

Meeting Agenda

Victorian Village Commission



Location: 111 N Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204



Date: March 13, 2024



Time: 4:00pm

Commissioners Present: *Skinner, Shah, Dodson, Hissem*

Commissioners Absent: *Conyers, Sprite, Shuler*

Staff Present: *Barnard-Sheehy*

I. Call to Order: 4:06PM

- **Next Business Meeting:**
Wednesday, March 27, 2024 - 12:00pm (Noon)
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 205
- **Next Hearing:**
Wednesday, April 10, 2024 - 4:00pm
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- Swear in Staff
- Introduction of Commissioners Present
- **Overview of Hearing Format**
- **Public Forum:**

- II. Approval of Staff Approvals** - The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Shah/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

- III. Approval of Minutes from Last Meeting – February 14, 2024**
MOTION: Shah/Dodson (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness

I. Continued Applications

1. VV-24-02-008

989 N. High St.

Tin Roof Bars (Applicant)/Starr/High LP (Owner)

Continue application VV-24-02-008, 989 N. High St., to allow the applicant to submit additional materials.

Exterior Modification

- Replace portion of existing storefront, per submitted materials.
- Repair portion of existing storefront, per submitted materials.
- Install mechanical equipment and associated screening, per submitted documentation.
- Reopen an egress door on the addition to the rear of the property.

MOTION: Dodson/Shah (4-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission was hesitant about the height of the proposed HVAC equipment on the roof. They questioned why so much program was needed for what would service one floor.
- The National Park Service can require site line studies where a pole is held up on a structure to see the impact from the surrounding area. The Commission suggests doing this for the proposed roof equipment.
- Additional site line photos from up/down N High Street as well as from the neighborhood side along W Starr Avenue were requested.
- The Commission feels that the proposed equipment would be the equivalent to adding a penthouse to the existing three story building.
- High rises are becoming more common in Victorian Village, so the Commission needs to consider the view from above as well.
- Commissioners want revised details of the proposed storefront along N High Street. They expressed concern regarding condensation collecting between the two windows.
- Commissioners also wanted to know if the stage would be above the window sill. If it is, that detail needs to be reflected in the drawings and the Commission needs to review to evaluate its appropriateness.
- A detailed section drawing through the storefront was also requested for review.

2. [VV-22-10-016b](#)

53-55 W Starr Ave

Jeffrey Dulle (Owner)

[Videos](#); [Previous Materials](#)

Approve application VV-22-10-016b, 53-55 W Starr Ave., as submitted with clarifications as noted:

Exterior Building Modification

- Retain the painting of previously unpainted masonry.
- House to be painted a color that will match the unpainted brick. Trim to be painted the color of the mortar.
- Rear (south) elevation house to remain unpainted.
- Applicant to submit paint chip/color sample of color to match the original brick, to subcommittee review of Commissioners Hissem and Shah for review prior to issuance of a Certificate.
- Note: Special case for approval in that the building was painted without approval. The applicant presented material numerous times to the commission showing their due diligence in attempting to correct the situation. Several iterations of paint removal were presented to the Commission, to the point that the paint removal would damage the brick. In order to preserve the brick, the Commission is allowing the brick to remain painted. The age and condition of the brick was also taken into consideration during evaluation of the application.

MOTION: Hissem/Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

II. **New Applications**

3. [VV-24-03-011](#)

349 W Second Ave

Jessica Elefritz (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #VV-24-03-011, was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action.

VV-24-03-011A

Approve application VV-24-03-011A, 349 W Second Ave, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

Landscaping

- Remove existing wood deck
- Replace with new cedar wood deck, per submitted documentation.
- New deck to measure 8' deep by 12' wide by 2' high.
- Applicant to submit updated stair drawing to eliminate smaller stair, guard rail detail, and skirting for subcommittee review by Commissioners Hissem and Skinner, prior to issuance of a Certificate.

MOTION: Dodson/Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Upon subcommittee review of VV-24-03-011A the proposed design was updated and approved. Approve application VV-24-03-011A, 349 W Second Ave, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

- Remove existing wood deck in rear yard.
- Replace deck with a paver patio at grade, per submitted documentation.
- Steps will be constructed out of the same pavers as the patio/walkway, per submitted documentation.

VV-24-03-011B

Approve application VV-24-03-011B, 349 W Second Ave, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

- Remove existing pavers and replace with new pavers, per submitted documentation.
- Applicant to provide clarification of which pavers will be used.

MOTION: Dodson/Hissem (4-0-0) APPROVED.

4. **VV-24-03-012**

851 Neil Ave

Jesse Bianconi (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-012, 851 Neil Ave, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

Landscaping

- Replace existing retaining wall with 1'9" Scottsdale stone retaining wall per submitted documentation.
- Land to be graded behind the retaining wall.
- Applicant to subcommittee detail of cap including height and material. Elevation drawing to be revised to include cap. A scaled/measured site plan of the proposed landscaping to be submitted as well. Material and drawing to be reviewed by subcommittee of Commissioners Skinner and Shah, prior to issuance of a Certificate.

MOTION: Dodson/Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

III. **Conceptual Applications**

5. [VV-24-03-013](#)

1029 Hunter Ave

Kareem Amr (Applicant)/ AFS I LLC (Owner)

New Construction

- Two story rear addition on west elevation, per submitted documentation.
- Proposed siding would be smooth Hardie Plank lap siding in Gray Slate with smooth 5/4 Hardie trim boards in artic white.

NO ACTION TAKEN

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission is supportive of the original siding being restored.
- The lots on Hunter Avenue are long but that doesn't mean the entirety of the lot can be built upon.
- The proposed design is a lot of program. Commissioners suggested to pull back the addition to where the first story porch. The rear of the current design breaks down and the current configuration looks too modern. Two story porches do have precedent in the area and the Commission noted that they'd be willing to explore that incorporated with the addition design.
- The current design just looks like the original portion of the house is mirrored.
- There's too much massing and program in the proposed addition.
- With the building to the south being a new design, it's not a great comparison. The new structure had more flexibility in its design as it wasn't being compared to an older portion of the house. This addition needs to balance the old versus the new.
- There's an opportunity for the design to get everything in it, but it needs to be articulated differently.
- Details need to be added to the addition design for the next review.

IV. Staff Approved Applications

- **VV-24-03-001**

216 Wilber Ave.

Stuart Miles (Applicant)/ Laura Modisette (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-001, 216 Wilber Ave., as submitted with clarifications as noted:

Exterior Modifications

- Replace existing Douglas Fir porch floor, in like-kind.
- Paint porch to match existing colors
 - Colors to be Valspar Early American Opal Green (791-2), Victorian Celadon Green (795-4) and Garnet Glory (852-3).

Replace Porch Flooring

- Remove and dispose of all existing flooring; pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing joists to insure structural integrity.
- Install tongue and groove, porch decking.
- Blind nail with galvanized finish nails only.
- Allow a 1 1/2" minimum to 2 1/2" maximum flooring overhang on all outside edges.
- Install exterior grade, quarter-round moulding to band board fascia, tight against all flooring overhang.
- Prime on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with appropriate material prior to installation. After installation, topcoat with same porch floor enamel according to manufacturer's specifications for finish coat.
- Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **VV-24-03-002**

182 W Fourth Ave.

DeMarco Inc. (Applicant)/William Dupuis (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-002, 182 W. Fourth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove approximately 140' of fascia, soffit and drip edge complete.
- Remove existing wood siding.
- Install approximately 140' of drip edge 24ga with Kynar finish.
- Install approximately 140' of 1x8 fascia board and prime only.
- Install approximately 140' of soffit using ¾ CDX and prime only.
- Install new cedar siding to match house siding.
- Install approximately 32' of 5" galvanized half-round gutter and approximately 20' of 3" corrugated downspout to include all accessories.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Victorian Village Commission.

Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

- **VV-24-03-003**

88-96 Wilber Ave.

Peter Lindemann (Applicant)/ William E. Benua TR (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-003, 88-96 Wilber Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Tuck point masonry where needed, to match existing.
- Wood window mullions will be reglazed and sill, frame, sash, mullion and wood siding, painted masonry primed.
- Window trim, bottom windowsill, down spout, roof fascia/drip edge, front porch boxed beams, front, porch door trim, rear siding, rear door and door trim to be painted with Benjamin Moore "Greenmount Silk" (HC-3).

- Front porch wood divider between units and, front and rear screen door to be painted Benjamin Moore “Webster Green” (HC-130).
- Metal hand railings at front & rear steps and, metal roof above rear steps to be painted Benjamin Moore “Cottage Red” (HC-184).
- Window sashes and muntin and, front porch ceiling to be painted Benjamin Moore “Snowfall White” (OC-118)
- Stone caps on half-wall and door stoops to be painted Benjamin Moore “Himalayan Trek” (1542)

Clean Previously Painted Masonry

- Prepare all previously painted stone on property for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Power wash all stone, if necessary (pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and a broad fan tip is to be used).
- Repaint all previously painted stone on property; paint color to match the existing, stone color as closely as possible.

Clean Previously Unpainted Masonry

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes.
- Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and a broad fan tip is to be used.
- **Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor the following patch test procedure is required:** Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Patch test to be approved by Historic Preservation Office staff prior to proceeding with the complete job.
- Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations.
- If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- “The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings”).

Spot Tuck Point-(partial)

- Check all mortar joints on the property for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings”, available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Repair Windows

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.

- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **VV-24-03-004**

308 W. Hubbard Ave.

Brian Lee (Owner)

Approve Application # VV-24-03-004, 308 W. Hubbard Ave., with all clarifications, as noted.

- Remove existing white TPO roofing on main peak of home down to sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new E.P.D.M rubber roofing in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- New E.P.D.M roof to be "Black".
- Install new edge metal. Color to be "Colonial Red" to match existing metal ridge roll and flashing.
- Rebuild existing Hatch Frame and Lid (24" x 24") to match existing. Wrap Hatch in E.P.D.M "Black" to match roof.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the main roof of home down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.

- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **VV-24-03-005**

1101 Highland St.

Able Roofing LLC (Applicant)/ Liz Plotnick-Snay (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-005, 1101 Highland St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace existing vinyl siding to match exactly, with new vinyl siding of the same color, finish and profile.
- Vinyl siding to be replaced only in the area between the porch roof and the gable of the front façade of the property.

Repair/Replace Vinyl Siding

- The existing, vinyl siding is in place and in good condition. Examine all siding on all elevations and replace any/all missing and damaged vinyl siding with new vinyl siding of the same color, finish and profile, as necessary; like-for-like.
- Following any/all necessary repairs to the vinyl siding and trim, prepare all vinyl siding for painting in accordance with all applicable industry standards and manufacturers' specifications. Power wash all surfaces with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p. s. i. and broad fan tip nozzle.
- Apply the appropriate exterior paint for vinyl surfaces, in accordance with industry standards and manufacturers' specifications.
- Paint all vinyl siding to match the existing siding color as closely as possible, or submit a new exterior paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Victorian Village Commission.

- **VV-24-03-006**

947-949 Highland St.

Karen Hanas (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-006, 947-949 Highland St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Paint siding and trim of property.
 - Siding to be PPG "Industrial Revolution" (PPG0997-6)
 - Trim to be PPG "Pacific Pearl" (PPG1011-1) and PPG "Onyx" (PPG1011-7)

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
 - Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.
- **VV-24-03-007**
188 W. Fourth Ave.
DeMarco Roof Inc. (Applicant)/ Douglas Graybeal and Samantha Spangler (Owners)
Approve application VV-24-03-007, 188 W. Fourth Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:
 - Remove 10-inch fiber board beveled siding from gable ends of garage.
 - Replace with 10-inch cedar beveled siding in gable ends of garage.
 - Paint trim with Sherwin Williams Gauntlet Gray (SW 7019)
 - Paint siding with Sherwin William Black Magic (SW6991)
 - Paint previously painted concrete block with Sherwin Williams Repose Gray (SW 7015).Repair/Replace Wood Siding
 - Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
 - Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Victorian Village Commission.Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **VV-24-03-008**

322 Buttes Ave.

Pella of Columbus (Applicant)/ Beachside 325 LLC (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-008, 322 Buttes Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove existing rear door on enclosed porch and replace with half lite, two panel fiberglass door, per submitted documentation.

Install New Door

- Install new, solid core door in existing door jamb on north elevation, in the rear.
- New door to be either a four-panel or half-lite: [] wood, [x] fiberglass, or [] metal. Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides. Exterior and hinged sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be painted. Interior and keyed sides of fiberglass and metal doors to be either painted or stained.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

- **VV-24-03-009**

938 Hunter Ave.

Lee Mueller (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-009, 938 Hunter Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the West and South elevations with new, 1-OVER-1, Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly.
- Windows to be "Pella – Architect Series – Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior" with white cladding from the Approved Window's List.

Replace Non-Original Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the West and South elevations with new, 1-OVER-1, Aluminum-Clad Wood Exterior/Wood Interior windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.

- **VV-24-03-010**

845 Dennison Ave.

Columbus Roofing Company (Applicant)/ Matt Bowers (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-03-010, 938 Hunter Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing k-style (ogee) gutters on eaves to match existing.

- Note: The roofing elements of this application will be addressed separately.

Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

V. New Business

VI. Old Business

VII. Adjournment 5:36 PM

MOTION: Skinner/Dodson (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing for new and continued applications for Certificates of Appropriateness and Certificates of Approval. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.