

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
Thursday, February 20, 2014
50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'**

Commissioners Present: Steward Gibboney, Beth Clark, Tom Wolf, Charles Rowan, Abbie Faust,
Daniel Morgan (Arrived—6:26).

Commissioners Absent: Robert Palmer.

Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Randy Black.

I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:17 p.m.

II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING— Thursday, March 13, 2014.

III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING— Thursday, March 20, 2014.

IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF

V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, January 16, 2014 MEETING MINUTES
MOTION: Clark/Rowan (5-0-0)—Meeting Minutes APPROVED

VI. STAFF APPROVALS

The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Clark/Rowan (5-0-0) ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD

VII. PUBLIC FORUM

VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

IX. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

HOLDOVERS

1. 13-7-20—(Approved temporarily 8/15/13)

344 South High Street

Alexandria Capital LLC (Applicant)

South High Commercial Group Historic District

In the absence of the Applicant, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #13-7-20, 344 South High Street, South High Commercial Group Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the March 20, 2014 regular meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Rowan/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

2. 14-2-6a, b, c & d

280 Reeb Avenue

Individually Listed Columbus Register Property

City of Columbus Real Estate Management [c/o Barry N. Bryant, P. E.] (Applicant/Owner)

14-2-6a

Following the presentation by the project architect, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded into the permanent record.

Recommend approval of Application #14-2-6a, 280 Reeb Avenue, Columbus Register Individual Listing, as presented.

Variance Recommendations

- Section 3212.27—Minimum Number of Parking Spaces—Reduce from the one hundred and fifty-three (153) required spaces to seventy-three (73) total spaces.
- Section 3212.49—Setbacks—Reduce the code required parking setback off of Eighth Street and the unnamed alley to zero feet (0') to accommodate the existing parking spaces and reduce the parking setback from twenty-five feet to two and one half feet (25'-2.5') on Innis Avenue and from twenty-five feet to five feet (25'-5') on Washington Avenue.

MOTION: Clark/Foster (6-0-0) RECOMMEND APPROVAL

14-2-6b

Following the presentation by the project architect, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded into the permanent record.

Recommend approval of Application #14-2-6b, 280 Reeb Avenue, Columbus Register Individual Listing, as presented.

Repair Historic School Building

- Install New Shingle Roof Complete.
- Spot point masonry on all elevations as necessary.
- Replace all non-original windows with new metal windows of historically appropriate dimensions and style.
- Replace all exterior doors with new metal doors.
- Install new concrete handicapped accessible ramp per submitted plans.
- Install new landscaping per submitted plans.
- Additional information regarding the age of the existing rooftop ventilation system to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review prior to removal.
- All final construction details regarding the handicap accessibility ramp to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the C. of A.

[Note: A majority of the commissioners present recommend minimizing the design of the connector of the historic building to the new addition.]

MOTION: Clark/Morgan (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-2-6c

Following the presentation by the project architect, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded into the permanent record.

Recommend approval of Application #14-2-6c, 280 Reeb Avenue, Columbus Register Individual Listing, as presented.

Existing Non-contributing Addition

- Demolish the 1968 addition on the east side of the original building.

MOTION: Clark/Morgan (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-2-6d

Following the presentation by the project architect, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded into the permanent record.

Recommend approval of Application #14-2-6c, 280 Reeb Avenue, Columbus Register Individual Listing, as presented.

New Addition

- Construct a new, one-story addition.
- **Final construction drawings to be reviewed and approved by the sub-committee of Mr. Wolf and Mr. Morgan prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the new addition.**
- The mansard roof is not to be included in the connector design.
- Applicant to return for additional Historic Resources Commission review of the monitor component if it is determined to be a necessary alternate during further design development considerations.
- Final color scheme for the new addition to be submitted for further review prior to final approval of that finish detail.

MOTION: Morgan/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEWS

3. 14-2-7

172 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District Buckeye

Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual Review

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

- Seeking to stay within the existing zoning stipulations with no variances required.

After the presentation by the project architect the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Faust—The addition roof line being lower than the existing residence is appropriate. Is the intent to make the connector look like a part of the addition?

Commissioner Morgan—Voiced concern with the appearance of a constructing a ‘second house’ on the site which does not read as an addition.

Commissioner Rowan—Voiced concern for the loss of the visual distinction between the new and the historic residences. The new building massing should not compete with the historic building massing.

Commissioner Clark—The proposed infill is not appropriate as presented however an addition can be appropriate at historic properties.

Commissioner Wolf—More information is needed regarding the neighboring building context. The new infill should not look like the primary houses that face the street in the Indianola Historic District. The new infill should take its design cues from the house elements that face the alley in the district. There is not a lot of precedent for houses that face the alley in the Indianola Forest Historic District.

No Action Taken

4. 14-2-8

118 East Frambes Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual Review

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

- Seeking to stay within the existing zoning stipulations with no variances required.

After the presentation with the project architect the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Gibboney—Appears appropriate “at first glance”. Will need additional details for further review.

Commissioner Faust—The proposal is appropriate as it looks like an addition and not a separate residence.

Commissioner Morgan—The proposed infill needs to look more like an addition rather than two separate houses on the same parcel. This is the fundamental design issue on all three sites.

Commissioner Rowan—The existing historic houses “should be the start of the story”. The proposed massing appears overpower the existing structure.

No Action Taken

5. 14-2-9

50 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual Review

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

After the presentation with the project architect the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Gibboney—Voiced support of the “lower feel”. Going in the right direction initially.

Commissioner Rowan— Voiced concern with the loss of the sleeping porch on the existing house.

No Action Taken

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS:

6. 14-2-10

222 Rustic Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Nicholson Builders/Attn.: Bryan Copley (A)

Bill Leiter (O)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion a was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-10, 222 Rustic Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications indicated.

Replace Bay Window Sash

- Remove the damaged bay window sash and dispose of all debris per Columbus Building Code.
- Install new, Marvin, (73 19/32” x 97 19/32”), Bronze Clad Exterior, Primed Pine Interior, ‘Clad Ultimate Casement Picture’ window unit in the exact same location.
- All finish trim to match existing; like-for-like.

MOTION: Rowan/Clark (4-2-0) [Wolf, Morgan] APPROVED

7. 14-2-11

154 East Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Lisa DuVernay (Applicant/Owner)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion a was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-11, 154 East Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications indicated.

Replace One (1) Window—(First Floor/East Elevation)

- Remove the deteriorated first floor window sash (i. e. first floor east elevation closest to front porch) and dispose of all debris per Columbus Building Code.
- Install new, wood sash to match existing in style, size, and dimension; like-for-like.

MOTION: Morgan/Foster (6-0-0) APPROVED

8. 14-2-12

729 Wilson Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Crystal Corley (Applicant/Owner)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion a was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-12, 729 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications indicated.

Paint Exterior Soffits

- Prepare all exterior, wooden soffit surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid

prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.

- Finish coat of all soffit surfaces to be Sherwin Williams "Dover White" (SW #6385).
- Prepare all previously painted stone lintels and sills on all elevations for repainting.
- Repaint all previously painted stone lintels and sills on all elevations. Finish color to match the existing, original stone color as closely as possible. Color chip to be submitted to and approved by the Historic Preservation Office for inclusion in the property file.

Install Hand Rails—(Front & Rear Steps)

- Install new, black metal hand rails at front service steps and rear entry steps.
- **All hand rail style to match the black metal rail design submitted for the "flat part of the back steps" in all locations.**

MOTION: Rowan/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

9. 14-2-13

77 West Jeffrey Place

Old Beechwold Historic District

Jim & Annette Lutz (Applicant/Owner)

Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion a was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-2-13, 77 West Jeffrey Place, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications indicated.

Enclose Rear Covered Patio

- Establish a sub-committee, consisting of Commissioners Faust and Morgan and Historic Preservation Office staff, for final review of all finish details to include, but not limited to: window replacement specifications, siding details, and to make final determination regarding the appropriateness of the porch enclosure to the residence constructed in 1965.
- Direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to work with the Applicants/Owners to conduct a site visit and provide additional photos of the existing siding and windows.

MOTION: Faust/Morgan (6-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-2-1**

370 East Eleventh Avenue

New Indianola Historic District

Wagenbrenner Dev., Inc. (A)

Weinland Park Properties LLC (O)

Staff Approval is granted for Application #14-2-1, 370 East Eleventh Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, for renewal of the exact same work as previously approved (per C. of A. #13-2-1) and as indicated :

- Upon analysis of the documentation provided by the applicant and the on-site determination of the Historic Preservation Officer that the building is beyond repair due to severe masonry and structural deterioration caused by water infiltration caused by inappropriate encapsulation of all exterior stone and brick surfaces, approve the proposed demolition of the residential property located at 370 East Eleventh Avenue, New Indianola Historic District.
- Measurements and detailed photos of all elevations are required as a condition of the approved demolition due to the unusual and compelling circumstances. All documentation to be placed in the permanent property file in the City Historic Preservation Office.
- Recommend reuse of any/all building materials in the sister building located immediately west and indicated as Building #19 on the site plan provided.
- Request that the applicant provide the H. R. C. with plans for the reuse of the site including, but not limited to, a detailed landscape plan.

• **14-2-2**

299 East Eleventh Avenue

New Indianola Historic District

Wagenbrenner Dev., Inc. (A)

Weinland Park Properties LLC (O)

Staff Approval is granted for Application #14-2-2, 299 East Eleventh Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, for renewal of the exact same work as previously approved (per C. of A. #13-2-2) and as indicated :

- Upon analysis of the documentation provided by the applicant and the on-site determination of the Historic Preservation Officer that the building is beyond repair, approve Application #14-2-2 (previously #13-2-2), for the proposed demolition of the property located at 299 East Eleventh Avenue (indicated as Building #1 on the site plan provided), New Indianola Historic District.
- Measurements and detailed photos of all elevations are required as a condition of the approved demolition due to the unusual and compelling circumstances. All documentation to be placed in the permanent property file in the City Historic Preservation Office.
- Request that the applicant provide the H. R. C. with plans for the reuse of the site including, but not limited to, a detailed landscape plan.

• **14-2-3**

280 Reeb Avenue

Individually Listed Columbus Register Property

City of Columbus Real Estate Management (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #14-2-3, 280 Reeb Avenue, Columbus Register Listed Property, as submitted and with all clarifications noted:

Perform Window Study

- Remove four (4) existing windows as indicated on West and North Elevations (dated 1/8/14) and perform examination necessary for final determination of finish treatment.
- Basement windows 'A' and 'B' on east end of North Elevation to be removed for placement of hood exhausts for duration of the construction phase.
- Windows 'C' on West Elevation and 'D' on North Elevation to be infilled with plywood and replaced with new window units when final window replacement is determined and approved by the Historic Resources Commission.
- The subject windows are identified in the submitted stamped elevations dated 1/8/14.

• **14-2-5**

Multiple Addresses

Old Oaks Historic District

Columbia Gas of Ohio/Heidi Zacher (Applicant)

Move gas meters from the interior to the exterior at each respective property listed, with all clarifications noted as follows:

- All meters to be placed on rear elevation of building, if possible, or in the least visible exterior location to be determined upon final site inspection by Columbia Gas of Ohio field inspectors.
- Gas meter relocation program: The exterior meter location will be determined by Columbia Gas in accordance with all applicable codes and safety standards.
- All property locations to be as per submitted address list stamped and dated February 3, 2014.

X. OLD BUSINESS

XI. NEW BUSINESS

Emergency Staff Approval Issued

• **14-2-4**

689 S. Ohio Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Hattie Gunn (Applicant/Owner)

A fire occurred on December 24, 2013 and a Notice of Unsafe Building Order(#SRTS1301790) was issued (January 3, 2014). The property owner met with the Historic Preservation Office staff on site (1/17/14) and an application has been submitted and current photos taken for the property file. The Certificate of Appropriateness has been issued as a Staff Approval.

Approve Application #14-2-4, 689 South Ohio Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, with all clarifications noted:

Vacate Due to Fire Damage

- **This approval is issued in the interest of public safety and per all applicable City of Columbus Building Codes.**
- **In accordance with Building Order #SRTS1301790 issued following a December 24, 2013 fire, vacate the property in accordance with Columbus Building Code Chapter 4109.02.**
- Select one (1) of the following two approved appropriate options for the fire damaged residence:

Option 'a':

Demolish the Building

- Remove the existing fire damaged, wood frame residence completely and dispose of all debris per Columbus City Code.
- Clean the site in accordance with all City Building Codes and reseed the lawn completely.
-

Or

Option 'b':

Secure the Building

- Obtain any/all necessary secure permits from the City Building Department and secure the structure in accordance with City Code Chapter 4109.09.

Board up Windows & Doors

- Install plywood over all window and door openings on all elevations to temporarily secure the building. Plywood to be exterior grade, 3/4", smooth on one side, and primed on all sides prior to installation. Plywood to be cut to fit the existing window jamb; outside-to-outside. Jamb and sash to remain in place.

Submit Rehabilitation Plans

- Submit all exterior rehabilitation plans to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by the Historic Resources Commission at a future commission meeting.

XII. ADJOURN

MOTION: Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:37 p.m.)