

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, January 16, 2014
50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'

Commissioners Present: Steward Gibboney, Beth Clark, Tom Wolf, Charles Rowan, Robert Palmer, Daniel Morgan.

Commissioners Absent: Abbie Faust.

Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Connie Torbeck, Randy Black.

I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:17 p.m.

II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING— Thursday, February 13, 2014.

III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING— Thursday, February 20, 2014.

IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF

V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, December 19, 2013 MEETING MINUTES
MOTION: Clark/Rowan (4-0-2)—[Palmer, Morgan] Meeting Minutes APPROVED

VI. APPROVAL OF Thursday, January 9, 2014 SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES
MOTION: Clark/Rowan (4-0-2) [Wolf, Palmer] Meeting Minutes APPROVED

VII. STAFF APPROVALS
The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD

VIII. PUBLIC FORUM

IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

HOLDOVERS

1. 13-7-24

742 Wilson Avenue

Ida Williams (Applicant/Owner)

Following the report by the Historic Preservation Office staff and again upon confirmation of the deteriorated condition of the existing wood-frame garage which is not reparable and presents public safety concerns, direct the Historic Preservation Officer to consult with the property owner and City Building Department staff regarding the demolition of the existing frame garage, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #13-7-24, 742 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Officer to place it on the April 17, 2014 regular meeting agenda as a Holdover for further discussion of the plan development for the new garage in the same location.

Garage Work as Previously Approved (July 18, 2013)

- **Note that the garage condition constitutes a safety concern and requires removal down to the slab floor and disposal of all debris per Columbus City Code.**
- Clean the site and make any/all repairs to the existing concrete slab as necessary.

- **The Applicant/Owner is required to submit plans for a new garage in the same location to the Historic Preservation Office staff for placement on the Historic Resources Commission meeting agenda within six months for further review.**
- **The approval of the demolition is specific to the 742 Wilson Avenue site only and is made in the best interest of public safety.**

MOTION: Rowan/Palmer (6-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-1-5a & b

286 W. Weisheimer Road

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Individually Listed Columbus Register Property

Bill & Caity Henniger (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, discussion of Sanborn Map research prepared by Assistant Historic Preservation Officer Torbeck, and subsequent review by the commissioners present, Application #14-1-5 was separated into parts 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action, corresponding motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-1-5a

Approve Application #14-1-5a, 286 West Weisheimer Road, individually listed Columbus Register property, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Demolish Rear Shed/Garage/Pool

- Remove Shed, Garage, & Pool
- The demolition is approved based on the research provided by the Historic Preservation Office staff that indicates that the structures are not original to the site and are not contributing resources.

MOTION: Palmer/Rowan (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-1-5b

Approve Application #14-1-5b, 286 West Weisheimer Road, individually listed Columbus Register property, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Rear Addition/Ancillary Buildings/Landscape

- Construct One-Story Garage/Pool House
- Install New In-Ground Pool
- Construct New 1 ½ Story Addition
- **All work is approved as per submitted plans reviewed and dated January 16, 2014. Any/all cut sheets and finish details to be supplied to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.**

MOTION: Palmer/Rowan (6-0-0) APPROVED

3. 14-1-6 a & b

734 Wilson Avenue

Scott Baker/SBA Studios (Applicant)

Old Oaks Historic District

Heather Rottenberg (Owner)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report, the presentation by the Applicant, and subsequent review by the commissioners present, Application #14-1-6 was separated into parts 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action, corresponding motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-1-6 a

Approve Application #14-1-6a, 734 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Demolish Garage

- Due to the existing deteriorated conditions of the structural elements on all elevations, demolish existing frame garage.
- Garage demolition is to be performed only after submittal of current interior and exterior photos with accurate measurements and building footprint to the Historic Preservation Office staff for inclusion in the permanent

property record.

- Remove existing trees near the garage.
- Dispose of any/all debris per Columbus City Code.

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-1-6 b

Approve Application #14-1-6b, 734 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Rebuild Front Porch

- Rebuild deteriorated front porch with existing materials with all finish details and dimensions to match the original front porch; like-for-like. All front porch dimensions and finish materials and details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with Commissioners Wolf and Morgan prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

New Garage

- Construct a new, ADA accessible, 22' x 22' garage with rear entry access to the residence.
- New garage to be located per submitted site plan.
- Existing driveway to remain in place and repair as necessary.
- Final construction drawings with all finish details, cut sheets, materials samples, etc. to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with Commissioners Wolf and Morgan prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Rear Addition

- Construct a new, two-story addition per submitted site plan.
- Install a covered chair-lift and rear porch per submitted site plan.
- Final construction drawings with all finish details, cut sheets, materials samples, etc. to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with Commissioners Wolf and Morgan prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

4. 14-1-7

705 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Tom D. Lang (Applicant/Owner)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion a was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-1-7, 705 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Rehabilitation

Applicant/Owner is directed to work with the Historic Preservation Officers for final review and approval of all exterior finish details and specifications on the rehabilitation of the vacant residence in accordance with the Historic Resources Commission Guidelines for all of the exterior elements.

- Replace Roof
- Repair Box Gutter System
- Repair Front Porch Complete
- Remove & Replace Rear Porch
- Repair Siding & Trim
- Repair All Windows
- Install New Front and Rear Entry Doors
- Paint Exterior
- Certificate of Appropriateness to be issued upon final review and approval by H. P. O. staff of all finish materials, cut sheets, manufacturers' brochures, etc.

MOTION: Clark/Wolf (6-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-1-1**

151 East Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Karen C. Myers (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-1, 151 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted.

Repair Fascia/ Rear Porch

- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia and trim with new wood of same dimension, as necessary, per the submitted photograph.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia; color to match the existing trim color.

• **14-1-2**

367 Chittenden Avenue

New Indianola Historic District

Patrick Costello (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-2, 367 Chittenden Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted.

Install New Gutters & Downspouts

- Replace any/all deteriorated, damaged, and/or missing wooden fascia with new wood of matching dimension as necessary; like-for-like. [Prime and finish coat all new and bare wood with exterior primer and finish coat to match the existing trim color; like-for-like.]
- Install new, metal, ogee gutters and new, metal, corrugated downspouts in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-1-3**

100 East Frambes Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Greg Gunnell/Continental Contractors (Applicant)

Cooper Properties, VI LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-3, 100 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Retain the existing Timberline "Charcoal" asphalt shingles on the shallow pitch (top) area of the roof, as installed.
- Remove all asphalt shingles on the mansard area of the roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

[] CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

[] Stonegate Gray

[] GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

[] English Gray Slate

[] Weathered Slate

[] Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

[] Estate Gray

[] Tamko (standard 3-tab) [] Antique Slate

- The use of cut shingle tabs for all ridges is appropriate for this specific, non-contributing building.

• **14-1-4**

69 East Frambes Avenue

C & C Associates (Applicant)

Indianola Forest Historic District

Mark Sturgeon (Owner)

Approve Application #14-1-4, 69 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted, and with all clarifications as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the front porch roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Certain Teed (standard 3-tab) "Nickel Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."

Note: This does not include approval of any slate on the main roof or dormers.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the front porch and main roof, as needed, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

- Nominations and Appointments for 2014 Historic Resources Commission officers:

Nominate Steward Gibboney to serve as the 2014 Historic Resources Commission Chair.
Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) NOMINATED

Vote on the nomination called for and unanimous consent received. Gibboney confirmed as 2014 Chair.

Nominate Charles Rowan to serve as the 2014 Historic Resources Commission Vice-Chair.
Clark/Palmer (6-0-0) NOMINATED

Vote on the nomination called for and unanimous consent received. Rowan confirmed as 2014 Vice-Chair.

Nominate Steward Gibboney to serve as the 2014 Historic Resources Commission Fiscal Officer.
Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) NOMINATED

Vote on the appointment called for and unanimous consent received. Gibboney confirmed as 2014 Fiscal

Officer.

XII. ADJOURN

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (7:10 p.m.)