

**HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMISSION
MEETING AGENDA
Thursday, April 16, 2015
6:00 p.m.
50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room ‘B’**

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission’s next meeting. If you have any questions please call the city’s Historic Preservation Office at 645-8040.

If you need assistance in participating in this meeting due to a disability under the ADA, please call the City’s ADA Coordinator at (614) 645-6504 or email raisbell@columbus.gov at least three (3) business days prior to the scheduled meeting or event to request an accommodation.

- I. CALL TO ORDER**
- II. NEXT BUSINESS MEETING—THURSDAY, May 14, 2015.**
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING—THURSDAY, May 21, 2015.**
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF**
- V. APPROVAL OF Thursday, March 19, 2015, MEETING MINUTES**
- VI. STAFF APPROVALS**
- VII. PUBLIC FORUM**
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS**
[Note: All applicants and speakers are identified and sworn in prior to review by the Historic Resources Commission, in accordance with City standards for public meetings.]

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

- 1. 13-3-7c**
309 – 311, 315-17, & 360-362 East Eleventh Avenue (Bldgs. #3, #4, # 20) New Indianola Historic District
Weinland Park Properties LLD (Applicant/Owner)
Item #1 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the April 9, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

Revised plan for front porch service steps railings submitted with drawing. Project architect has met with the Historic Preservation Officer.

Front Porch Service Steps Handrails (Buildings #3, #4, & #20)

- Request approval of installation of metal handrail system to match the approved metal front service steps rail system installed on the other front porches in the rehab project per submitted drawing.

Taken from the March 21, 2013 approved meeting minutes:

Following the presentation by the Applicant/Owner and the Historic Preservation Office Staff Report, the application was separated into Items 'a', 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

13-3-7c

Approve Application #13-3-7c as noted:

- **The Applicant/Owner is directed to submit all future plans to the Historic Preservation Office staff for review and final approval, provided the exterior rehabilitation work plans for all other properties in the Weinland Park Properties Ltd. New Indianola Historic District project remain as per the approved plans for both the 341-45 East Eleventh Avenue (aka Building #8) and 351-57 East Eleventh Avenue (aka Building #9) plans.**
- **Applicant/Owner is directed to return to the Historic Resources Commission for further review if the project work plans are altered or change from the plans submitted and approved for Buildings #8 and #9 on March 21, 2013.**

MOTION: Rowan/Morgan (6-0-0) APPROVED

2. 15-4-6

1320 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Robert Pilarski (Applicant/Owner)

An Application with current photo, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant/Owner has consulted with the H. P. O. staff.

Replace Rear Porch Stoop

- Remove non-original, non-contributing rear porch stoop and dispose of any/all debris per City Code.
- Install new rear porch supported by two (2) wooden columns of the same style as the original front porch columns.
- Railing and baluster system on upper and lower sections to match the photo sample provided.
- Exterior paint schedule to match existing.

3. 15-4-7

1085 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Michael J. Smith (Applicant/Owner)

Item #3 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by the Historic Preservation Officer at the April 9, 2015 H. R. C. Business Meeting (see below).

An Application with current photos, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the H. P. O. staff and a site visit has been conducted. The rear porch structure was removed prior to review due to safety concerns. A file photo of the original porch structure has been included.

Landscape Plan

- Install six foot high (6'H) cedar privacy fence with two (2) service gates in same location at the existing gates per submitted site plan.
- Rear Yard Landscape Plan—Install new trees, sod and clay paver patio & service walks from rear of home to garage per submitted plan. Install new clay paver patio on east side elevation per submitted plan.

HOLDOVERS

4. 15-3-11

463 N High Street

TRIAD Architects (Applicant)

North Market Historic District

Yanke Brothers LLC (Owner)

Signage

- Install new commercial tenant signage on rear of building per submitted plan.

Taken from the March 19, 2015 Meeting Minutes:

Following the H. P. O. Staff Report and subsequent discussion with the Applicant's representative present, the following represents some of the commissioners' observations.

Commissioner Comments/Observations:

Commissioner Morgan—*Proposed signage is too large and too much for the rear location. Recommends consideration of signage scale and design approved by the H. R. C. for 444 North Front Street.*

Commissioner Faust—*Recommends one sign panel only and minimized.*

Commissioner Clark—*Voiced concern with setting a precedent for signage on the backs of buildings. Too much signage is being proposed. Recommends minimizing the signage on the rear and eliminate them if possible.*

Commissioner Rowan—*Agrees with the comments made. Hard to reconcile the amount of proposed signage with the established standards for historic appropriateness. Recommends a more subtle treatment.*

Commissioner Wolf—*Agrees that the proposed signage is "too big, too much". Does not necessarily object to signs placed on the rear of these buildings because they face what was originally a public square where the North Market stood. The rear signage should, however, be secondary to the High Street signage. Voiced concern that the front and rear signs don't appear to have a design relationship.*

Following the presentation and subsequent discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #15-3-11, 463 N. High Street, North Market Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the April 16 meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Clark/Rowan (6-0-0) CONTINUED

5. 15-3-6b

693 S. Champion Avenue

Tom Lang (Applicant/Owner)

Old Oaks Historic District

Remove Cellar Access Door—(Rear)

- Remove rear exterior cellar door entrance dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Fill in the former exterior cellar entrance area with soil, compact, and reseed per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Extend Rear Porch

- Extend existing rear porch and roof over the previous rear cellar entrance per submitted plans.

Relocate Entry Door

- Relocate the existing entry door to the front living room location as indicated in the ghosting on the exterior brick.

Taken from the March 19th Meeting Minutes:

Following the Staff Report, the presentation by the property owner, and the subsequent discussion by the commissioners present, the project was divided into Items '1' and '2' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

15-3-6b '2'

Continue Application #15-3-6b '2', 631 Wilson Avenue, Old Oaks Historic District, and direct the Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the April 16, 2015 meeting agenda as a Holdover for further consideration.

MOTION: Rowan/Faust (6-0-0) CONTINUED

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:15 P.M.

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 15-4-8

400-402 Chittenden Avenue

Trevor Blake (Applicant)

New Indianola Historic District

Roman Capital, LLC (Owner)

An Application with current photo, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant/Owner has consulted with the H. P. O. staff. The Sanborn Maps indicate a full front porch was in place historically.

Construct New Front Porch

- Construct a new, wood frame, full front porch per submitted plans.
- New porch to include: Six inch (6") wood columns with chamfered edges, wood T. & G. flooring, wood hand-and foot-rails with two inch by two inch (2" x2") wooden balusters, wood skirting, wood steps, trim details, and roof shingles selected from the Approved Shingles List.
- Finish per submitted paint schedule.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

7. 15-4-9

1617 Bryden Road

Chelsi Technologies, LLC/Attn.: Barry Cummings (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

Senora Jelks (Owner)

An Application with current photos, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the H. P. O. staff and a site visit has been conducted. The rear porch structure was removed prior to review due to safety concerns. A file photo of the original porch structure has been included.

Construct New Front Porch

- Construct a new, wood frame, two-story rear porch per submitted plans.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:45 P.M.

8. 15-4-10

296-98 Kelton Avenue

Kevin Abt (Applicant/Owner)

Bryden Road Historic District

The Applicant/Owner received approval for the vacant property rehabilitation plans at the March 20, 2014 H. R. C. meeting. Rehabilitation has been in process following that approval however window replacement costs are causing project budget issues. Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer and a new application has been submitted regarding window replacement requirements.

Window Replacement

- Replace all windows with new vinyl or metal frame window units for a period of no less than two years and no more than four years (2 yrs. to 4 yrs.)
- Current or future owner to receive Historic Resources Commission approval to replace the in appropriate vinyl and/or metal frame window units within no less than two years and no more than four years from April 16, 2015.

Taken from the March 20, 2014 Approved Minutes

Applicant/Owner and ensuing commission review and discussion at the December 19, 2013 Historic Resources Commission meeting, the following motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Approve Application #13-11-18, 296-98 Kelton Avenue, Bryden Road Historic District, with all clarifications noted.

Convert two-family unit to single-family unit per work description noted:

- **Direct the Applicant/Owner of 296-298 Kelton Avenue, Bryden Road Historic District, to schedule a meeting with the Historic Preservation Office staff to assist in preparing all exterior work specifications in accordance with the established standards and guidelines for Staff Approval. [Note: The Applicant/Owner is not required to return for further review provided all exterior work requested is staff approvable in accordance with Chapters 3116 and 3117.]**

MOTION: Clark/Faust (5-0-0)—APPROVED

Install New Windows

- Examine all windows and original window openings on all elevations and make all necessary repairs to insure proper operation of existing, repairable upper and lower sashes.
- **Where possible, any/all original wood windows are to be repaired in accordance with industry standards for wood windows with new materials of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.**
- **Replace any/all window units which are missing or deteriorated beyond reasonable repair with complete new, double-hung, wooden window units of exact same profile and dimension to the fit original opening like-for-like.**
- West Elevation Second Floor 3-Gang Window Units—Install new wood, double-hung, window units ganged in accordance with the original configuration and sized to fit the original opening.
- Any/all existing window openings to remain on the exterior of the building regardless of interior use configurations.
- One (1) window on north elevation (i. e. second window unit from northwest building corner) and one (1) window on south elevation (i. e. second window unit from southwest building corner) to be boarded to appear as a wood window double-hung unit on the outside and be painted to match the exterior paint schedule. **Final exterior window treatment drawings to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for review and approval prior to installation.**
- **Any/all additional window enclosures not indicated here to be submitted for review and approval prior to beginning the work.**

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. 15-4-11

738 Bryden Road

WSA Studio/Attn.: Todd Boyer (Applicant)

Bryden Road Historic District

SoliHull LLC (Owner)

An Application with current photo, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the H. P. O. staff.

Conceptual Review of Proposed Rehabilitation Plan

- Renovate the building to accommodate the new market rate apartments.
- Site work: Landscaping, fencing, etc.
- New Slate Roof
- New Porch
- New Windows
- Tuck Pointing
- Exterior Painting

STAFF APPROVALS

- **15-4-1**

54 West Beechwold Boulevard

Old Beechwold Historic District

Tom Gabalski (Applicant/Owner)

An Application with current photo and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant/Owner has consulted with the H. P. O. staff.

Approve application 15-4-1, 54 West Beechwold Boulevard, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Reroof Garage

- Remove all asphalt shingles from the garage and dispose of any/all debris per City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with new wooden sheathing of appropriate dimensions; like-for-like.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Shingles to match the garage addition (approved 2013) shingles as indicated:

Manufacturer:
CertainTeed

Style:
XT25

Color:
Moire Black

- **15-4-2**

4827 Olentangy Boulevard

Old Beechwold Historic District

Jeffrey & Stacia Clifton (Applicants/Owners)

An Application with current photo and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant/Owner has consulted with the H. P. O. staff.

Approve application 15-4-2, 4827 Olentangy Boulevard, Old Beechwold Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Replace Three (3) Windows

- Remove three (3) deteriorated wooden casement windows per submitted photos: (1) Upper Bathroom Unit; (1) Master Bedroom Unit; and (1) Dining Room Unit and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Install new, all-wood, Marvin windows of exact same dimension and profile; like-for-like.
- Exterior window paint color to match the existing; like-for-like.
- Make any/all stucco repairs per industry standards as needed following the window replacement.

- **15-4-3**

50 Hamilton Park

Hamilton Park Historic District

Kristin Richard (Applicant)

Prince Hall Masonic Lodge (Owner)

An Application with current photos, site plan, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer.

Approve application 15-4-3, 50 Hamilton Park, Hamilton Park Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Repair Box Gutter System

- Examine all box gutters on main roof and make any repairs and/or replace existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- New liner to extend onto the main roof deck and under the new courses of shingles required upon completion of box gutter work.

- Install new twenty-four gauge (24 ga), pre-finished, custom steel crown fascia to match the historic metal crown molding detail; like-for-like.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary.
- All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.

• **15-4-4**

571 East Town Street

East Town Street Historic District

Andrew Retzinger (Applicant/Owner)

An Application with current photos, site plan, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Office staff.

Approve application 15-4-4, 571 East Town Street, East Town Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Replace all Window Sash

- Remove deteriorated wooden window sash which are beyond repair and dispose of all debris per City Code.
- Repair all window jamb frames as necessary to accept the new wooden sash packs in accordance with manufacturer's specifications and preservation standards.
- Install new wooden sash packs in the rehabilitated existing jamb frames. All new wooden sash to fit the existing, historic sash openings exactly and not be reduced or enlarged; like-for-like.
- New sash to be selected from one of the following appropriate styles at Owner's option: Pella Architect Series Double-Hung Inserts; Marvin Ultimate Insert Double-Hung, or Premium Jeld-Wen Traditions Plus Series Inserts.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with exterior paint according to manufacturer's specifications.
- All finish colors to remain the same as currently existing.

• **15-4-5**

1472-74 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

PSI Real Estate, LLC/Homer Neal (Applicant/Owner)

An Application with current photos, site plan, slate roof assessment, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Office staff.

Approve application 15-4-5, 1472-74 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Street Historic District, as submitted, with all clarifications as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- As confirmed by the slate assessment and photo documentation provided, remove all slate shingles on the main roof which are deteriorated and beyond repair down to the sheathing.
- Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.

- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	English Gray Slate Weathered Slate
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim and siding elements as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like.
- Prepare all wood windows and exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish coat all exterior wooden surfaces with Benjamin Moore Exterior Satin "Standish White" (HC-32) according to manufacturer's specifications.

- **13-3-7c**

**309 – 311, 315-17, & 360-362 East Eleventh Avenue (Bldgs. #3, #4, # 20) New Indianola Historic District
Weinland Park Properties LLD (Applicant/Owner)**

Converted to Staff Approval following H. P. O. presentation at the April 9, 2015 HRC Business Meeting.

Revised plan for front porch service steps railings submitted with drawing. Project architect has met with the Historic Preservation Officer.

Approve Application #15-3-7c, 309 – 311, 315-17, & 360-362 East Eleventh Avenue, New Indianola Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Front Porch Service Steps Handrails (Buildings #3, #4, & #20)

- Request approval of installation of metal handrail system to match the approved metal front service steps rail system installed on the other front porches in the rehab project per submitted drawing.

- **15-4-7**

1085 Bryden Road

Bryden Road Historic District

Michael J. Smith (Applicant/Owner)

Converted to Staff Approval following H. P. O. presentation at the April 9, 2015 HRC Business Meeting.

An Application with current photos, porch plans, and detailed work description has been submitted. Applicant has consulted with the H. P. O. staff and a site visit has been conducted. The rear porch structure was removed prior to review due to safety concerns. A file photo of the original porch structure has been included.

Approve Application #15-4-7, 1085 Bryden Road, Bryden Road Historic District, as submitted and with all clarifications noted.

Landscape Plan

- Install six foot high (6'H) cedar privacy fence with two (2) service gates in same location at the existing gates per submitted site plan.
- Rear Yard Landscape Plan—Install new trees, sod and clay paver patio & service walks from rear of home to

garage per submitted plan. Install new clay paver patio on east side elevation per submitted plan.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

- **15-1-3**
260 N. Fourth Street/Engine House #16 Columbus Register Individual Listing
Central Ohio Fire Museum & Learning Center City of Columbus
Direct the Historic Preservation Officer to issue the Certificate of Appropriateness and notify the Historic Resources Commission of the Board of Commission Appeals action.
MOTION: Rosen/Vogt (5-0-0) APPROVED
- **DESIGN STANDARDS for RENTAL SIGNAGE in HISTORIC DISTRICTS**

X. NEW BUSINESS

- **Olentangy Boulevard/Lot 30** **Old Beechwold Historic District**
Joseph & Laura Williams (Applicants/Owners)
Old Beechwold Historic district property owner has discussed the street and drainage study currently underway with the Historic Preservation Officer and has voiced strong concerns with the City Plans Review requirement for curbing at the approved new residence on Olentangy Boulevard.
Curb Issue for New Infill in the Old Beechwold Historic District
Request letter in support of historic street treatment plan which purposely did not include conventional concrete curbing in the original development of the historic district.
- **15-4-12**
Great Southern Hotel/Great Southern Theatre **Individually Listed (7/21/82)**
310 South High Street **WM Columbus Hotel, LLC (O)**
Ohio National Road Association/ Attn.: Chris W. Harkness (A)
The Applicant has consulted with the Historic Preservation Officer and the Ohio Historic Preservation Office staff. Full-size renderings have been submitted.
Interpretive Signage
Install two (2) signage identification markers per submitted plans.

XI. ADJOURN

