

## Meeting Agenda

### German Village Commission



**Location:** 111 N Front St., 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor, Room 204



**Date:** February 5, 2025



**Time:** 4:00pm

#### I. Call to Order (Chair)

- **Next Business Meeting:**

Wednesday, February 19, 2025 at 12:00pm  
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 205

- **Next Hearing:**

Wednesday, March 5, 2025 at 4:00pm  
111 N. Front St., 2nd Floor, Room 204

- Swear in Staff
- Introduction of Commissioners Present
- **Overview of Hearing Format**
- **Public Forum:**

Persons wishing to address the Commission on matters not on the posted agenda are invited to do so; however, the Commission is not able to undertake extended discussion or act on non-agenda items. The communication should be kept to a 3-minute limit.

#### II. Approval of Staff Approvals

#### III. Approval of Minutes from Last Meeting - January 2, 2025

### Staff Reports

### Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness

#### I. Continued Applications

##### 1. COA2400552

670 S. Grant Ave.

**Pioneer Roofing and Restoration LLC (Applicant)/ Erin Brown (Owner)**

Exterior Building Alteration – Gutter Replacement

- Remove existing half-round gutters and replace the gutters with 6" K-style gutters in the color "Dark Bronze."

*The following is from the unapproved January 2025 GVC Hearing minutes:*

*Continue application COA2400552, 670 S. Grant Ave., due to the applicant's absence:*

*MOTION: Thiel/Schultz (7-0-0) CONTINUED.*

#### Commissioner Comments:

- *The Commissioners present provided preliminary feedback, but the application was continued due to absence.*
- *The Commission concluded that as the eaves are perpendicular cut, the half-round gutter is the only appropriate option for the primary structure. The dormers have plumb cut eaves, so they would consider a k-style gutter for these areas, depending on the dormer's age.*

**2. COA2400618**

**242 E. Beck St.**

**Hidden Creek Landscaping (Applicant)/ 242 E. Beck Street LLC (Owners)**

Landscaping – Rear Yard

- Remove the existing rear brick patio/porches and replace with grade-level brick patios.
- Remove most of the existing landscaping elements including ponds, walkways, and small plantings.
- Install new bluestone walkways on lawn and new brick patios.
- Install new plantings per site plan.
- Remove existing railroad ties and replace with limestone retaining walls.

*The following is from the unapproved January 2025 GVC Hearing minutes:*

*Continue application COA2400618, 242 E. Beck St., due to the applicant's absence:*

*MOTION: Thiell/Schultz (7-0-0) CONTINUED.*

Commissioner Comments:

- *The Commissioners present provided preliminary feedback, but the application was continued due to absence.*
- *The Commission concluded the porches and raised porch flooring would likely be considered an important architectural characteristic and should be retained. Some Commissioners suggested raising the grade of the patio as a possible solution.*

**3. COA2400420**

**192 Thurman Ave.**

**Mark Ours (Applicant)/ Keriann Ours (Owners)**

Landscaping – Fence Demolition

- Demolish the existing historic wrought iron fence from the South (front) yard on the Thurman Avenue Street side.

*The following is from the approved November 2024 GVC Hearing minutes:*

*Continue application COA2400420, 192 Thurman Ave., to allow applicant time to provide updated materials for a future hearing:*

*MOTION: Thiell/Schultz (5-0-0) CONTINUED.*

Commissioner Comments:

- *The Commissioners concluded that they would not be supportive of removal of the fence with no appropriate replacement proposed.*
- *Some Commissioners determined that more documentation for the fence's condition and inability to be repaired would be required before they would support removal of the historic material. The Commission emphasized that other iron works companies could be contacted to provide an assessment on the repair of the existing fence.*
- *The applicant must demonstrate the fence is deteriorated beyond repair, before the Commission would support like-for-like replacement.*
- *The Commissioners present for the pending site visit will also evaluate the fence's condition.*

**II. New Application**

**4. COA2500022**

**192 Thurman Ave.**

**Mark Ours (Applicant)/ Keriann Ours (Owners)**

Exterior Building Alteration – Changes to an Approved Design

- Retain Marvin Ultimate as the approved replacement for the existing primary structure.
- Install other Marvin windows on the approved addition and new carriage house, from one of the following:
  - Install the Marvin Elevate on the approved addition and for the new carriage house construction.
    - Elevate is on the approved list, but only for New Construction in German Village.
  - Install the Marvin Essential on the approved addition and for the new carriage house construction.
    - Not on the approved list.

**5. COA2500023**

**192 Thurman Ave.**

**Mark Ours (Applicant)/ Keriann Ours (Owners)**

New Construction/Exterior Building Alteration – Changes to an Approved Design

- Change the slope of the front porch dormer roof to be upward sloped.
- Change the siding from 16" to random width of 8", 12", and 16" to follow submitted drawings.

**6. COA2500017**

**174 Nursey Lane**

**urbanorder (Applicant)/ Timothy Simeone (Owner)**

Landscaping - Pool

- Install new 12' x 23' 7" fiberglass pool with brick surround to match the existing patio, per submitted site plan.

**7. COA2400495**

**643 S. Sixth St.**

**Stephen Koczwarra (Owner)**

Exterior Building Alteration – Siding Change

- Remove existing 3" vinyl siding.
- Install new 4" vinyl siding from exterior portfolio in one of the following colors:
  - Historic Dark Navy with white trim Either: - PlyGem Mastic Carvedwood-44, Color BRUNSWICK or - Royal Building Products Exterior Portfolio, Color INDIGO
  - Historic Grey with black trim Either: - PlyGem Mastic Carvedwood-44, Color HARBOR GREY or - Royal Building Products Exterior Portfolio, Color STONE HARBOR
  - Historic Dark Brown with black trim Either: - PlyGem Mastic Carvedwood-44, Color CIVID BROWNSTONE or MODERN IRON or - Royal Building Products Exterior Portfolio, Color PEPPERCORN
- Structure was constructed in 1990s.

**8. COA2400159**

**230 Berger Alley**

**Columbus Realty Advisors LLC (Applicant)/ 230-232 Berger Aly LLC (Owner)**

Exterior Building Alteration – Entry Stairs/Stoop

- This application is the result of a code violation, violation number 24444-00095.
- The previously existing stairs were three-step painted wood stairs leading to each entrance door.
- Installed new four-step partially painted wood stairs leading to each entrance door.
  - Wood is textured with anti-slip ridges.
  - New stairs extend above the water table.

**9. COA2400646**

**239 E. Sycamore St.**

**Sabina Scott (Applicant)/ Artur Urazov (Owner)**

Landscaping – Install Pergola

- Install 8 ft tall wooden pergola with slanted roof on existing deck.
  - 15 feet x 8 feet
  - Paint all wood elements “Charcoal” (MAXPLUS5-429-7DB-S).

**10. COA2400619**

**573 S. Sixth St.**

**S&G Fence Company (Applicant)/ Jonathan Walley (Owner)**

Landscaping – Fence Installation

- Remove existing fence and install new wooden fence, per submitted site plan.
  - Fence has a 6’ x 4’ cut out from existing to accommodate existing trees.

**11. COA2500018**

**700 S. Third St.**

**MKC Architects (Applicant)/ Bishop Edward Herrmann (Owner)**

Landscaping – Fence Installation

- This application is the result of a code violation, violation number 24444-00111.
- Applicant installed a wooden dog-eared shadow box fence, following a larger landscaping approval.
- Applicant now proposes to convert the fence to a flat top by cutting off the dog-eared tops.

**12. COA2500027**

**189 E. Deshler Ave.**

**Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Jana L. Douglass (Owners)**

Landscaping

- Front/Side Yard
  - Install new limestone path (currently brick) from sidewalk to front porch. .
  - Install stone path from side porch to rear yard.
  - Install new landscaping, per submitted site plan.
  - Relocate existing lamp post.
  - Add painted window boxes to front elevation.

- Rear Yard
  - Remove the existing brick pool coping/patio and replace with new limestone pool deck.
  - Install a new outdoor kitchen.
  - Install new metal trellis on garage. Install a new pavilion.
  - Install turf dog run.
  - Install new landscaping, per submitted site plan.

### III. Conceptual Applications

#### 13. COA2500020

**764 S. Sixth St.**

**John Ingwersen (Applicant)/ Stephanie Campbell Cook (Owner)**

Exterior Building Alteration – Garage Dormers and Exterior Stair

- Add dormers to the gable roof to allow for expansion of second-floor space above the garage.
- Add exterior stair to the garage in the rear elevation.
- Garage constructed in 1990s.

#### 14. COA2500016

**770 S. Third St.**

**Juliet Bullock (Applicant)/ German Village Holdings LTD (Owner)**

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish two existing historic garages.
  - Both are on the 1960s Sanborn Maps.
- Construct a new two-story carriage house with orientation facing Columbus St.

#### 15. COA2500026

**982 Jaeger St.**

**Residential Designed Solutions (Applicant)/ Jeffrey Kapp (Owner)**

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the existing historic garage and garage addition.
  - Historic garage appears on the 1960s Sanborn Maps.
  - The addition was approved/constructed in 1998.
- Construct a new two-story carriage house with one double garage door.

#### 16. COA2500025

**247-257 E. Livingston Ave.**

**Berardi + Partners LLC (Applicant)/ Toulas Management LLC (Owners)**

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the existing brick office-building at 251 E. Livingston St.
  - COA for construction in 1981, constructed approximately 1981-1984.
- Construct a new four-story apartment building with 96 proposed units
  - Structure to wrap (without connection) around existing historic structures on Livingston.
  - 47 parking spaces.

- Fourth floor balconies/amenity spaces.

#### IV. Staff Approved Applications

- **COA2400602**

**188 Concord Place**

**Emily Hemminger (Applicant)/ Bradley Hemminger (Owner)**

Approve application COA2400602, 188 Concord Place, as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:

- Paint siding Sherwin Williams “Greenblack” (SW 6994).
- Paint trim, gutters, porch ceiling, and porch floor Sherwin Williams “Tricorn Black” (SW 6258).

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
  - Paint siding Sherwin Williams “Greenblack” (SW 6994).
  - Paint trim, gutters, porch ceiling, and porch floor Sherwin Williams “Tricorn Black” (SW 6258).
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **COA2400607**

**552 S. Pearl St.**

**Ascent Roofing Solutions LLC (Applicant)/Ten Penny Properties LLC (Owner)**

Approve application COA2400607, 552 S. Pearl St., as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:

- Replace asphalt shingle roof on the main roof with new CertainTeed (standard 3-tab) in “Nickel Gray.”
  - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
  - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- Reflash chimneys and skylights, as needed.

### **Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof**

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

[ ] CertainTeed

[ ] GAF

**[X] Certain Teed**

[ ] GAF

[ ] Owens Corning

[ ] Tamko

Style:

Carriage House (dimensional)

Slateline (dimensional)

**(standard 3-tab)**

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

Color:

[ ] Stonegate Gray

[ ] English Gray Slate

[ ] Weathered Slate

**[X] Nickel Gray**

[ ] Nickel Gray

[ ] Estate Gray

[ ] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **COA2400544**

**386 Jackson St.**

**James Stokes (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve application COA2400544, 386 Jackson St., as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:

- Remove existing fence and install new fence along the South property line, per submitted site plan.

### **Install New Privacy Fence - German Village**

- Remove existing privacy fence.

- Install a new six-feet high (6' H), wood privacy fence along the North, East, and West property line in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
  - Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: **a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside);** b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
  - Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
    - Fence to be stained Sherwin-Williams WoodScapes® Premium in "Cedar."
- **COA2400580**  
**239 E. Sycamore St.**  
**Sabina Scott (Applicant)/ Artur Urazov (Owner)**  
Approve application COA2400580, 239 E. Sycamore St., as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:
    - Replace five deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing basement windows on the with new, Marvin Ultimate awning windows.

Replace Deteriorated/Altered/Non-Original Window

    - Replace **five** deteriorated/non-original, non-contributing window on the North elevation with new, Marvin Ultimate awning wood windows of appropriate dimension and profile and to fit the original openings exactly. Window brochure or cutsheet to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
    - Any/all necessary brick mold is to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
    - Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
    - Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards.
  - **COA2400601**  
**1161 Jaeger St.**  
**CJE Restoration (Applicant)/ Walter Hartman Highland (Owner)**  
Approve application COA2400601, 1161 Jaeger St., as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:
    - Repair the existing slate roof.
    - Replace the existing EPDM flat roof with new EPDM in black or gray.
    - Remove existing siding and trim on the East elevation of the addition roof/siding and replace with new cedar siding and trim.
      - Paint new wood Sherwin Williams "Attitude Gray" (SW 7060).
    - Replace rear addition West elevation fascia and gutter with cedar fascia and like-for-like gutter.
      - Paint new wood fascia Sherwin Williams "Pure White" (SW 7005).



#### Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

#### Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the porch roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
  - E.P.D.M. rubber to be black or gray.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

#### Repair/Replace Wood Siding

- Replace all existing MDF siding and trim as needed with new 5" Cedar Siding **on the East elevation of the addition roof/siding only.**
- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval in consultation with the German Village Commission.
  - Paint new wood Sherwin Williams "Attitude Gray" (SW 7060).

#### Eave, Soffit & Fascia Repair

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like **on the rear (West elevation) modern addition only.**
  - Paint new wood fascia Sherwin Williams "Pure White" (SW 7005).

#### Install New K-Style Gutters

- Remove the existing, inappropriate, non-original, gutter and corrugated down spouts and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code **on the rear (West elevation) modern addition only.**
  - Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
  - Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
    - Paint new wood fascia Sherwin Williams “Pure White” (SW 7005).
  - Install new, 6", k-style metal gutters and metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
  - Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- 
- **COA2400627**  
**866 Macon Alley**  
**Kayla Sweeney (Applicant)/ Ryan Sweeney (Owner)**  
Approve application COA2400627, 866 Macon Alley, as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:
    - Replace asphalt shingle roof on the main roof with new Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) in “Estate Gray.”
      - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
      - Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.
    - **NOTE: No slate roof work is approved with this application.**

**Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof**

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

- **COA2400519**  
**689 S. Third St.**  
**Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)/ Nancy Gross Morbitzer (Owner)**  
Approve application COA2400519, 689 S. Third St., as submitted with the following clarifications as noted:  
Install Generator
  - Install a new residential 26KW Generac generator measuring at 48x25x29 inches in the rear of property behind the home and behind an existing privacy fence.
  - Install ventilated screening or low shrubs around generator for screening, per submitted site plan.
  - Generator lines to be run under existing brick patio.

**V. New Business**

**VI. Old Business**

**VII. Adjournment**

*Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing for new and continued applications for Certificates of Appropriateness and Certificates of Approval. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission’s next hearing. Meeting Accommodations: It is the policy of the City of Columbus that all City-sponsored public meetings and events are accessible to people with disabilities. If you need assistance in participating in this meeting or event due to a disability as defined under the ADA, please call the City’s ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-8871, or email [zdjones@columbus.gov](mailto:zdjones@columbus.gov), at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.*