

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

January 7, 2014

4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Commissioners Present: Lisa Case, Charissa Wang-Durst, Terrence O'Donnell, James Panzer, Ned Thiell, Brett Leukart,
Mark Ours

Commissioners Absent: None

City Staff Present: Cristin Moody

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:05 p.m.
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), January 28, 2014.
50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – TUESDAY, February 4, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, Tuesday, December 3, 2013.
MOTION: Ours/Case (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Ours/Thiell (6-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

HOLDOVERS

1. 13-11-25

282 East Sycamore Street

Jeffrey P. Norman (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #13-11-25, 282 East Sycamore Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing vinyl windows on the historic house and all wood windows on the addition with new Marvin, 1-over-1, aluminum clad wood windows, per submitted specifications.
- Exterior trim will be back-caulked, extruded aluminum brick mold.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED.

2. 13-12-12

673 Mohawk Street

Nau & Bullock Architects, et al. (Applicant)

Bob & Peggy Walter (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Divide Application #13-12-12a, 673 Mohawk Street into item 'a' for all work as submitted except for garden porch roof structure, which is designated as item 'c'.

MOTION: Ours/Case (7-0-0) APPROVED.

13-12-12a

Nau & Bullock Architects, William Hugus Architects (Applicant) Bob & Peggy Walter (Owner)

Approve Application #13-12-12a, 673 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Window & Door Alterations

- Replace one non-original door on the first story, south elevation with a window, to restore the original opening size and window configuration.
- Convert three (3) existing windows on the first story, south elevation to wood doors French doors with transoms, to maintain existing opening height and width.
- Remove existing non-original, non-contributing basement windows on the north and south elevation and fill in openings to restore original opening size, per revised plans. Install new wood windows to match original as closely as possible.
- Remove non-original door systems from west elevation and infill openings with brick and double hung windows to match existing on the building.
- Replace non-original basement door on north elevation with new wood French door to fit in the existing opening.

Replace Front Door

- Replace non-original front door with two six panel doors with clear glass in top four panels, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Remove non-original stained glass in tracery above front entrance; replace with clear glass. Maintain and preserve all of the existing stone tracery, and install undivided, insulated glass pane in each opening.

Roof Alterations

- Replace deteriorated, insufficient flat roof system with new substructure and membrane.
- Install new eight foot by sixteen by ten foot high (8' x 16' x 10'h) elevator belvedere on roof.
- Belvedere to have copper roof, three solid 2 panel doors and one French door; two wood windows on east elevation and slate end wall on west elevation.
- Construct new, seven foot by three foot, four inch by nine foot, six inch high (7'w x 3'4"l x 9'6" h) brick chimney with clay chimney pots on south side of roof.
- Install thirty inch (30") high, wrought iron railing system around top of roof, to match school house style fencing along street.

Garage Door

- Install new overhead garage door on south elevation, below grade, per submitted plans.

Remove Fire Escape

- Remove non-original, metal fire escape structure on the west elevation.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED.

13-12-12b

Hoerr Schaudt Landscape Architects (Applicant) Bob & Peggy Walter (Owner)

Approve Application #13-12-12b, 673 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Landscaping

- Remove asphalt parking lot, all of the trees on the site, and all walls, retaining walls and fences on the site.
- Remove existing brick public sidewalk and replace with new brick walk, using brick shown in submitted plans, laid in a herringbone pattern.
- Remove existing deteriorated curb along Mohawk Street and replace with new sandstone curb to match existing.
- Install new garden area with plantings, a stone water feature as well as brick and stone seat walls and brick and stone walkways and steps, per submitted landscape plan. **Note: Specific type and color of stone for walls and paving in interior garden area is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office for final approval prior to installation.**

- Plant four (4) Single-stem Washington Hawthorn trees, four (4) Flowering Crabapple Trees, four (4) London Plane trees, one (1) Katsura tree, two (2) Multi-stem Whitebuds, one (1) columnar evergreen specimen tree, and six (6) Sugar Maple trees
- Install six foot high (6' h) evergreen hedge along east property line and ten foot high (10' h) evergreen hedge adjacent to raised terrace, and sixteen to eighteen foot high (16-18' h) Arborvitae hedge along the south property line, and a four foot high (4' h) evergreen hedge at the northeast corner of the property, per submitted plans.
- Install eight foot (8' h) brick wall along the south side of the garden, sloping down at the east corner, per submitted plans.
- Install three foot, six inch (3'6" h) schoolhouse-style wrought iron fencing with four foot (4' h) stone piers and stone curb along the public sidewalk at the east property line, per submitted plans.
- Install six foot, six inch (6'6" h) brick and stone masonry columns at main entry with decorative metal gate. South column is to have a mailbox and lighted address plate, north column is to have lighted metal plaque commemorating St. Mary's School.
- Previously approved access easement is to have surface of granite cobblestone with stone curb, per submitted plans.
- Stone retaining wall, metal railings, handrails and gate to be installed around driveway ramp leading to basement garage, per submitted plans.
- Gravel paved utility area on west side of the building, per submitted plans.

MOTION: Thiell/Case (7-0-0) APPROVED.

13-12-12c

Nau & Bullock Architects, William Hugus Architects (Applicant) Bob & Peggy Walter (Owner)

Conditional approval of Application #13-12-12c, 673 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Covered Porch

- Construct new eighteen foot, six inch by twenty-two foot, six inch (18'6" x 22' 6") covered porch on south side with connector, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Porch is to have stone base, painted steel tube frame and clear glass roof.
- Construct freestanding brick wall with fireplace along west side of porch, per revised drawings.
- **This approval is a conditional approval of the location, design and size of the structure. Final plans showing details of the method of construction must be submitted to the German Village Commission for final approval.**

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED.

3. 13-12-17

877 Mohawk Street

Cheryl L. Brown (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #13-12-17, 877 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Remove two aluminum frame windows, double hung windows on the house with all wood Pella, 1-over-1, double hung wood windows, to fit exactly in the existing openings, per submitted specifications.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED.

NEW APPLICATION

4. 14-1-7

186 East Sycamore Street & 649 South Fifth Street

William Hugus Architects (Applicant)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-1-7a

186 East Sycamore Street

William Hugus Architects (Applicant)

Mary Raber (Owner)

Recommend Variance Request Application #14-1-7a, 186 East Sycamore Street, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation

- C.C. 3332.27 & 3332.28(E) - to allow reduced rear yard coverage for 18.8% to 16.5% and rear yard obstruction.

MOTION: Ours/Durst (7-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

14-1-7b

649 South Fifth Street

William Hugus Architects (Applicant)

Marie Logothetis & Daniel S. Kline (Owner)

Recommend Variance Request Application #14-1-7b, 649 South Fifth Street, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation

- C.C. 3332.26(E) – to reduce side yard setback from 3’ to 0 on south side of proposed new garage and from 3’ to 1’ on the north side of garage.
- C.C. 3332.18(D) – to allow lot coverage of 60.21% (existing lot coverage is non-conforming - 64.38%).

MOTION: Ours/Durst (7-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

14-1-7c

186 East Sycamore Street & 649 South Fifth Street

Following the staff report, presentation by the Applicant, ensuing discussion and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- Consider pulling up the window on the alley side or making it taller, possibly divide the pane.

Conceptual Review

- Construct new two car garage straddling property line.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

5. 14-1-4b

118 East Beck Street

Thomas S. Gulacy (Applicant)

John C. Rule (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-1-14b, 118 East Beck Street, and place on the February 4, 2014 meeting agenda.

New Dormers

- Construct new, thirteen foot, two inch long (13’2” L) shed dormers on both sides of rear, one story gable addition, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Siding is to be six inch (6”) Hardie plank; roofing is to be asphalt shingle from the approved shingle list.

Replace Side Door

- Remove non-functional side door on east elevation and replace with new Jeld-Wen double hung wood window, per submitted plans.

MOTION: Ours/O’Donnell (7-0-0) CONTINUED.

6. 14-1-8

237 East Livingston Avenue

Steve Gifford, G.M.C. Real Estate Investments, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-8, 237 East Livingston Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Light Fixture

- Install new pendant light fixture above entrance, to match fixture on adjacent store front, per submitted specifications.
- Fixture to be attached to existing arm above transom.

MOTION: Durst/O'Donnell (7-0-0) APPROVED.

7. **14-1-9**

521 City Park Avenue

H. Robinson (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-9, 521 City Park Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Curb Cut & Driveway

- Create curb cut on City Park Avenue in location of previously used driveway access, and install new driveway, per submitted plans.
- Driveway is to be eight feet (8') wide and sixty-five feet long (65').
- Driveway and apron surface to be brick pavers laid in pattern to match adjacent brick sidewalk.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Leukart (6-1-0) APPROVED [Thiell].

8. **14-1-10a**

160 Thurman Avenue

ON Architects, LLC (Applicant)

Joshua Zimmerman (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- The existing, original dormer should not be removed; new dormer design can be modified, simplified; it should not match original dormer details.
- Replacement windows should be complete window replacement or possibly sash packs, not whole new windows inserted in the existing frames.
- East elevation – awkward conjunction at the second floor addition; suggested pulling the proposed second story south wall back so that the corner or the original house is left exposed.
- West elevation – too much blank wall; suggestion was made to inset the new portion from the existing west wall and adding some kind of fenestration.
- Fiber cement siding has not been approved for existing structures and is not likely to be approved at this time.
- Look for a venting solution other than hat vents.

Following the discussion a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-1-10a, 160 Thurman Avenue, and place on the February 4, 2014 meeting agenda.

Replace Dormer

- Remove deteriorated gable dormer on west elevation of original two story house.
- Replace with new larger gable dormer in new location with seven inch (7") Hardie plank siding and wood trim, gable detail to match existing.
- Window is to be a fixed, single pane wood window.

Addition

- Expand rear two story addition and add second story over east side addition, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Foundation on addition is to be split faced CMU; roofing is to be asphalt shingle from the Approved Shingles List; siding is to be seven inch (7") Hardie plank siding with six inch (6") wood corner boards and wood trim.
- Gutters and downspouts are to be five inch (5") aluminum ogee style.
- Windows on addition are to be 1-over-1; doors will be one full light fiberglass door and four sliding doors.

Replace Siding

- Replace all existing wood siding on previous addition with new seven inch (7") Hardie plank siding with six inch (6") corner boards.

Replace Windows

- Replace all non-original, non-contributing windows on the house with new windows to match existing configurations, per submitted specifications.
- Original 2-over-2 windows on the first floor, south elevation are to remain.

MOTION: Thiell/O'Donnell (5-0-2) CONTINUED [Ours, Leukart recused].

14-1-10b

Following the staff report, presentation by the Applicant, ensuing discussion and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- Proposed structure is much taller than neighboring buildings; overall height should be reduced.
- Garage doors on the alley should be more residential in design due to the character of the structure.
- The north elevation asymmetry may be an issue; try adding a window on the first story or move dormer.

Conceptual Review

- Construct 765 sq. ft., two car carriage house with living space in the second story.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. 14-1-11

80 Concord Place

Albert Unetic, Architect (Applicant)

Joan Gialiotti (Owner)

At the request of the applicant, continue Application #14-1-11, 80 Concord Place, and place on the February 4, 2014 meeting agenda.

Conceptual Review

- Expand existing one story rear addition and construct new one story side addition.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Case (5-0-2) CONTINUED [Ours, Leukart].

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

10. 14-1-12

160 Thurman Avenue

Joshua Zimmerman (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-12, 160 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Slate Roof

- Remove all slate roofing on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

- CertainTeed
- GAF

Style:

- Carriage House (dimensional)
- Slateline (dimensional)

- (standard 3-tab)
- Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)
- (standard 3-tab)

Color:

- Stonegate Gray
- English Gray Slate
- Weathered Slate
- Nickel Gray
- Nickel Gray
- Estate Gray
- Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

MOTION: O’Donnell/Thiell (5-0-2) APPROVED [Ours, Leukart].

11. 14-1-13

1054 South Pearl Street

Dehlc Construction Services (Applicant)

Grand Canal Properties (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-13, 1054 South Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Exterior Stairs

- Remove deteriorated, rusting metal stairs to second story entrance on rear (east) elevation.
- Replace with new wood stairs with landing, located and detailed as shown in submitted drawing. Stamped, engineer drawing of full stair structure to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final approval prior to issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness.
- New wood stairs are to be painted to match existing color on the house.

Replace Siding

- Replace deteriorated wood siding on two-story rear addition with new five inch (5”) Dutch lap wood siding, to match existing.
- Prime all bare and new wood with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Owner has the option of selecting one (1) of the following appropriate painting methods: a) paint all wood trim, windows, doors, etc. the exact same color as currently exists on the wood trim or, b) submit a new paint schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Thiell/Case (5-0-2) APPROVED [Ours, Leukart].

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

• **14-1-1**

649 Mohawk Street

Annette Hilaman (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-1, 649 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications and paint with appropriate exterior paint. Paint colors for finish coat are to be: Benjamin Moore

“Cloud White” (967) for the soffits, gutters, and trim on the house, “Eagle Rock” (1469) for the porch floors, wood lintels and siding on the garage, and “Black” for the front door and trim on the garage.

- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-1-2**

293 East Beck Street

Stephanie & Judson Martt (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-2, 293 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Skylight

- Amend previously issued COA #13-7-30 for replacement of two (2) skylights to replace one (1) of the existing skylights on the south facing slope, as approved, and completely remove the other, per submitted specifications.
- The skylight opening is to be covered and shingled to match the existing roof materials.

- **14-1-3**

91 East Deshler Avenue

Hamilton J. Teaford (Applicant)

Margaret Hale Teaford (Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-3, 91 East Deshler Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Step

- Remove deteriorated, cracked portion of limestone step at bottom of stairs leading to front porch.
- Replace with new piece of limestone to match existing in color, dimensions and detail.
- New stone is to be set in mortar and caulked at the seam with remaining step to blend in as much as possible.

- **14-1-4a**

118 East Beck Street

Thomas S. Gulacy (Applicant)

John C. Rule (Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-4a, 118 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Door

- Remove screen door on front entrance and remove non-original front door.
- Replace with new, solid core four-panel door in existing door jamb
- Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

- **14-1-5**

43 East Kossuth Street

Brian Collins, bcf Design & Development, Ltd. (Applicant) Julie Bango & John Saunders (Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-5, 43 East Kossuth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all membrane roofing on the rear addition down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Repair/Replace Gutters and Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the rear addition and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Repair copper gutters on the front portion of the house and replace copper downspouts in kind.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-1-6**

576/578/580 Cedar Alley

Michele Lavon (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-6, 576/578/580 Cedar Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be the following from the approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 7:50 pm. MOTION: Thiell/Case (7-0-0) ADJORNED.