

**DRAFT**  
**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION**  
**MINUTES**

**March 3, 2015**

**German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street**

**Commissioners Present:** Terrence O’Donnell, James Panzer, Brett Leukart, Mark Ours, Anthony Hartke

**Commissioners Absent:** Charissa Wang-Durst, Ned Thiell

**City Staff Present:** Randy Black

**German Village Society Staff Present:** Sarah Marsom

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:08 p.m.
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), March 31, 2015.  
50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – TUESDAY, April 7, 2015.
- IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, Tuesday, February 19, 2015.  
MOTION: O’Donnell/Hartke (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: O’Donnell/Ours (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**1. 15-3-5**

**753 Mohawk Street**

**Chadwick & Allyson Irving (Applicant/Owner)**

*The Historic Preservation Officer presented the application with the accompanying photos and decibel research provided by the Applicant/Owner.*

Relocate A/C Unit

- Relocate existing air conditioner from side yard to non-original, non-contributing rear patio roof, per submitted specifications and structural engineer’s conditions.
- A/c unit is to be located no more than one foot (1’) from the support at the house and weight distributed over at least three joists.

*Following the staff report the Chair called members of the public wishing to comment:*

<b><u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u></b>	<b><u>Issues/Comments:</u></b>
Greg Lashutka 754 South Lazelle Street Neighboring Property Owner	Presented additional photos of the property. Also speaking as proxy for neighbor Tom Daily who was unable to attend. Voiced concern with the visual impact of the proposal on the historic property. No other roof mounted A. C. units appear in the vicinity. Recommended placement in the rear yard.
Bill Forbes	Shares same concerns voiced by Mr. Lashutka. The visual impact is

757 Mohawk Street Neighboring Property Owner	inappropriate for the historic neighborhood.
---	--

After the discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.  
 Continue Application 15-3-5, 753 Mohawk Street, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the April 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting Agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.  
 MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**2. 15-3-9**

**661 South Grant Avenue**

**Peter Cullicover (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-3-9, 661 South Grant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Remove two (2) non-original, 1-over-1, double hung windows on the rear of the house.
- Replace with new Pella Architect Series all wood units sized to fit in the original rough openings exactly.
- Replace any/all brick mold, as necessary, to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all windows and trim in accordance with industry standards, to match existing color.

Replace Door

- Remove non-original French door on the rear entrance.
- Replace with a new Pella Architect Series full light, wood door in existing door jamb. Set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color to match existing, or if a new color is chose, paint chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (5-0-0) APPROVED

**3. 15-3-10**

**279 Alexander Alley**

**Andrew Roth (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-3-10, 279 Alexander Alley, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Remove one (1) deteriorated and damaged, 2-over-2 window in the second story, north gable.
- Replace with a new Marvin Ultimate Insert, 2-over-2, double hung window
- Replace any/all brick mold, as necessary, to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all windows and trim in accordance with industry standards, to match existing color.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (5-0-0) APPROVED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**4. 15-3-6**

**799 South Third Street**

**Jon Knitter (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant/owner and the project architect, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-3-6, 799 South Third Street, as submitted:

New Curb Cut and Driveway

- Install new curb cut, driveway apron and driveway on the property, per submitted site plan.
- Driveway is to be thirty-six feet (36') long and nine feet (9') wide, brick pavers in Glen Gery color, laid in a running bond patten; the apron is to be concrete, finished per City of Columbus specifications.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (0-5-0) DENIED

Reasons for Denial:

German Village Commission Guidelines (p. 126): Whenever possible, curb cuts for driveways should be avoided, and alleys should be used for access to a parking area or garage at the rear of the lot.

GVC Guidelines Amendments (2005):

CURB CUTS Construction of new curb cuts (for driveways) is generally not appropriate.

The following factors may be considered in determining whether a new curb cut is appropriate.

- The new curb cut is from an alley.
- No on-street parking is eliminated, as a result of the new curb cut.
- A variance is not required for the new curb cut.
- Pedestrian flow is not impeded by the new curb cut.
- The new curb cut does not diminish the streetscape, including, but not limited to, the front or side yard parking of motor vehicles.
- Off-street parking of motor vehicles, created as a result of a new curb cut, does not create an infringement upon a neighboring residence, such as exhaust fumes from the motor vehicle onto a neighboring patio or into a neighboring home.
- The new curb cut does not create a public safety hazard, including, but not limited to, the hazard that may be created by the backing in or out of a driveway onto the street.

**5. 15-3-7**

**290 East Sycamore Street**

**Sycamore Property Group, LLC (Applicant/Owner)**

Demolition

- Demolish contributing, severely deteriorated and leaning two-story frame dwelling.

Construct New Single-Family Residence

- Plans for reconstruction on the site include a two-story single family home in approximately the same footprint, and a new two car garage.

*Following the staff report the Chair called members of the public wishing to comment:*

<b><u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u></b>	<b><u>Issues/Comments:</u></b>
Jay Smith 787 S. Third Street Neighboring Property Owner	Voiced support for the planned new construction. Fortunate to have the new owner.
Heidi Drake 793 S. Third Street Neighboring Property Owner	The residence is beyond repair. Voiced support for the demolition and the construction of the new single-family house.

*After the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Owner and project architect present, the following represents some of the commissioners' observations.*

Commissioner Comments/Observations:

Commissioner Ours—Requested a site visit to assess the building conditions. Expressed “mixed emotions” about mirroring the ‘ghost footprint’ for the new residence. Encouraged the project architect and owner to study the setbacks on the neighboring Sycamore Street block.

Commissioner O’Donnell—Asked for GVS comments.

Society Representative Marsom—Vacant properties in the neighborhood need to be repaired prior to getting to this stage of structural deterioration so that they can remain in place rather than be demolished whenever possible.

*After the discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Continue Application 15-3-7, 290 East Sycamore Street, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the April 7<sup>th</sup> Meeting Agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Ours/Hartke (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**6. 15-3-8**

**233½ East Livingston Avenue**

**Carolyn Gifford, G.M.C. Real Estate Investments, LLC (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, the Applicant agreed to the amendment of wood window specifications as noted, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-3-8, 233½ East Livingston Avenue, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Windows

- Remove all non-original, non-contributing, deteriorated, 1-over-1 and 6-over-1, double-hung windows on the second story.
- Install new, all wood, 1-over-1, Jeld-Wen windows on the east, west, and south elevations.
- Install new, all wood, 6-over-1, Jeld-Wen windows on the north (front) elevation.
- New wood windows are to fit in the original rough openings on all elevations exactly.
- Window cut-sheet with specifications to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for inclusion in the property file.
- Replace any/all brick mold, as necessary, to match existing in-kind, like-for-like.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all windows and trim in accordance with industry standards, to match existing color; like-for-like.

MOTION: Ours/O’Donnell (4-0-1) [Abstain-Hartke] APPROVED

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEWS**

[NOTE: Commissioner Hartke abstained from Application #15-3-11]

**7. 15-3-11**

**564 South Sixth Street**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**Michael & Deena Robinson (Owner)**

*Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant/owner and the project architect, the Commissioners’ present discussed the project conceptually and the following represents some of their observations.*

Commissioner Comments/Observations:

Commissioner Ours: Not opposed to plan ‘A’ but the overhang may present building construction issues. Noted “there is a hardship here”. Requested two drawings showing the new garage at twenty feet wide and nineteen feet wide (20’ W & 19’ W)

General Comments: Garage—One overhead door might work if the overhangs on the garage can be four inches wide (4” W).

Conceptual Review

- Add second story to the one-story rear frame addition.
- Add rear porch.
- Construct new two car garage.

NO ACTION TAKEN

[NOTE: Commissioner Hartke returned to the meeting at the conclusion of the review of Item #7.]

**8. 15-3-12**

**758 City Park Avenue**

**Mariellen M. Antonelli (Applicant/Owner)**

Following the staff report and presentation by the applicant/owner and the project architect, the Commissioners present discussed the project conceptually and the following represents some of their observations.

Commissioner Comments/Observations:

- More delineation of the new roofline on the rear is needed; the proposed new roof should not tie into the existing roof.

Conceptual Review

- Construct second story addition over existing rear one story addition.

**STAFF APPROVALS**

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

• **15-3-1**

**700 South Fifth Street**

**William Hugus Architects (Applicant)**

**Jay & Susan Kasey (Owner)**

Approve Application #15-3-1, 700 South Fifth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Repair Windows

- Examine all six (6) double hung windows on the frame accessory structure connected to existing garage and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows.
- Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Install new, metal, half-round gutters and round, metal down spouts of the appropriate size on north and south elevations of frame accessory structure. Finish color is to match trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile systems needed to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Repair Wood Siding

- Prepare all wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval prior to application of the finish coat.

[Panzer]

• **15-3-2**

**135 East Beck Street**

**Jim & Bow Nicholson (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-3-2, 135 East Beck Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Existing Fence with New Fence

- Remove deteriorated wood privacy fence in the rear yard.
- Install a new, six foot high (6' h), wooden fence in the rear yard in the same location as the existing wood fence. Style of the new wood fence is to match existing: Board-on-board, six foot high (6' h), wood fence with all vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts with the finished side out-facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).
- Fence is to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for fence is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **15-3-3**

**634 South Grant Avenue**

**Roger D. Worth (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-3-3, 634 South Grant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Gutters

- Remove the existing, deteriorated ogee gutter and down spouts and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, 5", ogee gutters and corrugated downspouts to match existing or new half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Remove Non-Contributing Siding

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing vertical wood siding to expose the original wood siding.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair/replace any/all damaged and deteriorated underlying original wood siding with new wood siding to match the original horizontal beveled lap siding in profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the vertical siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the main house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Paint all siding and trim with an appropriate exterior paint; paint color chips for the finish coat on siding and trim are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **15-3-4**

**874 Mohawk Street**

**Isabelle Billet (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-3-4, 874 Mohawk Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace/Repair Exterior Doors

- Remove two (2) existing, deteriorated, non-original exterior side doors on the south elevation.
- Replace with new solid core, all wood custom doors installed in the existing door jambs; one door is to be half-light and the other is to be four or six-panel, per German Village Guidelines, Drawing #13 (page 60); hardware to be installed, per submitted specifications.
- Set on 1½ pair 3½" x 3½" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- All existing transoms to remain in place. If glass is broken or missing, clean any/all remaining debris from sash, and install new glass to fit the sash.

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sills with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile to match existing.
- All new wood to be primed and painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint existing half-light door on the west elevation (front); prepare surface of the wood door using the appropriate hand tools and prime with an exterior primer.
- Finish color on all doors is to be Pantone “Green Gables” (PN9090).

- **15-3-14**

**628 South Grant Avenue**

**Robert McNitt (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-3-5, South Grant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red” or “Gray.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

Repair/Replace Gutters and Downspouts

- Examine all box gutters on the main roof and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer’s specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Remove the attached, metal, ogee gutters, as necessary, on the front porch and rear addition and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new, ogee style metal gutters to match style of existing, and of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Replace deteriorated and non-functional downspouts, as necessary; replace with new round metal downspouts in the appropriate locations and of the appropriate size to assure proper drainage. Downspouts are to be painted to match the siding color.

- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material.
- Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick which matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture. New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content (A mortar mix formula of 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement is recommended.)

Porch Repair

- Remove all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary.
- Install new wood trim elements (banister and post exterior pieces). All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prime any/all new wood per manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all wood trim as per existing paint color schedule.

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS**

**IX. NEW BUSINESS**

*[Commissioner Ours abstained from the discussion of Application #15-3-13]*

• **15-3-13**

**157-59 Thurman Avenue**

**BBCODESIGN/Bhakti Bania (Applicant)**

**Trust of Kenneth G. Hass (Owner)**

*Request to discuss the feasibility of redevelopment plans for the property prior to sale and transfer. Drawings have been submitted.*

Commissioner Comments:

- Need more information on the condition of the existing structures and history of the site. Need to determine which of the existing are contributing.
- The proposed development seems very dense for this part of German Village; lacks green space; the parking lot is likely to be an issue.
- Unit #8 is too close to Thurman Avenue if considered an addition; if it is designed as a separate infill residence on Thurman it would need a principle entrance on that façade.
- Lot coverage will need to be looked at as well as any other zoning variances.
- Complete documentation will be required of any structures that are approved for demolition.
- Need more detail on the architecture of the proposed structure; a large, monolithic structure may work against the density concerns.

**X. ADJOURNMENT**

**XI. ADJOURNMENT – 6:05 pm. MOTION: Hartke/ O'Donnell/ (5-0-0) ADJORNED.**