

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

Tuesday, December 16, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp,
Jason Sudy (arrived 6:21 p.m./Item #3; left 9:20 p.m.), Charmaine Sutton

Commissioners Absent: Ben Goodman

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I.** CALL TO ORDER (6:16 p.m.).
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, January 13, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, January 20, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV.** SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, November 18, 2014.
MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VI.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Special Meeting, Tuesday, December 9, 2014.
MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (4-0-1 [Lapp]) APPROVED
- VII.** STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII.** PUBLIC FORUM
- **14-11-10**
Request for Recommendation to the Department of Public Service
 - RGB, LLC has contacted the Department of Public Service regarding the possible sale of a portion of the Hull Alley right-of-way north of Warren Street between High and Pearl Streets, per the submitted site plan.

Following the presentation of the staff report, Chairman Hagerling called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Andrew Klein 1090 Say Avenue Italian Village Society	The issue of the vacation of part of Hull Alley, between High and Pearl, was discussed at a recent IVS committee meeting. The position of the IVS is that all existing alley intersections with High Street should be improved, not vacated. If people are going to be invited into the neighborhoods to park, alleys should also be available for pedestrian access from the neighborhoods.

Following the public speaker, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of, and at the request of RGB, LLC., continue Application # 14-11-10, to allow additional time to submit a site plan and drawings for a proposed new building, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the January 20, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-0) CONTINUED

IX. STAFF APPROVALS

X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 14-12-7

944 North High Street

Stan Young/Columbus Sign Co. (Applicant)

CEMAC Properties, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-12-7, 944 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Wall Sign

- Install one (1) new wall sign, per the submitted rendering.
- New sign composed of channel fabricated, 5” deep aluminum letters with business name, “ROCKET FIZZ,” with exposed neon and clear lens, set on an aluminum pan backer, painted “Silver Metallic.”
- Aluminum letters interior color to be “Red,” and exterior color to be “Black.”
- Neon to be single stroke, pink tube.
- Non-illuminated, computer cut, vinyl letters with business name tag line, “Soda Pop & Candy Shop,” to be below the channel letters. Vinyl letter colors to be “Bright Pink,” with “White” outline.
- Sign to measure 114” W x 17” H. (total 13.5 sq. ft.).
- New wall sign is to be centered above the four storefront windows, and located between the top of the storefront windows and the bottom of the stone stringcourse above, not overlapping the stone stringcourse.
- No window or door graphics are proposed or approved at this time.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

2. 14-11-17b

674 North High Street

Dana Depew/NorthCoast Sign Inc. (Applicant)

John Allen/Short North Tavern (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-17b, 674 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new, double-faced, 10 inch thick aluminum sign cabinet, painted black, with the letters “TAVERN” routed out of the faces, per the submitted drawing.
- Routed out letters to be backed with translucent acrylic.
- Opaque, offset letters, painted off-white, to “float” over the routed out letters, allowing LED lights inside the cabinet to create a halo effect around the opaque, offset letters.
- Sign to measure 105” H x 12” W. (total 8.75 sq. ft.).

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (5-0-0) APPROVED

3. 14-12-8

227 East Third Avenue

Matt Tewanger (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-12-18, 227 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Projecting Sign

- Retain the existing projecting sign that was installed prior to review and approval.
- The double-faced, 24" x 24", aluminum sign hangs on a 36" metal bracket.
- The sign is painted white with red logo and trim and black lettering including the business name, "CRAVINGS CARRYOUT CAFÉ."

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

4. 14-12-9b

263 Detroit Avenue

Arch City Realty Group, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-12-9b, 263 Detroit Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Windows

- Remove existing, deteriorated wood and non-original vinyl, one-over-one, double-hung windows, and install new all wood (interior/exterior) one-over-one, double-hung windows.
- New window sash to fit the size of the original window sash openings.
- Cut sheet/product specifications to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- All exterior trim elements to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the aluminum siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches. All trim to project ½" to ¾" above the surface of the new wood siding (see COA # 14-11-18).
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Note: No exterior alterations are to be made to any existing exterior window openings until new evidence is revealed that any original window openings were in a different location prior to the residing of the structure with the existing non-contributing siding.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

5. 14-10-14

1049-1051 North Fourth Street

Jared Williamson (Applicant)

Kevin Lykens (Owner)

Following the presentation of the staff report, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In accordance with Italian Village Commission policy, following three consecutive absences by the Applicant, remove Application # 14-10-14 from the Italian Village Commission agenda and from further review. Submission of a new application will be required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPLICATION REMOVED FROM AGENDA

6. 14-10-16 (Variance Recommendation)

920 North High Street

Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)

Emerald Light Ltd. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #14-10-16, Commission Chair Hagerling noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Commissioner Sudy assumed the role of Chair. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated. Upon review of Application #14-10-16, 920 North High Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 1) 3312.11, Drive-up Stacking Area, to reduce stacking for a restaurant pickup window from eight (8) spaces to four (4) spaces.
- 2) 3312.49(A)(B), Minimum Number of Parking Spaces Required, which Section requires a total of 169 parking spaces for 13,008 sq. ft. of building area for multi-tenant restaurant use and 2,140 sq. ft. of accessory patio area, while 8 spaces are provided on-site and off-site parking will also be provided, and to reduce required bicycle parking from 10 spaces to 6 spaces.
- 3) 3312.53, Minimum Number of Loading Spaces Required, which Section requires one (1) loading space for commercial uses with an aggregate area between 10,000 and less than 75,000 square feet, while the aggregate building commercial use area will be 13,008 +/- square feet and applicant proposes to not provide a loading space.
- 4) 3356.11, C-4 District Setback Lines, which Section requires a minimum building setback of 60 feet (North High Street, 4-2D arterial) and 8 +/- feet (East First Avenue, existing building to the east), while applicant requests zero (0) building setback on both streets in keeping with the historic commercial corridor.

Note: The proposed drive-thru stacking makes sense for this particular location. Suburban drive-thru stacking standards are not appropriate or compatible for a busy urban corridor.

Note: The Commission appreciates that the Applicant has obtained an off-site parking lease that will provide parking for, but not be limited to, Donatos customers, and sees this as a pro-active approach to parking issues. One desired goal of the current Short North Parking Study would be to have localized, accessible record-keeping of off-site parking leases, including locations and users. Currently, several lots have been committed to multiple users simultaneously.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (5-0-1 [Hagerling]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

7. 14-11-12

1014 North High Street (Fireproof Building Addition)

Tai Lieu (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #14-11-12, Commission Chair Hagerling returned and resumed the role of Chair. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-12, 1014 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new projecting sign, per the submitted drawings (revised and dated 12-17-14).
- New, double-faced, round, 6" deep aluminum cabinet to have painted, aluminum faces with routed letters.
- Sign faces to be opaque, with internal LEDs to illuminate the routed business name, "Tai Tiki," and a portion of the Tiki face profile only, per the submitted drawings.
- Sign faces to be gradient dark "Maroon" to dark "Red," with "Midnight Blue" edge border.
- Text to be illuminated "Pale Yellow," with opaque "Midnight Blue" drop shadow.
- Tike face profile to be "Midnight Blue" with illuminated "White" highlights.

- “Satin Silver” aluminum bracket to include cut-out, aluminum, “Satin Silver,” bamboo leaf detail, per the submitted drawings (revised and dated 12-17-14).

New Awning

- Install two (2) new fabric awnings facing onto High Street, per the revised renderings, submitted at the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission meeting.
- New awnings to include the “Tai Tiki” name/logo on the front flap of the awnings.

Door Graphics

- Install new door graphics, per the revised rendering, dated 12-17-14.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (6-0-0) APPROVED

8. 14-11-14

850 North Fourth Street

Carrie Lierl/Columbus Growing Collective (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, remove Application # 14-11-14 from the Italian Village Commission agenda and from further review. Submission of a new application will be required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (6-0-0) APPLICATION REMOVED FROM AGENDA

9. 14-11-20

1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Moe Hassan & Romeo Issa (Applicants)

Debora Czech & Roman Czech (Owners)

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-11-20, to allow additional time to prepare a modified design for the patio enclosure, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the January 20, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

10. 14-12-10

1120 North High Street

Karrin Ballard (Applicant)

The Katz Interests (Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-12-10, 1120 North High Street, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the January 20, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (5-0-0) CONTINUED

11. 14-12-11

933 Hamlet Street

Jason Kentner (Applicant)

St. Joseph’s Montesorri School (Owner)

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-12-11, 933 Hamlet Street, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the January 20, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (5-0-0) CONTINUED

12. 14-12-12

1059 Say Avenue

Jim Saltz (Applicant)

Chris Perry (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-12-12 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-12-12a

Approve Application #14-12-12a, 1059 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Exterior Alterations/Phase I – Existing House

- North elevation – No alterations.
- East/front elevation – No alterations.
- West elevation – No alterations.

South elevation/Install New Windows and Door

- Upon removal of interior walls and non-original exterior siding, Applicant is to consult with Historic Preservation Office staff, in consultation with Commissioner Hagerling, to determine the original size and placement of all original window openings and the appropriate size and placement of all new windows, prior to installation.
- Final cut sheets for new wood windows and new wood door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-12-12b

Demolition and New Construction/Phase II (Conceptual Review)

- Demolish the existing, one-story, rear addition.
- Build new, two-story, rear addition on the same footprint, per the submitted drawings.
- Siding to be horizontal lap siding.
- Roof shingles to match existing asphalt shingles.
- Gutters and downspouts to match existing.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Rex Hagerling:

- Conceptually, the second story, projecting bay seems okay.

David Cooke:

- The new solution (projecting bay) is an improvement over the previous submittal (regarding the previously submitted second story porch addition) and seems appropriate.

Josh Lapp:

- In agreement with Commissioner Cooke's comment.

Charmaine Sutton:

- In agreement with Commissioner Cooke's comment.

Todd Boyer:

- No additional comments.

Jason Sudy:

- No additional comments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

13. 14-11-26

955 North Sixth Street (North Lot)

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

955 North Sixth Street, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-26, 955 North Sixth Street (North Lot), as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, brick, single-family residence on the existing vacant lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double hung sash windows.
- Limestone headers and sills to be solid, not split.
- Front and rear porch railings to be wood, per the submitted detail drawing. Spaces between balusters to be no more than two-inches (2"). Front porch columns to be composite. Porch ceiling to be bead board.
- Garage siding to be 5 ¼" exposure cementitious siding.
- Approval includes the modification of the site plan to include an eight foot (8') easement at the rear/west end of the lot to provide vehicular access to the neighboring property.
- Revised drawings, including a modification to widen the front porch, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all siding materials, roofing materials, windows, dwelling and garage doors, porch railings, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: A curb cut on Sixth Street is being approved for the following reasons: 1) A shared driveway is being utilized for two properties in order to reduce the number of needed curb cuts; 2) Due to the configuration of these particular lots, there is no vehicular access to the rear of the lots; 3) Placement of garages at the rear of the lots is the most appropriate in order to maintain the character of the streetscape.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

14. 14-11-27

955 North Sixth Street (South Lot)

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

955 North Sixth Street, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-27, 955 North Sixth Street (South Lot), as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new, frame, single-family residence on the existing vacant lot, per the submitted drawings.
- Exterior cladding for dwelling to be a combination of 5 ¼" exposure cementitious siding and board-and-batten siding, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double hung sash windows.
- Foundation to be poured concrete faced with split face block.
- Front porch roof to be standing-seam-metal. Front porch privacy railing and hand rail to be wood, per the submitted detail drawing.
- Rear porch railings to be wrought iron/steel.
- Garage siding to be board-and-batten siding.
- Approval includes the modification of the site plan to include an eight foot (8') easement at the rear/west end of the lot to provide vehicular access to the neighboring property.
- Revised drawings, including a modification to include a pedestrian door to the east elevation of the garage, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all siding materials, roofing materials, windows, dwelling and garage doors, porch railings, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: A curb cut on Sixth Street is being approved for the following reasons: 1) A shared driveway is being utilized for two properties in order to reduce the number of needed curb cuts; 2) Due to the configuration of these particular lots, there is no vehicular access to the rear of the lots; 3) Placement of garages at the rear of the lots is the most appropriate in order to maintain the character of the streetscape.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy(6-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

15. 14-9-17

1089 Summit Street (rear)

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

Chad Seiber/1081-1089 Summit Street, LLC (Owner)

Construct New Single-Family Dwellings

- Construct two new, contemporary, single-family dwellings, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Todd Boyer:

- No objections to the proposed materials (ground face block and brick) The way the materials are assembled seems to be too much of a mix of residential and industrial. Would like to see it pushed more toward the industrial style, i.e. remove water tables, lintels, etc.
- The type of siding used (perhaps something non-traditional) and the trim details will also be important.
- Overall, thinks a simplification of the details will be important with such strong materials.

Charmaine Sutton:

- The submitted example photo seems a more simple design than the proposed designs. In some areas, the proposed designs seem to have more complexity than they need.
- Not opposed to the overall massing, just needs some simplification.

Rex Hagerling:

- Would like more information regarding how the site plan relates to the elevations.
- Likes the example house photo, and generally likes what is being proposed.
- Would be cautious about stripping them down too much. Is aware of the mix of residential and industrial detailing, and finds it a bit intriguing.
- Wants to see more on the detailing of materials.

David Cooke:

- Generally in agreement with comments of other Commissioners.
- The house in the submitted example photograph has a cleaner window aesthetic with fewer mullions/muntins. Due to the small scale of the houses, the number of muntins on the Lot 3 house seems a bit heavy.
- The extended bay on the east elevation/Lot 2 seems more appropriate than the east elevation/Lot 3. The bay on Lot 2 seems too close to the windows below it.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 14-12-13

95 Ottar Alley (see 1089 Summit St./rear)

Mulberry Ltd. c/o Jackson Reynolds (Applicant)

Chad Seiber/1081-1089 Summit Street, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-12-13, 95 Ottar Alley, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

Lot 1

- 1) 3332.15 Lot Area – reduce the lot area from 5,000 sq. ft. to 1,929 sq. ft. (a reduction of 3,071 sq. ft.)
- 2) 3332.27 Rearyard Area – reduce the required 25% rearyard at 483 sq. ft. to 38 sq. ft. a reduction of 445 sq. ft.
- 3) 3332.19 Frontage – no frontage on a publicly dedicated right of way
- 4) 3312.49 Parking to reduce the required parking space number from 2 spaces to 1 space
- 5) 3312.25 Maneuvering – access to the site shall come from private drive

Lot 2

- 1) 3332.15 Lot Area – reduce the lot area from 5,000 sq. ft. to 4,331 sq. ft. (a reduction of 669 sq. ft.)
- 2) 3332.27 Rearyard Area – reduce the required 25% rearyard of 1,083 sq. ft. to 641 sq. ft. – a reduction of 442 sq. ft.
- 3) 3332.19 Frontage – no frontage on a publicly dedicated right of way
- 4) 3312.25 Maneuvering – access to the site shall come from private drive
- 5) 3312.13(A) Driveway – to reduce the driveway width from 10' to 2' – a reduction of 8'

Lot 3

- 1) 3332.15 Lot Area – reduce the lot area from 5,000 sq. ft. to 3,018 sq. ft. (a reduction of 1,982 sq. ft.)
- 2) 3332.19 Frontage – to provide fronting off an alley instead of a public street
- 3) 3312.25 Maneuvering – access to the site shall come from a private drive
- 4) 3312.13(A) Driveway – to reduce the driveway width from 10' to 4' – a reduction of 6'

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) The proposed variances are reasonable and necessary to develop these unusual lots, which have no clearly definable front or rear elevation.

Note: The Applicant has submitted information regarding a proposed permanent easement along the east side of the property to allow access for neighboring properties, which is in accordance with the Commission's goal to maintain the historic street/alley grid of the area.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

17. 14-12-14

285 E. Fourth Avenue & 295-303 E. Fourth Avenue

Juliet Bullock (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

Convert Church to Residential Units

- First conceptual review to convert an abandoned church into eight (8) residential units.

New Construction

- Second conceptual review for construction of fourteen (14) residential townhouse units.

Prior to review of Application #14-12-14, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks the current site plan is a good response to comments requesting more of an alley grid pattern for the development. It feels more like an alley rather than a driveway curb cut. Also likes the use of off-street parking, which gives the feel of an alley rather than a parking lot.
- It may help to add some window openings to the street elevations of the garage behind the church, even if they are false windows.
- The Applicant's suggestion of moving one unit out of the church and putting it above the garage could be a workable solution to the smaller scale of the garage.
- Thinks a contemporary design for the apartments will be a good contrast to the historic church.

Charmaine Sutton:

- The height of the proposed garage behind the church building, may be making it seem not to relate to either the church nor the new construction.

David Cooke:

- If a residential unit is placed above the garage, some thought will need to be given to where the entrance should be. If placed on the east elevation, it may be good to consider breaking up that elevation with a different material or something that does not create one long façade with several garage doors.
- Noted that he was not present at the first conceptual review. Has concerns about the proposed density for this property. Consider providing more green space, perhaps by removing one unit of the apartment building facing onto Fourth Avenue, allowing a view of the rear building, and drawing the pedestrian back to the rear building.

Todd Boyer:

- Noted that he was not present at the first conceptual review.
- Agrees that the small garage needs some study, based on other Commissioner's comments.
- The scale of the windows on the entry tower portions of the apartments seems to work, but the infill sections seems rather dormitory-like.
- Would be more in favor of a clean line parapet so the deck is not so visible.

Rex Hagerling:

- Would not object to one less unit on the Fourth Avenue elevation.
- Could go either way on the garage being one or two stories. Would need to see more complete elevation drawings showing the relationship of the buildings.
- Currently likes the east and south elevations better than the north elevation, and would second the comments made by Commissioner Boyer.

NO ACTION TAKEN

18. 14-12-15

1030 North High Street

Mike Sorboro (Applicant)

Mike Maloof (Owner)

An application, site plan, and elevation drawings have been submitted.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing one-story, frame building. Based on a review of Sanborn Fire Insurance maps, the building was constructed sometime between 1901 and 1922, and was historically associated with auto dealerships.

Install New Pizza Stand & Landscaping

- Install a movable shipping container-style pizza trailer, per the submitted example photos.
- Stripe rear of lot for car parking, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new tables and landscaping.
- Install new fencing to separate parking, trash, and patron seating area, per the submitted site plan.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Could agree to installation of some sort of movable food trailer if the existing building is demolished and the south wall of the brick building repaired.
- Appreciates the Applicant's proposal to improve the lot.

Jason Sudy:

- Expects that the lot will be redeveloped at some point, at which time, it would be appropriate to remove the existing lean-to. In the meantime, having the existing lean-to building on the lot is better than having nothing there while it's an open lot. Could go either way with installing a temporary, movable structure and either removing or retaining the lean-to building.
- Overall, the proposed improvements would seem to work.

Charmaine Sutton:

- No additional comments.

Rex Hagerling:

- No additional comments.

Josh Lapp:

- No additional comments.

NO ACTION TAKEN

19. 14-12-16

1160 North High Street

John Behal/Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)

Stonewall Columbus, Inc. (Owner)

Demolition

- First conceptual review of the demolition of the existing 1957 commercial building at 1160 N. High Street and redevelopment of the lots in conjunction with the adjacent building at 14 East Fourth Avenue.

Prior to review of Application #14-12-16, Commission Sutton noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Noted that the building is listed as contributing by the Short North Design Guidelines (SNDG 4.3).
- Would strongly encourage the adaptive reuse of the building rather than demolition.
- Noted examples where the façade or front section of a building has been retained, with partial demolition and new construction at the rear.
- The significance of the building has to be evaluated within its own time period.

David Cooke:

- Referred to CC3116.14 – Standards for Demolition, which includes, "If seeking to demolish an entire structure or major portion thereof, the applicant shall also submit definite plans for reuse of the site, evidence of commitment for funding of the new project, a time frame for project initiation and completion, and an assessment of the effect such plans will have on the character and integrity of the Listed Property or District."
- The Commission is charged with maintaining the pedestrian experience. Filling in the entire block would encourage people to continue to move northward.
- This building does have significance and the right setback for High Street.

Jason Sudy:

- Noted that this particular corner is somewhat characterized by buildings dating from the 1950s.

- Referring to Commissioner Lapp's comment about utilizing a portion of the building, does not see an intrinsic need to saving the entire building. It would be an asset if all driveway access were to be eliminated and the entire High Street frontage would be infilled. Also, would prefer to see some elements of the existing building retained as part of the infill of the entire street frontage.
- Would need to be strongly compelled in order to support demolition of the entire building. The building is not of the general vernacular of the street, but is still a contributing element of the street. There is no doubt that the Fourth Avenue building needs to remain.
- Does not have an issue with adding stories. Would want to see a distinct visual break between the existing and the new construction. May be the best solution to add square footage.
- The Commission will consider all concepts, but there is a much higher bar for demolition than for rehabilitation or additions.

Rex Hagerling:

- Has never looked at the building and thought it would be a better streetscape without it.
- Thinks that the building does contribute to the streetscape to a certain extent.
- Would suggest presenting a variety of concepts.

NO ACTION TAKEN

20. 14-12-17

60 East Hubbard Avenue

Connie Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Nancy Haitz (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #14-12-17, Commissioner Sutton returned to the table.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-12-17 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-12-17a

Demolition

- Demolish the existing one story additions at the rear of the existing, contributing two-story house.

Reasons for approval of demolition:

1) Based on a review of Sanborn maps, tax records, and physical examination, the units attached to the rear of the two-story house are not original or appropriate, and are found to be non-contributing; 2) Removal of the one-story additions will restore the scale of the historic house.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) DEMOLITION APPROVED

14-12-17b

New Construction

- Construct new, two-story multi-family dwelling, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Exterior cladding to be brick and corrugated metal.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- For the next review, the Commission will need to see a complete site plan with walkways, courtyard, etc.
- Would it be possible to move the far left/west entrance on the rear/south elevation around to the side elevation to avoid having so many entrances on the south elevation?
- Consider using the same metal on the smaller section of the rooftop unit, perhaps in a different color. Also, consider stepping it back a bit to change the perspective from below.
- Would be helpful to see the floor plans.

Charmaine:

- It would be helpful to understand the rear elevation of the existing house. What will the view be from the house to the townhomes?

Rex Hagerling:

- Would like to see material samples for the next review.

Todd Boyer:

- The west elevation has a sort of composition of windows that is lacking on the east elevation.

NO ACTION TAKEN

21. 14-12-18 (Conceptual Review)

848 Pearl Street

Connie Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Wood Run Partners, LL. (Owner)

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, 1971, single-story industrial building.

New Construction

- Construct a new, six-story, glass and brick condominium building, per the submitted renderings.
- New building to include first floor parking space.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Appreciates the presented information regarding the evolution of the project. Agrees that the finishes and details will make the building.
- Is not yet comfortable with the articulation of the first floor. Difficult at this point to understand fully how it addresses the street. Initially, it feels like it needs more of a base statement. The base is not clearly defined.
- Would like to have more clarity about the entrances.

Todd Boyer:

- Still thinks that the building seems too big, but will have to see how it evolves.
- There is no real transition to High Street. As you move through the streets now, you build a transition to the scale and density of High Street. The final materials may make a difference. Would like to see more connectivity.
- The carving away on the south elevation is great.
- Will need to focus on the transition from the sidewalk into the building and from the building out to exterior spaces.
- Does not think that a terrace is always the best way to transition to exterior spaces.

Jason Sudy:

- Noted that scale is a challenge within this whole corridor. What is being proposed conceptually is neither right or wrong at this point. Seems to be on the right track with the translucency and glass walls.
- The moves that have been made to soften the corners are smart-at ground level and the upper floors.
- Would like more details regarding how the first floor entrances will work. What is visible from the street and what is not visible.
- Wonders about the value of including balconies on lower floors that look directly onto the parking garage.
- Need to consider adjacent restaurant service areas when determining the main entrances.

Josh Lapp:

- Agrees with Commissioner Cooke's comments regarding the base of the building.
- Is happy to see the provided green space/pocket park. It is an improvement to the right-of-way.
- Appreciates the possibility of including art and/or sculpture throughout the building.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Agrees with Commissioner Boyer regarding the mass of the building. Thinks the concern is more about the height than the footprint, which could be resolved with the base. Thinks it goes too far into the sidewalk.
- Likes the “mansard” effect shown at the top of the building, and thinks it could be pushed by bringing that effect down to the bottom. Perhaps a Miesian effect at the base, where one walks under a bit of the building.

Rex Hagerling:

- Reiterated that he is not in favor of building so high on the east side of Pearl Street, and is concerned about setting precedent.
- Putting mass aside, thinks it could have the potential of being a nice building, but would be reluctant to support a building of the proposed size.

NO ACTION TAKEN

22. 14-10-18

126-140 Greenwood Avenue/Burwell Court

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Brad Howe/Burwell Investments, LLC (Owner)

Application # 14-10-18, 126-140 Greenwood Avenue/Burwell Court, for the construction of three-story townhomes with a total of eight units, Phase I of a larger mixed-use project, was approved at the December 9, 2014 IVC special meeting. Submission of a new application will be required for further review of Phase II.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

23. 14-10-19

174 Detroit Avenue

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

Exterior Building Alteration

- Rehabilitate existing, two (2) story, brick building for use as eighteen (18) single bedroom units.
- Restore existing, bricked in window openings and install new aluminum windows.
- Remove existing awning.
- Infill existing front door with exterior cladding and window unit, and relocate entrance from Detroit Avenue to Hamlet Street.
- Remove a portion of the existing roof to create an open area well with new courtyard.

Demolition

- Demolish adjacent metal storage building and loading dock.

New Construction

- Build new 3.5 story wood frame building with thirteen (13) single bedroom units at location of existing metal storage building.
- Build new, partially below grade parking with thirty-one (31) spaces to serve both buildings.

Revised drawings were presented by the Applicant to follow up on the December 9th special meeting. Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Thinks that the revised version of the front garage entrance, with the curb cut moved to the side, is a much better solution than before.
- The additional space between the new construction and the existing historic house to the east is an improvement.
- Would like some clarification regarding exterior cladding materials.
- Will need to submit streetscapes for both sides of the street, street trees, sidewalks, etc.

Josh Lapp:

- Will need more time to review the submitted drawings, but initially thinks the revisions are an improvement over the previous submittal.

Todd Boyer:

- Likes the development of the corner moving in. It does a lot to make it a more inviting entry into that space. It's much more successful. It hides the maintenance door.
- The location of the signage and address number and the awning at the east end makes the location of the main entrance a bit confusing. The awning seems to denote a main entry.
- The rain screen piece seems too busy. Perhaps more solids could help.
- Continues to lean toward taking cues from the simplicity of the existing building.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Likes the idea of a glass box at the rear, but the columns make it look too busy.
- Currently sees a disconnect between the front elevation and the back elevation which don't match in any way. Would like to see something that somehow ties both pieces together. Consider more glass on the rear with the deconstructive pieces pushing through the glass, or tie the rear in more with the front.

Rex Hagerling:

- Likes the revisions that have been made to the front elevation, including the separation between the two buildings. It relates to the existing building much better.
- Would still be interested to see more simplification of the side and rear. There are a lot of different materials going on. Needs more information on the materials and colors, and how the materials connect. Would be inclined to see it more monochromatic.

NO ACTION TAKEN

24. 14-10-20

No Address (formerly 1066-1068 Hamlet/SE Corner of Detroit and Hamlet)

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-10-20, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the January 20, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) CONTINUED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-12-1 [Cooke]**

191 East First Avenue

Mark A. Potnick (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-12-1, 191 East First Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave, soffit, and fascia on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **14-12-2**
1034 Summit Street
Angela Fry (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-12-2, 1034 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Storm Door
 - Install a new, Larson full-view storm door, with almond frame to match house, at front door.
 - Cut sheet and color chip for the new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of the door.

- **14-12-3**
806 Hamlet Street
Lisa G. Swartzwelder (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-12-3, 806 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Windows
 - Remove the two (2), existing, deteriorated, one-over-one, double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows on the second floor of the west elevation.
 - Install two (2), new, Lincoln, one-over-one, double-hung, aluminum-clad wood windows in the same location, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. Exterior color to match existing windows.Note: Installation of aluminum-clad, wood windows is appropriate at this location because the house was constructed in 2002.

- **14-12-4**
158 Warren Street
Jessica Firkins (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-12-4, 158 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Install New Horizontal Fence
 - Install a new six-foot-high (6'H) fence in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan and example photograph.
 - Fence to be horizontally applied 1" x 6" cedar boards and 4" x 4" posts, per the submitted example photograph.
 - Fence to be double-sided, with no stringers or posts facing neighboring properties. Spacing between the horizontal boards to be no wider than one-half inch (½").
 - Finish to be natural cedar, or finish color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to application of paint or stain.

- **14-12-5**
834 Summit Street
Michael Linsker/Linsker Holdings, LLC (Applicant/Owner)
Approve Application 14-12-5, 834 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.
Repair Exterior Stairway
 - Repair/replace any rotted or damage wood on the existing, non-contributing, exterior stairway on the south elevation.
 - Install new, wood risers at each step.
 - Install additional, wood balusters, to match existing, to insure a maximum of two inches (2") of space between balusters.
 - Install new, wood, beveled hand rails at the landings and along the stairway.
 - Prepare all wood surfaces for repainting.
 - Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing trim, i.e., Valspar "High Speed Steel" and "Vintage Grey."

- **14-12-6**

54-56 East Third Avenue

JF Baker's Sons, Inc. (Applicant)

Carol A. Wengerd (Owner)

Approve Application 14-12-6, 54-56 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof and rear additions, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Certain Teed, standard 3-tab, color "Nickel Gray."
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the flat upper area of the roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **14-12-9a**

263 Detroit Avenue

Arch City Realty Group, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-12-9a, 263 Detroit Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Doors

- Remove the two (2) existing, non-original, non-contributing front entrance doors and the one (1) non-original, non-contributing rear entrance door.
- Install new, wood doors of an appropriate style, selected from the *Italian Village Guidelines for Rehabilitation & New Construction*, page 35 in consultation with the Italian Village Commission. Rear door only may be metal or fiberglass. Final door style selected to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation.
- Remove all materials to expose the original transoms at the two (2) front entrances, and restore, as necessary, with new wood and glass of the exact same profile and dimensions as the original; like-for-like.
- Paint/stain color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint/stain.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair/Main Roof and Porch Roof

- Repair and/or replace all non-original vinyl, or damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood.
- New material to be [] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead.
- Repair/replace all exposed rafter tails, on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Replace Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing, deteriorated porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be [] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead (with sanded surface and 1/8" beaded pattern approx. 1.6" o.c.); prime exposed surface complete.
- Paint/stain color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Restore the existing, wood front porch columns, as necessary, with like material of exact same dimension and profile, like-for-like.
- Repair/replace existing, wood front porch steps, as necessary.
- Remove the existing, non-original front porch skirting, and install new, wood porch skirting. Final design for the new front porch skirting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Install Stair Handrail

- Install new handrails at front porch and front and side yard service steps, in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes.
- Prior to the installation of the new handrail, examine the existing front porch and service steps, and perform any/all necessary site work to insure a stable and level foundation for the existing steps with appropriate slope for water drainage.
- Install new, black metal handrails in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes **[Note: Plumbers pipe with a combination of street and conventional 90's is not appropriate and is not approved for use on this site.]** Style of rails to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Install black pipe with malleable, adjustable fittings. Pipe diameter to be 1"-1 1/4" only; b) Install a one-piece, black, tubular steel rail & post unit. Tube diameter to be 1"- 1 1/4" only; c) Install a manufactured rail system per Fortin Welding & Mfg. Inc. (or like manufacturer) brochure, Model RSS, page #9.

Install New Half-Round Gutters

- Remove the existing, inappropriate, non-original, ogee gutters and corrugated down spouts and dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension, as necessary.
- Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; Paint color chip

to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- Install new, 5", half-round metal gutters and new round, metal down spouts of the appropriate dimension. Finish color to match the existing trim color.
- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

XI. OLD BUSINESS

XII. NEW BUSINESS

- Commission Chairs Meetings Update
 - Chair Hagerling provided a brief update on the Commission Chairs meetings that have been scheduled throughout the year. Historic Preservation Office staff has drafted specifications for new, non-illuminated, projecting signs and certain aspects of landscaping for possible addition to the Staff Approvals list for all Architectural Review areas. The specifications have been reviewed and discussed by the Commission Chairs and Vice-Chairs at several meetings, and now are being forwarded to all Commissioners for review and comment. Comments should be forwarded to Chair Hagerling.
- Commission Budget
 - Commissioner Cooke, treasurer, noted the requirement to close out the 2014 Italian Village Commission account and return any unused funds. Some of the uses for the 2014 funds included, donations of support for the German Village Society's Great Placemaker's Lab; NAPC memberships for IVC Commissioners; books for the Historic Preservation Office library; and attendance of one commissioner for the National Alliance for Preservation Commissions conference. Commissioners should be thinking about viable uses for the 2015 funds.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (5-0-0) ADJOURNED (9:35 p.m.)