

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

Tuesday, August 19, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: David Cooke, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy (arrived 6:24), Charmaine Sutton

Commissioners Absent: Todd Boyer

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I.** CALL TO ORDER (6:17 p.m.).
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, September 9, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, September 16, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, July 15, 2014.
MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (3-0-3 [Hagerling-Sutton-Goodman]) APPROVED
- V.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VI.** STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 14-6-7

995 North Fourth Street

John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application #14-6-7, 995 North Fourth Street, for paving of an existing parking lot, to allow the Applicant time to submit a landscaping plan with the purpose of providing a buffer strip and screening along the Fourth Street sidewalk, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

2. 14-8-12

875 Summit Street

Borror Properties (Applicant)

Wood Run Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-8-12, 875 Summit Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.039, R-4 residential district, which Section does not permit a dwelling containing an excess of four dwelling units. Applicant requests a variance to allow a six dwelling apartment building in the R-4 district.
2. 3332.18(D), Basis of computing area, which Section does not permit the erection of any building greater than 50 percent of the lot area. Applicant requests a variance to permit a building to cover 53% of the lot area.
3. 3332.21(D)(2), Building lines, which Section establishes a building line at that distance determined by extending a line which is the same distance from the street property line as the existing building and parallel with the street property line but not less than ten feet. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the Summit Street building line to 0 feet and the First Avenue building line to 0 feet.
4. 3312.13(B), Driveway, which Section requires driveways serving more than 8 residential parking spaces to have a minimum width of 20 feet and a maximum width of 35 feet measured at the street right-of-way line. Applicant requests a variance to permit a minimum driveway width of 18 feet. See Private Access Easement between Wood Run Partners, LLC and Andrew Joseph Otey.
5. 3321.05(A)(2), Vision clearance, which Section requires a clear vision area of 12 feet at driveways accessing residential lots. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the clear vision area to 9.5 feet.
6. 3321.05(B)(2), Vision clearance, which Section requires a clear vision triangle of 30 feet at intersections adjacent to residential apartment developments. Applicant request a variance to reduce the clear vision triangle to 9 feet on the corner of Summit Street and East 1st Avenue. As a mitigating factor, the traffic on Summit Street is one-way south. The reduced clear vision triangle will not impede vision of traffic on Summit Street.
7. 3312.49, Minimum number parking spaces allowed, which section requires a minimum of 2 bicycle parking spaces for residential uses of four or more dwelling units. Applicant requests a variance to reduce the number of bicycle parking spaces to 0. Applicant shall provide bicycle parking within the garage.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (5-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. 14-8-13

1006 North High Street (Fireproof Building/new construction)

Andrew Bacher/DaNite Sign Co. (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

At the request of, and in the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #14-8-13, 1006 North High Street, for installation of new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

4. **14-8-16**

620 North High Street (Le Meridien-Joseph Hotel)

Pizzuti Short North Hotel, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-8-16 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Following further discussion and review, a vote was requested by the Applicant, and the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-8-18a

Approve Application #14-8-18a, 620 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage/Front (west) Entrance

- Install one (1) new plaque sign at the main entrance on the west elevation, and wrapping to the south wall.
- New, brushed aluminum plaque sign to measure 4'-0" wide x 3'-0" high, with push through, illuminated acrylic letters with opaque, black vinyl faces.
- Sign to read "Le MERIDIEN THE JOSEPH" with "THE JOSEPH" located beneath and right justified with "Le MERIDIEN."
- Revised rendering to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-8-18b

Approve Application #14-8-18B, 620 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted

Install New Signage/South Elevation

- Install one (1) new wall sign at the top of the building on the southeast facing elevation, per the submitted drawings.
- New sign to measure 44'-6.5" wide x 4'-0" high.
- Individual letters, reading "Le Meridien The Joseph," to be LED illuminated, white acrylic.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (2-4-0) [Cooke-Goodman-Hagerling-Sutton]-DENIED

Note: The Commission requested to see studies of the sign with the name stacked and not stacked, and directed Historic Preservation Office staff to work with the Applicant to expedite the review of revised drawings prior to the September Italian Village Commission.

5. **14-8-17**

680 North High Street

GRAD Architects (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-8-17 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-8-17a

Install New Windows

- Repair the existing, non-original, wood windows, like-for-like, or, remove all existing first floor windows on the south and rear/east elevations, and install new, all wood (interior/exterior), windows, like-for-like. Cut sheet for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation

Rear Elevation

- Remove the existing, non-original, six-panel, rear exit door, and install new, half-light, steel or wood door, per the submitted drawing. Cut sheet for new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Remove the existing rear door awning, and install a new canvas or Sunbrella awning on the existing frame. Color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to installation. Framework to be painted the same color as the underside of the awning fabric.

- Install new ductwork, per the submitted drawing. Retain existing ductwork penetrations, as possible.
- Install new metal casing over conduit, per the submitted drawing.

Landscaping/Patio

- Remove the existing A/C condenser unit, and install new, concrete slab and protective bollards east of the stairwell for new A/C condenser unit, per the submitted site plan.
- Replace existing step with new, sloped concrete ramp, per the submitted site plan. New concrete to match the existing large aggregate concrete, where allowable in accordance with ADA requirements.
- Remove the existing metal bench and all existing rear fencing.
- Remove existing shrubs, and install new landscaping in existing planting bed. Final landscape plan to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new patio dining furniture. Cut sheets for patio furniture to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-8-17b

Continue Application #14-8-17a, for renovation of the existing storefront, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 16, 2014 Italian Village commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (6-0-0) CONTINUED.

6. 14-8-18

812 Hamlet Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Urban Restorations (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-18, 812 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Garage

- Build new, two-car, tandem garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Cladding to be smooth, Hardiboard backer with 1" x 2" wood battens at 12" on center.
- Eaves and asphalt roof shingles to match house.
- Foundation to be plain-face concrete block.
- Overhead garage doors to be glass on east elevation and wood on west elevation. Cut sheet for overhead doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Service door to be half-light, two-panel, steel door. Cut sheet for service door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Cut sheet for light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

7. 14-8-19

94 East Third Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Urban Restorations (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-8-19 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-8-19a

Approve Application #14-8-19a, 94 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Alter Front Entrance Steps

- Remove the existing, non-original, side facing front entrance steps from the existing building, and install new, concrete, front-facing steps.

- Install new half-light, two-panel door and sidelights. Existing wood surround to remain. Cut sheet for new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Install new metal porch railings. Cut sheet for new railings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.

NOTE: Prior to implementation of work, final revised drawings to be reviewed and stamped by Historic Preservation Office staff following review and approval by the Ohio Historic Preservation Office in association with the Ohio Historic Preservation Tax Credit Program and/or Federal Rehabilitation Tax Credit Program.

NOTE: Construction of a proposed new garage is to return for further review and approval by the Italian Village Commission at a future Italian Village Commission hearing.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-8-19b

Construct New Garage

Continue Application #14-8-19b, for the construction of a new five car garage with second story living space in the rear yard of the existing building, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the September 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

Ben Goodman:

- Would be open to additional windows on the south elevation, possibly clerestory windows.
- Would be open to an alternate material, such as concrete block, on the one story section of the garage.

David Cooke:

- Look at the existing house materials to the east when considering alternative materials for the garage.
- Has concerns regarding any roof decks that would look down on neighboring yards.

Josh Lapp:

- Prefers to see some greenery on the roof, as oppose to all rubber membrane.
- Also open to additional windows on the south elevation.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Not opposed to roof terraces as submitted. Parapet walls will provide some separation from neighboring yards.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) CONTINUED

8. 14-8-20

778 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #12-8-20, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-20, 778 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new single-family dwelling.
- Exterior cladding to be brick, with foundation brick to grade.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad, wood, two-over-two, double-hung sash.
- Cut sheets for windows, pedestrian doors, overhead garage door, exterior lighting, and permeable paver to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

9. 14-8-21

248 East Third Avenue

New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-21, 248 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all deteriorated slate on the roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

10. 14-8-22

53 East Prescott Street

Priestas Brothers Builders (Applicant)

Scott Kalkowsky (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-22, 53 East Prescott Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Construct New Garage

- Build new nineteen-foot-four-inches-wide-by-nineteen-foot-long (19'4" W x 19' L), frame garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Roof pitch to be 10/12.
- Eaves overhangs on front and rear elevations to be wood with a width of twelve inches (12"), per the submitted elevation drawings.

- Eaves overhangs on the east and west side elevations to be wood. Eaves overhang width to be in accordance with all applicable City and State Building Codes, based on the width of the lot and the width of the new garage. A minimum eaves overhang width of four inches (4") is preferred.
- Cladding to be smooth, Hardi Plank siding with 5" reveal. Colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Overhead door to be sixteen-foot-wide-by-7-foot-high (16'W x 7'H), #2060 Carriage House panel door, as on the existing garage at 45 East Prescott Street, but without the "rustic" hardware.
- Any/all lighting fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

11. 14-8-23

875 Summit Street

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-23, 875 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Temporary Construction Signage

- Install one temporary, 5'-6" x 5'-6" Tyvek sign, mounted on the construction fence, per the submitted site plan and rendering.
- Temporary sign to remain only as long as the construction fencing is in place.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman 5-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED

12. 14-8-24

866 North Pearl Street

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-8-24, 866 North Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Temporary Construction Signage

- Install one temporary, 5'-6" x 5'-6" Tyvek sign, mounted on the construction fence, per the submitted site plan and rendering.
- Temporary sign to remain only as long as the construction fencing is in place.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (5-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

13. 14-8-25

940 North High Street

The Wood Companies (Applicant)

Mark Wood & Robert Brunner (Owners)

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the two existing single-story commercial buildings at 936 and 940 North High Street.
- Construct a new, five story, brick commercial block, per the submitted renderings.
- New building to include basement level and first floor parking, first floor commercial space, and second through fifth floor living space.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Would like to see a rendering that includes the facades of the proposed Donato's (920 N. High St.) and other adjacent buildings.

- Thinks that traditional architecture works fine in this location. The proposed approach is respectful of the style being emulated, and does not appear as a false approach. The massing and scale seem in accordance with the intent of the Short North Guidelines, but will need more details about the fifth floor.
- Appreciates the Applicants attention to the treatment of the alley. The details for the entrances and exits will be significant.
- Need to be sensitive to the existing light well of the adjacent building.
- As new construction, there is more latitude regarding door/window/storefront materials, but keeping within this historic vernacular seems like a good direction.
- Thinks that the existing building at 940 N. High Street does have character, but not enough to outweigh the infill of these lots.

Ben Goodman:

- Would not be supportive of materials such as EIFS and break metal.
- Appreciates the inset entrances, as an homage to historic storefronts.
- Very supportive of the proposed, raised brick branding (Brunner 2015) of the building within the cornice.
- Looks fantastic. Looking forward to the next phase.

Joshua Lapp:

- Agrees that traditional architecture is a good approach here. Is sure the construction of the building will be high quality based on the Applicant's building across the street (Wood Co./941 N. High St.).
- The building at 930 N. High has the appearance of newer construction, or has been encased with modern alterations.
- Based on the staff report, the building at 940 N. High was built ca.1940. More consideration will need to be given to whether that makes it a historic building. Construction of a new one story building on the site would not be considered appropriate today.
- This is currently a very challenging section of High Street for walkability.

David Cooke:

- Both buildings are currently in use, not abandoned or in disrepair. They have some historic value as part of the auto-related history of the neighborhood. However, the trade off in losing these two buildings is that the proposed building would finish the line, fill in the "lost tooth," and bring the whole block back to a pedestrian street, which was a major goal of the Short North Guidelines.
- Appreciates that the long curb cut will be removed.
- The proposed building appears to have sufficient parking for all residents. Parking for the commercial spaces may be of concern, depending on the business tenants.
- Will still need details and discussion regarding a fifth floor. Would not be supportive of an all glass fifth floor.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Is in general agreement with comments of fellow Commissioners.
- Has some concerns about the loss of the existing buildings.

Rex Hagerling:

- The building at 940 N. High retains a bit of historic character, but the building at 930 N. High does not. As currently sited on the lots, these buildings are set back from the rest of the buildings along the street and have parking at the front of the lots, which is not consistent with the goals of the Short North Guidelines.
- In favor of traditional architecture if done well. Is confident, based on the Applicant's building across the street, that it will be done well.
- In general, is supportive of the proposed project.

Note: Historic Preservation Office staff noted that Historic American Building Survey (HABS) type documentation is generally required prior to demolition of any building that has any historic or architectural significance, including a historical narrative and detailed photographs.

NO ACTION TAKEN

14. 14-8-26

848 N. Pearl Street

Connie Klema (Applicant)

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Owners)

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the existing single-story industrial building.
- Construct a new, six story, glass and brick condominium building, per the submitted renderings.
- New building to include first floor parking space.

Following the swearing in of the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling, called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Kyle Ezell 57 E. Prescott St. Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Appreciates how the area has changed to a more pedestrian friendly feel. • Appreciates Ms. Klema’s attempts to meet with neighbors. • Likes the glass as a building material. • Good that parking is being provided for residents. • Looking forward to continued review of the project. • The proposed height is not a problem.
William Cross Kerr and Prescott Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Supportive of the proposed project. • Glad to see that the units will be owned rather than rented. • Has some concerns about traffic on Prescott Street. Would like to see it as brick. • Would like to see all utility lines buried.

Following the speakers, and presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Appreciates seeing a developer’s personality transferred to the design of a building.
- Does not have concerns with the height.
- Appreciates that the developer is talking to neighbors about the project.
- Would not want to see the Short North with only high end, for sale units. It is important to have a mix of unit sizes, owned and rental units, and price points.
- Does not think the 1971 crematory is a contributing or historic building.
- The pedestrian experience on both Pearl and Prescott will be important.

Ben Goodman:

- The 1971 building does not appear to be contributing, although there are good examples of renovated simple block buildings. Weighing the benefits of a new development is a part of the Commission’s charge.
- The height of the building within the surrounding context and the traffic load on the alley will continue to be issues for discussion. Does not expect to be supportive of a height beyond the height of the building to the north.
- Doesn’t think that changing the direction of the street is tied to this project.
- Need to consider how the building is experienced at the pedestrian level.

Jason Sudy:

- The scale will depend on the materials and details.

- The inspiration for the proposed idea seems the right way to transition from single lot residential development through to a commercial corridor.
- The Commission needs to consider the impacts of new construction on both current and future residents. Appreciates that the applicant has already begun communicating with the neighboring residents.
- The Commission and neighbors were aware, when the parking garage was being reviewed, of sacrifices being made in the interest of parking for the district. This development should not require any sacrifice to neighbors, as it does not really provide them a direct benefit.
- Will be interested to see how the first floor façade of Pearl Street is managed. Need to respect the façade across the street on Pearl (851 N. Pearl St.).
- The parking ratio seems to work.
- The alleys have been prioritized by the Italian Village Society for UIRF funding, so the speaker who commented on that issue may want to talk to the IVS.

Rex Hagerling:

- Does think that height is an issue. Is on the record as being opposed to high-rise buildings on the east side of Pearl Street.
- Does not find the existing building to be contributing.
- Has concerns about the addition of another large building causing a claustrophobic feel along the street.
- Does not want to see a big building on every piece of vacant ground in the district. Does not think it is appropriate to have high-rise building in largely residential areas.

David Cooke:

- Would not oppose demolition of the existing ca. 1971 building.
- Appreciates the Applicant's contact with the neighboring property owners.
- Appreciates that the units will be for sale rather than a rental property.
- Would like to see the building lowered at least one floor.
- Would like to see the an elevation showing the proposed new building with the previously approved new building at 866 N. Pearl Street to compare the height.
- Needs to be sensitivity to residents to the east.
- Great care on the detailing of the building needs to come through for it to be successful.

Charmaine Sutton:

- The footprint may need to be a bit smaller.
- Not opposed to the proposed height, but can't look soaring.
- There are many ways to be creative with the submitted schematic.
- Is supportive of glass and concrete, or other different materials.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-8-1**

151 East Third Avenue

Richard Long (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-1, 151 East Third Avenue, for renewal of expired COA # 11-11-9 (Expired: November 15, 2012), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Renovation/Modify Previous Approval

- Replace the front porch, as approved in COA 06-4-18 with the modification that the front steps are to be widened to the center column, and the balustrade to the left of the center column is to be eliminated.
- Replace all existing windows and doors with new all wood interior/exterior windows.
- Window and door cut sheets to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Repair or replace existing siding with new wood siding, like-for-like.

- Change roofline to be two (2) elevations rather than three (3) elevations.
- Remove deteriorated chimney which is not currently in use.
- Void and side over the non-original rear window opening.
- Any/all lighting cut sheets to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.

MOTION: Lewis/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED

- **14-8-2**

772 North High Street (Suite 102)

Web Smith (Applicant)

Wood Companies (Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-2, 772 North High Street (Suite 102), as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Awning

- Remove the existing awning material, and install new, black, canvas or Sunbrella awning on the existing frame, like-for-like.
- New awning to include no words or graphics.
- Any/all future signage to be submitted to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

- **14-8-3 [Goodman]**

835 Summit Street

Stacy Woodford (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-3, 835 Summit Street, for renewal of expired COA # 12-2-1 (Expired: February 3, 2013), as previously approved, and with the addition or soffit and fascia repair, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof of the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

Style:

Color:

CertainTeed

Carriage House (dimensional)

Stonegate Gray

GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

English Gray Slate

Weathered Slate

Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

Nickel Gray

Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

Estate Gray

Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."

- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the rear flat roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **14-8-4**

737-741 Kerr Street

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Paula Berry (Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-4, 737-741 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Window

- Install a new window in the south gable end, per the submitted elevation drawing and the photographs documenting the original rough framing of the window opening that was revealed upon removal of the interior wall.
- New window to match the size of the other existing windows in the house, and to match the new, all wood windows as approved in Certificate of Appropriateness # 14-5-13, per the submit product cut sheets.

• **14-8-5**

1114 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Brian Tucker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-5, 1114 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color scheme to be as follows, per the submitted paint color chips: Body – Benjamin Moore “Stuart Gold”; Trim - Benjamin Moore “Weston Flax”; Accent - Benjamin Moore “Cottage Red”; Optional porch railing detail - Benjamin Moore “Amazon Green”.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

• **14-8-6**

1044 North High Street

Fred E. Maloof (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-6, 1044 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the commercial building (windows, wood cornice, exterior stairs, etc.) for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to application of paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone window sills, foundation, and cornice; etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Applicant has the option of painting the existing, stucco north wall, which was previously approved for painting

in 2001, COA #01-11-6 (SW2001 “Rocky Coast”). Paint color to match existing color as closely as possible.

- **14-8-7**

235-249 East Fifth Avenue

Fred E. Maloof (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-7, 235-249 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Repair Façade

- Repair/replace the damaged section of the commercial building facade, like-for-like.
- Remove and relocate existing tiles, as needed, to create the least obtrusive infill pattern for new tiles.
- Reinstall any undamaged salvaged structural glazed tile.
- Replace any/all damaged and missing structural glazed tile with new structural glazed tile that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture, as closely as possible. Applicant is to submit a physical sample of the proposed replacement tile to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- New mortar to match the existing color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.

- **14-8-8**

97 East Lincoln Street

Michael Linsker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-8, 97 East Lincoln Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Repaint Metal Fence

- Prepare all metal surfaces for repainting by removing any/all rust and loose paint with appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime any/all bare metal with exterior metal primer according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Apply finish coat; color to be “black.”

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the main house and porches, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house and porches for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint colors to be Valspar “Vintage Grey” and “High Speed Steel.”
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone window sills and lintels, foundation, and water table; etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **14-8-9**

1062 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Matthew Wood (Applicant)

Matthew Wood & Christopher Hammer (Owner)

Approve Application 14-8-9, 1062 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Garage Repair

- Repair the existing, damaged, contributing, frame garage, in-like-kind.
- Remove any/all damaged roof trusses, exposed rafter tails, wood siding, and wood trim, as needed.
- Install new roof trusses, as needed, in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Retain and repair and/or reinstall any existing, salvageable rafter tails, wood siding, and wood trim.
- Install new wood rafter tails, wood siding, and wood trim, to match existing profiles and dimensions, like-for-like, as needed.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to be "white," to match existing.
- Install new, solid, wood poplar exterior service door, like-for-like.
- Remove all asphalt shingles on the garage roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new Owens Corning, standard 3-tab, Estate Gray asphalt shingles.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray," or "Tinner's Red."

- **14-8-10**

- **1068-1074 Summit Street**

- **New Victorians (Applicant)**

Joe Armeni (Owner)

- Approve Application 14-8-10, 1068-1074 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

- Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the two frame dwellings, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the two frame dwellings for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone window sills and lintels, foundation, and water table; etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

- **14-8-11**

- **41 East Prescott Street**

- **Kenneth & Michele Gagen (Applicant/Owner)**

- Approve Application 14-8-11, 41 East Prescott Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

- Repair Concrete Porch Deck, Porch Steps and Service Sidewalk

- Remove any/all deteriorated, concrete, front porch deck, porch steps, and service sidewalk, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair or install new concrete front porch deck, porch steps, and service sidewalk in the same location.
- Install an overlay of brick pavers on the concrete front porch steps and service sidewalk, per the submitted photographs, to insure an appropriate rise.
- Install new, wood, tongue-and-groove porch flooring over the existing, non-original concrete porch deck.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

- Install New Porch Railings

- Install new, wood plinths at the base of the existing wood columns. New wood plinths to match the size and dimensions of the existing, original plinth, like-for-like, per the submitted photographs.
- Install new, wood porch balustrade and hand railings, located per the submitted drawing.
- Spindle design to match the existing frieze spindles. Spacing of balustrade spindles to be in proportion with the spacing of the frieze spindles; not more than 2.5" apart.
- Top rail and bottom rail design to be per the illustration provided by Historic Preservation Office staff (CRHP Architectural Guidelines, p. 15).

- Install New Retaining Wall

- Remove the existing, non-original, wood retaining wall along the front and side of the existing front yard planting bed.

- Install a new, stone retaining wall in the same location, and not to exceed the height of the existing wood retaining wall. Final material to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- **14-8-14**
176-178 East Second Avenue
Michael Chute (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-8-14, 176-178 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:
Porch Rehabilitation
 - Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
 - Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
 - It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
 - Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
 - Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be "gray."
 - Install new, wood porch skirting, per the submitted photographs.
- **14-8-15**
684 Kerr Street
Jeff Kennedy (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-8-15, 684 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:
Exterior Painting
 - Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements on the house and garage, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
 - Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house and garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
 - Glaze and caulk as necessary.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be Sherwin Williams 2809, "Rookwood Shutter Green," and Sherwin Williams 2038, "Loggia."
 - **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone window sills and lintels, foundation, and water table; etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
 - **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

14-6-13b

1126 Say Avenue, 1130 Say Avenue, & 77 E. Fourth Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

The New Victorians (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #14-6-13b, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-13b, 1126 Say Avenue, 1130 Say Avenue, & 77 E. Fourth Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction/Three-family Dwelling

- Based on zoning requirements modify the previous approval of COA # 14-6-3, approved June 17, 2014.
- Shift the building to the south, per the submitted revised site plan.
- Relocate the porch steps on the Say Avenue side, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (9:33 p.m.)