

STAFF REPORT

DATE February 17, 2015
PLACE 50 W Gay St
TIME 3:00 pm

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 Meeting Summary- December 10, 2014

C OLD BUSINESS

D APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~3:05 15-02-001 Address: 201 S. Lucas
Property Owner: Manhattan Project, LLC
Applicant: Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design
To be reviewed: Live/work, multi-family development

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.19 Uses
3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

The 0.42 acre site is located at the northwest corner of Rich and Lucas streets. The site is currently vacant. The applicant is proposing a sixty-nine unit live/work apartment building with eighteen parking spaces on the ground floor and an additional eighty-nine parking spaces on Lucas Street. All units are studios. Ord# 0065-2013 (CV12-036) provided for a mixed use project bounded by Town and Rich streets to the north and south, McDowell Street to the west and railroad tracks to the east. The proposed multi-family project was originally included in CV12-036 as a seventy-unit multi-family development. The Council Variance also included 12,000 square feet of eating and drinking space and 1085 square feet of retail which are currently located within 401 W. Town and 400 W. Rich. A reduction in parking was granted by CV12-036 to allow 138 spaces; however, the number of spaces allocated to the multi-family development was not specified. Parking was to be located on the property of 400 W. Rich and the gravel lot on the southwest corner of Town and Lucas. Board review of the parking spaces associated with this multi-family proposal is appropriate (CV12-036 provided a variance to the previous M zoning district). Staff recognizes the parking reduction in CV12-036 was appropriate for the urban nature of the development and is consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD plan. A commitment to the number and location of spaces that will be permanently associated with the live/work apartment building is requested.

Parking requirements/approvals for mixed use project to date:

Site	Required	Approved	Reduction
CV12-036 (12,000 sq.ft Eating/Drinking, 1085 sq.ft Retail, 70 Multi-family units)	270 1 loading	138 0	-132 -1
401 W. Town (933 sq.ft interior bar, 3783 sq.ft interior patio, 11,015 sq.ft retail (existing artist studios), 8,394 sq.ft office)	59 1 loading	0 0	-59 -1
289 W. Walnut (M to Artist Manufacturing/Artist Work)	9 1	7 0	-2 -1

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
4 or more dwelling unit building	Permitted Use	Consistent
Live/work space	Permitted Use	Consistent
Market Alley		Need clarification on use
Surface Parking	Accessory Use	Need commitment to number/location of spaces associated with Lucas Lofts
Structured parking	Permitted Use	Garages on ground floor

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Site plan with dimensions, property lines, etc. requested
Maximum Front Yard	10'	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Clarity on setback related to Lucas
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Site plan with dimensions, property lines, etc. requested
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent - no fence provided
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Request for building height and elevator shaft height
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Building fronts on Rich Street. South elevation only provides balcony for east unit on third floor - further discussion requested
Lighting	18'	To be determined
Graphics		To be determined
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	103 (1.5 spaces per unit) Bicycle parking- 7 spaces	107 spaces provided (89 on Lucas) Bicycle parking to be determined

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Neighborhood Mixed Use	16-45 du/acre	69 du/0.42 acres = 164 du/acre Staff is supportive of density as project is consistent with overall goals of EFCCD plan.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility		Consistent with the code
Architecture— Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building (“foursided” architecture). 	Consistent - staff recommends consideration of windows on south and north elevation
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows. 	Further discussion requested
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building’s interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Residential spaces on ground floor. Dimensions required to determine percent of window glass on upper-floors.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason. 	Front stoops are not appropriate for project design. Small plaza may be appropriate based on site plan - To be determined. Balconies provided.
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and “visibility” in all new construction and rehabilitation of existing buildings 	Four ADA parking spaces required on Lucas St
Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear of buildings and screened per code. The use of pervious surfaces for surface parking is encouraged to minimize storm water runoff and increase infiltration. 	Parking primarily located on Lucas Street - privately owned - further discussion necessary If Lucas is repaved, owner to provide brick to City of Columbus
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for parking lots is five feet; parking located adjacent to a public sidewalk, however, can be located closer than five feet, provided that it fully meets all screening requirements. Parking lots and accessory buildings should be located at the rear of the principal building. Where access to the rear of the property is not possible from a public alley or street, up to 50 percent of the parking may be located at the side of the principal building 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured parking should be considered for higher density projects, as appropriate, and designed to minimize visual impacts. Building materials, detailing and landscape should be used that complement the surrounding area. Primary elevations should include ground floor uses (e.g., commercial space) or be screened with residential uses. Parking structures 	18 garages are provided

	<p>should be set back no more than 10 feet.</p>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	<p>Staff would consider a proposal for reduced parking with a design that maintains the urban character of Lucas Street. Commitment to the number and location of spaces requested.</p>
Signage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In general, signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Walls and blade signs are preferred. Pole signs are generally discouraged. The dimensional standards of the city graphics code should be used unless new standards are developed specific to East Franklinton. 	No graphics under review
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Signs are recommended to be placed and sized on buildings such that they are in keeping with the scale and size of the building facades and general streetscape so as not to obscure or interfere with architectural lines and details. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sign design and materials should relate to the general theme of the surrounding district and incorporate the building architecture. Examples include hand-crafted, artisan design and materials. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Freeway-oriented signs, pole signs, sign benches, billboards and other off-premises signs should not be supported. 	
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage. 	Setback on Lucas = 0' Setback on Rich TBD
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from the sidewalk. 	N/A
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary). 	Consistent

Buffering and Screening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable. 	No screening provided. Appropriate for urban nature of the site.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material. 	Dumpsters are within garage unit on north elevation. Details needed regarding accessibility for trash pick-up.
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens. 	
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	
Landscape Material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees and landscaping should be well maintained. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dead items should be replaced within six months or the next planting season, whichever occurs first. The size of the new material should equal the size of the original material when it was installed. 	
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line. 	

The sixty-nine unit live/work multi-family development is consistent with the general recommendations and the urban design recommendations of the EFCCD plan (p. 4.16). The new development will move forward the plan's vision to add live/work lofts in the Arts and Innovation District and help develop a walkable, dense, mixed-use neighborhood. The following items should be discussed further regarding building design: 1. Building setbacks and public space on Lucas and Rich streets; 2. The use classification of Market Alley and related parking; 3. Additional balconies or windows on the south (and north) elevations. The plan recommends at least twenty-five percent of upper-floor wall areas be clear window glass on the main façade (p.F4); 4. The shared overhead door on the north elevation for bulk garbage and a personal vehicle; 5. Wall sections/parapet height and the screening of roof-mounted mechanical units. In addition, further development and design of the site plan, landscape plan and site lighting is required.

Staff has concerns about the proposed parking design on Lucas Street. The proposed layout produces the appearance of a parking lot rather than the existing urban street. Further, this design is not reflected in the renderings of the building. Staff would consider a proposal for reduced parking with a design that maintains the urban character of Lucas Street. Possible alternatives could include parallel parking on the east side of Lucas and/or angled parking on the west with landscaping. The applicant should also provide details about any reconstruction of Lucas Street that will be required due to parking design. Staff requests a commitment to the number and location of spaces that will be permanently associated with the multi-family development. The EFCCD plan recommends the following: 1. Maintaining the existing urban pattern of the District by maintaining shorter block lengths and encouraging non-motorized permeability (p. 4.21); 2. Locating surface parking to the rear or side of the building (p. F5); and 3. Providing ground-floor residential units with access to public sidewalks and incorporate...small plazas to contribute to street activity (p. F4). These recommendations should be considered in the design of the overall site plan and the parking scheme on Lucas Street.

The applicant is seeking approval with conditions to return to the Board at a future date with final site plan and parking design.

Recommendations:	Conceptual Approval	Approval	Approval with Conditions	Disapproval
Conditions:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> Dimensioned site plan showing utility easement, right-of-way, setbacks, lighting, parking, bicycle parking and other relevant details submitted to the Board for review and decision. Landscape plan with plant and material descriptions and cut sheets submitted to the Board for review and decision. Commitment to the number of parking spaces on Lucas Street that will be permanently dedicated to the multi-family development. Building and elevator shaft height on elevations. Accessible parking provided per code. 			

E APPLICATIONS FOR CONCEPTUAL REVIEW, CODE ENFORCEMENT AND/OR ZONING

F STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

G BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

289 W Walnut

1. Change in use, Parking, Exterior Renovations | Reviewed 12/10/2014 | Issued 12/17/2014

H OTHER BUSINESS

- ~3:45
1. Expanded Staff Approval List

The East Franklinton District authorizes certain specified development projects to be reviewed and approved by city staff for issuance of a Certificate of Approval in place of the Review Board. The Board is authorized on an annual basis to approve an additional list of actions which are eligible for staff consideration.

Staff review serves to reduce project timelines and streamline Review Board agendas. The applicant or staff may request that an application eligible for staff review be referred to the EFRB. Staff denials may be appealed to the Board provided the appeal is filed within 30 days of the denial. Items on the staff approval list are intended to be considered as discrete work rather than part of larger projects, which require board consideration.

- ~3:55
2. East Franklinton District - Graphic Design Guidelines

On February 2, 2015, City Council adopted the East Franklinton District - Graphic Design Guidelines (Ord # 0213-2015). The Guidelines will be used by the Review Board and staff to review future graphics applications within the District.

- ~4:00
3. Election of Chairs

The Review Board shall elect a chair and vice-chair each year at an organizational meeting.

I NEXT MEETING

Tuesday - March 17, 2015 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm.