**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION**

**MINUTES**

**Tuesday, July 15, 2014**

**6:15 p.m.**

**50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B**

**Commissioners Present:** Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy

**Commissioners Absent:** Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Charmaine Sutton

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

1. CALL TO ORDER (6:16 p.m.).
2. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, August 12, 2014

– 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.

1. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, August 19, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, June 17, 2014.

 MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. PUBLIC FORUM

*Following the approval of the minutes, one speaker slip was submitted under Public Forum. The speaker was sworn in by Acting Chairperson Sudy.*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name, Address, Affiliation:** | **Issues/ Comments:** |
| Rob Wagner929 North Fourth StreetGeneral comments  | * Concerns regarding the recent collapse of the Sunset Lounge building. Thinks that the property was handled in an unsafe manner.
* Concerns that renovation of buildings in Italian Village is out of reach financially for some people.
* Concerns about some properties that are not maintained.
 |

In response, Commissioner Sudy noted that he is very unhappy that the Sunset lounge building collapsed, and does not understand why it collapsed. There was never any indication during the review that the building could not be safely rehabilitated. The Commission will discuss with HPO staff whether any policy changes could be implemented to prevent other historic buildings from collapsing during renovation or requiring demolition due to neglect. Commissioner Sudy encouraged Mr. Wagner to discuss any other issues with HPO staff, or put his concerns in writing, to be forwarded to the Commission.

Commissioner Cooke noted that issues such as unmown grass and general maintenance are not in the purview of the Italian Village Commission, and encouraged Mr. Wagner to use the City’s 311 system to report those concerns. Commissioner Cooke noted that demolition of the Sunset lounge was never approved. It was made clear during applications by Mr. Wagner and by Mr. Lykens that the building was a contributing building. Thinks it is a highly unusual situation that the building is down and gone.

1. APPROVAL OF SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES – Tuesday, May 13, 2014.

 MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. STAFF APPROVALS

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

1. **14-5-17**

**1024 North High Street**

**John Simon/RED Architecture & Planning (Applicant) Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-5-17, 1024 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Wall Signage/Chipotle

* Install one (1) new wall sign.
* The Applicant has the option of installing the new wall sign either on the facade (west elevation) or on the south elevation.

Install New Projecting Signage/Chipotle

* Install one (1) new projecting sign, one on the facade (west elevation).
* Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
* The fabrication techniques are approved, as proposed.
* No rear elevation signage is approved at this time.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-6-7**

**995 North Fourth Street**

**John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Continue Application # 14-6-7, 995 North Fourth Street, for paving of the existing parking lot, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the August 19, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for review.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) CONTINUED

1. **14-6-12**

 **1051 Hamlet Street**

 **Jason Slagle (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-6-12, 1051 Hamlet Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Porch Addition

* Extend the existing porch to wrap around to the front side of the house.
* Revised drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation staff for final review and approval, with the following clarifications: 1) Handrail design (top rail cap, bottom rail, balusters, etc.) to be per the drawing supplied by HPO staff; 2) Balusters to measure 1 ½”, with 1 ½” spaces between; 3) Roof shingles to match existing porch roof shingles; 4) Rubber membrane to line the window well.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-6-15**

 **1017 North Sixth Street**

 **Quinn Fallon (Applicant) Quinn Fallon & Scott Guiler (Owners)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-6-15, 1017 North Sixth Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

 Install Privacy Wrought Iron Fence

* Install new, 4’ H, wrought iron (steel) fence with pedestrian gate and vehicle gate along Sixth Street and the south property line, per the submitted drawing and product cut sheet.

Install Parking Pad

* Install new 12’ W, concrete parking pad, per the submitted site plan.
* Cut sheet for a permeable paver to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Install New Window Openings

* Create a new window opening on the second story of the south elevation and relocate the existing, double-hung window from the second story of the south gable end to the new opening.
* New window opening is to be aligned directly above the existing first story door opening and match size of existing window openings.
* If the existing gable end window is not in usable condition, a cut sheet for a new double-hung window is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Upon construction of the new addition, enclose the existing window opening on the second story of the south gable of the existing house, and match existing siding, as closely as possible.
* Install a new window opening at attic level in the south gable of the existing house. Product cut sheet for the new window to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Door Openings/Existing House

* All existing door openings are to remain, even if interior walls are added to cover the door openings. Cut sheets for any new operable or fixed doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

New Addition

* Construct a new three-season room at the south elevation, per the submitted drawings.
* Addition to be clad with smooth, cementitious, board-and-batten siding. Color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Note: A 4’ H fence is being approved along a street at this specific location for the following reasons: 1) The house is sited on the lot in an unusual manner, so that no rear yard exists.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-6-16**

 **1017 North Sixth Street**

 **Quinn Fallon (Applicant) Quinn Fallon & Scott Guiler (Owners)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Upon review of Application #14-6-16, 1017 North Sixth Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

Request For Variance Recommendation

* To allow the expansion of a non-conforming use.

3391.07(1)(B) Expansion of Non-Conforming Uses - Additions. For nonconforming residential uses, ordinary non-habitable additions such as attached garages, porches and decks, although requiring zoning clearance, shall not be considered expansions of nonconforming uses. Such non-habitable additions to nonconforming residential uses shall comply with the applicable development standards of the residential district that permits such use.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

**NEW APPLICATIONS**

1. **14-7-5**

 **944 North Fourth Street**

 **Quinn Fallon (Applicant/Owner)**

 New Rooftop Patio

* Install new 650 sq. ft. patio on the roof of the Little Rock Bar, per the submitted drawings.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, this application was moved to Conceptual Review. Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

* The Applicant should provide a site plan and an elevation drawing for the rear elevation at next review. Also would be helpful to have a drawing showing the building in context with any adjacent structures.
* Would consider a rooftop deck at this location, since it does not look down into residential yards or private spaces.
* Could be supportive of a fire escape approach on the rear, but no a large scale wood stairway. Would suggest more study of such an approach.

Jason Sudy:

* Any rear egress stairs should be metal and small as possible.
* Could support a rooftop deck at this location based on the conditions of this specific site. The building is low and directly on the street, a busy thoroughfare.
* There is an existing parapet, which would block the deck, somewhat on the front and sides.
* The addition of a rooftop deck should be designed in such a manner so that it does not negatively impact the building.

Josh Lapp:

* Sees this site as similar to the Seventh Son Brewing Co. site. Would not see the effect as being any different.
* Could be supportive of a rooftop deck at this location based on the way the building is situated and its character.
* Even if not a drop-type fire escape, the rear stairway should be metal and compliment the character of the building.

NO ACTION TAKEN

1. **14-7-6**

**1023 North Sixth Street**

**Jeanne Cabral (Applicant) Michael & Karen Goodburn (Owners)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-6, 1023 North Sixth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Fence/Wall

* Install a new, 6’ H, concrete block wall inside the north property line and along Sixth Street, per the submitted site plan, elevation drawings and gate detail.

Landscaping

* Install new street trees in the right-of-way, per the submitted site plan.

Signage and Lighting

* Any/all exterior lighting and signage to return for review at a future IVC hearing.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-4-33**

**270 East Third Avenue**

**Jody Dierksheide (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-4-33, 270 East Third Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

* Construct a new, frame construction, two-story, single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
* Exterior siding to be smooth, JamesHardie Flat Panel, and smooth fiver cement lap siding with 4” exposure, per the submitted product cut sheets. Color scheme to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Roof shingles to be GAF, Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) shingles; color to be Charcoal.
* Exterior light fixture over exterior entrances to be Progress Lighting, 7.25” H, metallic gray, dark sky outdoor wall light, per the submitted product cut sheet.
* Windows to be Marvin, aluminum-clad wood, Ultimate venting picture windows, per the submitted product cut sheets. Color to be “black.”
* Doors to be painted wood, Marvin Contemporary doors, per the submitted product cut sheets. Color to be “black.”
* Exterior decking to be Trex composite decking, color to be “Spiced Rum,” per the submitted product cut sheets.
* Foundation material to be smooth, DesignBlok, per the submitted example photographs. Color to be “gray.”
* Any exterior handrails to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-7 (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)**

**270 East Third Avenue**

**Jody Dierksheide (Applicant/Owner)**

New Construction/Hair Salon

* Construct a new building, for use as a hair salon, at the rear of the lot, per the submitted site plan.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

* The smaller salon, with a single proprietor, provides more parking spaces with three operating chairs, while the large salon indicates that additional parking spaces may be needed. Could entertain the smaller proposal that still has the feel of a garage structure. The larger salon would add too much traffic for the alleyway. Could not be supportive of the larger proposal.
* If the project goes forward, consider designing a salon that will relate to the design of the house.

Jason Sudy:

* Still need additional information regarding zoning in this area.
* Any business use in the rear of a residential lot needs to be generally no more burdensome to the neighbors than a typical garage.
* Commission would need to understand the number of employees, type of business, and other operational details.
* Could not be highly commercial in nature at a time of day when there is an expectation that it would behave like a residential area.

Josh Lapp:

* Historically, there have been and still are small home/residential business in the area. Will need to have a clear understanding of what constitutes a home business and what constitutes a full-scale business.
* Generally agrees that smaller concept is better for the neighborhood.
* Consider a loft space.
* Is supportive of the concept.

 Todd Boyer:

* In general agreement with comments of fellow commissioners.

NO ACTION TAKEN

1. **14-7-8**

**NE corner of Summit Street & Second Avenue (Addresses to be Assigned)**

**Land Use Plan, Ltd. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-8, NE corner of Summit Street & Second Avenue (Addresses to be Assigned), with all clarifications, as noted.

 New Construction

* Construct six (6) new single family homes on six (6) lots, per the submitted site plan, elevation drawings, and specifications.
* Foundation to be smooth, poured concrete.
* All roofs to be standing-seam-metal, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. Color to be “Charcoal Gray.”
* Siding to be HardiePanel vertical, board-and-batten siding, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. Battens to be 1 ½” wide, spaced 12” on center. Color scheme to be tones of gray, per the submitted paint color chips.
* Trim to be cementitious board, 1” thick, or Fypon, 1 ¼” thick, painted.
* Trim at windows and doors to be 3 ½” wide; Corner board trim to be 6” wide.
* All doors to be full light, aluminum clad doors, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications.
* All windows to be aluminum clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung sash, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications. Color to be “Charcoal Gray.”
* Cut sheet/specifications for garage doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
* Landscape design to return to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-9**

**875 Summit Street**

**Wood Run Partners, LLC/Truberry Custom Homes (Applicant/Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application* 14-7-9*, Commissioner Cooke noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room.*

*Following the swearing in of the Applicants, Acting Chairperson, Sudy, called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name, Address, Affiliation:** | **Issues/ Comments:** |
| Andrew Otey105 E. First Ave.Neighboring property owner | * Excited to see the site development. Appreciates cooperation he has experienced with the builder.
* Has some concerns about effect of below grade garages on the existing large tree.
* Concerns about access to the alley. Wants to see how that develops.
* Would like to see additional color accents added to the brick.
 |

*Following the speaker, further presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-9, 875 Summit Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

 New Construction

* Construct six (6) new, attached, three-story dwellings, per the submitted site plan and renderings dated 7-15-2014, and reviewed at the July 15, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing.
* Exterior cladding to be brick. Brick and mortar colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Material and color for roofline coping to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Details for entrance canopies, sunscreens, and downspouts to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Cut sheets and colors for windows, doors, and garage doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Sills and lintels to be solid, not split.
* Material for sills and lintels to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Final landscape plan, including sidewalk materials and dimensions, planter walls and fence materials, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
* Final details for dumpster location and screening to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
* Cut sheets for any/all exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
* Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (3-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

1. **14-7-10**

**Jeffrey Park Apartments/SE corner E. First Ave. & N. Sixth St.**

**Rob Harris (Applicant) Jeffrey New Day (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-10, Jeffrey Park Apartments/SE corner E. First Ave. & N. Sixth St., with all clarifications, as noted.

Change Previously Approved Brick Color/Texture for New Construction – Apartment Buildings A & B and Walk-Up Pods

* Brand, types, finishes, and colors of new brick “A” and “B” and “G” and “I” to be per the submitted photographic examples and specifications.
* Brand, types, finishes, and colors of new cast stone to be per the submitted photographic examples and specifications.

Modify Previously Approved Window Pattern for New Construction – Apartment Building B

* Shift window locations and remove one window, based on mandatory change per the fire code, per the submitted elevation drawings which illustrate the previously approved window pattern and the proposed changes.
* Window colors to remain the same as previously approved, per the submitted photographic examples.

Change Previously Approved Light Fixtures for New Construction

* New exterior light fixtures to be per the submitted photographic examples and specifications.

 MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-11**

**50 East Brickel Street**

**Jason Vo & Bryan Yuris (Applicants/Owners)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-11, 50 East Brickel Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Portion or Wall

* Remove a portion of the concrete block wall, as illustrated in the submitted photographs, to reduce vision obstruction of the building.

 MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-12**

**68 East Lincoln Street**

**Precision Slate & Tile (Applicant) Kris Schultz (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-12, 68 East Lincoln Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

## Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

* Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
* Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
* Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
* Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
* Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
* Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer: Style: Color:

[ ] CertainTeed Carriage House (dimensional) [ ] Stonegate Gray

[ ] GAF Slateline (dimensional) [ ] English Gray Slate

 [ ] Weathered Slate

[ ] Certain Teed (standard 3-tab) [ ] Nickel Gray

[ ] GAF Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab) [ ] Nickel Gray

[ ] Owens Corning (standard 3-tab) [ ] Estate Gray

[ ] Tamko (standard 3-tab) [ ] Antique Slate

* All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red.”
* Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
* Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

 MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-13 (New Application)**

**1047 North Fourth Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) Kevin Lykens/Lykens Co. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application # 14-7-13, 1047 North Fourth Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Storefront

* Remove the existing, non-original, plywood infill and flush door.
* Remove the existing block infill, per the submitted drawing.
* Repair/replace existing wood trim, like-for-like.
* Install new pedestrian doors, garage door, and storefront windows, per the submitted elevation drawing.
* A detail section drawing for the storefront to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Material details for the metal upper section of the façade to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation (Not to be brake metal or left to rust in place).
* All final exterior finishes and colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Product cut sheets/specifications for exterior pedestrian doors and overhead garage door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation
* Any/all exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Any/all exterior signage to return to the Italian Village Commission for further review.

MOTION: Lapp/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW**

1. **14-7-14**

**778 Summit Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) New Victorians (Owner)**

New Construction

* Construct a new single family residence, per the submitted site plan.

*Prior to review of Application* 14-7-14*, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Commissioner Cooke assumed the role of Chairperson.*

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Cooke opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

* If a variance is sought, would prefer to see the house pulled back to the east a bit more to add additional interior space.
* Will need to see all elevations.
* The style feels Federal in some way, e.g., the columned porch and windows. Doesn’t seem to quite fit into the character of the village.
* There seems to be too much space between the second story windows and roofline.
* Likes the idea of the projection, which screens the garage door.

Josh Lapp:

* Not generally supportive of an integrated garage, but, considering the site conditions, this may be about the only way to provide off street parking. It’s a one car garage, so may be less noticeable.
* Would a projection over the garage help in any way to screen the garage? Not a balcony, but something.

Todd Boyer

* The details of the corner of the house are going to be very important.
* The pitch of the roof seems high for the size of the house.
* Consider other roof types for the projection. A one story projection seems more appropriate than two story.
* Consider looking at wrapping the porch around to the side and integrating into the projection.

 NO ACTION TAKEN

1. **14-7-15 (New Application)**

**135 Punta Alley**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) Julio Valenzuela/Urban Restorations (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application* 14-7-15*, Commissioner Sudy resumed the role of Chairperson.*

New Construction

* Construct a new single family residence and two-car garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings, dated 6/29/14, and reviewed by the Italian Village Commission at the July 15, 2014 IVC hearing.
* All final exterior finishes, including exterior siding, roof shingles, foundation material, and colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Product cut sheets/specifications for exterior doors, including garage doors, and windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
* Any/all exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
* Final construction drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Approval of a breezeway is appropriate at this specific location based on nearby precedent.

Note: Applicant has confirmed that this new construction project has been approved by the homeowners’ association.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

1. **14-7-16 (Conceptual)**

**150 Detroit Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant) Julio Valenzuela/Urban Restorations (Owner)**

New Construction

* Second conceptual review of proposed new construction to include a two-story, two-unit residential building and a warehouse style carriage house with two residential units above, per the submitted site plan.

*Following the swearing in of the Applicants, Acting Chairperson, Sudy, called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.*

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Name, Address, Affiliation:** | **Issues/ Comments:** |
| Mary Ellen Turk154 Detroit Ave.Neighboring property owners 154, 158, 151, 153, 155 Detroit Ave. | * Ms. Turk submitted a letter, which is on file at the Historic Preservation Office.
* Discussed issues of social life of the street, building mass, property density, vehicular density, materials, and landscaping
 |
| Audrone Biknevicius158 Detroit Ave.Neighboring property owner | * Noted the amount of new development happening in the northern part of Italian Village. Excited about the new opportunities, but does not want the standards of development for the northern part of Italian Village to be less than for the southern part.
* Some of the new projects seem to be somewhat experimental.
* Substantial increase of residential properties on Detroit, will add additional noise, such as A/C condensers.
 |

*Following the speakers, and presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

* Doesn’t feel that the proposed design fits in as well as some other recent projects have done, i.e. 1111 Hamlet St.
* This is a larger lot, but it’s not necessarily a good approach to completely fill the lot if not in character with the area.
* Seems like if will be a challenge to walk around the garage with all the doors.

Josh Lapp:

* Not yet settled on the architecture question.
* There is a variety of building types on Hamlet, so seeing more streetscape drawings and photos could provide a better perspective.

Todd Boyer

* Appreciated the great comments presented by the neighbors, and understands that there are challenges with designing a modern house in this type of neighborhood.
* Not opposed to modern architecture at all, and if it is done well, it finds it place in the neighborhood.

The applicants have shown the Commission in past projects that they can achieve that goal, but this site will be a bigger challenge.

* A three-dimensional study may help in understanding the massing, how materials connect to each other, how it turns the corner, etc.
* Connecting to the street could be a visual connection. A modern building would have larger windows, a solid-void issue, rather than punched windows.
* Regarding the carriage house, just need more development to understand it. The way the parking has been solved on site is nice.

Jason Sudy:

* In general agreement with fellow commissioners’ comments.
* Not opposed to modern architecture, but it may be easier to go a different direction at this particular site. In particular, does not feel comfortable with the currently proposed modern design for the carriage house. However, a two-story carriage house could be successful.
* The neighbors’ comments are very helpful and valid.

NO ACTION TAKEN

1. **14-5-20**

**920 North High Street**

**Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants) Emerald Light Investments, Ltd.**

*This application was conceptually reviewed at the May 27 and June 17, 2014 IVC hearings. An application, site plan, and revised renderings have been submitted.*

Demolition and New Construction

* Demolish the existing 1994 brick commercial building.
* Construct new two-story commercial building, per the submitted site plan and renderings.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

* Thinks that most of the Commissioners’ concerns have been addressed. Is ready to see detailed drawings and move on to the next step.
* Still need to see more details about exterior tenant signage. As currently shown, the signage appears too big and too high on the building.
* Would like more information on how the screen wall works on the top of the new Donato’s piece. Noted that the wall has been raised in the back, so sound should come more towards the street. The modifications seem to work both on High Street and First Avenue. The site plan seems to be the right answer.
* The use of murals on the south wall would need to be curated in some way, so art is used, but not advertisements.

David Cooke:

* Agrees that the tenant signage is too big and too high. Needs to be more pedestrian scale.
* Sees the south wall as a way to add to the art feel of the neighborhood.

Josh Lapp:

* Applicant will also need to consider the new Short North Guidelines when submitting signage for the new Donato’s. Perhaps a blade sign would be appropriate.
* Thinks it would be possible to install art at the first and second floors on the south elevation.

Todd Boyer

* The southwest corner is greatly improved. The industrial windows and loss of the EIFS pieces helps tremendously.
* Would like to see black metal spandrel panel at the bottom of the south corner (Sheet 0.05 #2) to help it hit the ground to help with security, dirt, etc.
* Some of the detail that’s shown in the brick of the warehouse portion is very nice.
* Really has no other issues now except for the oversized tenant signage.

 NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF APPROVALS**

* **14-7-1**

**185 East Second Avenue**

**Benjamin Davis (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-7-1, 185 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Siding

* Removal of the non-original aluminum siding was approved November 19, 2013 (COA # 13-11-13b).
* Install new, wood siding over the existing deteriorated wood siding, per the submitted drawings. New wood siding to match the reveal and profile of the existing exactly, like-for-like.
* Install new wood window, door, and corner trim, per the submitted drawings.
* Paint color scheme to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
* **14-7-2**

**947 Mt. Pleasant Avenue**

**John W. Roeder (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-7-2, 947 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Downspouts

* Install one new downspout near the southeast corner of the house on the south elevation, and one new downspout on the west elevation to feed into the existing front and rear porch roof gutters.
* New downspouts to match the existing white gutters and downspouts.
* **14-7-3**

**974 Hamlet Street**

**Justin Cudak (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-7-3, 974 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Privacy Fence

* Install a new, 20’ Long, 6’ High, wood, dog-eared privacy fence in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
* New fence to extend northward from the north elevation of the house to the existing, neighboring privacy fence on the north property line; Finished side to face out to the street (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside).
* Two 4’ Wide gates will provide access to the rear of the lot, per the submitted site plan.
* Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
* **14-7-4**

**793 Summit Street**

**Michael J. Schmidt (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-7-4, 793 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Masonry Cleaning

* Clean all painted and unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer’s recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- “Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings,” http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm).

Tuck Pointing

* Check all mortar joints on exterior walls and foundation on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
* Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar per the submitted specifications.
* Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).

Repair Masonry Chimney

* Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
* New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm).
* Install new 2 ¾“ sandstone cap.
1. **OLD BUSINESS**
* **13-10-16**

**812 Hamlet Street**

**Julio Valenzuela/Urban Restorations (Applicant/Owner)**

*The applicant presented a site plan and requested a brief conceptual review to modify the originally approval for a new one car garage.*

Construct New Garage

Construct new, two-car, tandem garage.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

* This design may make it more challenging to drive a car into the garage.
* Need additional information about surrounding structures at the alley.
* Not sure that a tandem garage would be in proportion to the surrounding structures.

Jason Sudy:

* Not opposed to the notion. It would not cover more of the lot, or function any differently. It’s just an unusual proposal, and more information and drawings are needed.
1. **NEW BUSINESS**
2. **ADJOURNMENT**

 MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (4-0-0) ADJOURNED (9:50 p.m.)