

STAFF REPORT

DATE **AUGUST 21, 2018**
PLACE **MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER**
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203
TIME **3:00 PM**

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 MEETING SUMMARY – JUNE 19, 2018

C APPLICATIONS FOR CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

~3:10 1. APPLICATION: **EF_18-08-001**
ADDRESS: **429 W BROAD ST**
PROPERTY OWNER: **TERRA-M ASSOCIATES; NWD FRANKLINTON LLC; SOLAZZO**
APPLICANT: **DEVIN CAROTHERS | KAUFMAN DEVELOPMENT**
TO BE REVIEWED: **MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT**

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park
Code Reference: **3323.21 Development Standards**

Staff Observations:

The applicants are proposing to redevelop the block bounded by West Board to the North, McDowell to the West, West State to the South and the CSX/C&O Railroad Tracks to the East; directly across the street from the Gravity (I) project. The proposed project is a mix of uses in new and repurposed buildings for a total of 382,700sf of programed/conditioned spaced, 3000sf parkland/ greenspace and a 216,000sf parking garage with 665 spaces. The proposal consists of five buildings: a new mixed use (office and residential) 12 story building at the Northeast corner of the block; an addition to and repurposed mixed use (office and retail) 4 story building at the Northwest corner of the block; a new 5 story 655 space parking garage with townhomes at mid-block along McDowell; a renovated retail building at the Southwest corner of the block; and a new 5 story co-housing residential building at the Southeast corner of the block.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Broad Street District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Consistent
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent

Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Not Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	N/A
Graphics	3323.21	N/A
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking	3312.49 & 3323.	Proposed 665

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

STANDARD	BROAD STREET DISTRICT	STAFF COMMENTS
<p>Urban Mixed Use This classification encourages mixed uses at the regional level, including larger mixed-use development, residential, retail and office uses. Residential units are located either above and/or next to the commercial, office, or institutional uses in multistory buildings. Highest density buildings should be located adjacent to W. Broad Street</p>	45 or greater	<p>Consistent</p> <p>204 units on 5.2 Acres = 39 units/acre</p>

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

RECOMMENDATION AND STANDARD	STAFF COMMENTS
Land Use Compatibility	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported. 	Permitted use by code, Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When a proposed use may have potential conflicts with adjacent uses, such conflicts should be remedied or minimized through project redesign. 	As proposed no conflicts are apparent.
Density	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Density of infill development should be consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton plan. 	<p>Consistent</p> <p>Broad Street District: 45 units/acre or greater 204 units on 5.2 Acres = 39 units/acre</p>
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Infill development proposed at densities higher than the plan recommendations should utilize an extraordinary high level of design and materials to provide compatibility with nearby architecture and design (appropriate setbacks, roof pitch and shape, building materials, windows and doors, height, width, massing, porches, etc.), as well as design solutions to mitigate impacts (stepping down the height of structures, screening, etc.). 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building heights should be consistent with the urban design standards recommended in the plan and height map on page 4.18. Buildings between three and five stories should provide an additional building setback above the third floor. Buildings that exceed five stories should provide at least one additional setback above the fifth floor and employ design solutions that protect views. 	<p>Not Consistent.</p> <p>The proposal includes a mixed use building at 12 stories. The 12 story building is at the Eastern most extent of the District closest to Downtown, fronts Broad Street and is adjacent to the raised railroad tracks - all mitigating factors.</p>
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent. Additional attention should be paid to the integration of the 12 story building and parking garage.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture). 	Additional information on the Cohousing building and the Garage will be necessary for further review.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason. 	Consistent
Retail	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Retail uses are appropriate throughout the neighborhood, consistent with the East Franklinton plan, provided applicable code requirements are met. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Corner stores and offices are an appropriate use, particularly at intersections. Any potential negative impacts should be mitigated. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sidewalk dining should be supported that enhances restaurant, dining and entertainment businesses, provided ADA requirements are accommodated, per DPS approvals. 	Consistent
Mixed Uses	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mixed uses can occur vertically in a building (i.e., first floor retail, second-floor office, third and higher floors residential) or horizontally in a development among various buildings (in these cases, the uses should be integrated and not segregated). 	Consistent

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-floor uses in mixed-use buildings should include retail, restaurants, services, cultural facilities and amenities, personal services and offices. 	Consistent								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A variety of housing unit types and sizes should be provided in the residential portions of mixed-use developments. 	Consistent								
Accessibility									
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and “visitability” in all new construction and in rehabilitation and redevelopment of existing buildings. 	Consistent								
Parking									
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured parking should be considered for higher density projects, as appropriate, and designed to minimize visual impacts. Building materials, detailing and landscape should be used that complement the surrounding area. Primary elevations should include ground floor uses (e.g., commercial space) or be screened with residential uses. Parking structures should be set back no more than 10 feet. 	Largely Consistent - Provide additional information regarding the garage design.								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	<p>Largely Consistent- The applicants are proposing a 665 space parking garage. The parking demand per code is completely linked to the type of retail and residential unit count. A conservative approach to parking may require 676 parking space, thus requiring a parking reduction variance.</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Parking</th> <th>Residential</th> <th>Retail</th> <th>Office</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>676</td> <td>306</td> <td>112</td> <td>257</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Parking	Residential	Retail	Office	676	306	112	257
Parking	Residential	Retail	Office						
676	306	112	257						
Building Orientation and Setbacks									
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage. 	Consistent								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings, parking structures and other structures taller than four stories should provide additional space for pedestrians adjacent to the public sidewalk if the existing sidewalk is five feet or less in width. 	Consistent								
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary). 	Consistent								

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Secondary entrances can be located on side and rear elevations to meet fire code and to service adjacent parking. 	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Service and loading zones should be located to the rear, side or in an internal location where visibility from public rights-of-way and views from neighboring buildings and properties will be minimized or screened to their full height. 	Additional information regarding loading and service needs for the building will need to be provided.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	Additional information will need to be provided.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material. 	Additional information will need to be provided.
Public Spaces	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Developments over 1.5 acres in size in urban settings should include public spaces, such as plazas and courtyards. 	Consistent
Landscaping	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies. 	Additional information will need to be provided.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens. 	Additional information will need to be provided.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape adjacent to natural features should be used to soften the visual appearance of a development and provide a natural transition between the development and open space areas. 	Consistent
Street Trees and Streetscape	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tree-lined residential and commercial streets should be either established or maintained. 	Consistent

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	Consistent
Landscape Material	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	Additional information will need to be provided.

Staff Recommendations:

The proposed Mixed Use Development is largely consistent with the recommendations of the EFCCD Plan.

The proposal includes a mixed use building at 12 stories. The 12 story building is at the Eastern most extent of the District closest to Downtown, fronts Broad Street and is adjacent to the raised railroad tracks - all mitigating factors.

The parking demand per code is completely linked to the type of retail and residential unit count. A conservative approach to parking may require 676 parking space, thus requiring a parking reduction variance.

At a future meeting the Review Board will need to act on possible variances.

Recommendations:

Approval Approval with Conditions **Table** Disapproval

1. Additional information to further understand the proposal from the pedestrian level.
2. To better understand the prospective uses and demand for parking and support a parking reduction if necessary.
3. To support the requested height variance from 5 stories to 12.

D STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

	APPROVED : ITEMS APPROVED	COA ISSUED
1. EF_18-07-002 64 SOUTH GIFT STREET	SLATE ROOF REPLACEMENT	07/20/2018

E BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

	APPROVED : ITEMS APPROVED	COA ISSUED
1. EF_17-05-001 491 W BROAD ST AD FARROW	06/20/2018: BUILDING ADDITION, SIGNAGE	07/13/2018

F NEXT MEETING

TUESDAY – SEPTEMBER 18, 2018 AT 3:00 PM
MICHAEL B COLEMAN GOVERNMENT CENTER
111 NORTH FRONT STREET, ROOM 203