

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION
MINUTES**

Tuesday, June 17, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy, Charmaine Sutton

Commissioners Absent: Ben Goodman

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I.** CALL TO ORDER (6:17 p.m.).
- II.** NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, July 8, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III.** NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, July 15, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV.** APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, May 20, 2014.
MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED
- V.** PUBLIC FORUM
- VI.** STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VII.** APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 13-12-7

940 North High Street

Brian O’Neill (Applicant)

Robert E. Brunner (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 13-12-7, 940 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Signage

- Remove the existing 9’1” H ground sign, and the existing, metal, “Brigade” wall sign, installed prior to review and approval.
- Install one new, hand painted, 4’ W x 2.5’ H, metal ground sign on 4” x 4” stained wood posts (5’ overall height), per the submitted drawings. Sign to include an 8” H metal strip below the main sign with the property address.
- Install one new, hand painted, 6.6’ W x 4’ H, metal wall sign, per the submitted drawing.
- Revised drawings including the following modifications, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness:
 - 1) All bolts on both signs to be painted black to match the sign surface; 2) the arrow symbol is to be removed from the lower portion of the ground sign.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

2. **14-5-10**

842 & 850 North Fourth Street

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

At the request of the Applicant, remove Application # 14-5-10, for review of the pool enclosure, fence, and decking, from the agenda. Applicant will be required to submit a new application to be placed on a future agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

3. **13-10-12(b)**

866 North Pearl Street

Prescott & Pearl, LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 13-10-12(b), 866 North Pearl Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct new 3.5 story residential structure, to include 24 dwelling units, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- To include enclosed parking, at grade. On-site parking to provide 20 spaces.
- Final detail for the metal fascia to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of the Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Any/all exterior signage and landscape design to return for review and approval at a future Italian Village Commission hearing.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

4. **14-5-16**

801 Civitas Avenue

Michael Maistros/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)

Windsor Lofts, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-5-16, 801 Civitas Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Canopy

- Install one new, wall-mounted canopy over each of the two pedestrian entrances on the east elevation, per the submitted renderings and detail drawing.
- Materials to be metal and fiberglass painted to match existing color scheme.
- Canopies to include concealed lighting, per the submitted drawing.

New Signage

- Install one (1) new "VETRO" sign on each of the two (2) new canopies. New signs consist of cut out letters within the steel channel on the face of the canopies, per the submitted rendering. Letters to be backed with a translucent Plexiglas panel with halo effect lighting emitting through the cut out letters only.
- No other exterior signage is approved at this time.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

5. 14-5-17

1024 North High Street

John Simon/RED Architecture & Planning (Applicant) Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-5-17, to allow time for Historic Preservation Office staff to meet with the Applicant to discuss the revised signage proposal, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 15, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

6. 14-6-7

995 North Fourth Street

John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-6-7, to allow time for the Applicant to meet with the Building & Zoning Department staff to discuss the site plan, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 15, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) CONTINUED

7. 14-6-6b

65-67 Warren Street

Andrew Sanderell (Applicant)

Northwood Properties, Inc. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-6b, 65-67 Warren Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Sidewalk

- Remove the existing circulation sidewalk extending from the front sidewalk approach to the side basement entrance well.
- Replace sidewalk with turf.

Replace Doors

- Due to extensive interior damage, remove the two (2) existing half-light, three panel doors on the rear elevation, and the one, existing half-light, three panel basement door on the east elevation.
- Install new, wood, half-light, three-panel doors, to replicate the existing original doors, like-for-like.

Replace Windows

- Remove all existing wood windows, excepting the two first-story, front/north elevation cottage style windows.
- Install new all wood (interior/exterior) windows, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications.
- The replacement windows are to be wood (interior/exterior) sash packs, and the "tails" that extend from the bottom corners of the existing upper sashes are to be replicated in size, shape, and scale and installed on the new windows in the same locations. Applicant is to submit a drawing of the "tails" to Historic Preservation Office staff for their files.
- The existing wood jambs and exterior casings are to be repaired and retained.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

8. 14-6-8

Jeffrey Park Townhomes

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-8, Jeffrey Park Townhome "B", with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Previous Approval of Façade Design- Townhome "B"

- Modify the façade design, per the submitted rendering. The previously approved façade design will continue to be an option. Application #14-6-8 is an alternate design to the previously approved design with the following modifications: 1) The extended canopy on the second story porch is eliminated; 2) The indented corner and wrap around window are modified, utilizing less glazing.
- The first floor porch railing is to be retained, as previously approved, or, an alternate porch railing design is to be submitted to historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioner Cooke.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

9. 14-6-9

834 Hamlet Street

Kristin Boggs (Applicant/Owner)

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove the existing, concrete service sidewalk extending from the side of the existing, concrete front porch deck to the public sidewalk.
- Remove the small section of existing, concrete front porch deck that extends beyond the south wall of the house.
- Construct a new, 16' Wide x 6.5' Deep wood porch deck over the existing concrete porch deck, per the submitted drawings. Ledger and joists to be 2 x 8 pressure treated lumber.
- Temporarily support and retain the existing porch roof. Remove the existing, non-original scroll metal columns and railing, and install five (5) new wood columns and new wood rail/balustrade, per the submitted drawing. The space between the balusters is to equal [not to be greater than] the width of the balusters (generally 1 ½ to 2").
- Install new porch skirting, per the submitted drawing.
- Install one, new wood step, to be in line with the front door.
- Prime and paint all new wood columns, railings, skirting, and step "French White" to match existing trim.
- Install new brick sidewalk, extending from the front porch to the public sidewalk, in line with the front door.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED

10. 14-6-10b

85 East Lincoln Street

Leah & David O'Carroll (Applicants/Owners)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-10b, 85 East Lincoln Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Windows/Front Elevation

- Remove the four (4) existing, deteriorated, wood, one-over-one, double-hung window sash and jambs on the front elevation.
- Install four (4) new, all wood (interior/exterior), one-over-one, double-hung, Marvin Ultimate, replacement windows, per the submitted specifications.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

11. 14-6-11

145 Detroit Avenue

Matt Toddy (Applicant)

Matt & Kristie Toddy (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-11, 145 Detroit Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

Landscaping

- Remove the existing 6' privacy fence, asphalt parking pad, and paver patio.
- Install new 6' privacy fence and 18' automated sliding gate, per the submitted drawings.
- Fence and gate to be 6" horizontally applied cedar, stained naturally, per submitted precedent photos.
- Install new, stained concrete, limestone screening and sod patio, per the submitted drawings.
- Any/all future bollards or other traffic control features to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Note: A six-foot-high (6'H) fence/gate is being approved at this particular location for the following reasons: 1) The proposed landscaping project is an improvement to the pedestrian experience over the existing concrete slab; 2) The fence/gate faces onto Beacon Alley, which reads as a true alley, not as a street; 3) The new fence/gate faces onto a rear yard parking area.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

12. 14-6-12

1051 Hamlet Street

Jason Slagle (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-6-12, 1051 Hamlet Street, for construction of a new porch addition, to allow the Applicant time to submit revised, measured drawings, including the gutters/downspouts, column details, and spacing between spindles.

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

13. 14-6-13

No Address (formerly 81 E. Fourth Ave./Southeast Corner of Fourth & Say Avenues)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

The New Victorians (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-13, formerly 81 E. Fourth Ave./Southeast Corner of Fourth & Say Avenues, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct a new three-family dwelling, per the submitted drawings.
- Applicant to submit the following to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness: 1) Window/Door Schedule and or cut sheets, including garage doors; 2) Paint color scheme; 3) Roofing Shingles.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

14. 14-6-14

1038 N. High Street

Dan Morgan/Behal Sampson Dietz (Applicant)

Michael Maloof (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-14, 1038 N. High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Folding Window System

- Remove the existing storefront windows, and replace with new Ramco folding aluminum café windows, with dark bronze finish, per the submitted drawings and product specifications.
- Existing Luxfer Prism transom to remain. If/when the transoms are repaired, Applicant is to submit repair methods/specifications to Historic Preservation Office staff prior to initiation of work.
- Install new, exterior, wood knee wall panels to match new window configuration, per the submitted drawings.
- Note: Installation of a folding window system is being approved at this particular location for the following reasons: 1) The Luxfer Prism transom is a defining characteristic of the building and is being retained; 2) While the existing storefront glass is also a contributing element of the storefront and is being removed, the proportion of glass to knee wall is being retained, so future reinstallation of plate glass will be possible; 3) Because the transom and knee wall proportions are being retained, the existing symmetry with the adjacent storefront will also be retained.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (5-0-1[Sutton]) APPROVED

15. 14-6-3b

936 North Fourth Street

Kevin Noesner (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-3b, 936 North Fourth Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Storefront Modifications

- Remove the existing, non-original storefront cladding, windows, door, and awning.
- Build new aluminum and MDO plywood storefront, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new, black awning on existing frame, and gooseneck lighting, per the submitted drawings.
- Revised drawings, including a knee wall detail and transom windows shown equal to the height of the awning, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by Commissioner Hagerling.
- Any/all signage to return for review and approval at a future Italian Village Commission hearing.
- Note: An awning with enclosed ends is being approved at this particular location for the following reason: 1) It is appropriate to reuse an existing awning frame.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

16. 14-6-15

1017 North Sixth Street

Quinn Fallon (Applicant)

Quinn Fallon & Scott Guiler (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-6-15, to allow time for the Applicant to submit revised drawings/materials, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 15, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments:

- If installation of a new window opening is approved, it should be aligned over the first story doorway.
- The existing door openings should be retained, even if dry-walled over on the interior.
- The siding of the addition should match the existing wood siding reveal (beneath the existing aluminum siding).
- Consider increasing the pitch of the roof on the addition.

- Would be helpful to see details of how the shed roof of the addition will meet the existing shed roof of the existing porch.
- Consider raising the porch deck of the addition to meet the porch deck of the existing porch.
- Consider another type of window for the addition. Sliders are not typical to the historic district.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) CONTINUED

17. 14-6-16

1017 North Sixth Street

Quinn Fallon (Applicant)

Quinn Fallon & Scott Guiler (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-6-16, to allow time for further review of application # 14-6-16 (above), and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 15, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) CONTINUED

18. 14-6-17

1024 North High Street

Fireproof Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-6-17 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-6-17a

Approve Application # 14-6-17a, 1024 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage/Fireproof Building/Front Elevation

- Install one (1) new sign at the front entrance of the west elevation, per the submitted rendering and drawing.
- Sign to include the address number "1024."
- Numbers to be 3.5" deep aluminum bodies with painted number faces.
- Numbers to be attached to a 2" x 2" aluminum tube support bolted to beam.
- Applicant has the option of installing three (3) or four (4) down lights to be evenly spaced beneath the canopy.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-6-17b

Install New Signage/Fireproof Building/Rear Elevation

Approve Application # 14-6-17b, 1024 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

- Install one (1) new wall sign on the south wall of the rear/east elevation.
- New sign to be an art/sculptural piece with some dimension, such as a single, metal relief "F" insignia attached to the wall at a pedestrian scale to act as a feature to identify the rear entrance.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final approval by Commissioner Cooke.

Note: The proposed sign is to pay homage to the historic, painted Fireproof sign, without creating false history.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

19. 14-6-4b

788-790 Summit Street

Michael Linsker (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-4b, 788-790 Summit Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Porch Roof Shingles

- Standing seam metal roofing was removed, and new Owens Corning Oakridge shingles were installed prior to review and approval.

- Remove the existing, non-appropriate Owens Corning Oakridge shingles, and install new asphalt shingles.
 - Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate
 - All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red.”
- MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-1[**Sutton**]) APPROVED

20. 14-6-18

97 East Warren Avenue

Brian Stephens (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-18, 97 East Warren Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Wood Siding

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, horizontal wood siding from the rear addition, and install new, wood, board-and-batten siding.
- New wood corner boards to match existing.
- Paint colors and a drawing indicating the board width, batten locations, and corner boards to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval prior to installation of the new siding.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

21. 14-6-19

263 Detroit Avenue

Dona R. Chandler (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-19, 263 Detroit Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Slate and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all deteriorated slate on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “Tinner's Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Install New Gutters &Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

22. 14-6-20

846 North High Street

Bob Reed/Custom Sign Center, Inc. (Applicant)

1 Short North, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-20, 846 North High Street, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Sign

- Install one new projecting sign, per the submitted rendering and drawing. Existing sign, bracket, and external lighting to be relocated from 765 N. High Street.
- The 1/8” extruded aluminum sign cabinet measures 3’ W x 2’ H with applied vinyl graphics and attached, external light fixtures.
- Sign to be attached to masonry wall with four (4) 3/8” anchors, per the submitted rendering and drawing.

Note: This application modifies the previously approved Application #14-4-22. Installation of this sign (14-6-20) may preclude installation of signage approved in Application # 14-4-22.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

23. 14-6-21

914 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Priestas Brothers Builders (Applicant)

Kurt Knisley (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application # 14-6-21, 914 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, with all clarifications, as noted.

Construct New Garage

- Remover existing concrete parking pad.

- Construct a new 14' x 20' frame garage, per the submitted drawings.
- Roof pitch to be 6/12 with 8" wood overhangs.
- Siding to be 6", smooth Hardi-Plank with 6" wood corner trim and 4" wood door trim. Final color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval.
- Overhead door to be 10' x 7' foot steel door. Cut sheet for overhead door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval.
- Cut sheet for any/all exterior light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for approval.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (6-0-0) APPROVED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

24. 14-5-20

920 North High Street

Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)

Emerald Light Investments, Ltd.

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the existing 1994 brick commercial building.
- Construct new two-story commercial building, per the submitted renderings.

Prior to review of Application 14-5-20, Chairperson Hagerling noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and left the table. Vice-Chairperson Sudy assumed the role of Acting Chairperson.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Asked whether two means of egress would be required for the upper deck.
- Will be interested in issues of trash exit doors/removal, grease traps, etc.
- Will be concerned about any parking issues.
- Sees the First Avenue side of the building as a possible location for an art project/murals.
- Has some concerns about the travel path from Donato's kitchen to the dumpster.

Jason Sudy:

- Look at replicating the existing level of screening from the alley.
- Thinks the rooftop deck is okay based on the proposed wall at the back, and it is kept relatively low at the street level.
- In general, Commissioner comments have been in favor of the project and the proposed site plan.

Josh Lapp:

- Is supportive of the proposed massing and height.
- The progression of existing patios on High Street is moving toward more overhead covering than less covering.
- Has some concerns about the large windows at the corner on the south elevation.
- Would prefer to see the building scaled up rather than scaled down.

Todd Boyer

- Has concerns about the corner and how it turns down First Avenue. Wonders if a different window type such as a warehouse type could give it a different look.
- It's a very modern building tied together with different elements. The existing streetscape consists of separate buildings with their separate windows, doors, awnings working together. Has concerns that the building is one big mass on the corner, stitched together with different elements, but still appears as one big mass. The stitching together on the corner seems somewhat fussy.
- Is fine with the possible art piece on the south elevation.

- Would not be in support of EIFS at the cornice.

Charmaine Sutton:

- The parking lot side of the building is very solid. Is wondering about the pedestrian experience.

Rex Hagerling:

- Abstained.

NO ACTION TAKEN

25. 14-6-22

No Address (formerly 89 thru 117 E. Fifth Avenue)

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Brad Howe/Burwell Investments, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-6-22, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to schedule a special hearing for further conceptual review of the proposed demolition and new construction, on July 8, 2014, at 1:00 p.m., immediately following the regularly schedule noon business meeting.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy(6-0-0) CONTINUED

26. 14-6-23

No Address (Sixth St. & Auden Ave.)

Meyers & Associates Architects (Applicant)

Chad Seiber (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the April 15, 2014 IVC hearing. An application, site plan, photographs, and drawings have been submitted.

New Construction

- Conceptual review of new construction on a .964 acre site.
- New construction to consist of twenty-one townhomes surrounding a courtyard.
- Forty parking spaces are provided, with each unit having attached parking.

Following further presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Would like to see elevations showing the angled corners on N. Sixth Street.
- Would there be any concern about copper material streaking down onto lighter materials? Would like to have more information on those materials maintenance issues.

Jason Sudy:

- Applicant has responded to all concerns regarding site plan, i.e., entrances are on the street, and curb cuts have been removed.
- Reduced courtyard is fine. There is interconnectivity with larger open spaces. Has a solid front door approach on all three streets.
- Has some concern regarding the long corners on some units with nothing on the first floor, for example, #13. Not an irreconcilable issue. The tall windows interspersed with garage doors break the elevation up somewhat.

Josh Lapp:

- Would be helpful to have a southwest perspective.
- Would not have an issue with windows on the ground floor where there are currently blank walls, but would be open to some other program, e.g., an art or sculptural piece.
- Overall, thinks the project is great. It's something different, but in line with the neighborhood.
- Likes that the designs of the north and south elevations vary from the east and west.

Todd Boyer

- Does not have issues with the north and south elevations, because there is an A-B-A-B rhythm. It's a bit harder to read that rhythm on the east elevation.
- There is a lot of texture and materials, so is a bit worried that some of the higher quality materials will need to be eliminated. As long as the high quality of materials is maintained, does not have major issues with the design.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Made the observation that there are a lot of verticals breaking up the south and north elevations, while the east elevation seems more monolithic with fewer verticals. Thinks that the north and south elevations could be pared down a bit.
- Could see plantings or a seating area in the recess by the motor court areas.

Rex Hagerling:

- Agrees with adding more glass on the east side whether into the garage, or not.
- Agrees that there is a lot happening on the north and south elevations, which makes it more critical for the materials and detailing to be good.
- Will want more details on how elements are connected, how things turn the corner, etc.
- In general, the commission is in support of the project. Will need complete floor plans and elevation drawings for all elevations.

NO ACTION TAKEN

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-6-1**

157 East Fourth Avenue

Casey Davis (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-1, 157 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install Prehung Exterior Door

- Remove the existing two-panel, half-light door on the rear elevation of the 2004 dwelling.
- Install new, 32-inch, steel, two-panel, half-light door and frame, per the submitted specifications.
- Exterior and hinged sides to be painted.
- Paint color chip for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

• **14-6-2**

106 East Lincoln Street

Philip Davis (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-2, 106 East Lincoln Street, for renewal of expired COA # 12-7-10 (Expired: July 17, 2013), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Install New Fence

- Remove the existing chain link and wood fence.
- Install new steel/wrought iron, ornamental fence in front yard, per the submitted site plan, drawing, and product cut sheet/specifications.

MOTION: Goodman/Clark (5-0-0) APPROVED

• **14-6-3a**

936 North Fourth Street

Kevin Noesner (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-3, 936 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Remove Antenna

- Remove the existing television antenna from the roof and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings"
<http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>.

Repair/Replace Wood Siding and Wood Brick Mold

- Remove the existing, non-original, non-contributing aluminum siding from the gables to expose the original wood siding.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Repair/replace any/all original, existing wood siding located beneath the aluminum siding with any/all new wood siding to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Any/all repaired/replaced exterior trim elements (i. e. rake boards, crown molding) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the aluminum siding.
- Repair/replace any deteriorated wood brick molding around the windows with new wood to match the existing profile and dimensions exactly.
- Prepare all exterior wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools.
- Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint "white" to match existing.

Repair Aluminum Soffit

- Install a new section of vinyl soffit to replace the missing section of vinyl soffit, like-for-like.
- If, upon inspection, the entire vinyl soffit requires replacement, new wood soffit is to be installed.
- Remove and properly dispose of the existing soffit, and replace with new material indicated below (conventional exterior plywood is not acceptable). Galvanized nails of appropriate size and type required.
[] Tongue and Groove 1" x 3" pine [] Georgia-Pacific Ply-Bead, Traditional

Repair Windows

- Repair existing vinyl windows, and install new glass, as needed.

Remove Existing Sidewalk and Install New Sidewalk

- Remove any/all concrete public sidewalks, as needed, for water line maintenance, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

• **14-6-4a**

788-790 Summit Street

Michael Linsker (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-4, 788-790 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to

extend its useful life.

- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Restore the front porch hand rails/columns/skirting, as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front porch hand rails/columns/skirting; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color palette to be: Body: "High Speed Steel"; Porch, beams, and windows: "Grey"; Trim: "Ultra White."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-6-5**

792 Summit Street

Cathleen Graves (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-5, 792 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Remove any deteriorated wood elements, and restore the front porch headers, fascia, columns, skirting, hand rails, and trim as necessary with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original, front headers, fascia, porch columns, skirting, hand rails, and trim; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color palette to match the existing "black" and "white" colors at the adjacent 796 address.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-6-6a**

65-67 Warren Street

Andrew Sanderell (Applicant)

Northwood Properties, Inc. (Owner)

Approve Application 14-6-6a, 65-67 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Power Wash Spec

- Clean all unpainted masonry in accordance with industry standards and Columbus City Codes. Pressure is not to exceed 300 lb./p.s.i. and utilizing a broad fan tip. Should chemical cleaning be proposed by the owner or contractor or be determined to be necessary by Historic Preservation Office staff for paint removal of Previously Painted Masonry: the following procedure is required: Using the most diluted solution possible, perform a patch test by chemically cleaning a two foot by two foot (2' x2') section in the least visible location possible. Following the application of the approved cleaning solution, the entire area which has been treated is to be rinsed with water in accordance with the manufacturer's recommendations. If air pressure is needed for either the cleaning or the rinsing procedures, only a broad fan tip is to be used and the pressure is not to exceed 300 lb/psi. (Refer to Preservation Brief 1- "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellent Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings," <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/1-cleaning-water-repellent.htm>).

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on the brick dwelling and stone foundations on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Repair Stone Water Table

- Remove any stone that is deteriorated beyond repair, and replace with like-for-like materials. Any/all replacement stone is required to match the existing stone in original material type, size, color, and shape exactly, like-for-like. Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete, public and service sidewalks on the front elevation, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension, as necessary.
- Repair and/or replace existing circulation sidewalk on the west and north elevations, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

Install New Concrete Steps

- Remove the deteriorated, concrete front porch steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.

- Install new concrete steps in the exact same location and of the exact same dimension.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Install Stair Handrail

- Remove the existing, non-original, scroll-metal handrails at the front porch steps.
- Install a new black metal handrail on the front porch steps in accordance with all applicable Columbus Building Codes [Note: **Plumbers pipe with a combination of street and conventional 90's is not appropriate and is not approved for use on this site.**] Style of rails to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Install black pipe with malleable, adjustable fittings. Pipe diameter to be 1"-1 ¼" only; b) Install a one-piece, black, tubular steel rail & post unit. Tube diameter to be 1"- 1 ¼" only; c) Install a manufactured rail system per Fortin Welding & Mfg. Inc. (or like manufacturer) brochure, Model RSS, page #9.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system, and/or install underground tile for downspout drainage to curb, in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

Repair/Replace Existing Wrought Iron Fence

- Repair and paint the existing fence along the perimeter sidewalks.
- Replace missing sections with new wrought iron fencing to match existing.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit, corbeled rafter tails, and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair Rear Porches

- Repair/replace any/all deteriorated wood elements on the two existing rear porches, with new wood elements to match existing, like-for-like.
- Install new asphalt shingles to match existing main roof.

Repair Windows and Doors

- Repair and refinish the existing two (2), wood, three-quarter light front entrance doors and the existing two (2) first floor cottage style windows on the façade.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

- **14-6-10a**

85 East Lincoln Street

Leah & David O'Carroll (Applicants/Owners)

Approve Application 14-6-10a, 85 East Lincoln Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Storm Door

- Remove two (2) existing storm doors on the two front entry doors. Remove the existing transom storm windows. Existing leaded glass to remain.
- Install new, Provia aluminum storm doors on the two front entry doors.
- Cut sheet and color chip for the new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of the door.

VIII. OLD BUSINESS

IX. NEW BUSINESS

X. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (9:57 pm)