

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA
Thursday, January 15, 2015
6:00 p.m.
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘B’**

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission’s next meeting. If you have any questions please call the city’s Historic Preservation Office at 645-8040.

If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City’s ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-6504 or email raisbell@columbus.gov at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING—THURSDAY, February 12, 2015.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING—THURSDAY, February 19, 2015.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, December 18, 2014, MEETING MINUTES
- VI. STAFF APPROVALS
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-1-4

**693 South Champion Avenue
Tom Lang (Applicant/Owner)**

Old Oaks Historic District

A complete application with detailed work description and current photos has been submitted. The rehabilitation of a previously vacant property is underway and the scope of work for this application is limited to garage repairs.

Converted to Staff Approval following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer and commission review at the January 8th Business Meeting (see below).

HOLDOVERS

2. 14-11-20

30 West Spruce Street

North Market Historic District

Bass Studio Architects/Timothy A. Bass (A)

Annunciation Greek Orthodox Cathedral (O)

An Application with detailed work description, PhotoShop renderings, and current photos has been submitted.

Install Architectural Accent (North Elevation)

- Provide a small build out with painted metal finish around the second floor former door opening per submitted plan.
- Color to be a ‘green’ accent.

Taken from the December 18, 2014 Regular Meeting Minutes:

Following the presentation of the H. P. O. Staff Report, and subsequent discussion with the commissioners present, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #14-11-20, 30 West Spruce Street, North Market Historic District, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 15th, 2015 Historic Resources Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Clark /Wolf (5-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. 14-12-10

Olentangy Boulevard/Lot 30

Old Beechwold Historic District

Joseph & Laura Williams (Applicants/Owners)

Construction drawings, photos, cut sheets, and samples have been submitted. The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Office staff. Application #14-12-10 was continued at the December 18th meeting at the Applicants' request to allow additional time for final plans preparation.

Construct a New Residence

- Request approval of all house elevation & site plan.
- Final landscape plans to be submitted at future meeting.

Taken from the November 20, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Applicant's representatives present, the following represents some of the commissioners' observations.

Commissioner Comments/Observations:

Commissioner Morgan—Scale is appropriate. "Headed in the right direction." The siding should wrap the corners and not use corner board trim treatment.

Commissioner Foster—Massing and materials seem appropriate. Recommends use of stone in the design.

Commissioner Rowan—Massing of the center roof ridge seems high. Voiced general support of the concept.

Commissioner Wolf—Height should be similar to the neighboring houses. Pediments on the dormers are a concern. Recommends consideration of "less hefty" porch columns and main entry door with sidelites. "The general (design) direction is good."

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.

4. 15-1-2

105 East Lane Avenue

Indianola Forest Historic District

Barret Jardine (Applicant)

Wayne Garland, agent for Jerry Hoffman (Owner)

A new application for final review has been submitted with floor plans, elevations, and current photos. The project was reviewed conceptually at the September 18, 2014 meeting (see attached minutes below). Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.

New Construction/Addition

- Rebuild the existing, rear, one-story structure, and add a second story (182 sq. ft.).
- Rebuild and enlarge the existing dormer, per the submitted drawings.

Taken from the September 18, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

After the presentation by the Applicant and /Owner, the commissioners present discussed the proposal and made comments, some of which are as noted:

Commissioner Gibboney—Chimney removal is an issue of concern.

Commissioner Morgan—The addition concept is interesting to consider. The second-story addition does not raise significant issues of concern.

Commissioner Faust—*The existing chimneys are original elements that need to be retained. All new windows need to match the existing windows in materials, dimensions, and profiles.*

Commissioner Rowan—*Impressed with the addition conceptually. All chimneys are to remain. HardiPlank siding is not appropriate as a replacement for original wood siding.*

Commissioner Palmer—*The chimneys on buildings located in historic districts need to remain and be rebuilt if deteriorated.*

Commissioner Wolf—*The proposed addition concept appears to be an appropriate direction for this property. Voiced concerns with replacing wood siding with HardiPlank however, it warrants further consideration. The rear portion of the residence is not so significant that it could not be covered over with the new addition if detailed appropriately.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

REHEARING

5. 15-1-3

260 N. Fourth Street/Engine House #16

Central Ohio Fire Museum & Learning Center

Columbus Register Individual Listing

City of Columbus

An Appeals Application has been submitted for the denial of Application #14-11-17 issued following the November 20, 2014 H. R. C. regular meeting. Photos, accounting review, project bids, statement of circumstance, statement of project essential to charitable purposes, mission statement, tax exempt certificate, project specifications, and window brochures have been supplied. The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.

Rehearing Request

Substantial Economic Hardship

- Denial of a Certificate of Appropriateness will result in a substantial economic burden on the applicant because the applicant cannot reasonably maintain the property in its current form.
- No reasonable alternative exists consistent with the architectural standards and guidelines for the property.

Unusual and Compelling Circumstance

- No reasonable means of saving the property from deterioration, demolition or collapse other than the applicant's proposal exists.
- Non-Profit Organization—It is infeasible to financially or physically achieve its charitable purposes while conforming to the pertinent architectural standards and guidelines for the property.

STAFF APPROVALS

• 15-1-1

1718 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Tony Tan (Applicant/Owner)

Approve application 15-1-1, 1718 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Temporary Window Board-Up

- Temporarily install plywood over the existing slider window unit in the front elevation dormer. Plywood to be exterior grade, 3/4", smooth on one side, and primed on all sides prior to installation. Plywood to be cut to fit the existing window jamb; outside-to-outside. Jamb and sash to remain in place. Size of existing masonry opening to remain the same. Plywood to be painted white, or to match existing trim color.

Replace Dormer Window (Front Elevation)

- Remove inappropriate slider window unit from the front elevation dormer.
- Install two (2), new, wood double-hung windows in the exact same opening with a wood center rail of appropriate dimension and in accordance with the preservation guidelines and standards.
- Window specifications/cut sheets to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office Staff for review and approval prior to installation.

- Installation of new windows and all associated work to be completed on or before April 30, 2015.

- **15-1-4**

693 South Champion Avenue

Old Oaks Historic District

Tom Lang (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application #15-1-4, 693 South Champion Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Rehabilitate Block Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like. Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools. Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacture's specifications. All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.
- Repair any/all damaged, deteriorated, and/or missing concrete block per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes. Any/all replacement block to match the existing in dimension and profile; like-for-like.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the garage down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Garage Door

- Amarr 'Flush Panel' Garage Door per submitted cut sheet.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

- **14-12-17**
1126-1128 Bryden Road Project Status Update
Alan Feters (Applicant/Owner)
Chimney Removal Remedies

Taken from the December 18, 2014 Meeting Minutes:

In the absence of the Applicant/Owner, continue Application #1126-1128 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the January 15, 2015 H. R. C. meeting agenda under Old Business for further consideration. Note that the Applicant/Owner is required to attend.

MOTION: Rowan/Clark (6-0-0) CONTINUED

- **DESIGN STANDARDS for RENTAL SIGNAGE in HISTORIC DISTRICTS**
The 2014 analysis of rental signage in the Historic Resources Commission review districts has been conducted. Two (2) Public Meetings to review and discuss historic district signage requirements for rental property have been held and two (2) options have been approved. At the October 22nd Special Meeting the Historic Preservation Office staff was directed to prepare a third option for review and approval.

For Rent Sign Introduction:

In the residential areas of the historic districts, signage is to be incorporated without damaging or obscuring significant architectural features and details. Rental signage options have been developed in the interest of providing consistency of location and scale throughout the Columbus Register districts. Three (3) options have been approved for rental property signage. All residential rental signage requires review and approval by the Historic Resources Commission in accordance with City Code Chapters 3116 and 3117. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required prior to the installation of any/all signage.

Option 3) for Consideration:

One (1) sign only, to be placed on the ground floor, front elevation of the residence in a location that does not damage or conceal significant architectural features or details. Sign to be no larger than eighteen inches wide by twelve inches high (max. = 18"W x 12"H). Text to be limited to phone number and contact/company name. Exact location, size, text, and materials to be submitted to the H. R. C. for review and approval prior to installation.

Two Options Previously Established

Option 1) One (1) sign only, placed in the front yard in a standard metal real estate sign frame with one bolt-in sign panel eighteen inches high by twenty-four inches wide or less (24" x 18" max.). Signs panels to be two-sided and text to be limited to phone number and contact/company name. Exact location, size, text, and materials to be submitted to the H. R. C. for review and approval prior to installation;

Or

Option 2) One (1) sign only, placed on the inside glass of a front elevation first floor window with the text to be limited to the words "For Rent" and contact name and phone number. Sign size to be no more than eighteen inches wide by twelve inches high (18" W x 12" H). Exact location, size, text, and materials to be submitted to the H. R. C. for review and approval prior to installation.

General discussion with the commissioners and preservation staff present.
NO FORMAL ACTION TAKEN.

X. NEW BUSINESS

- **Rickenbacker Woods Campus Update**

- **1314, 1324, & 1334 East Livingston Avenue**

The City of Columbus Land Redevelopment Office manages all vacant properties owned by the City. Plans for the Rickenbacker-Woods Campus have now been prepared with a schematic site plan for the redevelopment of the City-owned properties located at 1314, 1324, and 1334 East Livingston Avenue. The 1334 East Livingston Avenue parcel is the site of the Rickenbacker Boyhood Home which is listed on the Columbus Register (5/14/84) and the National Register of Historic Places (5/11/76) and is recognized as a National Landmark. The Rickenbacker-Woods Campus will provide handicap accessible offices, a community learning center, and off-street parking

Project Partners

- Buckeye Community Hope Foundation
- Kent Place Homes
- Rickenbacker-Woods, Inc.

XI. ADJOURN

