

Regular Meeting

December 12, 2016
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, December 12, 2016, at 12:48 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew, Jr., Delena Edwards, and Stefanie Coe in attendance.

PLEASE NOTE: These Minutes are summarized and are not actual statements made by each presenter in the meeting.

* * *

RE: Review and approval of the Minutes from the November 14, 2016 Regular Meeting.

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

* * *

RE: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews.

No Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Rule Revisions.

No Rule Revisions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Trial Board Recommendations.

No Trial Board Recommendations were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Personnel Action for Columbus City Schools:

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to reallocate designated positions within Columbus City Schools to newly approved classifications within the Divisions of Accountability and Information Support. All incumbents will retain their classification status and date of rank. It is proposed that the reallocations be effective within 30 days of the Columbus City School Board's adoption of this plan.

PRESENT: Barb Crawford, Personnel Analyst II

Barb Crawford presented this request on behalf of Columbus City Schools to reallocate designated positions within Columbus City Schools to newly approved classifications within the Divisions of Accountability and Information Support. All incumbents will retain their classification status and date of rank. The reallocations will be effective within 30 days of the Columbus City School Board's adoption of this plan.

These reallocations were a result of recent Commission action creating two major sections within Columbus City Schools. Based on questionnaires completed by the affected employees and feedback received from directors, managers, and supervisors of these employees, all affected employees were informed of the changes to their classifications and all aspects of the reallocation process. All of these employees were interviewed and their qualifications were reviewed and it was confirmed that they met the minimum qualifications for their new classifications before finalizing the reallocation list.

The table listed below illustrates the changes, including the affected employees, position numbers, current classifications, and new classifications to which the employees are being reallocated to. To clarify again, these reallocations will become effective within 30 days of Columbus City Schools' Board of Education adoption of the reallocation plan.

EMPLOYEE	POSITION #	CURRENT CLASSIFICATION	PROPOSED CLASSIFICATION
Blankenship, Goble	581584401	Data Processing Analyst II	Data Reporting Specialist
Goldsby, Dante	581594412	Data Processing Analyst II	Data Reporting Specialist
Allen, Sonya	581594401	Data Processing Analyst II	Educational Systems Support Analyst
Carr, Jared	581594608	Data Processing Analyst II	Educational Systems Support Analyst
Thaci, Ilir	581594601	Data Processing Analyst II	Educational Systems Support Analyst
Kohn, Carol	581594607	Data Processing Analyst II	Educational Systems Data Analyst I
Djeric, Jelena	582094412	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Administrator
Foster, Cheri	582094601	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Administrator
Koleva, Ivelina	582094603	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Administrator
Ziemba, Randy	582094602	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Administrator
Foor, Mark	582094405	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Data Analyst II
Harden, Brian	582094402	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Data Analyst II
Kell, Chris	582094409	Data Processing Analyst III	Educational Systems Data Analyst II
Francia, Chris	581594402	Data Processing Analyst II	Systems Administrator
Lynch, Cathy	582094411	Data Processing Analyst III	Systems Administrator
Newton, Kevin	583094603	Network Analyst	Systems Administrator
Stewart, Daryl	583094409	Network Analyst	Systems Administrator
Sturgill, Greg	582094415	Data Processing Analyst III	Systems Administrator
Gay, Lenwood	582094408	Data Processing Analyst III	Database Administrator
Smith, Alex	582094404	Data Processing Analyst III	Database Administrator
Bumgardner, Alan	580294406	Data Processing Analyst III	Network Manager
Miller, Tim	582094410	Data Processing Analyst III	Network Administrator
Kelley, Charles	583094403	Network Analyst	Network Analyst
Trepp, John	583094406	Network Analyst	Network Analyst
Graff, Nathan	582094407	Data Processing Analyst III	Applications Architect
Pardo, Dario	582094403	Data Processing Analyst III	Applications Architect
Schor, Ryan	581594409	Data Processing Analyst II	Senior Applications Developer
Smith, Sheila	582094414	Data Processing Analyst III	Senior Applications Developer
Drain, Taleia	581594407	Data Processing Analyst II	Applications Developer
Hooks, Richard	581594406	Data Processing Analyst II	Applications Developer
Jackson, Judy	581594404	Data Processing Analyst II	Applications Developer
Bingaman, Ethan	583094412	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Dvorkin, Arthur	583094404	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Frum, Rob	583094411	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
MacGillis, Bill	583094402	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Russell, Bev	583094407	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Stewart, Anne	583094410	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Thomas, Dustin	583094408	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Trout, Jack	583094401	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Woods, Jamie	583094405	Network Analyst	Technical Support Analyst
Fling, Steve	675494404	Data Communications Specialist	Data Communications Technician II
Sauder, Dan	675494401	Data Communications Specialist	Data Communications Technician II

These reallocations conform to Civil Service Commission policy guidelines regarding minimum qualifications and language.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools (CCS), to abolish the specifications for the classifications Application Support Analyst (Job Code 9242), Data Analyst (Job Code 9227), Senior Data Analyst (Job Code 9228), Data Entry Operator (Job Code 9268), Data Entry Supervisor (Job Code 9269), Data Processing Analyst I (Job Code 9236), Data Processing Analyst II (Job Code 5815), Data Processing Analyst III (Job Code 5820), Data Processing Analyst IV (Job Code 5825), Computer Operator Trainee (Job Code 9245), Computer Operator I (Job Code 6751), Computer Operator II (Job Code 9247), Data Processing Operations Manager (Job Code 9249), Data

Processing Quality Controller Trainee (Job Code 9253), Data Processing Quality Controller I (Job Code 9254), Data Processing Quality Controller II (Job Code 9256), Management Information Systems Training Supervisor (Job Code 9276), Data Communications Specialist Supervisor (Job Code 5850), Telecommunications/Data Operations Support Manager (Job Code 9258), and Stenographer I (Job Code 6130).

PRESENT: Barb Crawford, Personnel Analyst II

Barb Crawford presented this request on behalf of Columbus City Schools (CCS), to abolish the specifications for the classifications Application Support Analyst, Data Analyst, Senior Data Analyst, Data Entry Operator, Data Entry Supervisor, Data Processing Analyst I, Data Processing Analyst II, Data Processing Analyst III, Data Processing Analyst IV, Computer Operator Trainee, Computer Operator I, Computer Operator II, Data Processing Operations Manager, Data Processing Quality Controller Trainee (Job Code 9253), Data Processing Quality Controller I, Data Processing Quality Controller II, Management Information Systems Training Supervisor, Data Communications Specialist Supervisor, Telecommunications/Data Operations Support Manager, and Stenographer I.

This request is part of the ongoing project to assist Columbus City Schools in reviewing their technology-related classes, revising current classifications where appropriate, abolishing outdated classes, and creating new classes as needed. A number of new classifications have been created and approved, which better reflect the duties and responsibilities of the employees in Information Support Services and the Department of Accountability, eliminating the need for several existing classifications.

It is requested that the abolishment of the Data Processing Analyst II and Data Processing Analyst III be effective upon the reallocation of the affected employees. Civil Service Commission staff requested that this information be included in the minutes for this action.

As a result of staff's review and consultation with CCS leadership, the classifications listed herein were determined to be obsolete, will not be used for future allocations, and currently have no incumbents with the exception of the two classes listed above. Therefore, it was recommended that the specifications for these classifications be abolished.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

Re: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the classification Warehouse Services Supervisor and extend the probationary period to 365 days (Job Code 5715).

PRESENT: Barb Crawford, Personnel Analyst II

Barb Crawford presented this request, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to revise the classification Warehouse Services Supervisor. It was last reviewed in May 1976. There are currently no incumbents within this classification. After interviews with the Purchasing Director and Interim Supervisor, revisions were proposed.

The definition section now reads, "Under general direction, is responsible for planning, coordinating, and supervising activities relating to inventory control, distribution, and warehouse management for Columbus City Schools; performs related duties as required."

Multiple additions, one revision, and multiple deletions to the examples of work section were done to bring the specification in line with industry standards. The revision reads, "Plans, implements, and administers computerized warehouse storage

and inventory control systems to insure proper storage and accurate accounting of goods on hand; coordinates physical inventory activities to ensure that all property is accounted for on an annual basis." The additions read, "Plans, coordinates, and supervises work activities relating to warehouse management including inventory control, shipping and receiving, distribution, and delivery of stock; Supervises employees involved in stocking, issuance, and delivery of supplies and materials, including performance evaluations and disciplinary recommendations; Coordinates and conducts auctions of surplus materials held by Columbus City Schools; supervises the repair and recycling of District property as required; Ensures that the storage and destruction of District records are in accordance with District policies and State of Ohio regulations relating to records retention; Oversees the training of personnel in the operation of forklifts, aerial platforms, boom trucks, and related safety procedures; Supervises the collection of data to be used in determining annual costs and budget projections of operations; monitors and controls expenditures to ensure expenses do not exceed budget allocation;" and "Prepares or oversees the completion of required documentation and reports; supervises the maintenance of departmental records, databases, and files."

The minimum qualifications now read, "Completion of the 12th school grade and six years of inventory control, warehousing, or storekeeping experience, which includes at least two years of supervisory or managerial experience. Substitutions: Possession of a bachelor's degree in one of the administrative or social sciences may substitute for up to four years of the non-supervisory experience, on a year-for-year bases. A certificate of high school equivalence (GED) will be accepted in lieu of a high school diploma. Possession of a valid driver's license."

Several additions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities were made as well as some deletions and revisions. The additions read, "general knowledge of packing and shipping processes; general knowledge of Microsoft Office products; ability to operate a computer and related software; ability to prepare reports and maintain records and files; ability to perform mathematical calculations; ability to communicate orally and in writing; ability to lift up to 50 pounds;" and "ability to operate machinery." The revisions read, "thorough knowledge of the principles and practices used in inventory control, distribution, and warehouse or storeroom operations;" and "considerable knowledge of warehousing and distribution policies and procedures."

There were no revisions to the examination type; however, the probationary period was assigned to 356 days.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

Re: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff, on behalf of Columbus City Schools, to create the classification Construction Contract Manager, designate the examination type as noncompetitive, and assign a probationary period of 365 days.

PRESENT: Barbara McGrath, Senior Executive Human Resources Administrator for Columbus City Schools

Barbara McGrath presented this request to create the classification Construction Contract Manager. This position will be responsible for the functions required for the School District to successfully procure, administer, and account for the District's capital improvements over the upcoming five years.

The definition sections reads, "Under direction, is responsible for performing the contracting and accounting functions required to procure professional and construction services related to the District's permanent improvements; performs related duties as required." The examples of work section includes, among other examples not listed here, "Understands and interprets present and future revisions to the Ohio Revised Code (ORC) requirements for the procurement of permanent improvements, including

professional services and construction services; Corresponds and coordinates with internal and external legal counsel as required to update District procedures, processes, and contracts to maintain compliance with ORC; Performs accounting tasks related to the department, program, and project budgets, including liaison activities between the Budget and Treasurer's office concerning computerized financial system activities;" and "Prepares requests for qualifications (RFQ's), construction bids, and requests for proposal (RFP's) by coordinating with project managers and developing scopes of work and contract terms in compliance with project objectives and ORC."

The minimum qualifications section reads "Possession of a bachelor's degree and three years of experience performing construction contract administration or professional accounting work. Substitution(s): Experience as specified above may substitute for two years of the required education on a year-for-year basis. Possession of a valid motor vehicle operator's license."

Some of the knowledge, skills, and abilities reads, "Thorough knowledge of generally accepted accounting principles; general knowledge of the laws and regulations governing the permanent improvements of a school district; ability to analyze financial records, revenue sources, and operating costs;" and "ability to conduct professional communications and work cooperatively with external auditors and school officials." The examination type was designated as noncompetitive and the probationary period was assigned to 356 days.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification E-Government Program Manager with no revisions (Job Code 0560).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to approve the specification review for the classification E-Government Program Manager with no revisions as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in July 2011. This a single position classification used only within the Department of Technology which is currently vacant.

After a review of the specification and obtaining feedback from a department representative, it was determined that the current specification adequately describes the work as it would be performed should the department choose to utilize the classification in the future.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Coordinator (Job Code 1672).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Emergency Medical Services (EMS) Coordinator as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in August 2011. There is currently one employee serving in this classification in the Department of Public Safety, Fire Division.

There were no revisions to the definition section. The examples of work section was revised to include, "Advises division personnel on operational, logistical, and

training activities which support minimizing injury, death, and suffering through the provision of timely and effective emergency medical services." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period..

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Administrator (Job Code 0873).

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Administrator as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in November 2011. This a single position classification utilized by the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging (COAAA), which is in the Columbus Recreation and Parks department.

After a review of the specification and obtaining feedback from department representatives, changes were proposed. Additional wording in the examples of work section and the knowledge, skills, and abilities was made to reflect that the programs of the COAAA are inclusive of older adults and individuals with disabilities. There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.

No Residency Hearing Reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Background Removals - Post-Exam.

	Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
1.	Ryan Jech	Firefighter	16-BR-043
2.	Michael Johnson	Firefighter	16-BR-044
3.	David Weimer	Firefighter	16-BR-045

After reviewing the files of Ryan Jech, Michael Johnson, and David Weimer, the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

* * *

RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews:

Review of the appeal of Keith O. Turner, regarding his three-day Suspension from the position of Custodian II with Columbus City Schools, Appeal #16-BA-0006.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Keith Turner on November 10, 2016. His appeal was regarding a three-day suspension from his position as a Custodian II with Columbus City Schools.

Section 124.34 of the Ohio Revised Code which outlines appeal rights for classified employees in the State of Ohio is applicable to school district employees. Appeals are

permitted for “a suspension of more than twenty-four hours” according to Section 124.34 (B). This means that a suspension of four or more work days can be appealed. A suspension of less than four days is not appealable under this Section of the State Law.

Therefore, the Commission determined that it does not have jurisdiction over Mr. Turner's appeal because his appeal was regarding a three-day suspension, not a suspension of four days or more. Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Turner's appeal pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1) because it does not have jurisdiction over his appeal.

Review of the appeal of Brian Ridley, regarding the rejection of his application for Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0013.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Brian Ridley on November 12, 2016 regarding the rejection of his application for Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Ridley stated that he did not have enough space on the paper application to list all of his work experience. Mr. Ridley's application was initially rejected because the work experience listed on his application did not meet the minimum qualifications for this examination. His application did not list jobs indicating that he had supervisory experience. Although he turned in additional jobs with his Request for Review on October 27, 2016, those positions weren't included in his initial application.

Commission policy does not allow jobs to be added to an application once applications have been reviewed for the minimum qualifications. The Commission reviewed Mr. Ridley's appeal and determined that his application remains rejected because he did not list enough work experience to meet the requirements for this examination.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission upheld the rejection for Mr. Ridley's application for Sewer Maintenance Supervisor II and decided to dismiss his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

* * *

Review of the appeal of Aaron Williams, regarding his discharge from the position of Building Inspector I with the City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0014.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Aaron Williams on November 21, 2016 regarding his discharge from the position of Building Inspector I with the City of Columbus Department of Building and Zoning Services. Mr. Williams stated that he completed the City's Background Review Form to the best of his ability and that he was unaware that a physical control violation was a misdemeanor.

The physical control conviction is in the traffic law section of the Ohio Revised Code and as such is a first-degree misdemeanor. Because Mr. Williams failed to list this relevant information on the Civil Service Commission's Background Review Form and he was still in his probationary period, he was discharged.

Civil Service Commission Rule XI(D)(4) permits termination during an employee's probationary period which states, “There shall be no appeal of any kind from the action of the appointing authority removing an employee during or at the end of the probationary period.” Therefore, because a decision to terminate an employee during the probationary period is made by the appointing authority, no appeal rights are permitted by the Commission Rules.

For the foregoing reasons, the Commission has no jurisdiction over Mr. Williams' appeal and has dismissed the appeal without a hearing.

* * *

Commission President Grady Pettigrew, Jr., announced Commission Member Delena Edwards' departure from the Civil Service Commission and this meeting as being her final meeting. He wished her well as did staff.

* * *

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:03 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date