

Regular Meeting

November 14, 2016  
12:30 p.m.

A regular meeting of the Municipal Civil Service Commission convened on Monday, November 14, 2016, at 12:58 p.m. with Grady Pettigrew, Jr. and Delena Edwards in attendance.

PLEASE NOTE: These Minutes are summarized and are not actual statements made by each presenter in the meeting.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and approval of the Minutes from the October 24, 2016 Regular Meeting.*

A motion to approve the minutes was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews.*

No Pre-Hearing Conference Reviews were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Rule Revisions.*

No Rule Revisions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Trial Board Recommendations.*

No Trial Board Recommendations were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Review and Approval of the 2017 Civil Service Commission Trial Board Hearing Schedule.*

A motion to approve this schedule was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

\* \* \*

*Re: Review and approval of the 2017 Regular Commission Meeting/Full Commission Hearing Schedule.*

A motion to approve this schedule was made, seconded, and approved unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Water Protection Specialist I with no revisions (Job Code 1871).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Water Protection Specialist II with no revisions (Job Code 1872).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Water Protection Coordinator with no revisions (Job Code 1873).*

*Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to approve the specification review for the classification Building Plans Examiner II with no revisions (Job Code 1116).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to approve the specification reviews for the classifications Water Protection Specialist I, Water Protection Specialist II, Water Protection Coordinator, and Building Plans Examiner II with no revisions as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years.

Based upon a review of the specifications, questionnaires received from incumbents, with supervisory review on some, and communication with department representatives, there were no revisions to these class specifications at this time.

A motion to approve these requests was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspection Manager, retitle it to read Inspection Manager, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Job Code 1771).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspection Manager and retitle it to read Inspection Manager as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in August 2011. This is a single position classification used by the Department of Building and Zoning Services.

Based upon a meeting with department representatives to review the specification, some revisions were proposed. There were no revisions to the definition section. Within the examples of work section, the word "multiple" was added to one example to show that the Building Inspection Manager maintains the records retention standard operating procedures for multiple building inspection units. Another example was revised to show that the Building Inspection Manager acts as a liaison between the inspection and plans review units within the Department. There was also an example added which reads, "Determines when a building or construction condition is a serious hazard and issues stop work orders and/or building orders for working without permits."

The reference to "building inspections" within the guidelines for class use section was revised to "inspections." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Plumbing Inspector II (Job Code 1776).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Plumbing Inspector II as a result of a class action request from the Department of Building and Zoning Services to correct inconsistencies within the Plumbing, Building, Electrical, and Mechanical Inspector II classifications.

There were no revisions to the definition section. Within the examples of work section, two examples were added which read, "Coordinates and participates in activities involving the inspection of plumbing systems in buildings, structures and appurtenances for conformance with approved plans, Ohio Building Code (OBC), Residential Code of Ohio, Columbus Building Code, Zoning Code and relevant ordinances;" and "Prepares and issues 'stop work orders' to contractors and property owners for non-compliance of applicable codes, regulations and ordinances; notifies Code Enforcement personnel as warranted."

The minimum qualifications section was revised to decrease the number of years of experience conducting inspections of plumbing installations, construction, maintenance, and repair work from three years to two years. There were no revisions to the guidelines for class use section, the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspector II (Job Code 1769).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Building Inspector II as a result of a class action request from the Department of Building and Zoning Services to correct inconsistencies within the Plumbing, Building, Electrical, and Mechanical Inspector II classifications.

There were no revisions to the definition section. Within the examples of work section, one example was added which reads, "Supervises employees engaged in the enforcement of all applicable building codes and regulations, to include conducting performance evaluations, approving/disapproving leave requests and/or initiating disciplinary action." There was a revision to remove the word "supervises" from the second example within this section which coincides with the addition of the added statement. A guidelines for class use section was added which reads, "This is a working supervisor classification. Building Inspector II's supervise Building Inspector I's. Building Inspector I is a performance classification."

The minimum qualifications section was revised to read "Possession of a valid State of Ohio certification as a Building Inspector and Residential Building Inspector (or Residential Building Official) and two years of experience conducting building inspections of commercial and residential buildings and other structures for conformance with governing codes." There were no revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Electrical Inspector II (Job Code 1783).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Electrical Inspector II as a result of a class action request from the Department of Building and Zoning Services to correct inconsistencies within the Plumbing, Building, Electrical, and Mechanical Inspector II classifications.

There were no revisions to the definition section. Two examples were added to the examples of work section which read, "Coordinates and participates in activities

involving the inspection of electrical systems in buildings, structures and appurtenances for conformance with approved plans, Ohio Building Code (OBC), Residential Code of Ohio, Columbus Building Code, Zoning Code and relevant ordinances;" and "Prepares and issues 'stop work orders' to contractors and property owners for non-compliance of applicable codes, regulations and ordinances; notifies Code Enforcement personnel as warranted."

A guidelines for class use section was added which reads, "This is a working supervisor classification. Electric Inspector II's supervise Electric Inspector I's. Electric Inspector I is a performance classification." The minimum qualifications section was revised to reduce the number of years of experience conducting inspections of electrical installation, construction, maintenance, and repair work from three years to two years. There were no revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Mechanical Inspector II (Job Code 1816).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Mechanical Inspector II as a result of a class action request from the Department of Building and Zoning Services to correct inconsistencies within the Plumbing, Building, Electrical, and Mechanical Inspector II classifications.

There were no revisions to the definition section. Two examples were added to the examples of work section which read, "Coordinates and participates in activities involving the inspection of mechanical systems in buildings, structures and appurtenances for conformance with approved plans, Ohio Building Code (OBC), Residential Code of Ohio, Columbus Building Code, Zoning Code and relevant ordinances;" and "Prepares and issues 'stop work orders' to contractors and property owners for non-compliance of applicable codes, regulations and ordinances; notifies Code Enforcement personnel as warranted."

A guidelines for class use section was added which reads, "This is a working supervisor classification. Mechanical Inspector II's supervise Mechanical Inspector I's. Mechanical Inspector I is a performance classification." Within the minimum qualifications section the number of years of experience in conducting inspections of mechanical systems and equipment was reduced from three years to two years and the experience was reworded to delete "systems and equipment" and replace it with "installations, construction, maintenance, and repair work." There were no revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Assistant Chief Building Official (Job Code 0176).*

PRESENT: Matt Wonderly, Personnel Analyst II

Matt Wonderly presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Assistant Chief Building Official as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in August 2011. This classification is currently vacant, but has previously been used within the Department of Building and Zoning Services.

Based upon a review of the specification and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed. The main focus of the Assistant Chief Building Official is to assist the Chief Building Official, and to oversee the Plans Review Section. The Building Inspection Manager will provide the oversight for all inspection activities and staff. Therefore all references to building inspection was removed. Within the examples of work section, all references to inspection activities were removed. Also, two examples were removed within this section as they will no longer be performed by incumbents within this classification.

Within the minimum qualification section, the addition of a valid State of Ohio certification as a Master Plans Examiner was added. There were no revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Manager (Job Code 0874).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Manager as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in November 2011. There are currently two incumbents within this classification in the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging (COAAA), which is in the Columbus Recreation and Parks Department.

Based upon a review of questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed. The definition section was revised to read, "Under general direction, is responsible for managing the functions of a unit of the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging that provides long-term health and/or social service programs available through COAAA; performs related duties as required." One example within the examples of work section was revised to read, "Evaluates existing programs and interprets, suggests, and develops revisions of policies and procedures for programs servicing older adults and/or individuals with high level of health and service needs."

Within the minimum qualification section, the master's degree was updated to be able to substitute for one year of the required experience. Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section were to add "general knowledge of the influence of culture and/or ethnicity on the assessment process; ability to communicate effectively orally and in writing; ability to identify the nature of problems and use logic and analysis to solve problems;" and "ability to present information to influence the opinions or actions of others." There were no revisions to the examination type or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Provider Relations Specialist (Job Code 0875).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Provider Relations Specialist as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in November 2011. There are currently nine incumbents within this classification in the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging (COAAA), which is in the Columbus Recreation and Parks Department.

Based upon a review of questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed. The definition section was revised to read, "Under direction, is responsible for monitoring, training, and evaluating contracted provider agencies for programs available through COAAA; performs related duties as required." Three examples within the examples of work section were revised to read, "Monitors contracts with agencies providing multi-services to older adults and/or other individuals with high level of health and service needs; ensures compliance with the terms and conditions of various programs by reviewing reports and provider records; Negotiates problems or complaints regarding service delivery between providers and clinical staff; facilitates accountability for service delivery by working with state agencies and community groups;" and "Monitors provider billing through unit of service verification; coordinates with fiscal staff regarding release of funds."

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section were to add "some knowledge of the influence of culture and/or ethnicity on service delivery; ability to convey information to individuals with limited English proficiency;" and "ability to maintain awareness of personal safety." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Case Management Supervisor I (Job Code 0867).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Case Management Supervisor I as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in November 2011. There are currently 17 incumbents within this classification in the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging (COAAA), which is in the Columbus Recreation and Parks Department.

Based upon a review of questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed. The definition section was revised to read, "Under direction, is responsible for supervising the activities of staff providing assessment and/or case management services through COAAA; performs related duties as required." Four examples within the examples of work section were revised to read, "Develops assessment and case management standards in accordance with program goals; supervises case management staff in accordance with agency policies and compliance with program goals; Assists staff in making proper consumer assessment and appropriate referrals to agencies providing services to older adults and/or other individuals with high level of health and service needs; Interprets assessment and case management program objectives and policies to staff;" and "Assists in assessment and case management program evaluation; prepares, monitors, and responds to reports."

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section were to add "some knowledge of the influence of culture and/or ethnicity on the assessment process; ability to convey information to individuals with limited English proficiency;" and "ability to maintain awareness of personal safety." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Case Management Supervisor II (Job Code 0876).*

PRESENT: Carol Lagemann, Personnel Analyst II

Carol Lagemann presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Aging Programs Case Management Supervisor II as part of the Commission's efforts to ensure that all classifications are reviewed at least every five years. It was last reviewed in February 2013. There are currently five incumbents within this classification in the Central Ohio Area Agency on Aging (COAAA), which is in the Columbus Recreation and Parks Department.

Based upon a review of questionnaires completed by incumbents, with supervisory review, and feedback from department representatives, some revisions were proposed. The definition section was revised to read, "Under general direction, is responsible for overseeing and supervising staff for assessment and/or case management services, the planning and development of programs which are available through COAAA, and/or management of contracted provider agencies; performs related duties as required." The examples of work section was revised to add "other individuals with high level of health and service needs" to one example. Some examples were rearranged to group like examples together and one redundant statement was deleted. Titles of classifications were removed from two examples and some minor additions were made to make them more broadly applicable to areas supervised by this classification.

Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section were to add "general knowledge of the influence of culture and/or ethnicity on service delivery;" and "ability to interpret important provisions of contracts or state code requirements." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Equal Business Opportunity Specialist I, retitle it to read Diversity and Inclusion Specialist I, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Job Code 0806).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Manager

Tammy Rollins presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Equal Business Opportunity Specialist I and retitle it to read Diversity and Inclusion Specialist I. The changes to this classification are supportive of the diversity related initiatives charged to the Equal Business Opportunity Commission, which will soon be renamed and recodified as the Office of Diversity and Inclusion. The revisions to this classification were made to be reflective of the expanded mission and responsibilities charged to the Office of Diversity and Inclusion. It was last revised in September 2011. There are currently no employees serving in this classification.

The definition section was revised to read, "Under direction, is responsible for performing entry-level professional work in the development and implementation of

diversity and inclusion programs for the City of Columbus pursuant to Title 39 of the Columbus City Code; performs related duties as required." The examples of work section was revised to include those duties most reflective of the work to be performed. Throughout the examples of work section, and where appropriate, emphasis was placed on small, minority, and female businesses as the crux for increasing supplier diversity for the City. Also reference was made regarding work to be performed that is specifically directed towards workforce diversity programming.

The guidelines for class use section was revised to read, "Positions allocated to this classification are restricted to the Mayor's Office, Office of Diversity and Inclusion." Revisions to the knowledge, skills, and abilities section include the addition of "some knowledge of current federal, state, and municipal laws, requirements, guidelines, and policies referring to procurement, diversity and inclusion, and equal business opportunity; some knowledge of Diversity and Inclusion code, methods, techniques, and activities;" and "some knowledge of objectives, methods, and problems of public or business administration." There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Request of the Civil Service Commission staff to revise the specification for the classification Equal Business Opportunity Specialist II, retitle it to read Diversity and Inclusion Specialist II, and amend Rule XI accordingly (Job Code 0805).*

PRESENT: Tammy Rollins, Personnel Administrative Manager

Tammy Rollins presented this request to revise the specification for the classification Equal Business Opportunity Specialist II and retitle it to read Diversity and Inclusion Specialist II. The changes to this classification are supportive of the diversity related initiatives charged to the Equal Business Opportunity Commission, which will soon be renamed and recodified as the Office of Diversity and Inclusion. The revisions to this classification were made to be reflective of the expanded mission and responsibilities charged to the Office of Diversity and Inclusion. It was last revised in September 2011. There are currently four employees serving in this classification.

The definition section was revised to read, "Under general direction, is responsible for developing and implementing diversity and inclusion programs for the City of Columbus pursuant to Title 39 of the Columbus City Code; performs related duties as required." The examples of work section was revised to include those duties most reflective of the work to be performed. Throughout the examples of work section, and where appropriate, emphasis was placed on small, minority, and female businesses as the crux for increasing supplier diversity for the City. Also reference was made regarding work to be performed that is specifically directed towards workforce diversity programming.

The guidelines for class use section was revised to read, "Positions allocated to this classification are restricted to the Mayor's Office, Office of Diversity and Inclusion." The knowledge, skills, and abilities section was revised to incorporate knowledges of diversity and inclusion, equal employment opportunity, and affirmative action issues in business. There were no revisions to the minimum qualifications section, the examination type, or the probationary period.

A motion to approve this request was made, seconded, and passed unanimously.

\* \* \*

*RE: Personnel Actions.*

No Personnel Actions were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Residency Hearing Reviews.*

No Residency Hearing Reviews were submitted this month.

\* \* \*

*RE: Background Removals - Post-Exam.*

	Name of Applicant	Position Applied For	BAR #
1.	Jason Majoros	Police Officer	16-BR-038
2.	Cody Corrova	Police Officer	16-BR-039
3.	Jared Nelson	Police Officer	16-BR-040
4.	Aaron To	Police Officer	16-BR-041
5.	Herbert McCraw	Police Officer	16-BR-042

After reviewing the files of Jason Majoros, Cody Corrova, Jared Nelson, and Aaron To, the Commissioners decided their names would not be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

After reviewing the file of Herbert McCraw, the Commissioners decided his name would be reinstated to the Police Officer eligible list.

\* \* \*

*RE: Other Administrative/Jurisdictional Reviews.*

*Review of the appeal of William R. Young, regarding his denied Request for Review for the Firefighter Captain examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0009.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by William R. Young on October 3, 2016, regarding his denied Request for Review for the Firefighter Captain examination with the City of Columbus. His appeal indicated that he had difficulty applying online for this exam. He stated that he called a Commission staff member on September 7, 2016 to discuss his technical difficulties but that conversation was cut short by a fire run; therefore, he did not meet the application deadline.

Mr. Young was informed that the Commission posted CIFA meeting minutes in April 2016 which identified important dates, including the application filing period dates. Additionally, the Commission had an email sent to all Division of Fire users during the filing period which reminded employees that the filing period was open and it included a link to the web page for applying.

The Commission staff member who did receive a phone call on September 7<sup>th</sup>, but indicated that he could not hear anything the caller was saying because there was an emergency dispatch coming across the PA system on the other end of the call. The staff member stated that he did not have any conversation with the caller and asked the caller to call back. Unfortunately, when Mr. Young called back on September 13, 2016, the filing period had closed.

The deadline for this exam was September 9, 2016 at 11:59 p.m. Staff members were also available for two additional work days if assistance was needed. No application from Mr. Young was submitted by the deadline on September 9, 2016 and the online system administrator (NEOGOV) verified that no profile existed in the system for him.

Unfortunately, Commission Rules and procedures require all applications be submitted by the close of the filing period. The Commission does not deviate from those procedures in order to ensure fair and consistent opportunities for applicants; therefore, a late application cannot be allowed.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Young's appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

*Review of the appeal of Larry Hamiter, regarding his denied Request for Review for the Refuse Collection Vehicle Operator examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0010.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Larry Hamiter on October 17, 2016, regarding his denied Request for Review for the Refuse Collection Vehicle Operator examination with the City of Columbus. In his appeal, Mr. Hamiter stated that he did not see an area to list other jobs so he did not include his work experience at SWACO on his application. The minimum qualifications for this classification requires one year of experience driving a vehicle that requires a CDL (Class A or B) and possession of a valid Class B CDL with an air brakes endorsement. Mr. Hamiter's application was rejected because he only listed his experience at Laz Parking, which did not involve driving.

Commission policy does not allow jobs to be added to an application once that application has been reviewed for the minimum qualifications. The Commission upheld the rejection of Mr. Hamiter's application because he did not list enough work experience to meet the requirements for this examination.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Hamiter's appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

\* \* \*

*Review of the appeal of Timotheus Williams, regarding his denied Request for Review regarding the Police Officer examination, City of Columbus, Appeal #16-CA-0011.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Timotheus Williams on October 25, 2016, regarding his writing sample score for the Police Officer examination with the City of Columbus.

In his appeal, Mr. Williams noted that the study guide for this examination indicated that the writing sample would be graded on two dimensions, but his Request for Review response stated that he passed two of the three parts of the exam component. The study guide was correct in that the writing sample is graded on two dimensions. Although the exam has two sections, candidates receive three scores on this exam.

The response to Mr. Williams' original Request for Review indicated that he received two passing scores on the writing sample exam, but his score was not high enough to pass the third part. A Commission staff member reviewed Mr. Williams' writing sample to verify the grading and unfortunately, his narrative left out many relevant details, so his score was not high enough to pass.

After a review of Mr. Williams' appeal, it was determined that his score on the Police Officer test stands. Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission decided to dismiss Mr. Williams' appeal without a hearing pursuant to Rule XIII (G)(1).

\* \* \*

*Review of the appeal of Leroy Kuehner, regarding his 3<sup>rd</sup> Step Grievance for the position of Bus Driver, Columbus City Schools, Appeal #16-BA-0005.*

The Commissioners reviewed the appeal filed by Leroy Kuehner on October 28, 2016 regarding his Step 3 Grievance and the bidding on bus routes.

The subjects of bidding and management assigning work are covered in Sections 8.10 and 3.1 of the Agreement between the Columbus School Employees Association and the Columbus Board of Education. The Civil Service Commission determined that this is a contractual matter governed by the bargaining agreement between the CSEA and the

Columbus Board of Education. The Commission does not have authority in these areas involving work assignment. Therefore, the Commission determined that it has no jurisdiction over the subject matter of Mr. Keuhner's appeal or any grievances related to this matter.

However, it appeared that the relief requested was granted in the Step 2 Grievance hearing. According to documents provided by Columbus City Schools, this bus route was determined to be retainable as a result of that grievance hearing.

Based upon the foregoing, the Civil Service Commission dismissed Mr. Kuehner's appeal without a hearing because of lack of jurisdiction over the appeal.

\* \* \*

The Commissioners adjourned their regular meeting at 1:13 p.m.

\* \* \*

---

Grady L. Pettigrew, Jr., President

---

Date