

Regular Meeting

February 29, 2016
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, February 29, 2016, at 12:44 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew, Jr. and Delena Edwards in attendance.

PLEASE NOTE: These Minutes are summarized and are not actual statements made by each presenter in the meeting.

* * *

RE: Review and approval of the Minutes from the January 25, 2016 Regular Meeting.

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

* * *

RE: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews.

No Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Rule Revisions.

No Rule Revisions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Request of Appellant, Kevin Bryant, to withdraw the appeal he filed November 5, 2015, regarding his 10-day suspension from the position of Intervention Aide with the Columbus City School – Appeal Number 15-BA-0013.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Election of Commission President.

This item was deferred until the March 2016 meeting because we only had two Commissioners.

* * *

Re: Trial Board Recommendations.

No Trial Board Recommendations were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Columbus City School Classification Actions.

No Columbus City School Classification Actions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Locksmith with no revisions (Job Code 3507).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Building Inspector I with no revisions (Job Code 1768).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Office Manager with no revisions (Job Code 1240).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Student Intern I with no revisions (Job Code 0781).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Student Intern II with no revisions (Job Code 0782).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Student Intern III with no revisions (Job Code 0788).

Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Keep Columbus Beautiful Manager with no revisions (Job Code 0751).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented these requests to approve the specification reviews for the classifications Locksmith, Building Inspector I, Office Manager, Student Intern I, Student Intern II, Student Intern III, and Keep Columbus Beautiful Manager with no revisions as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years.

Based upon questionnaires received from incumbents and communication with department representatives on all of the classifications except for Building Inspector I, it was determined that the current specifications adequately describe the work as is currently performed. Input from department representatives was solicited for Building Inspector I; however, no feedback was provided. But based upon questionnaires received from incumbents, it was determined that the current specification adequately describes the work as it is currently performed.

A motion to approve these requests was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to merge the specification for the classification Automotive Mechanic (Light) (Job Code 3458) into Automotive Mechanic (Heavy) (Job Code 3459), revise and retitle it to read Automotive Mechanic, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Job Code 3459).

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspector II (Job Code 1769).

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Criminal Intelligence Analyst (Job Code 0842).

This item was deferred.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to retitle the specification for the classification Development Rehabilitation Technician to read Housing Rehabilitation Technician, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Job Code 2044).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to retitle the specification for the classification Development Rehabilitation Technician to read Housing Rehabilitation Technician. This request was made in light of difficulties encountered in recruiting qualified individuals for a sufficient applicant pool, which will afford an adequate selection of candidates to choose from when filling positions.

There were no other revisions requested at this time.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Administrative Secretary and to change the probationary period to 365 days (Job Code 0773).

PRESENT: Suzy Ulry, Personnel Analyst II

Suzy Ulry presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Administrative Secretary as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in December 2011. There are currently 23 employees serving in this classification, located in various City departments.

Based upon a review of questionnaires received from incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some minor revisions were proposed. There were no revisions to the definition section. One statement within the examples of work section was revised to note that employees working in the classification assemble, collate, and copy various "and comprehensive" documents for meetings, presentations, and other uses.

The minimum qualifications section was revised to limit the college substitution to "up to four years." Within the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, one statement was expanded to note that employees in this classification need the ability to perform office procedures independently "with accuracy, attention to detail, and appropriate confidentiality." The probationary period was changed to 365 days as a reflection of the associated learning time for an individual to become proficient in the job. There were no changes to the examination type.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Debt Management Coordinator (Job Code 0755).

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request revise the specification for the classification Debt Management Coordinator as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in July 2011. This classification is a single position classification in the Department of Finance and Management.

Based upon feedback from department representatives, a revision was proposed. There were no revisions to the definition section. Within the examples of work section, one statement was revised to add "and approves" to the language which now reads, "Reviews and approves ordinances related to the Capital Improvements Budget."

There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

* * *

RE: Personnel Actions.

No Personnel Actions were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.

No Residency Hearing Reviews were submitted this month.

* * *

RE: Background Removals - Post-Exam.

	Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
1.	Forrest, Derrick	Firefighter	16-BR-003
2.	Muraca, Matthew	Firefighter	16-BR-005
3.	Thompson, Dylan	Police Officer	16-BR-006
4.	Bolzenius, Patrick	Firefighter	16-BR-007

After reviewing the file of Derrick Forrest, the Commissioners decided his name would not be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

After reviewing the files of Matthew Muraca and Patrick Bolzenius, the Commissioners decided their names would be reinstated to the Firefighter eligible list.

After reviewing the file of Dylan Thompson, the Commissioners decided his name would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

* * *

RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews.

Review of the appeal of Toija Bell, regarding her one-day suspension from the position of Instructional Assistant, Columbus City Schools, Appeal #15-BA-0016.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Toija Bell on December 11, 2015, regarding her one-day suspension from the position of Instructional Assistant with Columbus City Schools.

The Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") identifies appeal rights for classified employees, which include school district employees. ORC Section 124.34 (B) specifies that appeals may be filed when there is a "a suspension of more than twenty-four work hours." Thus, suspensions of less than twenty-four hours, or three days, are not appealable under this section of the state law.

In addition, ORC Section 3319.088 (D) states, "Educational assistants employed by a board of education shall have all rights, benefits, and legal protection available to other nonteaching employees in the school district, except that provisions of Chapter 124 of the Revised Code shall not apply to any person employed as an educational assistant." The Commission determined that the term Instructional Assistant is the same as Educational Assistant. Further, since Chapter 124 of the ORC outlines appeal rights for classified employees, the ORC does not allow Instructional Assistants to appeal disciplinary action to the Civil Service Commission.

The Civil Service Commission determined that Ms. Bell does not have appeal rights regarding her discharge. Therefore, it does not have jurisdiction or authority over her appeal.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Ms. Bell's appeal pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1) because it does not have jurisdiction over her appeal.

* * *

Review of the appeal of William Lytle, II, regarding the rejection of his application for the Inventory Control Manager examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0001.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by William Lytle, II on December 31, 2015, regarding the rejection of his application for the Inventory Control Manager examination with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Lytle stated that he had the required experience and that he had updated his profile to detail that work experience. His application was originally rejected because he did not demonstrate that he had the required six years of inventory control, warehousing, or storekeeping experience and the two years of supervisory experience in that area. The information he submitted with his appeal was reviewed along with all of the materials he submitted with his original Request for Review and in his application. Based on that review, it was determined that Mr. Lytle's experience as a Retail Manager and a Director of Purchasing and Distribution along with his work for the City of Columbus as a Storekeeper meets the minimum qualifications for this examination. Therefore, Mr. Lytle's application was approved.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to approve Mr. Lytle's application for the Inventory Control Manager examination and grant his appeal.

* * *

Review of the appeal of Zachary Garven, regarding the rejection of his application for the Plant Maintenance Electrician examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0002.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Zachary Garven on January 21, 2016, regarding the rejection of his application for the Plant Maintenance Electrician examination with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Garven stated that he has experience on 3-phase industrial and commercial jobs with the International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers ("IBEW"). Mr. Garven provided specifics about the work he did and the companies to where he was assigned. His online application listed a total of 32 months experience with IBEW.

Mr. Garven's application was originally rejected because he did not demonstrate that he had the two years of electrical experience required by the minimum qualifications. Based on the information he submitted with his appeal to clarify his work history, it was determined that he meets the minimum qualifications.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to approve Mr. Garven's application for the Plant Maintenance Electrician examination and grant his appeal.

* * *

Review of the appeal of Blake Dolder, regarding the rejection of his application for the Sewer Maintenance Worker examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0003.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Blake Dolder on January 29, 2016, regarding the rejection of his application for the Sewer Maintenance Worker examination with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Dolder stated that he did not think the attachments he provided were considered and he believed that his remodeling experience was misinterpreted. The minimum qualifications for Sewer Maintenance Worker require one year of experience in construction, sewer maintenance, and/or other underground utility work. Mr. Dolder wasn't given experience credit for his employment at Quality Improvements because it was remodeling and replacement work rather than construction and sewer maintenance work as required. Mr. Dolder's Laborer experience was not considered to be construction work because he did not list any construction or sewer maintenance job duties on his application.

All of the materials Mr. Dolder submitted with his appeal were reviewed, despite the fact he highlighted duties related to the minimum qualifications; these are just examples of work for the position. As listed on the job posting, any one position may not include all of the duties listed. Mr. Dolder's work experience was evaluated based on the duties he listed on his application, not based on the examples of work for his position. As a result, his application remains rejected because he did not list enough work experience to demonstrate that he met the minimum qualifications.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission upheld the rejection of Mr. Dolder's application for the Sewer Maintenance Worker examination and decided to dismiss his appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

* * *

Review of the appeal of Brian Carle, regarding the rejection of his application for the Water Maintenance Worker examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0004.

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Brian Carle on January 29, 2016, regarding the rejection of his application for the Water Maintenance Worker examination with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Carle stated that he has the concrete experience with both Clayton Excavation and Mid-Ohio Concrete. The minimum qualifications for the Water Maintenance Worker examination includes two years of experience in general maintenance and/or construction which includes laying and finishing concrete. Because he did not list Mid-Ohio Concrete on his application, that job was not counted towards the requirements.

However, he indicated that he did concrete removal as well as pouring and finishing concrete for sidewalks, catch basins, and manholes while employed at Clayton Excavation.

Because Mr. Carle had 10 years of experience at that company, it was determined that he meets the minimum qualifications.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to approve Mr. Carle's application for the Water Maintenance Worker examination and grant his appeal.

* * *

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 12:56 p.m.

* * *

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

Date