

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION  
MEETING MINUTES  
Thursday, April 17, 2014  
50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'**

**Commissioners Present:** Steward Gibboney, Beth Clark, Tom Wolf, Robert Palmer, Abbie Faust, Daniel Morgan (Arrived—6:25).

**Commissioners Absent:** Charles Rowan.

**Historic Preservation Office Staff Present:** Randy Black.

**I.** CALL TO ORDER – 6:15 p.m.

**II.** NEXT BUSINESS MEETING— Thursday, May 8, 2014.

**III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING— Thursday, May 15, 2014.

**IV.** SWEARING IN OF STAFF

**V.** APPROVAL OF Thursday, March 20, 2014 MEETING MINUTES  
MOTION: Clark/Palmer (4-0-1) [Faust]—Meeting Minutes APPROVED

**VI.** STAFF APPROVALS  
The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Palmer/Clark (5-0-0) —ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD

**VII.** PUBLIC FORUM

**VIII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS  
*[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]*

**IX.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS  
*[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]*

## **HOLDOVERS**

### **1. 13-7-24**

**742 Wilson Avenue**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

**Ida Williams (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the report by the Historic Preservation Officer, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:*

Approve Application #13-7-25, 742 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, with all clarifications noted:

In accordance with the July 18, 2013 approval, the frame garage has now been removed and the Owner is directed to continue working with the Historic Preservation Office staff for the development of a final schedule and final plans to construct a new frame garage on site.

Continue Application #13-7-25 and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to give the commission a status update at the September 21, 2014 Regular Meeting and to place on the October 25, 2014 Regular Meeting Agenda for further consideration.

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (5-0-0) CONTINUED

### **2. 14-3-5a, b, & c**

**463 North High Street**

**North Market Historic District**

**Signcom Inc./Attn.: Melody Ward (Applicant)**

**Yankee Brothers LLC (Owner)**

*Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report, the presentation by the Applicant/Owner, and subsequent review by the commissioners present, Application #14-3-5 was separated into parts 'a', 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action, motions made, votes taken, and results recorded into the permanent record as indicated.*

14-3-5a

Approve Application #14-3-5a, 463 North High Street, North Market Historic District, per all clarifications noted.

Install New Signage—Front Main Entry Door(right/north door)

- Install new vinyl signage on the one (1) front entry door located to the right (i.e. north) as seen from High Street.
- New vinyl to be limited to the name 'Barburger Organic', hours of operation, and the Facebook and Twitter addresses only.
- Final text and layout to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for inclusion in the permanent property file.

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-3-5b

Approve Application #14-3-5b, 463 North High Street, North Market Historic District, per all clarifications noted.

Install New Signage—Main Door Logo

- Install new vinyl logo on the one (1) front entry door to the left (i.e. south) as seen from High Street; color to be 'white'.
- Final design and size of the logo to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Faust/Palmer (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-3-5c

Continue Application #14-3-5c for further consideration of the front window graphics proposed and direct the Historic Preservation Officer to place on the May 15, 2014 meeting agenda as a Holdover.

MOTION: Palmer/Clark (6-0-0) CONTINUED

## NEW APPLICATIONS

### 3. 14-4-3

**668 Wilson Avenue**  
**Gene A. Smith (Applicant)**  
Build New Garage

**Old Oaks Historic District**  
**David Gray ((Owner)**

- Construct new, twenty-foot wide by twenty-two foot long (20' W x 22' L), two-car, wood-frame garage per submitted plans and work specifications.

*Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report, the presentation by the Applicant/Owner, the commissioners present all noted their support of the project.*

Commissioner Morgan—Requested more finish details and dimensions. Roof slope should be the same as the house roof slope with metal ridge roll and hung gutters.

Commissioner Gibboney—Recommends single overhead door with the appearance of two overhead doors and noted Samples of various styles available.

*After the discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Upon review of Application #14-4-3, 668 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, Grant Conditional Approval of the proposed massing, height, and site placement of the proposed new garage.

- **All finish details to be submitted for final review at the May 15, 2014 Historic Resources Commission meeting.**

MOTION: Faust/Palmer (6-0-0) CONDITIONAL APPROVAL GRANTED

### 4. 14-4-4

**467 North High Street**  
**Clear Channel Outdoor (Applicant)**

**North Market Historic District**  
**467 N. High Street Condominium Association**

*Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report, the presentation by the Applicant/Owner, and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded into the permanent record.*

Approve Application #14-4-4, 467 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted.

Install Wall Sign/Graphic

- Attach advertising wall graphic to exterior of north facing wall as per submitted rendering.
- Size to be eighteen feet high by twenty-six feet wide (18' H x 26' W).
- Material to be lightweight, mesh vinyl installed with wall anchors.
- Display period to be twenty-eight (28) days; May 12 through June 8, 2014.

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (0-6-0) DENIED

#### **Reason(s) for Denial:**

Columbus City Code Chapter 3116.11(1), (2), & (5)

The following standards shall apply to evaluation of the appropriateness of a proposed alteration:

- (1) Every reasonable effort shall be made to use the property for its originally intended purpose or to provide a compatible requiring minimal alteration.
- (2) The distinguishing characteristics of the property shall not be destroyed. The removal or alteration of any historic material or distinctive architectural feature shall be avoided whenever possible.
- (5) Distinctive stylistic features and examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be treated with sensitivity.

H. R. C. Guidelines (p. 72)

- Preserve and maintain historic signage on your building.

- Ensure that the size and placement of a new sign complements the building's architectural style. For example, place a new sign on the sign band on the front façade between the first and second floors of a commercial building.

5. 14-4-5

241 Oakland Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Handyman Matters/Attn.: Scott Simmons (Applicant)

Repair/Rebuild Rear Deck

- Remove existing rubber roof and decking.
- Install new roof decking and rubber membrane per industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Repair and/or replace existing wooden hand- and foot-rails and balusters as necessary with new wood of dimension and profile in accordance with the guidelines.
- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated asphalt shingles on mansard roof with new asphalt shingles selected from the Approved Shingles List.

*Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report, the presentation by the Applicant, and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Continue Application #14-4-5, 241 Oakland Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Officer to work with the sub-committee of Commissioners Faust and Morgan and the Applicant (i.e. project contractor) to prepare the final work specifications for review and final action at the May 15, 2014 regular meeting.

MOTION: Morgan/Clark (6/0/0) CONTINUED

6. 14-4-6

529 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Matthew Loving (Applicant)

N. J. Loving Apartments Ltd.

Conceptual

*Revised plans were submitted by the submittal deadline and updated renderings were brought to the meeting for additional consideration.*

Demolition and Construction of New Carriage House w/New Addition

- Retain existing brick building.
- Remove frame portion of carriage house completely.
- Construct new, two-story low sloped roof connector to new one and one-half (1 ½) story addition.

*After the presentation by the project architect the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:*

Commissioner Morgan—Recommends reduction in roof height on the new north elevation gable element. Adding additional windows can be appropriate.

Commissioner Wolf—The proposed new north elevation looks primarily frame however that elevation is primarily wood-frame construction which raises a concern. Recommends resisting the proposal to the historic window configuration.

Commissioner Faust—Recommends pulling back the proposed north addition to expose the historic brick fabric.

NO ACTION TAKEN

7. 14-4-7

172 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

*After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:*

Commissioner Clark—Recommends submitting a landscape plan to provide screening between parking and the rear lawn. Agrees that the project appears to be moving in the right direction.

Commissioner Palmer—The project is appropriate.

Commissioner Morgan—The east and west elevation roof treatments remain a concern.

Commissioner Faust—Expressed support of the new direction taken for the addition.

Commissioner Wolf—Appears that the project design is going in the right direction.

All Commissioners—Support the submittal of a new application for final review with the necessary construction drawings and finish details at the May 15, 2014 regular meeting if the Applicant/Owner so choose.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**8. 14-4-8**

**118 East Frambes Avenue**  
**Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)**  
**Conceptual**  
Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

**Indianola Forest Historic District**

*After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:*

*After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:*

Commissioner Gibboney—The revisions made to the porch appear to be in the right direction. The window treatments are appropriate. The addition still appears to be very large in relation to the original house and is “swallowing the building”.

Commissioner Morgan—The addition should “step in” from the original building in order to maintain the visual distinction between the historic and the new. Recommends “choking it in” more.

Majority of Commissioners— Voiced support for removal of the third floor dormer and reduction of the new addition roof pitch.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**9. 14-4-9**

**50 East Lane Avenue**  
**Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)**  
**Conceptual**  
Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

**Indianola Forest Historic District**

*After the presentation by the project architect and property owner the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:*

Commissioner Gibboney—Is in agreement with Commissioner Wolf’s observation at the March 20<sup>th</sup> meeting that the original sleeping porch on the rear of the existing residence is an important historic element. The stepping in of the new addition from the historic building is the appropriate direction.

Commissioner Morgan—Requests that the plan and elevation details and scale match what is shown on the site plan for all future reviews.

Commissioner Clark— Agrees that the new addition is improved from the March submittal.

Commissioner Wolf— Continuing to struggle with the proposal at this address. Has visited the site and the brick is

laid in a Flemish Bond on all elevations indicative of a more expensively designed home when constructed. The historic sleeping porch on the rear (i.e. north) elevation is an important contributing element that the treatment of which still needs resolution.

Commissioner Faust—Agrees that the sleeping porch treatment needs to be handled appropriately. Recommends reducing the size of the new addition.

NO ACTION TAKEN

## STAFF RECOMMENATIONS

### 10. 14-4-10

**926 East Broad Street**  
**Sprit/Attn.: Rinell Saro (Applicant)**

**18<sup>th</sup> & East Broad Street Historic District**  
**Community Properties of Ohio (Owner)**  
**Attn.: Sharon Griffith Pheifer**

*Following Historic Preservation Officer Staff Report and subsequent review by the commissioners present, a motion was made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-3-10, 139 West Main Street, Columbus Register Listed Property, with all clarifications noted.

#### Install New Equipment in Existing Rooftop Cell Site

- All work to be in accordance with the submitted work specifications, cutsheets, and elevations stamped and dated 4/17/14 by the Historic Preservation Office staff.

MOTION: Morgan/Palmer (6/0/0) APPROVED

## STAFF APPROVALS

### • 14-4-1

**624 Oakwood Avenue**  
**Fabian K. Summerville (Applicant/Owner)**

**Old Oaks Historic District**

Approve Application #14-4-1, 624 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted:

#### Replace Deteriorated Retaining Wall—North of Public Steps/Walk

- Remove the damaged and deteriorated cement block retaining wall north of the front public steps/walk which is beyond repair and dispose of any/all debris per all applicable City of Columbus Codes.
- Install new cement block wall in the exact same location and in line with and matching the height and setback of the existing cement block retaining wall south of the front public steps/walk; like-for-like.
- Install the necessary drain tile in the proper locations and backfill the front (i.e. west) yard as necessary and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes.

### • 14-4-2

**87 East Northwood Avenue**  
**Muth and Company Roofing (Applicant)**

**Northwood Park Historic District**  
**David Landsman (Owner)**

Approve Application #14-4-2, 87 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted:

#### Repair Box Gutter System Complete

- Examine all box gutters on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts of the appropriate diameter and in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and

neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair Rear One-Story Flat Roof

- Remove existing, deteriorated EPDM roof and any/all deteriorated and damaged sheathing dispose of any/all debris per all applicable City of Columbus Codes.
- Install new fiberboard and fully adhered, new EPDM roofing system per industry standards and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.

**X. OLD BUSINESS**

- **Cristo Rey School Signage Update**—H. P. Officer directed to place signage package review on the May 15<sup>th</sup> regular meeting agenda for further consideration.

**XI. NEW BUSINESS**

**XII. ADJOURN**

MOTION: Clark/Palmer (6-0-0)—Adjourned (8:52 p.m.)