

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA**

Thursday, August 21, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘B’

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions please call the city's Historic Preservation Office at 645-8040. A Sign Language Interpreter to "Sign" this meeting will be made available for anyone with a need for this service. Sign language interpreters must be schedule by calling 645-7964 or TDD 645-3293 at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the scheduled meeting.

- I. CALL TO ORDER**
- II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING—THURSDAY, September 11, 2014.**
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING—THURSDAY, September 18, 2014.**
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF**
- V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, July 17 19, 2014, MEETING MINUTES**
- VI. STAFF APPROVALS**
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM**
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

HOLDOVERS

1. 14-7-9

718 Kimball Place

Old Oaks Historic District

Lance R. Keeler (Applicant/Owner)

An application and photographs have been submitted.

Remove Sleeping Porch

- Demolish the existing, two-story sleeping porch, per the submitted photographs.

The following is taken from the July 17, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-7-9, 718 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 21, 2014 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review of the proposed demolition of the two story rear porch.

MOTION: Palmer/Wolf (5-0-0) CONTINUED

2. 14-7-8

350 South High Street

Callif Bonding, LLC (Applicant)

South High Commercial Historic Group

Ty Safaryan/350 Gray Gables Realty (Owner)

Two 48" x 104" canvas, banner signs were approved in 2003. The banners were removed and new banners installed prior to review and approval. An application, photographs, and drawings for new signs have been submitted. Application #14-7-8 was continued at the July 17, 2014 to allow additional time to present the necessary information required for final action (see minutes attachment below).

Install New Signs

- Remove the two (2) existing banner signs, that were installed prior to review and approval, per the submitted photographs.
- Install two (2) new signs, one at each end of the existing covered walkway, per the submitted drawings.
- New signs to be double-face fabricated aluminum pans, measuring 8' 3" Wide by 4' High.
- Graphics to be computer cut vinyl letters/numbers, reading "Andy Callif, Bail Bonds, 614/221-0100."
- Background color to be Dark Green; Text and inset line to be Pearl Grey.

Continue Application # 14-7-8, 350 South High Street, South High Commercial Historic Group, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 21, 2014 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

The following is taken from the July 17, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

Following the presentation by counsel for the Applicant and the property owner, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-7-8, 350 South High Street, South High Commercial Historic Group, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 21, 2014 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

The Applicant should submit photographs and drawings to allow for a comprehensive review of all existing and proposed signage for Callif Bonding at 350 South High Street and 22-24 E. Mound Street as well as a copy of the lease for 350 South High Street as it relates to tenant signage.

MOTION: Morgan/Palmer (5-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. 14-6-10b

529 East Town Street

Matthew Loving/Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

East Town Street Historic District

N. J. Loving Apartments Ltd. (Owner)

Revise he previously approved south and east façade window and north façade door details on the previously approved elevations (dated 6/4/14).

South Elevation

- Reduce the size of the south façade window per submitted South Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

East Elevation

- Eliminate one window per submitted East Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

North Elevation

- Install three (3), half-lite, wooden service doors per North Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

The following is taken from the June 19, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 14-6-10, 529 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Demolition and Construction of New Carriage House w/New Addition

- Retain existing brick building.
- Remove frame portion of carriage house completely. [NOTE: This partial demolition is allowed as a result of damage sustained by the fire.]
- Construct new, two-story low sloped roof connector to new one and one-half (1 ½) story addition per submitted plans and specifications.

- Construction drawings and specifications to be reviewed and approved by the H. P. O. staff prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Morgan/Rowan (5-0-0) APPROVED

4. 14-8-3

513 East Rich Street

East Town Street Historic District

Columbus Sign Company/Attn.: Mark Borden (Applicant)

Jones Law Group/Attn.: Eric Jones (Owner)

Clarifications and revisions have been made to the previous submittal for reconsideration.

Replace Existing Sign Face

- Remove existing sign panel facings (approved 7/2/12).
- Install new, non-illuminated, aluminum sign faces per submitted drawings: White Graphics on Black Background.

The following is taken from the July 17, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-7-15, 513 East Rich Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Replace Existing Sign Face

- Remove existing sign panel facings (approved 7/2/12).
- Install new, non-illuminated, aluminum sign faces per submitted drawings: White Graphics on Black Background.

MOTION: Morgan/Palmer (2-2 [Wolf - Faust]-1 [Morgan]) DENIED

Reasons For Denial:

- *The proposed modification to the sign face does not meet the original intent of the sign, as approved in 2004.*
- *The style, size, and amount of signage for a building partially depends on the size, location, and architectural style of the building. Ensure that the size and placement of a new sign compliments the building's architectural style. (CRHP Architectural Guidelines, p. 72).*
- *C.C.C. 3116.11(12) Standards for Alteration:
In passing upon appropriateness, the Commission shall consider, in addition to any other pertinent factor, the architectural characteristics typical of structures in the District or Listed Property, the historical and architectural value and significance, architectural style, general design, arrangement, texture, material, and color of the architectural feature involved and its relation to the architectural features of other contributing properties in the immediate neighborhood.*
- *C.C.C. 3116.13(C) Signs are regulated by Chapters 3375, 3377, 3379, and 3381, but shall also be in keeping with the character of the adjacent environment. Excessive size and inappropriate placement results in visual clutter and shall be avoided. A good sign should relate harmoniously to exterior building material, texture, and color; express a simple, clear message; and contain a minimum number of words.*

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

5. 14-8-4

467 N. High Street

North Market Historic District

Harper Architectural Studio/Attn.: Scott Harper (A)

Barleys Brewing Company (O)

An Application with current photos, plans, and elevations with detailed work specifications has been submitted.

Remove Storefront Portion

- Remove portion of existing storefront wall (at vestibule).

Install New Entry

- New wall to be in line with the existing exterior wall per submitted plans.
- Existing support post to be enclosed in the new exterior wall.
- All existing storefront glass to remain.

- Existing exterior lighting to remain.
- All new materials to be wood and glass matching the existing storefront materials; like-for-like.
- Install new kickplates on both entry doors.
- Awning to remain as existing.

Install New Signage

- Install new, two foot six inch by two foot six inch (2' 6" x 2' 6"), hanging blade sign from black metal bracket per submitted measured drawing.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:45 P.M.

6. 14-8-5

546-558 East Rich Street

East Town Street Historic District

Christopher Bruzzese/Berardi & Partners (A) Community Housing Network/Attn.: Laurie Southerland (O)

An Application with detailed work description has been submitted. The Applicant will bring samples to the August 21st meeting for commission review.

Window Head & Sill Materials Change

- Change from previously approved limestone window heads and sills on all elevations to synthetic limestone product per submitted sample.

The following is taken from the November 21, 2013 Meeting Minutes:

Approve Application #13-11-19, 546-558 East Rich Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new three-story building on existing asphalt parking lot in accordance with all previously reviewed and Conditionally Approved building plans.
- Approve for all necessary items noted:
 - Site Plan and all proposed site alterations & changes from the existing condition(s).
 - All elevations. Windows to be 2-over-2 sash units only.
 - Complete exterior finish materials (samples provided at 11/21/13 meeting)list including: all masonry types; cement finishes/colors; metal screening details; window and door details; exterior paint samples; lighting fixtures; signage details; landscaping details; etc.
 - Recommendation for the Complete Variance and Zoning package following review by the City Zoning Division.

[NOTE: Certificate of Appropriateness #13-11-19 to be held on file pending submittal of revised construction drawings with 2-over-2 windows indicated on all elevations.]

MOTION: Morgan/Clark (6-0-0) APPROVED

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

7. 14-8-6

50 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual

The project was presented previously and reviewed conceptually at the March 20, April 19, and May 19, 2014 meetings and was withdrawn at the June 19th meeting by the Applicant to allow additional time for further plan development. An Application has been submitted with new site plan, revised elevations and floor plans. The project architect has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer. ,

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

- Rehabilitate the existing rear frame sun-porch.
- Construct new rear frame addition with flat roof frame connector per submitted plans.

The following is taken from the March 20th Meeting Minutes:

After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Wolf—“Struggling more” with this proposal than the other two sites in the same district. The existing sun-porch represents historic fabric of the original residence and its loss from the original building with the proposed new addition is a concern. Appreciates the design considerations being explored but needs to analyze further before making further comment.

Commissioner Gibboney—Recommends a flat roof be explored for the addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN

The following is taken from the April 17th Meeting Minutes:

After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Gibboney—Is in agreement with Commissioner Wolf’s observation at the March 20th meeting that the original sleeping porch on the rear of the existing residence is an important historic element. The stepping in of the new addition from the historic building is the appropriate direction.

Commissioner Morgan—Requests that the plan and elevation details and scale match what is shown on the site plan for all future reviews.

Commissioner Clark—Agrees that the new addition is improved from the March submittal.

Commissioner Wolf—Continuing to struggle with the proposal at this address. Has visited the site and the brick is laid in a Flemish Bond on all elevations indicative of a more expensively designed home when constructed. The historic sleeping porch on the rear (i.e. north) elevation is an important contributing element that the treatment of which still needs resolution.

Commissioner Faust—Agrees that the sleeping porch treatment needs to be handled appropriately. Recommends reducing the size of the new addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN

The following is taken from the May 15th Meeting Minutes:

After the presentation by the project architect, the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Wolf—Removal of the historic sleeping porch on the rear (i.e. north) elevation is not appropriate. Another design resolution needs to be found. Consider a new design alternative to the treatment of the sleeping porch which is contrary to the City standards for preservation.

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:15 P.M.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

8. 14-8-7

676 Kimball Place

City of Columbus Hosing Division/Attn.: Randi Arnette (A)

Old Oaks Historic District

Montrese Hollar (O)

The project is a in the Old Oaks Historic District Pilot Project (City Development Department Housing Funding Program). An application with detailed work description and specifications and current photos, site plan, floor plan, and elevations has been submitted. [Note: The house has been vacant for over a decade. Repairs are necessary to for re-use and ensure sustainable contributing residence in the district.

Previous Garage Space—Rear Yard

- Retain existing concrete slab in previous garage location.
- Screening details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval and inclusion in the property file.

Tuck Pointing—Chimney & Foundation & Front Porch Columns

- Check all mortar joints on all elevation for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place. Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")
- Repair front porch columns above grade, as necessary, like-for-like. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")

Front Porch

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing T & G, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, T & G, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, T & G wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; color to match the existing.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated and missing wood trim (i. e. brackets, beaded ceiling etc.) with new wood of exact same dimension and profile, like-for-like.
- New front porch skirting at grade to match the original front porch wood skirting in design and dimension; like-for-like.
- Repair and/or replace the front porch banisters/hand rails as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails; like-for-like.

Rear Porch

- Remove rear frame porch completely and dispose of all debris per Columbus City Code.
- Rebuild two-story frame porches in same style, dimension, and material as existing historic rear two-story porches; like-for-like.
- Rear porch skirting at grade to match the front porch wood skirting in design and dimension; like-for-like.
- Measured drawing to be submitted to the H.P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission (H. R. C.) prior to construction.

Fence

- Install six foot high (6' H), board-on-board, dog-eared, wood fence per submitted description:
 - Fence to start approximately two-hundred thirty-five feet (235 LF) with two (2) thirty-six inch wide (36"W) gates;
 - Starting at the south side of the house to the east of the first side window adjacent to the front porch;
 - Extending south to the property line;
 - Continuing north to the northeast property line; west to the northeast corner of the house;
 - Terminating at the northwest corner of the residence.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.

- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
Certain Teed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Gutters and Down spouts

- Install new, metal, half-round gutters and round, metal down spouts of the appropriate size on all elevations. Finish color to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile systems needed to insure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Replace Exterior Doors

- Remove all six (6) deteriorated and damaged exterior entry doors (1 front, w rear, 1 north side and 2 front porch French doors) and dispose according to Columbus City Code.
- Install new, wooden doors and hardware of appropriate style.
- Door cutsheets to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with the H. R. C.

Repair Siding

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated siding with new siding of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Windows—All Elevations

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows. Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension.
- **Downsizing of one (1) kitchen window requires additional review by H. P. O. staff in consultation with the H. R. C. prior to approval.**

Basement Windows—All Elevations

- Examine existing basement window sash and jamb frame and make any/all necessary repairs to make operable and secure including but not limited to: glass replacement, sash replacement, replacement of all or part of the deteriorated, missing and damaged existing jamb.
- All new materials to be of exact same profile, type and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- [Note: Interior bars or screening can be installed for security in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.]

Mailbox & House Numbers

- Install new mailbox and house numbers following approval of submitted cutsheets by H. P. O. staff..

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-8-1**

1617 Bryden Road

Barry Cummings/Chelsi Technologies, LLC (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Senora Jelks (Owner)

Approve Application #14-8-1, 1617 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Air Conditioner Condenser Unit

- Install a new concrete pad and air conditioner condenser unit in the rear yard, per the submitted location photograph and site plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

• **14-8-2**

1765 Bryden Road

Chad A. Seiber (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

Approve Application #14-8-2, 1765 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary.
- All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint schedule to be Sherwin Williams: Main Body Color = "Mindful Gray (SW #7016); Trim Color = "Dovetail Gray" (SW #7018).

Repair/Replace Window Sashes

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes. Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows. Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with custom made new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension. Window face trim to be repaired and/or replaced as necessary with all new wood to be of exact same profile; like-for-like.

Repair Box Gutters/Soffits/Eaves Complete

- Examine all box gutters, soffits, and eaves on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Replace Existing Fence

- Remove all deteriorated wood fencing from all elevations and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, six foot high (6' H), wooden fence in the same location. Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), wood fence with all vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Stain chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to its application.
- Location and dimension of all gates to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Repair/Replace Sidewalks & Patio

- Repair and/or replace existing concrete patio and sidewalks as necessary. Any/all new concrete to be of exact same dimensions and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards; like-for-like.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

- **Chairs Meeting Ongoing**—3:00 p.m., Monday, August 25, 2014

X. NEW BUSINESS

- **Historic District Signage Special Meeting**—1:00 p.m., Thursday, September 11, 2014—50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor Room 'B'

XI. ADJOURN

