

**GERMAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**February 3, 2015**

**German Village Meeting Haus – 588 S. Third Street**

**Commissioners Present:** Charissa Wang-Durst, Terrence O'Donnell (arr. 4:15pm), James Panzer, Ned Thiell, Brett Leukart, Mark Ours (arr. 5:20pm), Anthony Hartke

**City Staff Present:** Cristin Moody

**German Village Society Staff Present:** Sarah Marsom

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 4:06 p.m.
- II. NEXT MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 PM (NOON), February 24, 2015.  
50 WEST GAY STREET (BEACON BUILDING)
- III. NEXT COMMISSION HEARING – TUESDAY, March 3, 2015.
- IV. APPROVAL OF REGULAR MEETING MINUTES, Tuesday, January 6, 2015.  
MOTION: Thiell/Durst (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- V. STAFF APPROVALS – The German Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approval items above as listed, and enters them into the formal record. Abstentions (if any) are shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Thiell/Durst (5-0-0) APPROVED.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

**1. 15-2-6**

**75 East Sycamore Street**

**Michael Nycz (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-2-6, 75 East Sycamore Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

**Replace Rear Door**

- Remove non-original, non-contributing patio doors on rear of the house.
- Replace with new double, all wood, Pella Architect Series French doors, per submitted specifications.
- New doors are to be painted white, to match existing color.

MOTION: Thiell/Durst (5-0-0) APPROVED.

**HOLDOVERS**

**2. 14-12-26**

**874 Mohawk Street**

**Isabelle Billet (Applicant/Owner)**

At the request of the applicant, remove Application #14-12-26 from the agenda until further notice.

Replace Windows

- Remove four (4), 2-over-2, double hung windows on the second story, front elevation of the house; replace with new 2-over-2, Pella Architect Series SDL, double hung windows, to fit in the existing openings exactly.

NO ACTION TAKEN.

3. **15-1-21**

**799 Mohawk Street**

**Blostein Overly Architects (Applicant)**

**Jane & Ian Flores (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-1-21, 799 Mohawk Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Rear Addition and Garage

- Construct new single story attached garage and two-story rear addition, per submitted plans and specifications.
- The addition and garage are to have asphalt shingle roofing from the Approved Shingle List, wood lap siding with wood trim, wood windows and doors and an overhead, flush panel wood garage door.
- Remove one mature spruce tree from rear yard.
- Remove non-historic garden shed from rear yard.

Driveway

- Remove brick pavers from existing driveway and relay as ribbon drive with a solid parking pad in front of new garage, per submitted site plan. New drive is to be laid using salvaged brick and new brick to match color and size, as needed. Brick pavers are to be laid in a herringbone pattern with grass in center strip.
- Remove existing driveway apron and pour new concrete apron in adjusted location, further from south property line, with partial center grass strip, per submitted site plan.
- Remove existing concrete porch steps and install new poured concrete porch steps, per submitted site plan. Any new railing for these steps is to be submitted for German Village Commission review prior to installation.

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new brick paver sidewalk in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary. Brick pavers are to be laid in a herringbone pattern, to match adjacent brick sidewalk.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Durst (5-1-0) APPROVED [Thiell].

4. **15-1-22**

**799 South Third Street**

**William Hugus Architects, Ltd. (Applicant)**

**John Knitter (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-1-22, 799 South Third Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

New Single Family Residence

- Construct new, two-story, single family home on the property, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Roof is to be asphalt shingle from the Approved Shingle list with a metal ridge roll; siding is to be dark gray brick, per submitted sample, with matching gray mortar on the front half and Hardie Plank lap siding on the rear with Hardie fiber cement trim, gutters are to be half round with round metal downspouts; foundation is to be split-faced concrete block on the front portion and parged concrete on the rear.
- Windows and doors are to be Lincoln brand, all wood units in configurations as shown on the approved plans with 2-over-2 SDL on all double hung windows;
- Window and door openings on the brick portion of the structure are to have solid limestone lintels and sills.

- One skylight on the north facing roof slope is to be a low profile Velux skylight.
- Front porch is to have five inch (5") square posts, simple wood railing, and concrete foundation and poured concrete steps; two entrances on the south elevation and one on west elevation (rear) are to have a poured concrete steps.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Durst (5-1-0) APPROVED [Thiell].

5. 15-1-23

**910 City Park Avenue**

**Eric & Elaine Moehring (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-1-23, 910 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Windows

- Repair or replace all existing, deteriorated windows on south half of duplex.
- Replacement windows for first and second story are to be Loewen brand, all wood, 2-over-2 windows to fit in existing rough openings exactly, per submitted specifications. Two arch-topped windows (one on the south elevation and one on the east elevation) are to be replaced with new, 2-over-2, arch-topped windows, to match existing in shape and proportion. All new exterior wood trim is to match existing in dimension and profile.
- Replacement windows for the third story are to be Loewen brand, all wood, awning style windows, to fit in the existing rough openings exactly.

Repair / Replace Exterior Casings & Sills

- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing casing and/or sill with new wood of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Prepare, prime, and paint all casings and sills in accordance with industry standards. Finish color is to match existing, or if new color is chosen, a color chip is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to application of the paint.

MOTION: Thiell/Leukart (5-2-0) APPROVED [Ours, O'Donnell].

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

6. 15-2-7

**700 South Fifth Street**

**William Hugus Architects (Applicant)**

**Jay & Susan Kasey (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-2-7, 700 South Fifth Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Remove Front Porch

- Remove non-original front porch.
- Install new concrete steps at front entrance, per submitted plans.

Replace Door

- Remove existing, non-original front door and install new, solid core door in existing door jamb.
- New door to be a four-panel door set on 1 1/2 pair 3 1/2" x 3 1/2" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

Construct Addition

- Construct new one and a half story frame addition on the south side of the existing two story structure with a one story connector.
- Add second story over existing one story rear addition.

- Alter existing one story rear addition to replace hipped roof with a rear gable.
- Roofing is to be asphalt shingles from the Approved Shingle List with metal ridge roll and standing seam metal, as noted on the plans.
- Siding is to be brick veneer on cottage addition and four inch (4") wood lap siding with wood trim on rear addition; foundation is to be split-faced block.
- All windows and doors are to be Marvin wood units. Cut sheets for the windows and doors are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.
- All work to be completed per revised plans and specifications.

Garage Alteration/Addition

- Remove six feet (6') of the east end of existing concrete block garage structure; finish new wall to match rest of the existing garage.
- Clad existing concrete block structure with thin brick to match the house addition in color, texture and size.
- Construct twenty-two by twenty-two foot (22' x 22'), two car addition to the garage, per submitted plans.
- Addition is to have asphalt shingle roof from the approved shingles list with a metal ridge roll, and six inch K style gutters.
- Walls are to be brick veneer with color, texture and size to match the house addition.
- Three single garage doors (one on existing structure and two on the addition) are to be flush wood overhead doors.
- Limestone headers to be installed over all three garage doors.
- Remove plywood from gable window on frame accessory structure connected to the existing garage. Add new fixed or operable, single pane, wood window to fit in existing rough opening exactly.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Thiell (4-1-1) APPROVED [Harke opposed, Panzer recused].

**7. 15-2-8**

**275 East Whittier Street**

**James Negron (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-2-8, 275 East Whittier Street, as amended, with all clarifications noted:

Restore Front Porch

- Remove non-original, non-contributing front porch enclosure and restore front porch in the same location, per submitted plans and specifications.
- Install a thirty-six inch wide, single, double hung window centered below the second story east window and install new four panel or half light wood door with transom window, centered below the second story west window. Replace all missing wood trim to match dimensions and profile of existing wood trim on the house.
- Existing roof, foundation and stone steps are to remain.
- Repair existing bead board ceiling; install new wood columns, to match one existing column, new wood handrail and new wood fascia.
- Install new cedar shingle siding on the original exterior wall, to match existing siding on the house.
- All new wood is to be primed and painted with an appropriate exterior paint; a color chip for the finish color is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to applying the paint.

Remove Exterior Stairs

- Remove non-original, exterior metal stair case on the side of the house.
- Replace non-original door at the second story entrance with a new, 1-over-1, wood window to fit in the original opening; width is to match window directly below. Fill in remaining opening below window with siding to match existing.

MOTION: Durst/Hartke (7-0-0) APPROVED.

**8. 15-2-9**

**391 East Livingston Avenue**

**Michael E. Cox, Danite Sign Co. (Applicant)**

**William Stewart & Celeste Malvar-Stewart (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, presentation by the applicant, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-2-9, 391 East Livingston Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Install New Signage

- Install a new thirty-seven by forty-two inch (37" x 42"), non-illuminated, projecting sign, per submitted plans and specifications.
- The sign is to be constructed of panted aluminum with vinyl lettering and mounted to the brick façade on an aluminum bracket.

MOTION: Our/Durst (4-1-2) APPROVED [O'Donnell opposed, Hartke recused, Thiell abstained].

**STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

**9. 15-2-10**

**792 City Park Avenue**

**John N. Schilling Inc. (Applicant)**

**Catherine Hart (Owner)**

*Following the staff report, ensuing discussion, and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #15-2-10, 792 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Dormer Roof

- Remove rubber roofing on front and rear dormers, and dispose of all debris properly.
- Supply and install a new standing seam metal roof with an 18" wide panel configuration. Snap on metal seams shall be 1" in height and bent to the curvature of the roof. All clips shall be fastened through the deck to the roof purlins. Materials shall be 24 gauge, galvalume, as by Dimensional Metals. Color to be standard galvanized metal "gray".
- Supply and install all new edge flashings, roof penetration flashings and wall copings in accordance with manufacturer specifications and the SMACNA standard details.
- Provide all accessory items and components necessary for a complete and watertight roof system.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Durst (7-0-0) APPROVED.

**STAFF APPROVALS**

(The following applicants do not need to attend the hearing)

• **15-2-1**

**910 City Park Avenue**

**Eric & Elaine Moehring (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-2-1, 910 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted.

Replace Door

- Replace deteriorated, non-original rear door with new three-quarter light wood door.
- Door is to be set on 1½ pair 3½" x 3½" butt hinges; hinge locations to be determined by the existing jamb.
- Wood units to be stained or painted; finish all six sides. Finish color is to match existing, or if new color is chosen, a paint/stain color chips is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.
- Remove plywood over transom window and install new wood transom window to fit in the original opening exactly.
- Cut sheets for the door and transom window are to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office prior to installation.

• **15-2-2**

**911 City Park Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Dan & Michele Lavon (Owner)**

Approve Application #15-2-2, 911 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Expand Rear Patio

- Extend brick paver patio in rear yard to a total of fifteen by twenty-one feet (15' x 21'), per submitted site plan.
- New brick pavers are to match existing in color and size as closely as possible, and are to be laid in the same pattern as existing.

• **15-2-3**

**610 South Third Street**

**APCO Industries (Applicant)**

**Steven Davies (Owner)**

Approve Application #15-2-3, 610 South Third Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Replace Storm Windows

- Remove any/all deteriorated storm windows on the house and install new, ProVia, low profile, double track, metal storm windows.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

• **15-2-4**

**849 City Park Avenue**

**Bill Schmidt, Brothers Roofing & Const. (Applicant)**

**Robert Mullinax (Owner)**

Approve Application #15-2-4, 849 City Park Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
[ ] GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	[ ] English Gray Slate
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

• **15-2-5**

**913 South Lazelle Street**

**Christina Ching (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #15-2-5, 913 South Lazelle Street, as submitted, with all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:  

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red" or "Gray."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents.

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS**

**IX. NEW BUSINESS**

*Commissioners discussed the proposed new Staff Approvals for landscaping and a hanging signs, as developed in the Commission Chairs meetings. Draft language for Staff Approval specifications under consideration:*

Landscaping – rear yard

- Install new landscaping in rear yard or side yard not visible from the public way, per submitted landscape plan.
- New plantings, including [species] bushes, shrubs, and flowers are to be planted in accordance with applicable landscaping industry standards for height, spacing and light requirements.
- Retaining walls and seat walls are to be no more than 30 inches in height, constructed of [brick, stone, concrete] per applicable landscaping industry standards; a material sample is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office.
- Water feature apparatus to be no more than 4 feet in height.

Landscaping – front yard

- Remove overgrown/deteriorated/dead shrubs in front yard.
- Install new foundation plantings in front of house, per submitted landscape plan.
- New plantings, including [species] bushes, shrubs, and flowers are to be a sufficient distance from the house to avoid any damage to any historic masonry foundation or walls, and in accordance with applicable landscaping industry and building maintenance standards.
- Replace any existing, historic/appropriate, [stone/concrete] retaining walls with new stone/brick to match existing in materials, height, width, and all detailing.

Remove Existing Driveway and Install New Brick Driveway

- Remove deteriorated, damaged [concrete/brick/stone] driveway and apron and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.

- Install a new apron and driveway in the same location and of the exact same size and dimension as the existing in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards.
- New apron is to be brick pavers to match existing, adjacent, brick public sidewalk. New driveway is to be one of the following: 1) Solid, brick pavers laid in a basket weave, herringbone, or running bond pattern; 2) Ribbon driveway with two brick paver strips and grass or other ground cover in between.
- A sample of the paver material is to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office for final approval prior to installation.

#### Hanging Signs

- Hanging signs eligible for staff approval are to be proportional to the building, site, and setback. The maximum size of a hanging sign eligible for staff approval is 12 square feet (3' x 4'), however site specific constraints, as determined by H.P.O staff in coordination with the commission, will often require a smaller scale in order to meet the standards for appropriateness. **H. P. O. staff has the discretion to send any proposed signage to the whole commission for review.**
- Sign brackets are to be of a simple design and should avoid excessive detailing (scroll-work or other ornaments).
- Signs are to be placed on the building in a manner that: 1) maintains a minimum of 10 feet of clearance between grade and the bottom of the sign, 2) the top of the sign is no higher than 15 feet from grade, 3) all attachments to the building are through mortar joints only, and 4) placement does not obscure or destroy any significant architectural detail.
- Any illumination of the sign is to be created via external fixtures, such as 'gooseneck' lamps. No more than two (2) light fixtures per sign are approvable.
- Signage graphics may include the business name, logo, function and/or street number or address and related artistic treatments. Phone numbers, websites, and lists of services are not approvable.
- Signage submission must include: 1) a completed application, 2) a measure 2D signage rendering including signage bracket, and 3) current photographs of the property and/or a photographic rendering of the proposed sign in place.

*Commissioners noted a number of concerns with the wording and maximum sign size. Suggestion was made to change the maximum size of a hanging sign to six square feet, and add language indicating that signs between six and twelve square feet may be staff approved in certain areas.*

*Following the discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve the proposed Staff Approval specifications for Signage as presented.

MOTION: Ours/O'Donnell (0-7-0) NOT APPROVED.

Approve the proposed Staff Approval specifications for Landscaping as presented.

MOTION: O'Donnell/Durst (4-3-0) APPROVED [Thiell/Hartke/Ours].

**X.** ADJOURNMENT – 7:09 pm. MOTION: O'Donnell/Hartke (7-0-0) ADJORNED.