

-  **Location:** 111 N Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
-  **Date:** February 14, 2024
-  **Time:** 4:00pm

Commissioners Present: *Skinner, Sprite, Shah, Shuler, Dodson, Hissem*

Commissioners Absent: *Conyers*

Staff Present: *Vogel, Barnard-Sheehy*

I. Call to Order (Chair)

- Next Business Meeting:
Wednesday, February 28, 2024 - 12:00pm (Noon)
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 205
- Next Hearing:
Wednesday, March 13, 2024 - 4:00pm
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204
- Swear in Staff
- Introduction of Commissioners Present
- **Overview of Hearing Format**
- **Public Forum:**
City Attorney's Office Board/Commission Oath of Office and Pledge of Ethical Conduct
 - All seated Commissioners will raise their hand and repeat the oath. Assistant City Attorney, Joshua Monroe, will administer and notarize the oath, which will be filed with the City Clerk.

- II. Approval of Staff Approvals** - The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Sprite/Shah (6-0-0) APPROVED.

- III. Approval of Minutes from Last Meeting – [January 10, 2024](#)**
MOTION: Sprite/Dodson (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness

I. Continued Applications

1. [VV-23-12-011](#)

1226 Forsythe Ave
Darren Schue (Owner)
[Previous Materials](#)

Approve application VV-23-12-011, 1226 Forsythe Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

New Construction

- Construct a two-story carriage house.
- Proposed footprint would measure 25'-5" deep by 20' wide being offset from the alley by 2'-8", per submitted documentation.

- The carriage house would measure 23'-4" overall with Owens Corning supreme 3-tab shingles in Estate gray.
- Windows would be Marvin Elevate 2-over-2 double hung.
- **Note:** Paint color for trim to be submitted to HPO staff for review and approval, prior to issuance of a certificate.
MOTION: Sprite/Hissem (6-0-0) APPROVED.

2. [VV-24-01-006](#)

989 N. High St.

DaNite Sign Co. (Applicant)/ Starr/High LP (Owner)

[Previous Materials](#)

Approve application VV-24-01-006, 989 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

Signage

- Install a new blade and wall sign on storefront elevation, per submitted materials.
- Blade sign:
 - Size to 2' 3.25" x 4' 11" x 5" aluminum cabinet sign. Cabinet to have elements that extrude 2.5" either side.
 - Sign to be mounted via mortar joints.
 - "Tin Roof" to be HDPE letters with inset LED flex tubing.
 - "A Live Music Joint" to be non-illuminated, painted layered acrylic.
 - Dancing woman portion to be reverse Cloud Cabinet with external faux-neon illuminated outline.
 - Bulbs to be installed to illuminate the arrow.
 - Sign to be installed 11' 6" from grade.
- Wall Sign:
 - Size to be 2' x 6' 5/16"
 - Installed on mounted raceway that will be 10' from grade.
 - Raceway to be painted black and installed via mortar joints.
 - "Tin Roof" to have externally illuminated channel letters with LED faux neon.
 - Illumination for "A Live Music Joint" to be externally exposed LED modules.
- **Note:** Final drawings to be submitted to HPO staff and reviewed by subcommittee of Commissioner Shuler, Commissioner Sprite, and Commissioner Shah.
- **Note:** Updated drawings are to be submitted with the height of the projecting sign adjusted to fall between the two stories, all documents must match accurately.
- **Note:** The Commission also requested details about the reverse cloud cabinet, including a photographic example of a previous reverse cloud cabinet that has been manufactured.
MOTION: Sprite/Shah (6-0-0) APPROVED.

3. [VV-24-01-008](#)

1025 and 1029 Hunter Ave

The Columbus Design Company (Applicant)/ Roby Development (Owner)

[Previous Materials](#)

Approve application VV-24-01-008, 1025 and 1029 Hunter Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

New Construction

- Construct a two-story, single-family house, with basement and plunge pool, per submitted drawings.
- The house would measure approximately 18'-8" wide by 74' deep.
- Construct two, single-story garages.
- **Note:** Soffit lights on the garage to be replaced with gooseneck lights above the garage doors, a cutsheet and updated drawings to show the location of the lights are to be provided to HPO staff for review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.
- **Note:** Product cut sheet for the material for front walkway and steps to be provided to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a certificate.
- **Note:** Product cut sheet for the proposed pavers for the surround of the plunge pool to be provided to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Sprite/Shah (6-0-0) APPROVED.

II. New Applications

4. [VV-24-02-004](#)

871 Neil Avenue

Locke and Joy McKenzie (Owners)

Approve application VV-24-02-004, 871 Neil Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

New Construction

- Remove existing deck and replace with new larger deck, per submitted documentation.
- Install a new fire pit with stone surround and a pergola, per submitted drawings.
- Pergola to constructed from red cedar and stained with Valspar transparent stain.
- **Note:** The existing tiered deck structure will be removed from this application and will remain as is.
- **Note:** The lower deck area will be hardscaped, with materials for the hardscaping submitted to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.
- **Note:** All of the drawings must be updated to show the changes to the application and the location of posts for the pergola are to be shown on the site plan. These drawings are to be provided to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Sprite/Hissem (6-0-0) APPROVED.

5. [VV-24-02-005](#)

705 N. High St.

Zoning Resources (Applicant)

Approve application VV-24-02-005, 705 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

A code violation has been issued for installation without approval.

Signage

- Install a new wall sign on storefront elevation, per submitted materials.
- Proposed wall sign to be 32" x 120".
- Sign to have aluminum channel letters with clear acrylic trimless faces covered with vinyl to match channel letters, with internal illumination.

- **Note:** A completely opaque vinyl is to be applied to the face of the sign, to create a halo-lit effect with no glow from the face of the sign.

MOTION: Hissem/Sprite (6-0-0) APPROVED.

6. [VV-24-02-006](#)

965 N. High St.

Zoning Resources (Applicant)

At the hearing the application was split for clarity of action, Application #VV-24-02-006, was divided into Items 'a,' and 'b.'

Approve application VV-24-02-006a, 965 N. High St., as submitted:

- Blade sign:
 - 2'3 3/8" x 5'2 3/4" in area.
 - "Mecha" to be halo-lit and cabinet to have a faux neon strip element at the edge of the cabinet.
 - Sign to be a vinyl print on aluminum skin, with the business name to be a white acrylic element.
- Wall Sign:
 - 2' 1/4" x 2' 1/4" x 6" in total massing.
 - Logo to be halo-lit.
 - Sign to be a painted aluminum cabinet with white acrylic lettering, overlaid with red vinyl.

MOTION: Sprite/Dodson (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Approve application VV-24-02-006b, 965 N. High St., as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Vinyl Graphics:
 - Vinyl graphics of varying sizes applied to a number of storefront windows.
 - The cumulative area of the vinyl signs is less than 25% of the window space but larger than 6 sq. ft.
- **Note:** Window graphics are to be reduced to 6 square feet or less per storefront elevation, and revised drawings are to be submitted to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Sprite/Shuler (6-0-0) APPROVED.

7. [VV-24-02-007](#)

1035 Hunter Ave.

Urbanorder Architecture (Applicant)/ Sally MacLeod + Chuck Hootman (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-02-007, 1035 Hunter Ave., as submitted with the following clarifications:

New Construction

- Rotate garage roof and construct two shed dormers to create a second story on garage, per submitted documentation.
- **Note:** Applicant to use a solid stain color to meld the older siding with the new siding.
- **Note:** Applicant to submit stain color, cut sheet for skylights, and proposed shingle to HPO Staff for review and approval prior to issuance of a certificate.

MOTION: Hissem/Sprite (6-0-0) APPROVED.

8. [VV-24-02-008](#)

989 N. High St.

Tin Roof Bars (Applicant)/Starr/High LP (Owner)

Continue application VV-24-02-008, 989 N. High St., to allow the applicant time to respond to Commissioner feedback:

Exterior Modification

- Replace portion of existing storefront, per submitted materials.
- Repair portion of existing storefront, per submitted materials.
- Install mechanical equipment and associated screening, per submitted documentation.
- Reopen an egress door on the addition to the rear of the property.

MOTION: Sprite/Shah (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

Commissioner Comments

- The Commission supported the storefronts being repaired or replaced in like-kind, and noted that a change in color would be supported.
- The mechanical equipment is currently only visually screened, so the Commission noted that an acoustic baffle screening is an option to explore.
- Commissioner Shah stated that a roof plan would be helpful.
- It was also noted that high-rise buildings surround this property, so thinking of aesthetics from the roof is necessary.
- A sightline study from street level requested for pedestrian view of the mechanical equipment. Considering the project holistically is important.
- The Commission clarified that there will be no ductwork running outside of the building.
- The Commission noted that although the open space is not being proposed as patio, how it will be used needs to be considered during this process.
- Whether any variances are required was asked by the Commission.
- The Commission noted that the wall that is built inside of the windows on the rear addition should either be screened through mirroring or painting.
- The key notes need to be updated on the drawings to match what they are pointing to.
- It was noted that, for future use, the sound wall would be better than bricking in the openings.
- The Commission asked where the dumpsters were located and where deliveries will take place for this property.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Eric Gioglio 19 W. Starr Ave West Starr Avenue Condo Association	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Thanked Tin Roof for their willingness to discuss their plans and openness to listen to concerns of neighbors. • Believes that the walk-in apartments at the rear of the property should remain residential due to the housing crisis.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Wishes to ensure that the project does not harm the quality of life of the surrounding residents.• Asked Commission to clarify whether the rear addition windows and doors are contributing, and if appropriate, permit Tin Roof to replace any non-contributing elements to help with noise control and aesthetics.• Appreciates the screening of the mechanical but wonders whether the roof of the first-floor addition is the right place for them and worries about noise from this equipment.• Requests Commissioners to visit the space behind the building before making any formal decisions, and requested that the Commission table the application to allow the neighbors and the applicant further time to discuss the proposal.
--	--

III. Conceptual Applications

9. [VV-24-02-009](#)

148 Price Ave.

Dana Rettig (Applicant)/ Patrick McCarthy (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a two-story addition, with basement, per submitted documentation.
- Addition of a large dormer on south side of the roof and a shed roof over the back porch on north side of the property.
- Existing brick wall surrounding yard to be removed and replaced with new brick, per submitted documentation.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments

- Commissioner Sprite clarified that the property is a contributing structure.
- It was noted that the roof lines have become overly complicated, when looking at this row of structures there is usually a gable and now a lot of hips are being introduced.
- One point of discussion was the new massing, and the split between the top level and lower level. It feels more horizontal than the rest of the home that presents vertically. The Commission suggested that carrying one material on the extent of that massing could help with making it appear more vertical.
- The elevator stack appears suburban. The Commission noted that brick may be more appropriate for that portion of the proposal, and make it appear more chimney-like. It was noted that not the height that was not what made the elevator stack stand out, but the material and possibly the depth; but that may be necessary for the elevator.
- The Commission were conflicted in making the Dennison Avenue elevation of the property appear to be the front. Commissioner Hissem noted that the Dennison Avenue side is becoming the long, formal elevation of the home. Commissioner Shah countered that very rarely does a home present the gable end as the front when the gable is so wide. Other

Commissioners were in agreement that this side is no longer presented as a gable end, with the addition of the new addition and elevator stack.

- It was noted that if the home has a Price Avenue address, then Price Avenue is the front. If the applicant would like the front to appear to be on the Dennison Avenue frontage, then the address should change. It is possible to get an address change to a Dennison address, but it is a long process.
- Commissioner Sprite stated that the Price Avenue frontage looks like the side of a house, rather than the front. It was countered that the Price Avenue side looks like the front of a very simple Federal or Italianate style home that were very narrow in the front and long in the back.
- The Commission requested five different iterations of the proposal, to allow them to provide further feedback. The noted that construction detail level drawings are not necessary at this stage, but general massing, black and white elevations and floor plans would be helpful for review. The Commission encouraged the applicant to think about materials, about clarity of what side the home will front, and about how the entry will be treated. Simple is usually better.
- It was noted that having the stairs to the porch facing Price Avenue and having a rectangular porch rather than the wrap around, could help with establishing Price Avenue as the front of the home and would be more in keeping with the other simple Italianate houses. This corner of the property needs further work.
- The Commission noted that if the applicant returned to this Commission with drawings of an addition that fits in with the neighborhood, and looks like it belongs, then they would be open to the changes.

IV. Staff Approved Applications

• **VV-24-02-001**

312 W. Hubbard Ave.

Klaus Roofing Systems (Applicant)/Orion Foss (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-02-001, 312 W. Hubbard Avenue, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **VV-24-02-002**

325 W. Hubbard Ave.

Innovative Roofing Systems (Applicant)/Marcus Johnson (Owner)

Approve Application # VV-24-02-002, 325 W. Hubbard Ave., as submitted with clarifications as noted:

- Repair box gutters in like kind and reline with new black E.P.D.M., to match existing.
- Clean and paint box gutters to match existing.
 - Color to be Sherwin Williams Victorian Renwick Olive (SW 2815).

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
 - Reline with new black E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
 - Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
 - Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- **VV-24-02-003**
640 Neil Ave.
ProNova Contractors (Applicant)/Jason Mertens (Owner)
Approve Application # VV-24-02-003, 640 Neil Ave., as submitted with clarifications as noted:
 - Remove any/all damaged textured concrete block on South elevation of non-original garage with new concrete block to match existing in size, color and shape.
 - Replace existing damaged fiber cement siding on South elevation of non-original garage with new fiber cement siding of the same color and profile, as necessary; like-for-like.
 - Siding to be “White”.
 - Replace existing damaged metal garage door on East elevation of non-original garage with new steel garage door, “Ideal Door – Traditional Steel Panel – Elegant Short Panel” to match existing. Door to be “White”.

Repair Masonry Foundation Wall

- Remove any/all damaged material and replace with like-for-like materials as indicated by checked box. Replacement []brick [X]block and/or []stone to match existing in size, color, and shape. Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

Repair/Replace Fiber Cement Siding

- The existing, non-original, fiber cement siding is in place and in good condition. Examine all siding on all elevations and replace any/all missing and damaged fiber cement siding with new fiber cement siding of the same color and profile, as necessary; like-for-like.
- Following any/all necessary repairs to the fiber cement siding and trim, prepare all fiber cement siding and trim for painting in accordance with all applicable industry standards and manufacturers’ specifications.
- Apply the appropriate exterior paint for fiber cement surfaces, in accordance with industry standards and manufacturers’ specifications.

- Paint all fiber siding to match the existing siding color as closely as possible, or submit a new exterior paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Replace Non-Original Garage Door

- Replacement of existing (1) deteriorated non-historic wood garage doors on non-original garage.
- Replace with (1) new wood garage door, “Ideal Door – Traditional Steel Panel – Elegant Short Panel”, no windows, no faux hardware per submitted materials.
- New garage doors to be appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly; to match existing.
- Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- Paint color to be a **White** finish.

V. New Business

VI. Old Business

VII. Adjournment 6:07 PM

MOTION: Shuler/Shah (6-0-0) APPROVED.

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing for new and continued applications for Certificates of Appropriateness and Certificates of Approval. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission’s next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City’s ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.