

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

March 4, 2014

4:00 p.m.

German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street

Commissioners Present: Lisa Case, Charissa Wang-Durst, Terrence O'Donnell, James Panzer, Ned Thiell, Mark Ours

Commissioners Absent: Brett Leukart

City Staff Present: Cristin Moody

German Village Society Staff Present: Sarah Marsom

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:15 p.m.
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), March 25, 2014.
50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – TUESDAY, April 1, 2014.
- IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, Tuesday, February 4, 2014.
MOTION: Ours/Durst (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Ours/Thiell (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION

1. 14-3-5

376 East Beck Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

George Lekorenos (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-3-5a

Recommend Variance Request Application #14-3-5a, 376 East Beck Street, as submitted:

Variance Recommendation

- Renew previous Variance Recommendation #08-5-21, for the exact same conditions as stated. Expired: May 6, 2009.

Rear Yard Variance

3332.27 Rear Yard Variance – The rear yard area to be reduced from the required 1169 Sq feet to 895 Sq feet.

Motion: Thiell/ Ours (6-0-1) RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL

MOTION: Ours/Case (6-0-0) RECOMMENDED.

14-3-5b

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- A shed dormer on the north side of the addition roof can work; it does not need to be pushed back to the end.
- The addition and dormer should be a logical composition that makes sense and works together; make the entire addition look like a new building.
- It would be preferable to use 1-over-1 windows on the addition.

Conceptual Review

- Changes to previously approved rear addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-3-6

186 East Sycamore & 649 South Fifth Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Dan Kline & Marie Logothetis (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-6, 186 East Sycamore Street & 649 South Fifth Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

New Two Car Garage

- Construct new, 528 sq. ft. frame garage, straddling the property line between the two lots, with one car access on each, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Garage is to have standing seam metal roof, six inch (6") Hardie plank lap siding, Hardie panels with 1x2 battens at twenty-four inch (24") o.c., wood and MDO trim. Foundation is to be exposed concrete.
- Garage doors are to be smooth, flush wood overhead doors, service doors are to be smooth, flush wood doors and windows are to be Jeld-wen, all wood, fixed windows.

MOTION: Ours/Case (5-1-0) APPROVED [Thiell].

3. 14-3-7

685 South Third Street

Theresa Sugar (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-7, 685 South Third Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Doors

- Remove existing, non-original, double doors on the rear elevation.
- Enlarge opening to install new, eight foot (8' h), three quarter light wood French doors, per revised specifications.
- Revise previously approved windows along the west and south sides of the rear corner to align tops of windows with the new doors and size panels below windows to match panels on the doors.

MOTION: Durst/Thiell (6-0-0) APPROVED.

4. 14-3-8

495 South Third Street

Kittie's Cakes, Kelly Fankhauer (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-8, 495 South Third Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Sidewalk Seating Area

- Add exterior sidewalk seating adjacent to storefront, per submitted plans and revised specifications.
- New furniture is to include two sixteen inch (16”) dia. fixed painted steel tables, three pairs (6 total) Loll “Vang” plastic lounge chairs, and several Loll “Milk Stool” plastic side tables. Existing bench to remain.

MOTION: Ours/Case (6-0-0) APPROVED.

5. **14-3-9**

160 Thurman Avenue

ON Architects LLC (Applicant)

Joshua Zimmerman (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-3-9a

Recommend Variance Request Application #14-3-9a, 160 Thurman Avenue, as submitted:

Variance Request

- C.C. 3332.38(H) – to allow habitable space in a detached garage.
- C.C. 3332.38 – to allow an increase in the overall height of a garage from 15 ft. to 23ft., 4 in., and to allow habitable space above the garage as a result of the increased height.

MOTION: O’Donnell/Case (4-1-1) RECOMMENDED [Panzer opposed, Ours recused].

14-3-9b

Approve Application #14-3-9b, 160 Thurman Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

New Carriage House

- Construct new 709 sq. ft., two-story, two car carriage house at the rear of the property, facing Redbud Alley.
- Carriage house is to have asphalt shingle roof from the Approved Shingle List with metal ridge roll; five inch (5”) Hardie plank siding; wood trim; aluminum gutters and downspouts; and split-faced concrete block foundation.
- Windows are to be wood double hung and fixed windows, alley side garage doors are to be wood, carriage house style overhead doors, yard side garage door to be glass overhead door. Service doors are to be wood half light and wood four panel door.

Rear Deck

- Construct new wood deck extending from rear of the main house, with no railing, per submitted plans.

MOTION: O’Donnell/Durst (4-1-1) APPROVED [Panzer opposed, Ours recused].

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

6. **14-3-10**

578 South Sixth Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Mike & Patricia Powers (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- It is inappropriate to put a shed dormer on a roof of this style; it out of scale and the wrong shape.

Conceptual Review

- Add shed dormer on north slope of main roof.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

7. **14-3-14**

577 Cedar Alley

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Ellisar Group/Dan & Michele Lavon (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- It would be an improvement if the two story addition could be rendered as a story-and-a-half with dormers. The height is an issue due to its visibility from the alley.
- Most Commissioners are fine with the variance request due to the fact that the overall coverage would not be more than fifty percent. The location of the yard is also a mitigating factor; the addition does not seem to be crowding the neighborhood any more than the existing structure.

Conceptual Review

- Expand one story addition to two story house to create a two story addition with connector.
- Variance required.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

8. 14-3-11

902 Mohawk Street

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Natalie DiSabato & Drew Rothchild (Owner)

Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, Commissioners offered the following comments:

Commissioner Comments:

- Commissioners question whether the existing porch fabric is original or newer. If it is not original, it is probably okay to remove it to construct a continuous wrap around porch.
- If it is original, the existing original roof should remain and the new roof should be separate, not continuous.
- If the entire porch is replaced, it should look contemporary, simpler, and not include faux historic details
- Staff should conduct a site visit to determine what might be original.

Conceptual Review

- Expand existing rear porch to wrap around the rear of the house.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

9. 14-3-12

616 Mohawk Street

William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)

Dawn & Jamie Lowery (Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-12, 616 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install Light Fixtures

- Install new twenty-eight inch (28") h. gas light fixture at the entrance on the south elevation of the original cottage, per submitted specifications.
- Install new twenty-six (26") h. metal and acrylic light fixture on the south elevation of new connector, per submitted specifications.

MOTION: Ours/Case (5-0-1) APPROVED [Thiell].

10. 14-3-4b

785 City Park Avenue

Michael Thompson & Dennis Giglio (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-4b, 785 City Park Avenue, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Replace all non-contributing wood sashes on the front bay window of non-historic house with new Marvin wood windows, to match existing.
- Replace one rear, second story, 1-over-1, window with new Marvin, all wood, push out casement window with center cross bar, to fit in the existing opening exactly.

MOTION: Ours/Case (5-0-0) APPROVED.

11. 14-3-13

772 South Fifth Street

Tim Bibler (Applicant/Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-13, 772 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Vinyl Siding

- Remove deteriorated vinyl siding on the south and above the porch on east elevation of the 1979 addition.
- Replace with new Oracle Solid Core vinyl siding in a similar color with same four inch (4") exposure; corner trim to be replaced with new four inch (4") wood corner trim to match existing.

MOTION: Ours/Thiell (5-0-0) APPROVED.

12. 14-3-3b

551 South Fifth Street

Shawn Sigafos (Applicant)

Sandy Kight (Owner)

Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-3b, 551 South Fifth Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Non-original Window

- Remove one non-original, non-contributing, single pane, fixed window on the east side of the building.
- Replace with new, 1-over-one, double hung, wood window to fit in the existing rough opening exactly.
- New window is to be painted to match the existing color.

MOTION: Ours/Durst (5-0-0) APPROVED.

STAFF APPROVALS

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

• **14-3-1**

540 South Sixth Street

Karla Kaeser (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-3-1, 540 South Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

• **14-3-2**

173 East Blenkner Street

Precision Slate & Tile (Applicant)

John Offenbacher (Owner)

Approve Application #14-3-2, 173 East Blenkner Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Install Slate Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Remove existing hat vents and power vent. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new slate of appropriate color and profile on the main roof in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.
- Install new metal valleys of appropriate dimension. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Install new metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- All ridges to be capped with copper, slate, or galvanized metal ridge roll painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing (excluding copper) are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

- **14-3-3a**

551 South Fifth Street

Shawn Sigafos (Applicant)

Sandy Kight (Owner)

Approve Application #14-3-3a, 551 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Wooden Storm Windows

- Remove all deteriorated wood storm windows.
- Replace with new custom wood storm windows to match existing in all dimension and details.
- New storm windows are to be installed in exactly the same manner and locations as existing and are to be painted to match the existing color.
- Reuse any existing hardware (i.e. hinges, latches, hooks, etc.); where damaged or missing, install new hardware to match as closely as possible.

- **14-3-4a**

785 City Park Avenue

Michael Thompson & Dennis Giglio (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-3-4a, 785 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Door

- Replace non-contributing steel door on the north elevation of non-historic home with new three quarter light, all wood exterior door, per submitted photograph.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT – 6:05 pm. MOTION: Panzer/Case (6-0-0) ADJORNED.