

## STAFF REPORT

DATE May 20, 2014  
PLACE 50 W Gay St  
TIME 3:00 pm

### A APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

1. **Address:** 424 W Town St  
**Property Owner:** Harper Enterprises Inc. (Kathie Harper)  
**Applicant:** Mode Architects / Mark Ours  
**To be reviewed:** Modifications  
**Requests:**

**Sub-Districts:** West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park  
**Code Reference:** 3323.21 Development Standards

**Staff Observations:**

The approximate 12,000 sqft building is located at the northwest corner of W Town St and Lucas Street. The building is currently vacant. The applicant is proposing a microbrewery at this location.

**Applicable Code Development Standards for Arts and Innovation District:**

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Eating and Drinking Establishment	Allowable	Consistent
Lighting	18'	Consistent
Graphics	Painted- white	Consistent with the District's industrial character
Parking	62 (Calculations on site plan) Bicycle Parking-3 spaces	17 Provided

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility		Consistent with the code
Architecture— Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Architectural should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods.</li> </ul>	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials.</li> </ul>	Contemporary architecture
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).</li> </ul>	Architectural details are mimicked along proposed exterior elevations
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation.</li> </ul>	Existing Building
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows.</li> </ul>	Existing Building
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass.</li> </ul>	The exterior alterations include floor to ceiling windows
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason.</li> </ul>	Existing Building
Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate.</li> </ul>	62 parking spaces are required, 17 are provided. The reduced number of parking spaces is compatible with the urban development pattern of this neighborhood. Also, on-street parking will be available for any additional parking.
Signage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In general, signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Walls and blade signs are preferred. Pole signs are generally discouraged. The dimensional standards of the city graphics code should be used unless new standards are developed specific to East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Painted along Town St and Lucas St elevations
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Signs are recommended to be placed and sized on buildings such that they are in keeping with the scale and size of the building facades and general streetscape so as not to obscure or interfere with architectural lines and details.</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Sign design and materials should relate to the general theme of the surrounding district and incorporate the building architecture. Examples include hand-crafted, artisan design and materials.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Freeway-oriented signs, pole signs, sign benches, billboards and other off-premises signs should not be supported.</li> </ul>	NA
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street.</li> </ul>	Existing Building
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage.</li> </ul>	Existing Building
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from the sidewalk.</li> </ul>	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary).</li> </ul>	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable.</li> </ul>	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material.</li> </ul>	
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.</li> </ul>	Decorative grass along Town St elevation
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies.</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens.</li> </ul>	
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience.</li> </ul>	
Landscape Material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All trees and landscaping should be well maintained.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dead items should be replaced within six months or the next planting season, whichever occurs first. The size of the new material should equal the size of the original material when it was installed.</li> </ul>	
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line.</li> </ul>	

The proposed request within Arts and Innovation District is consistent with the Plan’s general recommendations, and also with the urban development pattern of this area.

The Board reviewed and approved this proposal on March 18, 2014.

The Applicant is requesting following modifications to the COA as response to Value Engineering effort -

- Change Patio space to ‘on grade’ from in lieu of elevated concrete patio: Details provided
- Delete operable wall and storefront from West Elevation
- Move rear exit stair to the north along West Elevation: Details provided
- Change steel fascia to South Facade only (delete along West Elevation)

- All changes to West Elevation are being done as cost measures and are intended to be completed in the future.

The staff is in support of the changes requested for patio and exit stair. The Staff Recommends “Approval”. The staff recommends “approval” for the deletion of the operable wall, steel fascia, and storefront from west elevation upon design review and timeline review by the Board.

**Recommendations:**      Conceptual Approval      Approval with Conditions       Approval      Disapproval

**Conditions:** NA

**2. Address:** 455-465 W State St  
**Property Owner:** Franklinton Development Association  
**Applicant:** Jim Sweeny  
**To be reviewed:** Multifamily Development  
**Requests:** Site Plan/ Elevations

**Sub-Districts:**      West Broad St       Arts and Innovation      Dodge Park

**Code Reference:** 3323.21/ D- Development Standards and Graphics

**Staff Observations:**

The 0.52 acre site is located at south-west corner of W State St and McDowell Rd. It is a current vacant parcel. The proposal is to construct 18 new two-bedroom attached units with rooftop decks and attached single car garages accessed from the back. The site has two entrances, one from McDowell St and the other from Chapel St.

**Applicable Code Development Standards for Arts and Innovation District:**

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Residential Use	Allowable	Consistent
Minimum Front Yard	0'	0'
Maximum Front Yard	10'	
Minimum Side Yard	0'	0'
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	76% on McDowell
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	45 feet
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public St	Buildings front along all three streets.
Lighting	18'	Entry lights
Graphics		Entry lights with steel plate with cut numbers
Parking	27 (1.5 spaces per unit) Bicycle Parking- 2 spaces	18 (1 space per unit) Provided

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility		Consistent with the code
Architecture— Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Architectural should be provided that establishes and defines a building’s appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods.</li> </ul>	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials.</li> </ul>	Contemporary architecture
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture).</li> </ul>	Architectural details are mimicked along the sides.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass.</li> </ul>	NA
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason.</li> </ul>	Consistent
Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate.</li> </ul>	27 parking spaces are required, 18 are provided. The reduced number of parking spaces is compatible with the urban development pattern of this neighborhood. Also, on-street parking will be available for any additional parking.
Signage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>In general, signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Walls and blade signs are preferred. Pole signs are generally discouraged. The dimensional standards of the city graphics code should be used unless new standards are developed specific to East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Entry lights with steel plate with cut numbers
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Signs are recommended to be placed and sized on buildings such that they are in keeping with the scale and size of the building facades and general streetscape so as not to obscure or interfere with architectural lines and details.</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sign design and materials should relate to the general theme of the surrounding district and incorporate the building architecture. Examples include hand-crafted, artisan design and materials.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Freeway-oriented signs, pole signs, sign benches, billboards and other off-premises signs should not be supported.</li> </ul>	
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from the sidewalk.</li> </ul>	Fence between the parcel to the east and proposed development. Options are provided
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary).</li> </ul>	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable.</li> </ul>	Fence between the parcel to the east and proposed development. Options are provided
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials.</li> </ul>	Commitment needed
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material.</li> </ul>	Commitment needed
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits.</li> </ul>	Site plan shows landscaped areas, materials are yet to be finalized.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies.</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens.</li> </ul>	
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester.</li> </ul>	Existing street trees along McDowell St
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience.</li> </ul>	
Landscape Material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground.</li> </ul>	Plan provided
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All trees and landscaping should be well maintained.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Dead items should be replaced within six months or the next planting season, whichever occurs first. The size of the new material should equal the size of the original material when it was installed.</li> </ul>	
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings.</li> </ul>	Entry lights with steel plate with cut numbers
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward.</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line.</li> </ul>	

The proposed residential development within Arts and Innovation District is consistent with the development standards of the zoning code, the Plan's general recommendations, and also with the urban development pattern of this area.

The Board reviewed the project in March, 2014 and issued "Conditional Approval" with following conditions-

- Fence and landscaping design details: Landscaping plan is provided
- HOA agreement details regarding railing and landscaping design: Balcony railing details are provided
- Finalizing paint colors: Commitments needed
- New treatment for window heights: As shown on the elevations
- Limiting the hardy plank material above grade for elevations and extending other base material: As



The Applicant is proposing a blade signage at the southwest corner of 401 W Town St to include Strongwater logo. The assembly is welded using 1 ½” sq mtl tuning and wrapped with 20ga galvanized sheet metal.

The staff recommends conditional approval:

- Detailed information of the wall mounting system
- Detailed information of the north elevation
- Sample of the sheet metal

**Recommendations:**      Conceptual Approval      Approval with Conditions      Approval for the Site Plan      Approval      Disapproval

**Conditions:**                      NA

4.      Address:                                      421 W State St  
       Property Owner:                         FDA Acquisition Corp. 2011, LLC  
       Applicant:                                    Blake Compton  
       To be reviewed:                         Signage

**Sub-Districts:**                              West Broad St      Arts and Innovation      Dodge Park

**Code Reference:**                         3323.21/ D- Development Standards and Graphics

**Staff Observations:**

The Columbus Idea Foundry provides space and the tools for the community as workshop, learning center, and creative space. They also provide training, tools and technology for members (entrepreneurs, fabricators, inventors, prototypers, designers, craftsmen, artisans & artists) for their business, artistry, and hobbies.  
 The Applicant is proposing signage along its north and west elevation.

**Applicable Code Development Standards for Arts and Innovation District**

Standard	Dodge Park	Staff Comments
Graphics	1. Weather treated birch plywood with vinyl or painted decals 2. LED backlighting strips	Consistent with the District’s industrial character

**Applicable Plan Development Standards:**

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Signage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In general, signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Walls and blade signs are preferred. Pole signs are generally discouraged. The dimensional standards of the city graphics code should be used unless new standards are developed specific to East Franklinton.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Signs are recommended to be placed and sized on buildings such that they area in keeping with the scale and size of the building facades and general streetscape so as not to obscure or interfere with architectural lines and details.</li> </ul>	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sign design and materials should relate to the general theme of the surrounding district and incorporate the building architecture. Examples include hand-crafted, artisan design and materials.</li> </ul>	Consistent



Additional parking is also available in close vicinity if required. Hence the parking reduction request is justified. The staff recommends “approval”.

<b>Recommendations:</b>	Conceptual Approval	Approval with Conditions	Approval for the Site Plan	<b>Approval</b>	Disapproval
<b>Conditions:</b>	NA				