

**DRAFT**  
**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION**  
**MINUTES**

**Tuesday, January 21, 2014**

**6:15 p.m.**

**50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B**

**Commissioners Present:** Todd Boyer (left 6:30 p.m.), David Cooke, Ben Goodman (acting Chair through agenda item #2), Rex Hagerling (arrived 6:52 p.m.), Joshua Lapp, Charmaine Sutton

**Commissioners Absent:** Jason Sudy

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

- I.** CALL TO ORDER (6:15 p.m.).
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, February 11, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, February 18, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, December 17, 2013.  
MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-1-0 [Cooke]) APPROVED
- V.** PUBLIC FORUM
- **14-1-13**  
**608 N High Street, 650 North High Street, 700 North High Street, 944 North High Street, and 1130 North High Street**  
**Short North Alliance (Applicant) Multiple Owners**  
*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and ensuing discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*  
Approve Application 14-1-13, 323 608 N High Street, 650 North High Street, 700 North High Street, 944 North High Street, and 1130 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted:  
Install New Mini Murals
    - Install five (5) new, approximately 10’ x 10’, temporary murals on multiple locations for the ‘Short North Arts District Mini Mural’ program for 2014.
    - Murals are high resolution photographs of works of art transferred to a vinyl material, printed, and heat-adhered to the exterior wall of the buildings.
    - Murals to be installed for a period of eighteen (18) months from the projected installation date of the last two weeks of February 2014.
    - The 2014 mini mural location will be as follows: 608 N High Street, 650 North High Street, 700 North High Street, 944 North High Street, and 1130 North High Street.MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VI.** STAFF APPROVALS  
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

## HOLDOVERS

### 1. 13-11-23

**780 North High Street**

**Jeff Parenteau & Chris Corso (Applicants)**

**Silver Century Holdings, Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and ensuing discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application 13-11-23, 780 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Exterior Cooler

- Retain the existing five-foot-wide-by-eight-foot-high cooler, as installed at the rear of the building, per the submitted photographs.
- Remove the existing eight-foot-high (8' H) chain link fencing with metal posts that encloses the existing cooler at the rear of the property.
- Install new, eight-foot-high (8' H) fence in the same location, to enclose the existing cooler.
- Final fencing and post materials and fence drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioner Sutton, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

### 2. 13-12-7

**940 North High Street**

**Brian O'Neill (Applicant)**

**Robert E. Brunner (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Continue Application # 13-12-7, 940 North High Street, for a second time, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the February 18, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda. The Applicant is to work with Historic Preservation Office staff to submit drawings for a new or modified sign design no later than the application date of February 4<sup>th</sup>.

NOTE: In keeping with the requirements of the Italian Village Commission, applications will be removed from the agenda following three consecutive absences of the Applicant.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) CONTINUED

## NEW APPLICATIONS

### 3. 14-1-5

**27 East Fifth Avenue**

**Kevin Grimm/Fireball Express (Applicant)**

**Richard T. Day (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and further discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Continue Application # 14-1-5, 27 East Fifth Avenue, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the February 18, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda. The Applicant is to remove the existing four flags on the front elevation, and submit drawings for a new sign design no later than the application date of February 4<sup>th</sup>.

Commissioner Comments:

- Holes made into the mortar of the façade for the existing flag poles will need to be appropriately repaired.
- Encourage the Applicant to consider a banner sign or projecting sign.

MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (5-0-0) CONTINUED

4. 13-12-8

**185 East Second Avenue**

**Benjamin James Davis (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and further discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application 13-12-8, 185 East Second Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted:

Enclose Side Entrance Porch

- Remove existing concrete steps on west elevation.
- Enclose the existing, recessed, side entrance porch on the west elevation, per the submitted rendering.
- New wood siding over infilled porch to match original wood siding following the removal of existing, non-original aluminum siding and asbestos cement siding from the entire house (see COA # 13-11-13a).

Convert Existing Window Opening to Door Opening

- Convert the existing window opening on the first floor rear/south elevation, center bay, to a door opening, per the submitted drawing.
- Install new, wood stoop, steps, and handrails at the new entrance. Drawing to be submitted to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation. Paint color chip for stoop, steps, and handrails to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new shed or gable roofed door hood above the new entrance steps. Drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- New window for the small window opening on the first floor of the rear/south elevation is to be a single light fixed, casement, or awning window.
- Install new four-light, two-panel door. Cut sheet/specifications for new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Following the removal of existing, non-original aluminum siding and asbestos cement siding from the entire house, Applicant is to submit detail drawings for any new wood window trim, door trim, and corner boards, prior to installation (see COA #13-11-13a and #13-11-13b).

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED

5. 14-1-7

**850 North Fourth Street**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)**

**Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, installation of a temporary private garden was added to the application, and Application #14-1-7 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

**14-1-7a**

Approve Application 14-1-7a, 850 North Fourth Street, with all clarifications, as noted:

Jeffrey Park Community Center / Modify Previously Approved Plans

- Modify previously approved plans, as approved November 19, 2013/COA # 13-11-18a, to accommodate restaurant tenant.
- Utilize the roof directly over the office and the restaurant for rooftop gardening.
- Extend the stair on East First Avenue above the roof deck to allow access to the roof.
- Modify mechanical screening and guardrails to accommodate the plantings.
- Utilize Café seating on North Fourth Street between the restaurant and building entrance. Most of the seating to be on private property with a small portion being in the city right-of-way.
- Modify the roof top pool terrace to just a rooftop with no stair or railings.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

**14-1-7b**

Approve Application 14-1-7b, 850 North Fourth Street, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install Temporary Private Garden

- Install a temporary private garden at the southwest corner of North Fourth Street and Warren Street, per the submitted site plan.
- The temporary garden is approved for a period of one year from the date of approval (January 21, 2014). Continuation of the garden beyond the one year period will require a new application and review by the Italian Village Commission.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED

**VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS**

**6. 14-1-8**

**1066 North High Street**

**Douglas Graff (Applicant)**

**Directions for Youth & Families (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and further discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Recommend approval of Application 14-1-8, 1066 North High street, with all clarifications, as noted:

Recommendation for Rezoning

- Change in zoning from R-4 Residential District to C-4 Commercial.
- Council Variance 98-048, approved December 1998, currently restricts use of the former church building to social service agencies for offices, education, recreation, assembly, and food and clothing distribution only.
- Use to change from Short Stop Youth Center to professional offices.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) RECOMMENDED

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**7. 14-1-9**

**806 Hamlet Street**

**Lisa G. Swartzwelder (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

- At the request of the Applicant, remove Application # 14-1-9, for installation of one (1) new, Fortin, arched, black, iron handrail, from the agenda.

Note: Submittal of a new application would be required to be placed on a future agenda.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (5-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

**8. 14-1-10**

**732-734 Kerr Street**

**Andrea Longshore (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the staff report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

*Note: installation of the porch balustrades was removed from the application by the Applicant.*

Approve Application 14-1-10, 732-734 Kerr Street, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Porch Steps Handrails

- Install new, black, wrought iron porch steps railings at the front stoops of 732 and 734 Kerr Street, per the submitted drawing.
- All materials powder coated black.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (4-0-1 [Sutton]) APPROVED

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

**9. 13-12-10**

**875 Summit Street**

**Wood Run Partners, LLC/Truberry Custom Homes (Applicant)**

**Al-Khatib Khalid (Owner)**

Demolition

- Demolish the existing ca. 1938 gas station building.

New Construction

- Construct seven (7) new, three-story dwellings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- Individual, two (2) car garage space provided for each unit on the first story.
- Primary access to be from First Avenue at the north side of the site.

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Comments

David Cooke:

- Opposed to the northernmost unit on First Avenue. Reducing it to one story may help.
- Encourage applicant to look at the porches again. Need variety to make them appear as separate dwellings.
- Would like to see a variety of windows. Currently proposed window type is not typical of the neighborhood.
- Appreciates the current proposal is all residential with no commercial.

Joshua Lapp:

- The overall design and footprint seems okay.
- Does not find the existing gas station to be as significant as others in the neighborhood.

Charmaine Sutton:

- If the existing gas station is approved for demolition, would not be opposed to the overall proposal, in general.
- The project seems suburban and too big for the site.
- Would like to see more creative setbacks. Consider the relationship to pedestrians.

Ben Goodman:

- The proposed design still has a ways to go. The flat roofs seem out of character for the neighborhood. Hipped or shallow slope would be more appropriate.
- The cornice between the second and third levels is too much detail.
- The section along East First Avenue should be scaled down to meld more with the character of existing dwellings.
- Still need further discussion as to whether the demolition of the existing gas station building is appropriate. Would like to see the existing building recycled into the development in some fashion.

Rex Hagerling:

- Agrees that the north section is an intrusion on East First Avenue. Reducing to one story may help.
- Thinks the proposed window size could be appropriate, but not the muntin pattern.
- Would like to see some elements of the design simplified.
- Is okay with the overall footprint as currently proposed.
- Could appreciate an appropriate restoration of the existing gas station building, but not sure if it could be part of a residential project.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**10. 13-10-12**

**866 North Pearl Street**

**Prescott & Pearl, LLC (Applicant/Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and renderings have been submitted.*

New Construction

- Construct a new 3.5-story residential building with 24 dwelling units.
- First floor to include enclosed parking at grade, with primary access from N. Pearl Street at the west.
- On-site parking to provide 20 spaces, including handicap access and bike storage.
- Building to be constructed to step back from the south, east, and west property lines at the top level.
- Building materials to include stone veneer, brick veneer and glass.

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Comments

David Cooke:

- The top still seems detached from the base. Consider making the top black rather than white or a light color.
- Would like to see the canopy at the entryway more pronounced to announce the entrance.
- Would not have an issue with hanging the canopy off the building. A metal industrial look would be appropriate.
- Consider reducing the glass at the entrance, i.e., eliminate the bottom window.
- Will be interested in how the building is branded.

Joshua Lapp:

- The overall proposal is fitting better. The changes that have been made work.

Ben Goodman:

- Overall, the proposal is on the right track. Some details still need to be worked out.
- The entry and the way the walls there are treated will be an important feature.
- Will be interested in seeing some trees on the site. Consider ways to make the sidewalk attractive.

Rex Hagerling:

- In general, the project is much improved.
- Would like to see the panels in the base recessed more than ¾ or an inch.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**11. 14-1-11**

**875 Summit Street**

**Lauren Culley & Jeffrey Excell (Applicants)**

**Al-Khatib Khalid (Owner)**

*Following the January 14, 2014 IVC business meeting, this application was withdrawn by the applicants, in consultation with the property owner.*

Building Renovation

- Renovate the existing ca. 1938 gas station building for use as an artisan café, per the submitted drawings.
- Site work to include widening of the sidewalks on Summit Street and First Avenue, repaving of the parking area, and installation of plantings.

NO ACTION REQUIRED

**12. 14-1-12**

**155, 159, 163, 167, 169 East Third Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**The New Victorians, Inc. (Owner)**

*An application, photographs, site plan, and elevations have been submitted.*

New Construction

- Construct five (5) new, single family homes and five (5) new detached, two-car garages.

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Comments

David Cooke:

- Three full, second story porches along the block seems like too much. Consider eliminating the porch on house #2 (167 E. Third Ave).
- The garages have been the least successful part of the development at 150-170 Punta Alley project. Could two garages be clustered together as pairs? Would add a bit more variety to have them less exactly symmetrically placed. Also, gives more lawn or garden space. Garage materials could vary.
- Consider entering the 171 E. Third Ave garage from the alley.

Ben Goodman:

- Overall, moving in the right direction.
- The second story porch railings seem a bit out of character for the neighborhood. Consider one of the two with spindles and one with a privacy panel.
- Flat roofs could be appropriate on some of the garages.
- Would like to see some door hoods over the garage service doors.

Rex Hagerling:

- Generally in agreement with comments of other Commissioners.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **14-1-1**

**233-235 East Third Avenue**

**The New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-1-1, 233-235 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color to be "gray."
- Repair/replace wood trim at the base of the existing columns, with new wood, like-for-like. Paint color to match existing, "white."

• **14-1-2**

**732-734 Kerr Street [Goodman]**

**Andrea Longshore (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-1-2, 732-734 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Basement Windows

- Retain the existing glass block basement windows, as installed by previous owner.
- At such time when it is necessary to replace the basement windows in the future, the appropriate, two-light, wood, hopper windows are to be installed by the current or future owner.

Install New Storm Doors

- Install new, Larson Lakeview ScreenAway, aluminum storm doors on the front entrance doors of 732 and 734 Kerr Street, per the submitted product cut sheet. Color to be "Almond."

Repair Stone Foundation & Brick Porch/Steps (work completed)

- Remove any/all damaged brick and/or stone and replace with brick and/or stone that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.

- Moisture surface with water and solid point with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Install New Drain Pipe From Downspouts

- Install new drain pipe from the existing gutter/downspout on the front elevation of 734 Kerr Street, beneath the existing public sidewalk to the existing stone curb, similar to existing at 732 Kerr Street.
- Reinstall any damaged concrete sidewalk and/or stone curbing, like-for-like, as needed.
- All work to be completed per industry standards and in accordance with any/all Columbus City Codes.

- **14-1-3**

**1039 Hamlet Street**

**Mae & Fred Hollis (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-1-3, 1039 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Windows

- Remove the existing four (4), non-original vinyl windows and the one (1), deteriorated, wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash window on the north elevation.
- Install five (5) new, Pella, Architect Series, all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash windows. New windows to match the size of the original window openings.

- **14-1-4**

**1116 Say Avenue [Lapp]**

**Timothy Foradis (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-1-4, 1116 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Windows

- Remove all existing, non-original, wood windows (replacement of all windows previously approved in 1999).
- Install new, PlyGem, all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung sash windows, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. New windows to be located within the original window openings, and to be of the same size as the original window openings.
- Install new, wood, exterior window trim, to match existing, non-original wood trim.
- Prime and paint new wood windows and trim. Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff, prior to application of paint.

- **14-1-6**

**24-30 East First Avenue**

**John Wood (Applicant)**

**Owner)**

Approve Application 14-1-6, 24-30 East First Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install Tie Rods

- Install new, structural tension rods to repair brick veneer/lateral brick displacement, per the submitted photographs and engineer's report. Exterior anchor plates to be star-shaped.
- New ties to be installed at the floor framing level and roof framing level.
- Any deteriorated or missing tile or metal coping to be replaced, like-for-like.

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS**

**IX. NEW BUSINESS**

- 2014 Election of Chair, Vice-Chair, and Treasurer

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION BY-LAWS, ARTICLE IV - Organization

Officers shall be elected annually by majority vote of the Commission and should include, but not limited to, Chairman, Secretary and Recorder.

*The following nominations of officers were made at the December 17, 2013 IVC hearing :*

*Nominations for Chair, Vice-Chair, and Fiscal Officer for the year 2014.*

- *Chair – Rex Hagerling nominated*
- *Vice-Chair – Jason Sudy nominated*
- *Fiscal Officer – David Cooke nominated*

*MOTION: Goodman/Sudy ALL NOMINATIONS APPROVED*

**X. ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (5-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:40 p.m.)