all
10 classifications every five years.

11 In the examples of work section, it is
12 recommended to revise the language of an existing
13 statement which discusses the incident command
14 system team.

15 The proposed revision allows for the use
16 of the preferred language utilized within Columbus
17 Public Health; therefore, it is recommended that
18 the Health Education Program Planner be revised as
19 proposed.

20 And there are no other revisions proposed
21 at this time.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

23 Questions from commissioners?

24 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a

1 motion.

2 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
3 Item No. 9: Request of the Civil Service
4 Commission staff to revise the specification for
5 the classification Health Education Program
6 Planner.

7 MR. HATCH: Second.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
9 moved and seconded.

10 All those in favor say "aye."

11 MR. HATCH: Aye.

12 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

13 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

14 All those opposed?

15 Motion passes.

16 MS. DYKE: Thank you.

17 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

18 Item 10 -- Good afternoon, Lynda.

19 MS. LOFTON: Good afternoon.

20 PRESIDENT PRICE: Request of the Civil
21 Service Commission staff to revise the
22 specification for the classification Employee
23 Assistance Counselor.

24 MS. LOFTON: Lynda Lofton, personnel

1 analyst, Civil Service staff. The review of this
2 classification is part of the Civil Service
3 Commission's efforts to review all classifications
4 every five years.

5 Feedback from department representatives
6 and current incumbents were -- was collected, and
7 after review of this series -- I'm sorry -- after
8 this -- after review of this classification
9 including -- I'm sorry.

10 After review of this classification, it
11 was determined that the specification still
12 accurately represents the work as it currently
13 exists.

14 However, with the minimum qualifications
15 section, it is recommended to update the current
16 language "possession of a valid motor vehicle
17 operator's license" to the preferred language
18 "possession of a valid driver's license."

19 No other revisions are proposed to this
20 classification at this time.

21 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
22 commissioners?

23 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
24 motion.

10

1 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
2 Item 10: Request of the Civil Service Commission
3 staff to revise the specification for the
4 classification Employee Assistance Counselor.

5 MR. HATCH: Second.

6 MS. TYLER LEE: It's been properly moved
7 and seconded.

8 All those in favor say "aye."

9 MR. HATCH: Aye.

10 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

11 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

12 All those opposed?

13 Motion passes.

14 Items 11 and 12 shall be combined.

15 Item -- Item 11: Request of the Civil
16 Service Commission staff to revise the
17 specification for the classification Parking
18 Enforcement Officer.

19 Item 12: Request of the Civil Service
20 Commission staff to revise the specification for
21 the classification Parking Enforcement Supervisor.

22 MS. LOFTON: Lynda Lofton, personnel
23 analyst, Civil Service staff. The parking
24 enforcement series consists of Parking Enforcement

11

1 Officer and Parking Enforcement Supervisor.

2 The Parking Enforcement Officer serves as
3 the entry-level classification of this series; and
4 under general supervision, Parking Enforcement
5 Officers are responsible for issuing parking
6 violation tickets and identifying vehicles that are
7 eligible for impoundment or immobilization.

8 While the definition of this
9 classification still accurately represents the work
10 as it currently exists, revisions are recommended
11 to this classification.

12 It is recommended to add additional
13 experience content to the minimum qualifications
14 section to broaden the work experience requirement
15 for entry into this class.

16 Feedback from incumbents has indicated
17 that while serving in this class, public behaviors
18 may escalate and intensify; therefore, it is
19 recommended to revise the minimum qualifications
20 section to require completion of the 12th school
21 grade and one year of experience in customer
22 service or public contact, conflict resolution,
23 general office related experience or deescalation
24 tactics.

12

1 Additionally, it is recommended to update
2 "possession of a valid motor vehicle operator's
3 license" to the preferred language "possession of a
4 valid driver's license."

5 Within the knowledge, skills and
6 abilities section, it is recommended to add
7 language referencing the addition of the
8 deescalation and conflict resolution as well as
9 reference the use of mobile devices. These
10 additions support the proposed minimum
11 qualifications and work related skill sets.

12 Further, it should be noted that the
13 public service departmental HR representatives
14 requested removal of the civil service exam for
15 Parking Enforcement Officer.

16 However, it is important to note that
17 examples of work and knowledge, skills and
18 abilities described in the -- I'm sorry -- in the
19 specification do not support removal of the civil
20 service exam; therefore, no other revisions are
21 proposed to probationary period or exam type.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

23 Questions from commissioners?

24 MS. LOFTON: I'm sorry. I have one more.

13

1 I apologize.

2 PRESIDENT PRICE: Okay. I'm sorry. Last
3 time they combined them.

4 MS. LOFTON: Lastly, in reviewing Parking
5 Enforcement Supervisor, it was determined that the
6 current specification accurately represents the
7 work performed; however, it is recommended to
8 update language regarding "possession of a valid
9 motor vehicle operator's license" to the preferred
10 "possession of a valid driver's license."

11 There are no revisions -- I'm sorry -- no
12 additional revisions recommended for Parking
13 Enforcement Supervisor and no other revisions
14 recommended for this series.

15 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you, Lynda.

16 MS. LOFTON: Thank you.

17 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
18 commissioners?

19 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
20 motion.

21 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
22 Item No. 11: Request of the Civil Service
23 Commission staff to revise the specification for
24 the classification of Parking Enforcement Officer.

14

1 And Agenda Item No. 12: Parking
2 Enforcement Supervisor.

3 MR. HATCH: Second.

4 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
5 moved and seconded.

6 All those in favor say "aye."

7 MR. HATCH: Aye.

8 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

9 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

10 All those opposed?

11 Motions passes.

12 MS. LOFTON: Thank you.

13 PRESIDENT PRICE: Items 13, 14 and 15
14 will be combined.

15 Good afternoon, Maggie.

16 MS. BIER: Good afternoon.

17 PRESIDENT PRICE: Item 13: Request of
18 the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
19 specification for the classification Medical
20 Technologist.

21 Item 14: Request of the Civil Service
22 Commission staff to revise the specification for
23 the classification Medical Technologist Supervisor.

24 Item 15: Request of the Civil Service

15

1 Commission staff to revise the specification for
2 the classification Medical Laboratory Manager.

3 MS. BIER: Thank you.

4 Maggie Bier, personnel analyst with the
5 Civil Service Commission. The review of these
6 classifications is part of the Civil Service
7 Commission's efforts to review all classifications
8 every five years.

9 Within the -- with -- Excuse me. Within
10 the example of work section of the Medical
11 Technologist classification, it is recommended to
12 revise the language regarding the incident command
13 system to the following updated vernacular used
14 within Columbus Public Health: The National
15 Credentialing Agency for Laboratory Personnel
16 merged with the Board of Registry of the American
17 Society for Clinical Pathology and created the
18 Board of Certification of the American Society for
19 Clinical Pathology in 2009.

20 Therefore, it's proposed to revise the
21 minimum qualifications of all three classifications
22 to reflect these changes.

23 In addition it is recommended to update
24 the language regarding "possession of a valid motor

16

1 vehicle operator's license" to read "possession of
2 a valid driver's license" within the Medical
3 Technologist classification.

4 There are no other changes proposed at
5 this time.

6 PRESIDENT PRICE: Any questions from
7 commissioners?

8 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
9 motion.

10 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
11 Item 13: Request of the Civil Service Commission
12 staff to revise the specification for the
13 classification Medical Technologist.

14 Item 14: Medical Technologist
15 Supervisor.

16 And Item 15: Medical Laboratory Manager.

17 MR. HATCH: Second.

18 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
19 moved and seconded.

20 All those in favor say "aye."

21 MR. HATCH: Aye.

22 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

23 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

24 All opposed?

17

1 Motions passes.

2 Item 16: Request of the Civil Service
3 Commission staff to revise the specification for
4 the classification Crime Analyst.

5 MS. BIER: Thank you.

6 Maggie Bier, again, personnel analyst
7 with the Civil Service Commission. The review of
8 this classification is also part of Civil Service
9 Commission's efforts to review all classifications
10 every five years.

11 It is recommended to revise two
12 statements regarding -- two statements in order to
13 better describe the current duties being performed
14 within the examples of work section.

15 Within the knowledge, skills and
16 abilities section, it is recommended to separate a
17 knowledge statement into three different knowledge
18 statements to separate the different competencies
19 and for easier readability.

20 In addition, it is recommended to add the
21 statement "Ability to communicate effectively,
22 orally" or -- "and in writing."

23 There are no other changes proposed at
24 this time.

18

1 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
2 commissioners?

3 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
4 motion.

5 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
6 Item 16: Request of the Civil Service Commission
7 staff to revise the specification for the
8 classification Crime Analyst.

9 MR. HATCH: Second.

10 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
11 moved and seconded.

12 All those in favor say "aye."

13 MR. HATCH: Aye.

14 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

15 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

16 All opposed?

17 The motion passes.

18 MS. BIER: Thank you.

19 PRESIDENT PRICE: Thank you.

20 Good afternoon, Carol.

21 MS. LAGEMANN: Hey.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: Item 17: Request of
23 the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the
24 specification for the classification Equal

19

1 Opportunity Representative.

2 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, personnel
3 analyst with Civil Service Commission. The review
4 of this classification was part of our effort to
5 review all classifications every five years.

6 The only proposed revision is to add
7 that, "Some positions may require a driver's
8 license."

9 When allocated to the mayor's office,
10 some positions may be required to go -- to drive to
11 meet with business representatives in this city;
12 therefore, it's recommended the specification for
13 the classification Equal Opportunity Representative
14 be revised as proposed.

15 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
16 commissioners?

17 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
18 motion.

19 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
20 Item 17: Request of the Civil Service Commission
21 staff to revise the specification for the
22 classification Equal Opportunity Representative.

23 MR. HATCH: Second.

24 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly

1 moved and seconded.

2 All those in favor say "aye."

3 MR. HATCH: Aye.

4 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

5 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

6 All those opposed?

7 Motion passes.

8 Item 18: Request of the Civil Service

9 Commission staff to revise the specification for

10 the classification Right-of-Way/Traffic

11 Investigator.

12 MS. LAGEMANN: Carol Lagemann, personnel

13 analyst with Civil Service. The review of this

14 classification was part of our effort to review all

15 classifications every five years.

16 Revisions are proposed to the definition

17 and examples of work to better reflect the work

18 that incumbents are doing to notify and -- this is

19 early next year -- issue citations for right-of-way

20 permit violations.

21 The only proposed change to the minimum

22 qualifications is for the driver's license

23 language. And within the knowledge, skills and

24 abilities section, the knowledge of rules and

21

1 regulations and the ability to interpret city code
2 language, plans and blueprints, along with ability
3 to identify and remedy hazardous conditions in the
4 right-of-way are proposed to be added; therefore,
5 it's recommended that the specification for -- for
6 the classification Right-of-Way/Traffic
7 Investigator be revised as proposed.

8 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
9 commissioners?

10 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
11 motion.

12 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
13 Item 18: Request of the Civil Service Commission
14 staff to revise the specification for the
15 classification Right-of-Way/Traffic Investigator.

16 MR. HATCH: Second.

17 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
18 moved and seconded.

19 All those in favor say "aye."

20 MR. HATCH: Aye.

21 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

23 All those opposed?

24 Motion passes.

1 Item 19: Request of the Civil Service
2 Commission staff to revise the specification for
3 the classification Rental Services Supervisor.

4 MS. LAGEMANN: Again, Carol Lagemann,
5 personnel analyst with Civil Service. The review
6 of this classification was part of our effort to
7 review all classifications every five years.

8 The only proposed change to the minimum
9 qualifications is for the driver's license
10 language; therefore, it's recommended the
11 specification for the classification Rental
12 Services Supervisor be revised as proposed.

13 PRESIDENT PRICE: Questions from
14 commissioners?

15 Hearing none, Chair will entertain a
16 motion.

17 MS. TYLER LEE: I move approval of Agenda
18 Item 19: Request of the Civil Service Commission
19 staff to revise the specification for the
20 classification Rental Services Supervisor.

21 MR. HATCH: Second.

22 PRESIDENT PRICE: It's been properly
23 moved and seconded.

24 All those in favor say "aye."

1 MR. HATCH: Aye.

2 MS. TYLER LEE: Aye.

3 PRESIDENT PRICE: Aye.

4 All those opposed?

5 Motion passes.

6 Item 20: Background removals.

7 Applicants removed preexam:

8 Anayda Guardado, 9-1-1 emergency

9 dispatcher, do not reinstate.

10 Applicants removed post exam:

11 Heather Fitzgerald, 9-1-1 emergency

12 dispatcher, do not reinstate.

13 Ja'Von Kimberly, police officer, do not

14 reinstate.

15 Brett Nunn, police officer, do not

16 reinstate.

17 Jasmine Parker, 9-1-1 ER call taker, do

18 not reinstate.

19 Aaron Saez, police officer, do not

20 reinstate.

21 Jordan Thompson, police officer, do not

22 reinstate.

23 Ricardo Thompson, police officer,

24 reinstate.

1 Shannon Wertman, police officer, do not
2 reinstate.

3 Item 21: Other administrative
4 jurisdictional reviews:

5 A: 23-BA-0003, review and approval to
6 dismiss a Notice of Appeal filed May 3, 2023, for
7 Andrew Bunce. Nature of Appeal: Columbus City
8 Schools, termination, electrician/boiler;
9 Appeal No. 23-BA-0003.

10 In the matter of Andrew Bunce, the
11 commission approves the dismissal of the appeal, a
12 settlement achieved between Mr. Bunce and Columbus
13 City Schools. The commission approves the letter
14 as written and authorizes the -- the Director to
15 distribute.

16 With that, we have completed the agenda
17 and we are adjourned. Thank you.

18 - - -

19 And, thereupon, the meeting was
20 concluded at approximately 12:48 p.m.

21

22

23

24

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18

C-E-R-T-I-F-I-C-A-T-E

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true, correct and complete written transcript of the digitally recorded proceedings in this matter and transcribed by me to the best of my ability on the 13th day of November, 2023.

Christy M. Heaney
Professional Reporter
Notary Public in and for
the State of Ohio.

My Commission Expires: March 25, 2026.

_____ Larry Price, President	_____ 11/20/2023 Date
---------------------------------	-----------------------------