

Meeting Agenda

Victorian Village Commission



Location: 111 N Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204



Date: April 10, 2024



Time: 4:00pm

Commissioners Present: *Shah, Hissem, Conyers, Sprite*

Commissioners Absent: *Shuler, Skinner, Dodson*

Staff Present: *Barnard-Sheehy*

I. Call to Order: 4:09PM

- **Next Business Meeting:**

Wednesday, April 24, 2025 - 12:00pm (Noon)

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 205

- **Next Hearing:**

Wednesday, May 8, 2024 - 4:00pm

111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204

- Swear in Staff
- Introduction of Commissioners Present
- **Overview of Hearing Format**
- **Public Forum:**

- [Update to the Common Staff Approvals List](#)

Approve the updated Common Staff Approvals List, as submitted.

MOTION: Hissem/Sprite (4-0-0) APPROVED.

- II. Approval of Staff Approvals** - The Victorian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved, as listed, (see below), and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
- MOTION: Sprite/Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

- III. Approval of Minutes from Last Meeting – [March 13, 2024](#)**

MOTION: Shah/Sprite (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness

I. New Applications

1. [VV-24-04-013](#)

1135 Neil Avenue

Ingrid Navarro (Applicant)/ 1135 Neil Ave (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-013, 1135 Neil Avenue, as submitted:

Landscaping

- Add pavers, brick walkway, and gravel to the rear yard, per submitted documentation.
- Plant various bushes, flowers, and grasses, per submitted documentation.
- Erect a vertical wood privacy fence.

MOTION: Sprite/Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

2. [VV-24-04-014](#)

100 W Fourth Ave

Brewer-Garrett Company (Applicant)/ Columbus City Schools (Owner)

[Approval for W Hubbard](#)

Approve application VV-24-04-011, 75 W Starr Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

Exterior Building Modification

- Install a new roof top HVAC unit on existing gymnasium, per submitted documentation. Existing units to remain.
- The unit will measure 86.75" wide by 123.25" long by 60" tall.
- New duct work and gas line to be added, per submitted drawings.
- Applicant to proceed with installation of option 2 which consists of a vinyl wrap of the HVAC unit. Wrap will use picture of the existing bricks for its color. Vinyl product information to be submitted to HPO staff, prior to issuance of a Certificate.
- Exposed ductwork will be premanufactured color or painted in a much darker tone, to match the existing brick. Brick wrapping not to be on any of the ductwork. Preferred option is manufactured installed coloring. Secondary option would be painting. Final color option or paint chip/color swatch to be submitted to HPO staff prior to issuance of Certificate.

MOTION: Sprite/ Shah (4-0-0) APPROVED.

II. **Conceptual Applications**

3. [VV-24-04-016](#)

148 Price Ave

Leonard Rettig Design Build (Applicant)/ Patrick McCarthy (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a 37'x14' addition on the west side of the existing house.
- The addition will be a two and a half story structure with a front porch fronting Price Ave.
- Construction of a masonry privacy fence between addition and existing garage.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- The Commission is in support of the proposed brick wall connecting the house and garage because it's a product of its time and the addition is proposed on a newer build.
- The new addition design is different, it says what the front of the house is and where the front door is located.
- The dormer to the existing portion of the property and rear addition work together with the existing vocab.
- The massing is there, but details of the design need to be refined.
- The dormers aren't quite right in terms of their openings and the overhang of the walk out balcony looks out of scale. Commissioners encourage the applicant to pull back the balcony from the façade if they'd like to keep the square footage of it. Could also look into a Juliette balcony if they want to keep the interior square footage.

- Commissioners weren't sold on the materiality on the addition. The existing context keeps the second and third floors connected while the proposed material didn't quite work with the proposed third floor balcony.
- The Commission encouraged the applicant to work through different possibilities. If the applicant would like to submit for action at the next hearing, they are welcome to submit options for the siding in order for the best possibility of the project moving forward.
- There's not one element that will solve the siding equation. A balance needs to be struck.

4. [VV-24-04-015](#)

332 W Second Ave

Urbanorder (Applicant)/ Mike Bambrick + Meaghan FitzGerald (Owners)

New Construction

- Construct a second floor frame addition over the existing single story brick addition at the rear of the house, per submitted documentation.
- Alter the rear of the house by removing a window and adding a French door.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- The different siding material will be nice with the contrast that it will create at the rear.
- One Commissioner noted that instead of making the door a double on the rear, they'd be more supportive if it were a single door. Their reasoning was that the one window opening is large, so a single door would be a minimal alteration to the existing historic fabric. The single door would be a compromise to the proposed and the Victorian Village Guidelines.
- Another Commissioner is okay with the proposed opening alteration as it activates the rear yard.
- The proposed east elevation looks balanced with the triple window and offset door below it. Mimics the set up of the entry with the porch.
- For the next hearing the applicant needs to submit the typical material selection and color, including proposed siding, windows, etc.

5. [VV-24-04-017](#)

199 W Third Ave

Urbanorder architecture (Applicant)/ Bruce Shumard (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a 15'-6" by 7'-6" enclosed porch on east side of house, per submitted documentation.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

Commissioner Comments:

- The proposed porch is sensitive to step back from the front which helps the Commission support it.
- The design will also be easily removable if it were to be taken off in the future.
- As it's proposed, the design will cover two existing windows, but won't block them.

- The Commission was concerned with the proposed roofline interacting with the existing two roofs. But the applicant was able to confirm that they'd have the needed clearance and the exiting gutter could be retained.

III. Staff Approved Applications

- **VV-24-04-001**

188 W Fourth St

Demarco Roofing Inc (Applicant)/ Douglas Graybael (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-001, 188 W Fourth St, as submitted with clarifications as noted:

- Remove existing asphalt shingles on garage. Install GAF Slateline shingles in English Gray slate or Weathered Slate.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **VV-24-04-002**

47 W Third Ave

Seth Lawton (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-002, 47 W Third Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Tuck point four out of the six chimneys on the main house. Chimneys on south, middle-east, northwest, northeast, per submitted documentation.
- Remove top 3-5 course of middle-east elevation chimney, rebuild to match existing. Existing bricks will be reused.
- Repair flashing as required.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all chimneys for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Replace any/all missing damaged material and replace with new or used brick of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of

1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

- **VV-24-04-003**

731-737 N High St

Nancy Davis (Applicant)/ Short North Real Estate (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-003, 731-737 N High St, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Scrape and remove rust from the existing rear metal decks.
- Weld and repair existing rear decks, as needed.
- Paint rear metal decks Rust-oleum High performance Protective Enamel Black color, per submitted documentation.

- **VV-24-04-004**

601 N High St

LaserAway LLC (Applicant)

Approve Application # VV-24-04-004, 601 N High St, with all clarifications, as noted.

- Install temporary storefront window graphics, per submitted documentation.
- Graphics will be removable 3m IJ40R-C vinyl with matte laminate.
- Graphics will be installed on March 15, 2024 and removed by June 12, 2024.
- Note: Permanent signage to be approved as part of a separate application.

- **VV-24-04-005**

47 W Third Ave

Seth Lawaton (Applicant)

Approve application VV-24-04-005, 47 W Third Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing asphalt shingle roof on house and garage with Owens Corning Standard 3-tab shingle in Estate Gray.
- Remove two existing skylights and replace with manual "Fresh Air" deck-mounted Velux skylights, per submitted documentation.
- Replace damaged gutters on garage (k-style) to match existing.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.

- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **VV-24-04-006**

969 Dennison Ave

Mighty Dog Roofing (Applicant)/ Ben Walters (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-006, 969 Dennison Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing asphalt shingle roof with Owens Corning standard 3-tab shingles in Estate Gray.
- Metal ridge roll to be added.
- Remove existing hat vents and vent at ridge and/or edge.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **VV-24-04-007**

967 Dennison Ave

Mighty Dog Roofing (Applicant)/ Joan Stack (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-007, 967 Dennison Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing asphalt shingle roof with Owens Corning standard 3-tab shingles in Estate Gray.
- Metal ridge roll to be added.
- Remove existing hat vents and vent at ridge and/or edge.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **VV-24-04-008**

965 Dennison Ave

Mighty Dog Roofing (Applicant)/ Jeanne Daniel (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-008, 965 Dennison Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing asphalt shingle roof with Owens Corning standard 3-tab shingles in Estate Gray.
- Metal ridge roll to be added.
- Remove existing hat vents and vent at ridge and/or edge.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **VV-24-04-009**

963 Dennison Ave

Mighty Dog Roofing (Applicant)/ Suzanne Allison (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-009, 963 Dennison Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove and replace existing asphalt shingle roof with Owens Corning standard 3-tab shingles in Estate Gray.
- Metal ridge roll to be added.
- Remove existing hat vents and vent at ridge and/or edge.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **VV-24-04-010**

743 Dennison Ave

Mallory Jones (Applicant)/ Michael Cash (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-010, 743 Dennison Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Remove 10 windows on the first floor of the house, per submitted documentation.
- Replace the windows with Marvin Ultimate Next Generation 2.0 aluminum clad, double hung one, over one windows in Bronze, per submitted documentation.
- Note: front picture window to remain.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Windows

- Replace all deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing windows on the first floor as per City Staff site visit determination.

- Install new, Marvin Ultimate (1-OVER-1), all-wood, interior/exterior, double-hung windows of appropriate dimension and profile and sized exactly to fit the original openings. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
 - Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
 - Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.
- **VV-24-04-011**
75 W Starr Ave
George Ypsilantis (Applicant)/ Notus Investments LLC (Owner)
Approve application VV-24-04-011, 75 W Starr Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:
- Remove existing asphalt shingle porch roofs and gutters for units B and C.
 - Install GAF slateline shingles in English gray on the two porch roofs.
 - Install new k-style (ogee) gutters to match existing.
- Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof
- Remove all asphalt shingles on the two porches, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
 - Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
 - Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
 - Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
 - Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles.
 - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
 - Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
 - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
- Repair/Replace Gutters & Downspouts
- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the two porches and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
 - Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
 - Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **VV-24-04-012**

61-63 W Starr Ave

Sean Adamcan-Dunkel (Applicant)/ Solar Investments (Owner)

Approve application VV-24-04-012, 61-63 W Starr Ave, as submitted with the following clarifications:

- Replace wood siding on house's southeast addition with wood siding, per submitted documentation.
- Paint siding SW Antique White. Trim, soffit, and rear doors to be painted custom "Dunkel Terra Cotta", per submitted documentation.
- Fire escape will be painted Rust-oleum semi-gloss black.
- Previously painted sills and lintels on the rear to be painted back to a stone color, Simple Stone (SW 9521), per submitted documentation.
- Note: Siding has 104 profile. Also, stone lintels and sills which have not been previously painted are to remain unpainted.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Repair/replace all wood siding and trim as needed to match existing, in-kind, like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the Victorian Village Commission.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications, and per submitted paint color chips.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

IV. New Business

V. Old Business

VI. Adjournment 5:04 PM

MOTION: Skinner/Dodson (4-0-0) APPROVED.

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing for new and continued applications for Certificates of Appropriateness and Certificates of Approval. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City's ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email zdjones@columbus.gov, at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.