

DRAFT

HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

Thursday, June 19, 2014

50 W. Gay Street, Ground Floor, Room 'B'

Commissioners Present: Steward Gibboney, Tom Wolf, Abbie Faust, Daniel Morgan, Charles Rowan.

Commissioners Absent: Robert Palmer, Beth Clark.

Historic Preservation Office Staff Present: Randy Black .

I. CALL TO ORDER – 6:16p.m.

II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING— Thursday, July 10, 2014.

III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING— Thursday, July 17, 2014.

IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF

V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, May 15, 2014 MEETING MINUTES
MOTION: Faust/Wolf (5-0-0)—Meeting Minutes APPROVED

VI. STAFF APPROVALS

The Historic Resources Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Wolf/Faust (4-0-0) —ACCEPTED INTO THE PERMANENT RECORD

VII. PUBLIC FORUM

VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

HOLDOVERS

1. 14-3-5c

463 North High Street

Signcom Inc./Attn.: Melody Ward (Applicant)

North Market Historic District

Yankee Brothers LLC (Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-3-5c, 463 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Signage

- Install new pressure sensitive vinyl graphics on four (4) storefront windows (i.e. facing High Street) per submitted elevation for a period of one year (1 yr.).
- Direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place Application #14-3-5c on the June 18, 2015 regular meeting agenda for status update by the Applicant.

Motion: Faust/Morgan (4-1-0) APPROVED

2. 14-5-15b

280 Reeb Avenue

Individually Listed Columbus Register Property

MoodyNolan Architects/Rex Hagerling (Applicant)

City of Columbus Real Estate Management (c/o Barry N. Bryent, P. E.) (Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 14-5-15b, 280 Reeb Avenue, Individually Listed/Columbus Register Property, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Signage

- 'Loaves and Fishes' soup kitchen signage per submitted elevation.
- All final signage details and drawings to be submitted to the Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.
- [NOTE: Historic Resources Commission review and approval is required for any/all changes necessitated by future business model revisions by the current or subsequent tenant utilizing the 'Loaves and Fishes' building space.

MOTION: Rowan/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

NEW BUSINESS

3. 14-6-10

529 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Matthew Loving/Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

N. J. Loving Apartments Ltd. (Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 14-6-10, 529 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Demolition and Construction of New Carriage House w/New Addition

- Retain existing brick building.
- Remove frame portion of carriage house completely. [NOTE: This partial demolition is allowed as a result of damage sustained by the fire.]
- Construct new, two-story low sloped roof connector to new one and one-half (1 ½) story addition per submitted plans and specifications.
- Construction drawings and specifications to be reviewed and approved by the H. P. O. staff prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Morgan/Rowan (5-0-0) APPROVED

4. 14-6-11

518-520 North Park Street

North Market Historic District

520 North Park Street LLC. / Attn.: Jeff Lauback (Applicant/Owner)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application 14-6-11, 518-520 North Park Street, North Market Street Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Outdoor Patio Cover

- Remove existing awnings.
- Re-install awnings to improve outdoor patio cover and drainage per submitted plans.
- Final drawing(s) with any/all finish details to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for final review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Faust/Morgan (5-0-0) APPROVED

5. 14-6-12

2027 North Fourth Street

Iuka Ravine Historic District

Robert R. & Anita J. Anderson (Applicants/Owners)

Construct New Rear Addition

- Remove current rear entry/laundry room addition.
- Construct a new rear addition per submitted plans.
- Vinyl siding per submitted Certainteed Restoration Classic sample; color = “Herringbone” to match existing main house trim color. Soffit to be ‘white’.
- Certainteed Standard 3-tab, Nickel Gray asphalt shingles with metal ridge roll and valleys.
- Split block foundation above grade; color = ‘tan’.
- Relocate existing rear entry door to new rear entry with trim to match existing.
- Install new rear porch steps and landing per submitted plans.

After the presentation by the Applicants/Owners, the commissioners discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Gibboney—Encouraged the Applicants/Owners to work with the H. P. O. staff on the final paint color schedule. New plans are important for final review.

Commissioner Morgan—The addition has to be a bit more sensitive to the style of the house. The roof slope and the proportioning of the new addition are important considerations for final design approval. Recommends consideration of revising the plans to ensure that the new addition fits with the established massing and rhythm of the house. Elevations showing the existing and the proposed new addition are needed for the next review. Examples of other proposed additions to similar residences would be helpful.

Commissioner Faust—More sensitivity to the existing house north and south elevations is needed. The plans as presented are “just not there” yet and need additional refinements. North and south elevations would be helpful for the next review. The door on the side elevation may not be needed if plans are revised.

Commissioner Wolf—Voiced general support of the new addition idea as presented. Additional finish details can serve to improve the understanding of the impact of the new rear addition on the historic residence. Outlining the addition similarly to the main house might be a good choice. Window treatment as a gesture to the asymmetry should be considered.

Commissioner Rowan: Shifting the windows left or right might be a good design direction.

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-6-12, 2027 North Fourth Street, Iuka Ravine Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 17th meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Faust/Rowan (5-0-0) CONTINUED

6. 14-6-13

50 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual

Construct New Residence on the Rear of Parcel

WITHDRAWN FROM FURTHER CONSIDERATION AT OWNER’S REQUEST

7. **14-6-14a & b**

31 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Buckeye Real Estate (Applicant/Owner)

Conceptual/Final

Following presentation of the project plans by the project architect and property owner, and the ensuing review by the commissioners present, Application #14-6-14 was converted to Final Review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-6-14a

Upon review of the complete packet of information and plans submitted, convert Application #14-6-13, 31 East Lane Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, to Final Review status following consultation with the Applicant and Property Owner.

MOTION: Morgan/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

14-6-14b

Approve Application #14-6-13b, 31 East Lane Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Add Second Story to Existing Addition—(North)

- Add second story rear addition to the existing contributing property per submitted elevations.
- Roof slopes/pitches on the second floor above the new entry to reflect the traditional sleeping porch appearance and be reflected in the revised elevations and plans.
- Final construction drawings to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the established subcommittee of Commissioners Faust and Morgan.

MOTION: Morgan/Faust (5-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF RECOMMENATIONS

8. **14-6--15**

787-789 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Joseph Seifert & Jack DeBarr (Applicants/Owners)

The application was presented by the Historic Preservation Officer in consultation with the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-6-15, 787-789 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Repair Rear Frame Addition

- Repair/replace wood siding and trim on rear frame addition per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Any/all new wood siding and wood trim to be of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting—Rear Frame Addition

- Prepare all wood siding, fascia, and soffit trim elements for repainting using the appropriate hand tools. Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.

Replace Windows—Rear Sunroom Only

- Remove all non-original, non-contributing aluminum windows from rear addition sunroom.
- Install new Marvin Ultimate Double Hung wood windows in the exact same locations and of the exact same size in the existing openings.

Replace Exterior Rear Sunroom Entry Door

- Replace the deteriorated, non-original rear entry door with a new, all-wood, Marvin Ultimate French door system with transom. [Note: T remaining hinge mortise profile in the existing jamb indicates the door system was a French door system in the same jamb with the transom above as proposed.]

MOTION: Rowan/Wolf (5-0-0) APPROVED

9. 14-6-16

1096 Bryden Road /aka 224 S. Ohio

Bryden Road Historic District

Joseph Seifert & Jack DeBarr (Applicants/Owners)

The application was presented by the Historic Preservation Officer in consultation with the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-6-16, 1096 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install Front Porch Railing

- Install new metal Fortin Ironworks Model #RSS front porch railing.
- Repair or replace existing deteriorated concrete front entry steps, as necessary. New concrete steps to match existing steps in dimension and finish; like-for-like.

Replace Concrete Porch Landing

- Repair and pour new top concrete entry landing of same dimensions; like-for-like.

MOTION: Rowan/Wolf (5-0-0) APPROVED

10. 14-6-17

1104 Bryden Road/aka 224 S. Ohio

Bryden Road Historic District

Joseph Seifert & Jack DeBarr (Applicants/Owners)

The application was presented by the Historic Preservation Officer in consultation with the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-6-17, 1104 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted. Repair/Replace Front Entry Steps

- Repair or replace existing deteriorated concrete front entry steps, as necessary. New concrete steps to match existing steps in dimension and finish; like-for-like.

MOTION: Rowan/Wolf (5-0-0) APPROVED

11. 14-6-18

54-56 East Northwood Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Kathryn Epp (Applicant/Owner)

The application was presented by the Historic Preservation Officer in consultation with the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-6-18, 54-56 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install One (1) Parking Space

- Perform all necessary site work per City of Columbus Building and Zoning Code requirements.
- Install one eight foot wide by twenty-two foot deep (8' W x 22' D) parking space with either concrete pad or brick pavers at Owner's option, per submitted site plan and photos.
- New pad to be bounded on the east by the existing frame garage, on the west by the existing fence and large pine tree and new lilac shrub, on the south by new fenced back hard with gate and on the north by the existing alley.
- Install new, wood fence to match the style, size, and spacing of the existing wooden fence previously reviewed and approved (July 24, 1997).

MOTION: MOTION: Rowan/Wolf (5-0-0) APPROVED

12. 14-6-19

505 North High Street

North Market Historic District

Signcom/Attn.: Bruce Sommerfelt (Applicant)

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and the presentation by the Applicant and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-6-10, 505 North High Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Sign

- Install new blade sign from existing metal bracket.
- Install new, externally illuminated, eleven foot three and one half inch by fourteen and one half inch (11' 3 1/2" x 24") wall sign per submitted plan.
- Thinner letter stroke similar to the neighboring restaurant font (i.e. Deep Wood) is recommended.
- Lights to be mounted on the banding in line with the neighboring restaurant (i.e. Deep Wood) signage.
- Final signage plans to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Faust/Rowan (4-0-1) [Morgan] APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-6-1**

733 Oakwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Belinda Morgan (Applicant)

Jeff Kowalczyk (Owner)

Approve Application #14-6-1, 733 Oakwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, per submitted site plan and with all clarifications as noted.

Install Rear Yard Fence

- Remove all non-contributing, non-original, chain link fencing from all elevations and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, six foot high (6' H), wooden fence in the rear yard on in the same location as the existing chain link fence and as per site plan stamped and dated May 12, 2014.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six foot high (6' H), wood fence with all vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Stain chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to its application.

• **14-6-2**

1744 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Barbara J. Peterson (Applicant)

Bea Foster (Owner)

Approve Application #14-6-2, 1744 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Exterior Painting

- Repair all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood widow and trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

- Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.
- Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-6-3**

87 East Northwood Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

David Lindeman & Jennifer Werth (Applicants/Owners)

Approve Application #14-6-3, 87 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Fence:

- Remove all non-contributing, non-original, chain link and/or wood fencing from all elevations and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install a new, six foot high (6' H), dog-eared, wood fence in the rear yard on in the same location as the existing chain link fence and as per submitted site plan stamped and dated by the H. P. O. 5/21/14.
- Stringers to be placed on the inside of the yard with finished side facing out (i.e. to the neighboring properties).
- Service gates to be in locations indicated on the site plan.
- Stain chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval and inclusion in the H. P. O. property file.

- **14-6-4**

57 East Northwood Avenue

Northwood Park Historic District

Allstate Exteriors, LLC/Attn. : Brian Wilson (A) Xenia Palus(O)

Approve Application #14-6-4, 57 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Chimney Flashing

- Reflash existing brick chimney per industry standards and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations, as necessary, with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile. Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Replace Picket Fence:

- Install new, wooden, picket fence in the same location as the existing, damaged/deteriorated wooden picket fence. Service gate(s) to be in same location(s) as existing. Stringers to be placed on the inside of the yard with finished side facing out.
- Finish paint or stain chip to be submitted for final review and approval by the H. P. O. staff and inclusion in the historic district property file.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood fascia and soffit trim elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood fascia and soffit trim elements for repainting using the appropriate hand tools. Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacture's specifications. All finish colors

to remain the same as currently existing.

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, existing aluminum soffit wrap with new aluminum wrap to match the existing; like-for-like. [NOTE: This approval is for the repair of existing damaged soffit materials caused by the collapse of the neighboring property chimney and is approved in the best interest of maintaining structural integrity of the 57 East Northwood Avenue property at this time. Should the entire soffit require repairs in the future, the restoration to the historic wooden soffit will be required.]

Repair/Replace Damaged Window Screens

- Repair/replace any/all damaged window screens as necessary.

• **14-6-5**

140 East Frambes Avenue

Matt Cooper (A)

Indianola Forest Historic District

Copper Properties VIII, LLC (O)

Approve Application #14-6-5, 140 East Frambes Avenue, Indianola Forest Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all existing red asphalt shingles on the main roof and all porches and/or window bays down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles: Certainteed XT-30, color to be "Maple Red Blend".
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."
- [NOTE: The "Maple Red Blend" color, Certainteed shingle is approved for this property only and is in keeping with the historic record for the shingles previously installed on the 140 East Frambes Avenue residence and in keeping with the historic color palette for this age and style of property.]

• **14-6-6**

59 Spruce Street

Stauf's Coffee Roasters/Mark Swanson & Sullivan Builders/Joe Longenbaker (Applicant)

North Market Development Authority/Attn.: Peggy Outcalt (Owner)

Approve Application #14-6-6, 59 Spruce Street, North Market Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install Roof Vent

- Penetrate and install new 'b' vent through roof for coffee roaster per industry standards and any/all applicable City Building Codes per submitted east elevation labeled photographic rendering.

• **14-6-7**

353 East Northwood Avenue

John E. Sauer (Applicants/Owners)

Northwood Park Historic District

Approve Application #14-6-7, 353 East Northwood Avenue, Northwood Park Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all existing deteriorated asphalt shingles on the main roof and any/all porches as necessary down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.

- As necessary, replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- As necessary, replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles: Certaineed “Weathered Wood”.
- Any/all ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red”.

• **14-6-8**

682 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Will Hill/Evans & Hill (Applicant)

Jessica Jones (Owners)

Approve Application #14-6-8, 682 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Install New Door

- Retain the existing, steel, six-panel door, located on the side elevation, which was installed following vandalism that damaged the previous door.
- A new steel, fiberglass, or wood door is to be installed within one (1) year of the issuance of COA # 14-6-8 (June 10, 2015). New door to be chosen from the six (6) styles provided by Historic Preservation Office staff, i.e., full glass, single panel with glass, two panel with glass, three panel with glass, four panel, or five panel.
- Cut sheet/specifications for the new door are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

• **14-6-9**

663 Linwood Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Mid-Ohio Regional Planning Commission/Attn.: Dave Porchetti (Applicant)

Vantie Caldwell (Owners)

Approve Application #14-6-9, 663 Linwood Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Site Work

- Perform all necessary tree trimming and tree removal per industry standards and any/all applicable City of Columbus Building and Zoning Codes.
- Remove any/all dead and dying trees and/or shrubs to prevent damage to main and accessory structures on site.
- Trim all limbs encroaching on existing power lines as necessary.
- Remove all stumps below grade and reseed the yard as per industry standards and any/all applicable City of Columbus Building and Zoning Codes.
- Dispose of all debris per City Code.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. ADJOURN

MOTION: Rowan/Morgan (5-0-0)—Adjourned (8:55 p.m.)