

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

February 4, 2014

4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Commissioners Present: Lisa Case, Charissa Wang-Durst, Terrence O'Donnell, James Panzer, Ned Thiell, Brett Leukart,
Mark Ours

City Staff Present: Cristin Moody

German Village Society Staff Present: Sarah Marsom

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:03 p.m.
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), February 25, 2014.
50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – TUESDAY, March 4, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, Tuesday, January 7, 2014.
MOTION: Ours/Thiell (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Thiell/Ours (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

HOLDOVERS

1. 14-1-4b

118 East Beck Street

Thomas S. Gulacy (Applicant)

John C. Rule (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-4b, 118 East Beck Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

New Dormers

- Construct new, twelve foot, two inch long (12'2" L), four foot high (4' h) shed dormers on both sides of rear, one story gable addition, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Siding is to be five inch (5") wood lap siding; roofing is to be asphalt shingle from the approved shingle list.
- Each dormer is to have one (1) single light wood fixed window; casing around windows to be per guidelines. A cut sheet for the windows is to be submitted to staff for final approval prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Ours/Case (5-1-0) APPROVED [Thiell].

2. 14-1-10a

160 Thurman Avenue

ON Architects, LLC (Applicant)

Joshua Zimmerman (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-10a, 160 Thurman Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

New Dormer

- Install new gable dormer on west elevation with five and a half inch (5½") beveled wood siding and wood trim, gable detail to match existing.
- Window is to be a fixed, single pane wood window.

Addition

- Expand rear two story addition and add second story over east side addition, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Foundation on addition is to be split faced CMU; roofing is to be asphalt shingle from the Approved Shingles List; siding is to be five and a half inch (5½") beveled siding with wood trim
- Gutters and downspouts are to be five inch (5") aluminum ogee style.
- Windows on addition are to be three (3) single light casements on east elevation, one (1) 1-over-1 on north elevation, and two (2) single light awning windows on west elevation.
- Doors on addition to be one (1) half light wood door, patio door group with two sliding and two fixed doors, and set of double full light doors on second story balcony.

Replace Siding

- Replace all existing wood siding on previous addition with new five and a half inch (5½") beveled wood siding with wood trim.

Replace Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the house with new windows to match existing configurations, per submitted specifications.
- Original 2-over-2 windows on the first floor, south elevation are to remain.

MOTION: Thiell/O'Donnell (5-0-2) APPROVED [Ours, Leukart].

3. 14-1-11

80 Concord Place

Albert Unetic, Architect (Applicant)

Joan Gigliotti (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners would like to see less of an impact on the historic cottage structure.
- The dining area bump out is not consistent with the guidelines and would destroy historic fabric; it would be better to maintain the historic cottage form and add to the rear.

Conceptual Review

- Expand existing one story rear addition and construct new one story side addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

NEW APPLICATION

4. 14-2-5

640 South Fifth Street

Ara Mekhjian (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-2-5, 640 South Fifth Street, and place on the March 4, 2014 meeting agenda.

Replace Siding

- Remove deteriorated, damaged MDF siding on rear, two story addition.
- Replace with new five inch (5”) fiber cement lap siding and fiber cement trim.

MOTION: Thiehl/Durst (5-0-2) CONTINUED [O’Donnell, Panzer].

5. 14-2-6

361 East Livingston Avenue

Adrienne Mellen Rainstack (Applicant)

Berardi & Partners (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-6, 361 East Livingston Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Signage

- Install new thirty-six by thirty-six inch (30” x 30”) projecting sign on the building façade, above entrance, per submitted rendering.
- Sign will be hung on metal brackets, mounted on the masonry with bolts drilled into the mortar.

MOTION: Durst/Thiehl (7-0-0) APPROVED.

6. 14-2-4b

902 Mohawk Street

Will Lehnert, Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Drew Rothschild & Natalie Disabatio (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-4b, 902 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Install Bike Rack

- Install thirty-three and three eights inch high (33 3/8” h), black powder coated bike rack next to tree lawn planting area. Metal bike rack to be mounted in concrete, per specifications submitted February 4, 2014.
- Metal rack is to be surface-mounted on metal flanges anchored into the concrete.

Landscaping

- Replace foundation plantings and tree lawn plantings, per submitted landscape plan.
- Install three inch wide, four inch high (3” w, 4” h) Indiana Limestone curb along both sides of concrete service walk, per

Install Wood Arbor

- Install eight and a half foot (8½’ h) wood arbor with five foot, eleven inch (5’11” h) gate on the south side of the house, per submitted plans.
- Structure is to have wood posts with ornamental caps and a square trellis side panel.
- All wood is to be painted Sherwin Williams “Black Swan” (SW 6279) or equivalent.

Install Window Box

- Install wood window box on front first story window, paint to match trim color on the house.

MOTION: Ours/Thiehl (7-0-0) APPROVED.

7. 14-2-7

637 South Third Street

Jonathan Barnes (Applicant)

Jenny Barnes (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-7, 637 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Replace all deteriorated, non-original, non-contributing windows with new 1-over-1 Jeld-wen Tradition Plus wood sash packs.

Clean Previously Unpainted Masonry

- Clean all unpainted brick in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes.
- Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and a broad fan tip is to be used.
- **Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor the following patch test procedure is required:** Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Patch test to be approved by Historic Preservation Office staff prior to proceeding with the complete job.
- Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations.
- If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "The Cleaning and Waterproof Coating of Masonry Buildings").

Spot Tuck Point-(partial)

- Check all mortar joints on the house for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.cr.nps.gov/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Paint Exterior Masonry

- Paint all painted and unpainted brick walls on the house; finish coat is to be Benjamin Moore "Buxbury Gray" (HC-163).

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (6-0-1) APPROVED [Thiell].

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

8. 14-2-8

577 Cedar Alley

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Ellisar Group/Dan & Michele Lavon (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- The exterior chimney on the addition is not something the Commission typically approves, unless there is a precedent for it on the historic structure.
- The massing of the addition is an issue; Commissioners suggested lowering the roof; the addition needs to be subservient to the historic structure.
- Raising the peak of the roof on the one story section on the north elevation is likely not a problem, but adding a shed dormer on that roof may be an issue.

Conceptual Review

- Expand one story addition to two story house to create a two story addition with connector.
- Variance required.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

- **14-2-1**

874 City Park Avenue

Jeff & Mary Jablonski (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-1, 874 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Slate Roof

- Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new black slate of appropriate color and profile to match existing style, in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.
- Install new metal valleys of appropriate dimension. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Install new metal flashing on all existing chimneys and skylight.
- All ridges to be capped with copper, slate, or galvanized metal ridge roll painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing (excluding copper) are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."

- **14-2-2**

544 South Sixth Street

Katharine Alexander & Barnaby Nardella (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-2, 544 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install New Storm Door

- Install a new, full light Larson "Classic View" aluminum storm door on the front entrance, per submitted specifications.
- Storm door color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.

- **14-2-3**

925 Mohawk Street

Joe Halabi & Michelle Wong (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-3, 925 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Section of Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove damaged, deteriorated roofing and sheathing on two foot section of main roof all around the lower edge. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing with new metal flashing.
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to match existing asphalt shingles on the roof.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Rebuild damaged chimney to match original height and detail using as many salvaged brick as possible. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with new brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.

- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings", available at <http://www.nps.gov/history/hps/tps/briefs/brief02.htm>).

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Remove the existing, inappropriate, non-original, ogee gutter and corrugated down spouts and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
 - Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
 - Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
 - Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
 - Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- **14-2-4a**

902 Mohawk Street

Will Lehnert, Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)

Drew Rothschild & Natalie Disabatio (Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-4a, 902 Mohawk Street, as submitted with all clarifications noted:

Relay Existing Brick Sidewalk

- Remove deteriorated brick public sidewalk along Mohawk Street, per submitted plans. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Re-install existing brick in the exact same location and in the same pattern existing.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Repair Porch Steps

- Reset existing front porch steps and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Repair cheek walls as necessary by removing any/all damaged material and replace with like-for-like materials as indicated by checked box. Replacement []brick []block and/or []stone to match existing in size, color, and shape. Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.
- All work to be completed in accordance with industry standards.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 6:24 pm MOTION: Ours/Case (7-0-0) ADJORNED.