

Regular Meeting

March 31, 2014  
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, March 31, 2014, at 12:40 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew, Jr. and Jeff Porter in attendance.

PLEASE NOTE: These Minutes are summarized and are not actual statements made by each presenter in the meeting.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and approval of the minutes from the February 24, 2014 Regular Meeting.*

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews.*

*a. Kimberly Podolski vs. Columbus City Schools; Bus Driver; 10-Day Suspension. Trial Board Hearing scheduled for April 23, 2014; Appeal Number 14-BA-0001.*

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Officer

Brenda Sobieck presented the pre-hearing conference review of Kimberly Podolski, a Bus Driver, who was suspended for 10 days from Columbus City Schools. Since Ms. Podolski has two appeals to be heard, these trial board hearings will be combined. Columbus City Schools will have two witnesses and the Appellant will have three witnesses. Because the two appeals will be heard at the same time and because both include video evidence from bus cameras, Counsel is asking for a start time of 9:00 a.m.

*b. Larry Votaw vs. Columbus City Schools; Bus Driver; Discharge. Trial Board Hearing scheduled for May 5, 2014; Appeal Number 13-BA-0024.*

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Officer

Brenda Sobieck presented the pre-hearing conference review of Larry Votaw, a Bus Driver, who was discharged from Columbus City Schools. Columbus City Schools will have three witnesses and the Appellant will have two witnesses. Counsel believes they will complete the trial board hearing in an afternoon, therefore, there is no need to expand the time.

*c. Denise Rhoades vs. Columbus City Schools; Food Service Worker; Discharge. Trial Board Hearing scheduled for May 12, 2014; Appeal Number 13-BA-0026.*

PRESENT: Brenda Sobieck, Personnel Administrative Officer

Brenda Sobieck presented the pre-hearing conference review of Denise Rhoades, a Food Service Worker, who was discharged from Columbus City Schools. Columbus City Schools will have four witnesses and the Appellant will have three witnesses. Counsel believes they will complete the trial board hearing in an afternoon, therefore, there is no need to expand the time.

\* \* \*

*RE: Rule Revisions*

No Rule revisions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*Re: Trial Board Recommendations.*

No Trial Board recommendations were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Columbus City School Classification Actions.*

No Columbus City School Classification Actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Watershed Manager with no revisions (Job Code 1173).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Recreation Administrative Coordinator with no revisions (Job Code 3166).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Recreation Service Representative with no revisions (Job Code 3151).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Horticulturalist with no revisions (Job Code 1540).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Drafting Trainee with no revisions (Job Code 1182).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Public Utilities Division Assistant Administrator with no revisions (Job Code 0161).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Golf Courses Division Administrator with no revisions (Job Code 0300).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst I

Matt Wonderly presented these requests to approve the specification reviews for the classifications Watershed Manager, Recreation Administrative Coordinator, Recreation Service Representative, Horticulturalist, Drafting Trainee, Public Utilities Division Assistant Administrator, and Golf Courses Division Administrator with no revisions as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years.

Based on a review of the specifications, questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, there were no revisions to these classification specifications at this time.

A motion to approve these requests was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspection Specialist (Job Code 1773).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst I

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspection Specialist as a result of conversations with representatives of the Building and Zoning Services Department. It was last reviewed in January 2014. There are currently no employees serving in this classification within the Building and Zoning Services Department.

Based on these conversations with department representatives, the minimum qualifications section was revised to reduce the experience to three years to more appropriately align this classification within the Building Inspection series in terms of responsibility and compensation. The Building Inspection Team would not actually be performing inspections that would require the Medical Gas Inspector or the Fire Protection Inspector licenses, therefore, these were eliminated. A substitution reads, "A letter of interim approval as an Inspector in one of the disciplines listed above from the State of Ohio may substitute for the above-referenced certifications. When the letter of interim approval is substituted, a valid State of Ohio certification in that discipline must be obtained by the end of the probationary period."

There were no revisions to the definition section, the examples of work section, the knowledge, skills and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Airworthiness Specialist, designate the examination type as noncompetitive, assign a probationary period of 365 days, and amend Rule XI accordingly.*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst I

Matt Wonderly presented this request to create the specification for the classification Airworthiness Specialist which was initiated by the Department of Public Safety to create a civilian classification for use in the Division of Police, Helicopter Unit, for a position historically staffed by sworn personnel.

The definition section reads, "Under direction, is responsible for managing all aircraft and component records in accordance with FAA requirements and manufacturer's specifications to ensure airworthiness for the fleet of helicopters in the Police division; performs related duties as required."

Some of the examples of work include, "maintains aircraft records, maintenance data, and flight data in accordance with FAA and division regulations; tracks flight hours for each aircraft to determine when scheduled maintenance and inspections are to be completed; monitors new and recurring FAA Airworthiness Directives and Manufacturer Service Bulletins;" and "verifies completion of required documentation by the contracted maintenance provider to ensure division aircraft are within compliance with FAA regulations."

The guidelines for class use section restricts this classification to the Police Division. The minimum qualifications section reads, "Completion of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade and three years of experience in aviation records maintenance, which included compliance with FAA airworthiness directives. Substitution(s): A certificate of high school equivalence (GED) will be accepted in lieu of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade completion. Possession of a valid U.S. Airframe and Powerplant (A&P) mechanic certificate. Possession of a valid FAA Inspector Authorization (IA) certificate."

Some of the knowledge, skills, and abilities include, "considerable knowledge of FAA Rules and Regulations title 14 part 91; general knowledge of standard procedures and practices used in coordinating rotor wing aircraft maintenance, repairs, and servicing schedules; skill in using a computer and relevant software to create spreadsheets, documents, and perform other related functions;" and "ability to project budget deficits or surpluses on a quarterly basis." The examination type was designated as noncompetitive and the probationary period was assigned 365 days.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Parks Irrigation Specialist, designate the examination type as competitive, assign a probationary period of 365 days, and amend Rule XI accordingly.*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst I

Matt Wonderly presented this request to create the specification for the classification Parks Irrigation Specialist which was initiated by the Recreation and Parks Department in an effort to form a classification that would specialize in performing fully skilled mechanical and computerized irrigation system operation.

The definition section reads, "Under direction, is responsible for performing fully skilled mechanical and computerized irrigation system operation; performs related duties as required."

Some of the examples of work include, "Plans, implements, and oversees a comprehensive irrigation system preventive and seasonal maintenance schedule; inspects and diagnoses problems with irrigation systems taking appropriate corrective actions; troubleshoots electrical, computer, and mechanical problems including pumps, motors, controls, wiring, piping, and other system components; may operate a motor vehicle and trailer;" and "may supervise employees engaged in the maintenance of Recreation and Parks grounds."

The minimum qualifications section reads, "Completion of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade and five years experience assisting in the installation, maintenance, and repair of computerized irrigation systems. Substitution(s): An associate's degree in irrigation technology or a closely related field may substitute for two years of the required experience. A certificate of high school equivalence (GED) will be accepted in lieu of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade completion. Possession of a valid motor vehicle operator's license. Some positions may require possession of a valid Class A Commercial Driver's License (CDL) upon completion of the probationary period."

Some of the knowledge, skills, and abilities include, "Considerable knowledge of the practices and principles used in the maintenance and operation of manual, automatic, and computerized irrigation systems; general knowledge of Occupational Safety and Health Administration (OSHA) regulations; skill in troubleshooting, repair, maintenance, and installation of irrigation systems; skill in the programming of automated and computer controlled irrigation systems; ability to repair irrigation system components with accuracy and speed; ability to read blueprints and technical drawings;" and "ability to use a personal computer and related software." The examination type was designated as competitive and the probationary period was assigned 365 days.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the specification for the classification Damage Prevention Supervisor, designate the examination type as competitive, assign a probationary period of 365 days, and amend Rule XI accordingly.*

This item was deferred.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Damage Prevention Program Manager (Job Code 4056).*

This item was deferred.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Drafter/CAD Operator (Job Code 1183).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Drafter/CAD Operator as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in October 2009. There are currently three employees serving in this classification located in the Department of Public Utilities and the Department of Public Service. Based on questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, revisions were proposed.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The minimum qualifications section was revised to read, "Completion of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade and one year of experience drafting technical drawings, plans, or maps utilizing standard drawing instruments or a computer aided drafting (CAD) system. Substitution(s): Post-secondary coursework (16 semester hours or 24 quarter hours) in drafting and design technology or related coursework may substitute for the required experience. A certificate of high school equivalence (GED) will be accepted in lieu of the 12<sup>th</sup> school grade requirement."

There were no revisions to the examples of work section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager (Job Code 0282).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Citywide Occupational Safety and Health Manager as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in August 2009. This is a single position classification within the Department of Human Resources. Based on a review of the specification and feedback from the incumbent, revisions were proposed.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The examples of work section was revised to remove wording from five statements that is simply redundant with other statements and a statement was added that represents work that the incumbent must undertake to manage contracts with vendors associated with health and safety at the City.

There were no revisions to the guidelines for class use section, the minimum qualifications section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Sewerage and Drainage Division Assistant Administrator (Job Code 0166).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Sewerage and Drainage Division Assistant Administrator as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in November 2009. There are currently two incumbents within this classification in the Department of Public Utilities. Based on a review of the specification and feedback from department representatives, one change was proposed.

The minimum qualifications section was revised to describe qualifying experience as being within a "utility collection or distribution system" instead of just a "utility distribution system." There were no revisions to the definition section, the examples of work section, the knowledge, skills and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to create the specification for the classification Education Director (U) and include as part of the unclassified service.*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Officer

Tammy Rollins presented this request to create the specification for the classification Education Director (U) in anticipation of the new department being created and legislated via City Council later this year. The proposed new department would allow the City a more proactive, authoritative role in ensuring student success within Columbus City Schools with the goal of providing a greater workforce for tomorrow. The proposed new department would house the staffing needed to provide this vital link.

The definition section reads, "Subject to executive and/or legislative determination, is responsible for directing the Department of Education that will oversee educational improvement within Columbus City Schools and community schools; performs related duties as required."

Some examples of work include, "advises the Mayor's Office in the development of strategic and shorter range plans designed to increase the City's capacity to support student success within Columbus City Schools; Collaborates with Columbus Board of Education and district administration, Columbus City Council, early learning providers, community, and private/parochial schools, higher education institutions, and non-profit, public and private sector stakeholders and other organizations to identify and support partnerships that increase educational performance and attainment in Columbus;" and "Develops and implements a detailed plan and budget for \$7.5M of City funds to advance educational opportunities and partnerships."

A guidelines for class use section reads, "This classification description is for the unclassified service. The incumbent receives an appointment pursuant to City Charter Section 148(1)(c)."

A motion to approve the request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Personnel Actions.*

No personnel actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.*

No residency hearing reviews were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Background Removals – Post-Exam.*

	Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
1.	Edward Chung	Police Officer	14-BR-005

After reviewing the file of Edward Chung, the Commissioners decided his name would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

\* \* \*

*RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews.*

*Review of the appeal of Ronald Whatley, regarding his discharge from the position of Truck Driver, Columbus City Schools, Appeal Number 14-BA-0003.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Ronald Whatley on February 12, 2014 regarding your termination from the position of Truck Driver with Columbus City Schools.

Columbus City Schools notified Mr. Whatley by mail of the decision to discharge him because the Bureau of Worker's Compensation determined that he reached Maximum Medical Improvement in October 2013. The letter informing Mr. Whatley of this decision was dated December 2, 2013.

Ohio Revised Code Section 124.34 states that classified school employees may appeal a discharge or "removal" to the Commission within 10 days. Since the letter from Columbus City Schools was dated December 3, 2013, the deadline to file an appeal was December 13, 2013. However, Mr. Whatley did not file his appeal until February 12, 2014, which was too late. Therefore, the Civil Service Commission determined that it has no authority or jurisdiction over Mr. Whatley's appeal because it was filed beyond the deadline date.

Based upon the foregoing the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Whatley's appeal without a hearing because of lack of jurisdiction over the appeal.

*Review of the appeal of Andre' Washington, regarding a 3<sup>rd</sup> Step Grievance, Columbus City Schools, Appeal Number 14-BA-0004.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Thom Ibinson on January 15, 2014 regarding the Commission's determination that he did not meet the minimum qualifications for the position of License Manager. In his appeal, Mr. Ibinson stated

that he enforced all health code and accounting regulations for three years as part of operating his business.

The minimum qualifications for License Manager include possession of a bachelor's degree and three years of experience enforcing regulations or ensuring regulatory compliance to operable codes, or comparable experience elsewhere. As discussed in the response letter to Mr. Ibinson's original request for review, the Commission gave credit for his 16 months of experience ensuring compliance with the Columbus Purchasing Code as a Management Analyst II. All of the other work experience listed on his application involves complying with codes and regulations, not enforcing regulations.

The Commission staff reviewed all of the information Mr. Ibinson submitted with his appeal and the work experience listed on his application. As a result, it was determined that he does not have sufficient experience to meet the minimum qualifications for this position. Therefore, Mr. Ibinson's application remains rejected.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission upheld the rejection of Mr. Ibinson's application for License Manager and decided to dismiss his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

*Review of the appeal of Darrell Martin, regarding his denied application for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II Examination, City of Columbus, Appeal Number 14-CA-0003.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Darrell Martin on February 24, 2014 regarding the rejection of his application for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II examination, City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Martin stated that he believed that all of his work experience was included on his online application and he was unsure as to what happened to the job information he included. He also stated that his work experience information is already on file with the Civil Service Commission.

Typically, the Commission does not retrieve information from personnel files for the review of applications due to the thousands of applications we receive each year. However, after receiving Mr. Martin's appeal, it was verified that he had been approved for this examination in 2005 and that he had served in the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor I classification. Since the Commission switched to a new online application platform in January 2014, it may be confusing to applicants at first and for this and the reasons stated above, Mr. Martin's application was approved for this examination.

Based on the information provided with his appeal, the Commission decided to grant Mr. Martin's appeal and approve his application for the Sewer Maintenance supervisor II examination.

*Review of the appeal of Kevin Wood, regarding his denied application for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II Examination, City of Columbus, Appeal Number 14-CA-0004.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Kevin Wood on February 26, 2014 regarding the rejection of his application for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II examination, City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Wood stated that he currently supervise an employee, which includes approving leave requests and handling performance appraisals and discipline. He also indicated that he had experience overseeing multiple people working with site sewer piping.

The information Mr. Wood submitted with his appeal was reviewed along with his application. It was unclear if the position where he had additional supervisory experience of crews working with site sewer piping was listed on his application. However, Mr.

Wood's Construction Inspector II classification is responsible for supervision of construction Inspector I employees, including the responsibilities listed above. Mr. Wood also stated that he oversees crews repairing, cleaning, and constructing sanitary and storm sewers. Based on this information, it was determined that Mr. Wood meets the minimum qualifications for this position.

Based on the information provided with his appeal, the Commission decided to grant Mr. Wood's appeal and approve his application for the Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II examination.

\* \* \*

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 12:58 p.m.

---

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

---

Date