

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION**  
**MEETING MINUTES**  
**Thursday, August 21, 2014**  
**50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'**

**Commissioners Present:** Steward Gibboney, Abbie Faust, Daniel Morgan, Robert Palmer, Tom Wolf.

**Commissioners Absent:** Charles Rowan, Beth Clark.

**Historic Preservation Office Staff Present:** Randy Black, Connie Torbeck.

- I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:17p.m.
- II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING— Thursday, September 11, 2014.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING— Thursday, September 18, 2014.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, July 17, 2014 MEETING MINUTES  
MOTION: Morgan/Palmer (5-0-0) — Meeting Minutes APPROVED
- VI. STAFF APPROVALS  
The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Palmer/Morgan (5-0-0) —ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS  
*[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]*

**HOLDOVERS**

**1. 14-7-9**

**718 Kimball Place**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Lance R. Keeler (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-7-9, 718 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 18, 2014 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Palmer/Wolf (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**2. 14-7-8**

**350 South High Street**

**South High Commercial Historic Group**

**Callif Bonding, LLC (Applicant)**

**Ty Safaryan/350 Gray Gables Realty (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-7-8, 350 South High Street, South High Commercial Group Historic District, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 18, 2014 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Wolf/ Palmer (5-0-0) CONTINUED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

**3. 14-6-10b**

**529 East Town Street**

**Matthew Loving/Juliet Bullock (Applicant)**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**N. J. Loving Apartments Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-6-10b, 529 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

**South Elevation**

- Reduce the size of the south façade window per submitted South Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

**East Elevation**

- Eliminate one window per submitted East Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

**North Elevation**

- Install three (3), half-lite, wooden service doors per North Elevation drawing dated August 6, 2014.

Any all Finish Details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness and date-stamped construction drawings.

Motion: Faust/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

**4. 14-8-3**

**513 East Rich Street**

**Columbus Sign Company/Attn.: Mark Borden (Applicant)  
(Owner)**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Jones Law Group/Attn.: Eric Jones**

*Following presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-3, 513 East Rich Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

**Replace Existing Sign Face**

- Remove existing sign panel facings (approved 7/2/12).
- Install new, non-illuminated, aluminum sign faces per submitted drawings: White Graphics on Black Background.
- New sign face drawing to be revised to remove the white line between the 'JLG' and 'Law Group LLC' bands with final revised plan to be submitted to and approved by, the H. P. O. staff prior to issuance of the C. of A.
- The approval of the sign face is specific to the 513 East Rich Street site due to the existing sign can and the change of current tenants with the understanding by the commission and the property owner that the stall and type of signage may be changed in the future with H. R. C. review and approval as per City Code Chapters 3116 and 3117.

MOTION: Morgan/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

**5. 14-8-4a & b**

**467 N. High Street**

**Harper Architectural Studio/Attn.: Scott Harper (A)**

**North Market Historic District**

**Barleys Brewing Company (O)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant and Owner and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, Application # 14-7-10 was divided into items "a" and "b" for clarity of action. The following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

*Application 14-8-14a was discussed and initially continued pending receipt of additional information regarding the historic configuration of the storefront. The applicant returned to the meeting with a photo showing the storefront prior to the alterations and the review was re-opened, the proposal analyzed in consideration of the new information. After additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

**14-8-4a**

Approve Application #14-7-10a, 467 N. High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Remove Storefront Portion

- Remove portion of existing storefront wall (at vestibule).

Install New Entry

- New wall to be in line with the existing exterior wall per submitted plans.
- Existing support post to be enclosed in the new exterior wall.
- All existing storefront glass to remain.
- Existing exterior lighting to remain.
- All new materials to be wood and glass matching the existing storefront materials; like-for-like.
- Install new kickplates on both entry doors.
- Awning to remain as existing.

MOTION: Palmer/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

**14-8-4b**

Approve Application #14-7-10b, 467 N. High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Signage

- Install new, two foot six inch by two foot six inch (2' 6" x 2' 6"), hanging blade sign from black metal bracket.
- Existing gooseneck light to remain in place in its current location.
- Applicant to submit final bracket details to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Palmer/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

**6. 14-8-5**

**546-558 East Rich Street**

**East Town Street Historic District**

**Christopher Bruzzese/Berardi & Partners (A)**  
**(O)**

**Community Housing Network/Attn.: Laurie Southerland**

*Following presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-3, 548-558 East Rich Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Window Head & Sill Materials Change

- Change from previously approved limestone window heads and sills on all elevations to synthetic limestone product per submitted sample; rockcast product in 'Charlotte tan'.

[Note: The rockcast product in 'Charlotte tan' is appropriate for use in the new infill project being constructed in 2014. It closely matches the historic limestone head and sill material common in 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> Century buildings found in the East Town Street Historic District, and represents a proper reflection of 21<sup>st</sup> Century building materials used in new construction.]

MOTION: Morgan/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

7. 14-8-6

50 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual/Final

*Following presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, Application #14-8-6 was converted to Final Review by consensus agreement of all parties present. A motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-6, 50 East Lane Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

- Rehabilitate the existing rear frame sun-porch.
- Construct new rear frame addition with flat roof frame connector per submitted plans.
- **Certificate of Appropriateness #14-8-5 is to be held on file pending final review and approval of the construction drawings by the H. P. O. staff in consultation with Commissioner Faust.**

MOTION: Faust/Palmer (5-0-0) APPROVED

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

8. 14-8-7

676 Kimball Place

Old Oaks Historic District

City of Columbus Hosing Division/Attn.: Randi Arnette (A)

Montrese Hollar (O)

*[Background: The project is in the Old Oaks Historic District Pilot Project (City Development Department Housing Funding Program). An application with detailed work description and specifications and current photos, site plan, floor plan, and elevations has been submitted. The house has been vacant for over a decade. Repairs are necessary to for re-use and ensure sustainable contributing residence in the district.]*

*Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-7, 676 Kimball Place, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Previous Garage Space—Rear Yard

- Retain existing concrete slab in previous garage location.
- Screening details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval and inclusion in the property file.

Tuck Pointing—Chimney & Foundation & Front Porch Columns

- Check all mortar joints on all elevation for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place. Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")
- Repair front porch columns above grade, as necessary, like-for-like. New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings")

Front Porch

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing T & G, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- It is recommended that all new, T & G, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, T & G wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; color to match the existing.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated and missing wood trim ( i. e. brackets, beaded ceiling etc.) with new wood of exact same dimension and profile, like-for-like.
- New front porch skirting at grade to match the original front porch wood skirting in design and dimension; like-for-like.
- Repair and/or replace the front porch banisters/hand rails as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch banisters/hand rails; like-for-like.

#### Rear Porch

- Remove rear frame porch completely and dispose of all debris per Columbus City Code.
- Rebuild two-story frame porches in same style, dimension, and material as existing historic rear two-story porches; like-for-like.
- Rear porch skirting at grade to match the front porch wood skirting in design and dimension; like-for-like.
- Measured drawing to be submitted to the H.P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Historic Resources Commission (H. R. C.) prior to construction.

#### Fence

- Install six foot high (6' H), board-on-board, dog-eared, wood fence per submitted description:
- Fence to start approximately two-hundred thirty-five feet (235 LF) with two (2) thirty-six inch wide (36"W) gates;
- Starting at the south side of the house to the east of the first side window adjacent to the front porch;
- Extending south to the property line;
- Continuing north to the northeast property line; west to the northeast corner of the house;
- Terminating at the northwest corner of the residence.

#### Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
Certain Teed	Carriage House (dimensional)	Stonegate Gray
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

#### Gutters and Down spouts

- Install new, metal, half-round gutters and round, metal down spouts of the appropriate size on all elevations. Finish color to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile systems needed to insure proper drainage away

from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.

Replace Exterior Doors

- Remove all six (6) deteriorated and damaged exterior entry doors (1 front, w rear, 1 north side and 2 front porch French doors) and dispose according to Columbus City Code.
- Install new, wooden doors and hardware of appropriate style.
- Door cutsheets to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval in consultation with the H. R. C.

Repair Siding

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated siding with new siding of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Windows—All Elevations

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes.
- Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows. Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension.
- Downsizing of one (1) kitchen window requires additional review by H. P. O. staff in consultation with the H. R. C. prior to approval.

Basement Windows—All Elevations

- Examine existing basement window sash and jamb frame and make any/all necessary repairs to make operable and secure including but not limited to: glass replacement, sash replacement, replacement of all or part of the deteriorated, missing and damaged existing jamb.
- All new materials to be of exact same profile, type and dimension as the original; like-for-like.
- [Note: Interior bars or screening can be installed for security in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Mailbox & House Numbers

- Install new mailbox and house numbers following approval of submitted cutsheets by H. P. O. staff.

MOTION: Morgan/Palmer(4-0-1) [Wolf] APPROVED

9. 14-8-8

**862 Bryden Road**

**Benchmark Roofing (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Elizabeth & Jerald Sadoff (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-8, 676 862 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Front Porch Shingles

- Remove the existing asphalt shingles on the front porch roof only (300 sq. ft.)
- Install ice and water shield on entire front porch roof.
- Install new, CertainTeed, Carriage house, dimensional shingles; color to be “Colonial Slate.”
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red”.

[Note: The Historic Resources Commission recommends that the CertainTeed Carriage House “Colonial Slate” color shingle be considered by all Columbus historic district commissions for addition to the Staff Approved Shingles List.]

MOTION: Palmer/ Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

## **STAFF APPROVALS**

- **14-8-1**

**1617 Bryden Road**

**Barry Cummings/Chelsi Technologies, LLC (Applicant)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

**Senora Jelks (Owner)**

Approve Application #14-8-1, 1617 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Air Conditioner Condenser Unit

- Install a new concrete pad and air conditioner condenser unit in the rear yard, per the submitted location photograph and site plan.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete service sidewalks, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

- **14-8-2**

**1765 Bryden Road**

**Chad A. Seiber (Applicant/Owner)**

**Bryden Road Historic District**

Approve Application #14-8-2, 1765 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary.
- All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint schedule to be Sherwin Williams: Main Body Color = "Mindful Gray (SW #7016); Trim Color = "Dovetail Gray" (SW #7018).

Repair/Replace Window Sashes

- Examine all windows on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of upper and lower sashes. Any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows. Repair all double-hung, wood windows as needed with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Replace any/all sash which are deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with custom made new wooden sash of exact same profile and dimension. Window face trim to be repaired and/or replaced as necessary with all new wood to be of exact same profile; like-for-like.

Repair Box Gutters/Soffits/Eaves Complete

- Examine all box gutters, soffits, and eaves on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.  
Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Replace Existing Fence

- Remove all deteriorated wood fencing from all elevations and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City

Code.

- Install a new, six foot high (6' H), wooden fence in the same location. Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), wood fence with all vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Stain chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to its application.
- Location and dimension of all gates to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Repair/Replace Sidewalks & Patio

- Repair and/or replace existing concrete patio and sidewalks as necessary. Any/all new concrete to be of exact same dimensions and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards; like-for-like.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof with new or used slate of exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

**IX. OLD BUSINESS**

- **Chairs Meeting Ongoing**—3:00 p.m., Monday, August 25, 2014

**X. NEW BUSINESS**

- **Historic District Signage Special Meeting**—1:00 p.m., Thursday, September 11, 2014—50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor Room 'B'

**XI. ADJOURN**

MOTION: Palmer/Morgan (5-0-0) ADJOURNED 8:48 p.m.