

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION AGENDA

Tuesday, March 18, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Applicants or their representatives must attend this meeting. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next meeting. If you have any questions, please call the city's Historic Preservation Office at 645-8620. A Sign Language Interpreter to 'Sign' this meeting will be made available for anyone with a need for this service. Sign language interpreters must be scheduled by calling 645-8620 or TDD 645-6407 at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the scheduled meeting.

- I. CALL TO ORDER
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 pm (Noon), Tuesday, April 8, 2014 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room A
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – Tuesday, April 15, 2014 – 50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B
- IV. SWEAR IN STAFF
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, February 18, 2013.
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

HOLDOVERS

1. 13-12-7

940 North High Street

Brian O'Neill (Applicant)

Robert E. Brunner (Owner)

Work was completed prior to approval. Following three consecutive absences of the Applicant, this application was removed from the agenda on September 17, 2013. A new application was submitted for the December 17, 2013 IVC hearing and continued to the January 21, 2014 IVC hearing. No new information was submitted, and the application was continued to the February 18, 2014 hearing, at which, following discussion with the applicant, the application was continued to the March 18 hearing.

New Signage

- Remove the existing 9'1" H ground sign, installed prior to review and approval.
- Install a new, hand painted wood or metal sign on 4" x 4" wood posts, per the submitted drawing.
- New sign to measure five-foot-high (5' H) and four-foot-wide (4' W).

2. 14-2-10b(2)

1024 North High Street

Fireproof Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

This application was continued from the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing. Additional photos have been submitted.

Modify East Elevation of Existing Building

- Remove masonry infill and replace with EIFS walls, per submitted plans and specifications.

NEW APPLICATIONS

3. 14-3-5

682 North High Street

Rachel Ferguson/Global Gifts (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owner)

An application, photographs and drawing have been submitted.

Install New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new projecting sign, per the submitted example photograph and drawing.
- New sign to be suspended from the existing awning frame, per the submitted elevation drawing.
- Sign to measure approximately 16" wide by 18" high (including round sign and hanging chain).
- New, double-sided sign to be sandblasted cedar painted "dark red" with text and logo painted "ivory."

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 6:30 P.M.

4. 14-3-6

801 Civitas Avenue/Vetro Lofts

Michael J. Maistros/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)

Windsor Lofts, LLC (Owner)

An application, photographs and drawing have been submitted.

Install New Canopies

- Install two (2) new, entry canopies at the two pedestrian entrances on the east elevation.
- New canopies to be metal and fiberglass wall mounted with metal cable supports.

New Walled Entry Patios

- Construct new, walled patios for the five new dwelling units.
- New brick patio walls to be 36" high with a 24" high, painted metal fence detail (total height five feet).
- Entrance/egress provided by a metal gate, as per the submitted rendering.

Modify Existing Roof Patios

- Modify the existing rooftop patios to provide private areas for the direct access of units directly below, and public areas for use by any other tenants.
- Modifications to include slightly raised decking materials and movable screening plants.

New Signage

- Install new wall mounted sign, per the submitted rendering (Sheet 4-A).

Garbage Receptacles

- Relocate the existing garbage dumpsters from the interior of the parking garage to the exterior, with 5' high, masonry screening, per the submitted site plan and rendering (Sheet 5-A & 5-B).

5. 14-3-7a/b/c/d/e

155, 159, 163, 167, 169 East Third Avenue

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

The New Victorians, Inc. (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the January 21, 2014 IVC hearing. An application, site plans, and elevations have been submitted.

New Construction

- Construct five (5) new, single family homes and five (5) new detached, two-car garages.

The following comments are from the January 21, 2014 IVC hearing:

David Cooke:

- *Three full, second story porches along the block seems like too much. Consider eliminating the porch on house #2 (167 E. Third Ave).*
- *The garages have been the least successful part of the development at 150-170 Punta Alley project. Could two garages be clustered together as pairs? Would add a bit more variety to have them less exactly symmetrically placed. Also, gives more lawn or garden space. Garage materials could vary.*
- *Consider entering the 171 E. Third Ave garage from the alley.*

Ben Goodman:

- Overall, moving in the right direction.
- The second story porch railings seem a bit out of character for the neighborhood. Consider one of the two with spindles and one with a privacy panel.
- Flat roofs could be appropriate on some of the garages.
- Would like to see some door hoods over the garage service doors.

Rex Hagerling:

- Generally in agreement with comments of other Commissioners.

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:00 P.M.

6. 14-3-10

608 N. High Street

J. Carter Bean Architect (Applicant)

C & W 608 North High LLC. (Owner)

An application, photographs, and photo-shop renderings have been submitted.

Storefront Modifications

- Install new, retractable awnings on west and south sides of the building;
- Paint existing storefront bulkhead red & gold;
- Externally illuminated signage on west and south faces & associated gooseneck fixtures;
- Install white subway tile finish on west and south façades;
- EIFS band above subway tile on south façade to finish the top edge and match existing limestone detailing on building;
- Install new operable exterior storefront system on south façade, to replace existing storefronts;
- Install new decorative wall sconce fixtures on south façade at either end of operable storefront;
- Install gold lettering graphics on glazing throughout;
- Install new logo graphic on subway tile, south elevation.

VARIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS

7. 14-3-9

608 North High Street

J. Carter Bean Architect (Applicant)

C & W 608 North High LLC. (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendation

(1) 3312.03 OFF STREET PARKING and 3312.49 MINIMUM NUMBER OF SPACES REQUIRED

- Reduce number or required parking spaces from seventeen (17) to zero (0).

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 7:30 P.M.

8. 14-3-8

94 East Third Avenue

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

North Side Day Nursery Assn. (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and statement of hardship have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendations

(1) 3332.039 R-4 RESIDENTIAL DISTRICT

Corner Lot: To permit two (2) dwellings on one lot.

Interior Lot: To permit two (2) dwellings on one lot and to permit more than four (4) dwelling units in one dwelling and to permit eight (8).

(2) 3332.05 AREA DISTRICT LOT WIDTH REQUIREMENTS

Corner Lot: To permit a lot with a width measured at the front lot line of less than 50 feet and to permit 46' 10 1/4".

(3) 3332.15 R-4 AREA DISTRICT REQUIREMENTS:

Corner Lot: To permit a single family dwelling and a three family dwelling to be situated on a lot of no less than 1759.155 square feet per dwelling unit.

Interior Lot: To permit one dwelling above a garage and a dwelling with eight (8) dwelling units to be situated on a lot of no less than 10,112.3 square feet.

(4) 3332.19 FRONTING

Corner Lot: To permit one dwelling above a garage to not front on a public street.

(5) 3332.25 MAXIMUM SIDE YARDS REQUIRED

Interior Lot: To permit the sum of the widths of each side yard of the carriage house to be less than 20 percent of the width of the lot and less than 16 feet and to be 12 feet 3 3/8".

(6) 3332.26 MINIMUM SIDE YARD PERMITTED

Corner Lot: To permit the side yard dimension between the building and/or pavement and the side lot lines to be less than five feet.

Interior Lot: To permit the side yard dimension between the buildings and/or pavement and the side lot lines to be less than five feet.

(7) 3332.27 REAR YARD

Corner Lot: To permit a rear yard totaling less than 25 percent of the total lot area and totaling 4 percent.

Interior Lot: To permit a rear yard totaling less than 25 percent of the total lot area and totaling 7 percent.

(8) 3312.13 DRIVEWAY

Interior Lot: *If/when it is determined by Zoning Staff that this variance is required, Applicant will return to a future IVC further review and recommendations.*

(9) 3312.49 MINIMUM NUMBER OF PARKING SPACES REQUIRED

Corner Lot: To permit the minimum number of parking spaces required to be less than two (2) per unit and to be one (1) per unit totaling four (4).

Interior Lot: To permit the minimum number of parking spaces required to be less than two (2) per unit for a one unit carriage house and 1.5 per unit for a dwelling with 8 units and to be one (1) per unit totaling nine (9).

(10) 3312.29 PARKING SPACE

Interior Lot: To permit one stacked parking space to be counted as a required parking space.

(11) 3312.25 MANEUVERING

Interior Lot: To permit the maneuvering area of one stacked parking space to include the area of its adjacent stacked parking space.

9. 14-3-11

737-741 Kerr Street

Eric D. Marineau, Attny. (Applicant)

Paul Berry/Berry Ohio Holdings, LLC (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and drawings have been submitted.

Request for Variance Recommendation

Summary: conversion of a 2 family house into a single-family residence, including the addition of a single-car garage on the first floor and a second floor addition over the new garage and an earlier addition.

Zoning variances for this project and to make the existing structure conforming include the following:

- (1) 3332.18 – Lot Coverage. Variance to allow structures to occupy 70% of the lot area.
- (2) 3312.49 – Minimum number of required parking spaces. The current two-family house has zero off-street parking. The project will provide for 1 garage space.
- (3) 3332.21 – Building Line. To conform the existing building line of 0’.
- (4) 3332.25 – Building setback – to conform to existing 0’ setback (3 sides, including addition on the south side)
- (5) 3332.26 – Minimum side-yard. Variance to conform with existing 0’ side-yard (3 sides, including addition on the south side)
- (6) 3321.05 – Vision clearance. Variance from 10’ vision triangle requirement to conform with existing 0’ vision clearance.

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

10. 14-3-12

47 East Lincoln Street

Keith Denlinger (Applicant)

Ruth Gless (Owner)

An application, photographs and drawing have been submitted.

Install New Signage/Window

- Install one new, vinyl, applied window graphic on the north elevation, per the submitted photo-shop photograph and drawing.
- Existing window measures 22 sq. ft., and proposed sign measures 10.75 sq. ft.
- Vinyl colors to be “light gold metallic” with “gold metallic” shade.
- New sign to read “Danceville U.S.A Columbus Ohio”

Install New Signage/Door

- Install one new, vinyl, applied window graphic on the full-light door of the north elevation, per the submitted photo-shop photograph and drawing.
- Existing door glass measures 10 sq. ft., and proposed sign measures 4.375 sq. ft.
- Vinyl colors to be “light gold metallic” with “gold metallic” shade.
- New sign to include business name, phone number, and hours of operation.

11. 14-3-13

244 East Third Avenue

New Victorians (Applicant/Owner)

An application, photographs, drawings, and product cut sheet has been submitted.

Install New Skylights

- Install six (6) new skylights on the west slope of the ca. 1960 apartment building, per the submitted drawings and product cut sheet/specifications.

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:15P.M.

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

12.13-12-10

875 Summit Street

Wood Run Partners, LLC/Truberry Custom Homes (Applicant/Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the December 17, 2013, January 21 and February 18, 2014 IVC hearings. Revised drawings have been submitted.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing ca. 1938 gas station building.

New Construction

- Construct seven (7) new, three-story dwellings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- The first floor of each dwelling unit is designed as parking, providing two (2) parking spaces for each unit.
- Primary access to be from First Avenue at the north side of the site with a 20' drive lane extending to the south, connecting to the existing alley, and exiting onto Summit Street.

The following comments are from the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing:

Jason Sudy:

- *The rendering on A09 illustrates the issue of inappropriate scale. It creates a problem to bring the façade out so close to First Avenue with the proposed scale.*
- *Consider eliminating unit C/D/E/or F, and moved back away from First Avenue that distance.*
- *The density and parking seem appropriate.*
- *Is still considering the demolition of the existing gas station, but is coming around to thinking it will be okay, but not with the project as currently proposed. It overwhelms the corner.*
- *An example of a building type that could work on this site is at the NW corner of Second Ave and Fourth Street. That scale of brick row house with two to two-and-a-half stories. Needs more simplicity. Could wrap the corner with an entrance on First Ave. Should still not come up much closer to First Avenue than the existing neighboring house.*

David Cooke:

- *No matter what architectural style is utilized, the project is still too big for this site. It has the appearance of an entire neighborhood compacted onto one site.*
- *Appreciates the attempts that have been made, but there is too much going on that is not compatible with the neighborhood, i.e., the round window in the gable, the corbels, the drive-through capped by louvered vents.*
- *The currently proposed version would seem to fit into Victorian Village better.*

Joshua Lapp:

- *Noted a possible appropriate example at Seventh and Summit Street.*
- *Eliminating the garage space adjacent to First Avenue could be a more appropriate setback.*

Ben Goodman:

- *Agrees that the design is too busy. There is too much articulation. It seems to be trying to accomplish too much; asking too much of the site.*
- *In recently observing the site from the southwest, to visualize three stories on this site seems incompatible with the surrounding buildings.*
- *If the goal is to discover an appropriate solution in order to demolish the existing building, then we are not yet at the right solution to consider demolition.*

Charmaine Sutton:

- *Is in general agreement with other Commissioners' comments. Would not agree with an attempt to exactly replicate an existing brick row house, but rather an interpretation of that building type. Should not historicize.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

13. 13-10-12

866 North Pearl Street

Prescott & Pearl, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the emergency demolition of an existing building on this site, this application was first conceptually reviewed at the October 2013 IVC hearing. Revised drawings have been submitted. Applicant seeks conditional approval.

New Construction

- Construct a new 3.5-story residential building with 24 dwelling units.
- First floor to include enclosed parking at grade, with primary access from N. Pearl Street at the west.
- On-site parking to provide 20 spaces, including handicap access and bike storage.
- Building to be constructed to step back from the south, east, and west property lines at the top level.
- Building materials to include stone veneer, brick veneer and glass.

The following comments are from the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing:

Jason Sudy:

- *Agrees that it is appropriate for the developer to address the Italian Village Society prior to conditional approval by the Italian Village Commission.*

David Cooke:

- *Still has concerns about the small size of the units. Would prefer to see units combined, resulting in lower density, to address traffic flow and parking.*
- *Given the alleyway, it is still too much building for the site.*

Joshua Lapp:

- *Each unit should have a window opening to the outside.*
- *Thinks the unit size and density are appropriate for the area.*
- *A one-to-one parking ration would be better for the neighborhood.*
- *In general, the proposed height seems to work with the surrounding buildings.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

14. 14-2-11

No Address (formerly 81 E. Fourth Ave./Southeast Corner of Fourth & Say Avenues)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

New Victorians (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing. An application and revised site plan and elevations have been submitted.

New Construction

- Construct a new 4-unit residential building.

The following comments are from the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing:

David Cooke:

- *Has concerns about the proposed curb cut on East Fourth Avenue.*
- *Thinks that three units would be more appropriate than four units on this site.*
- *The peak of the roof appears too high.*

Charmaine Sutton:

- *Also concerned about a curb cut on Fourth Avenue.*

Joshua Lapp:

- *The overall height and massing appears appropriate.*
- *A curb cut on Say Avenue would be more appropriate. Should not be on Fourth Avenue.*

Ben Goodman

- *It can be difficult for a broader frame building, as opposed to a brick building, to appear typical for the neighborhood, i.e., the gables, the pitches of the roof, etc.*

- *New construction does not have to be some sort of rendition of the “Italian Village home,” especially if it is over scaled. Since this is new construction, there are ways to pursue a contemporary architectural piece, as long as the materials are sincere, which may be a better fit for this lot style.*
- *Seems to be trying to fit too much on this lot.*
- *Also more in favor of a curb cut on Say Avenue.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

IT IS ESTIMATED THAT THE FOLLOWING APPLICATIONS WILL NOT BE HEARD BEFORE 8:30 P.M.

15. 14-2-13

**24 East Lincoln Street
CCB, LLC (Applicant)**

Wood Companies (Owner)

This application was conceptually reviewed at the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing. Revised site plan and renderings have been submitted.

Exterior Building Alterations

- Relocate East Lincoln Street (south elevation) entrance (Sheet A-04)
- Remove existing door on E. Lincoln Street with one of appropriate door type.
- Paint exterior.
- Replace existing asphalt shingle roof with new asphalt shingle roof.

The following comments are from the February 18, 2014 IVC hearing:

Ben Goodman

- *Would not want to see the original entrance/door opening on Pearl Street removed. Need to retain that character and have some sort of street scape.*
- *The proposed porch and deck addition will need some additional thought. As proposed, the posts are over-scaled and the railings and roof are not really typical of the area. Understands that this is a first effort, and it will need some work to fit in with the village architecture.*

David Cooke:

- *Would not be in favor of removal of the door opening on Pearl Street. The opening could be dry walled on the interior, but the door and framing and stoop would need to remain on the exterior.*
- *Agrees that the proposed porch/deck is out of scale and out of character for the neighborhood.*
- *Need to try to retain the simple character of the building.*
- *It may be possible to retain the shed addition and move the wall forward from the recessed entrance, as long as the new wall is still recessed from the existing wall.*
- *Encouraged Applicant to look at appropriate door types in the Italian Village Guidelines.*

Charmaine Sutton:

- *Would not be in favor of the porch and upper deck, as proposed.*
- *Can see the rear entrance being moved forward, as long as it is not to the same plane of the window wall.*

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 14-3-15

1031 North Fourth Street

Lauren Culley & Jeff Excell (Applicants)

Carol Guiler (Owner)

An application, photographs, site plan, and renderings have been submitted.

Renovate Garage for use as Café

- Replace existing overhead doors with glass and wood garage doors.
- Lengthen and widen the existing 5' x 4'2" windows on the south and west elevations.
- Install new window opening on east elevation to increase street visibility.
- Relocate existing front door to east elevation to meet ADA requirements.
- Paint exterior.
- Install new lighting and green space.
- Remove existing fence along east elevation.

STAFF APPROVALS

- **14-3-1**

806 Hamlet Street

Lisa G. Swartzwelder (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-3-1, 806 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Handrail

- Install one (1) new, Fortin, black, iron handrail at the front porch steps, facing onto Hamlet Street. Style to be “picket” or “line,” per the submitted product cut sheet.

- **14-3-2**

893 North Fourth Street

Robert J. Wagner (Applicant)

Victor Investments (Owner)

Approve Application 14-3-2, 893 North Fourth Street, for renewal of expired COA # 12-5-8a (Expired: May 15, 2013), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Install new Siding

- Remove the existing asbestos cement siding on the front and side elevations of the rear/frame section of the building, and install new HardiePlank siding to match the HardiePlank that was previously approved for the rear elevation. Paint color to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Install new wood corner boards to match those existing on rear elevation.
- Repair/replace exterior wood trim, as needed, like-for-like.

MOTION: Clark/Baker (5-0-0) APPROVED

- **14-3-3**

659 Kerr Street

Yadira Hawkins (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-3-3, 659 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Front Door

- Remove the existing, non-original entrance door on the front façade.
- Install a new, wood, two-panel, half-light door in the same location. Cut sheet/specifications for the new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Install New Front Porch Flooring

- Remove any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing tongue and groove, wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Install New Front Porch Balusters

- Remove all non-original wood lattice railings and trim from the front porch.
- Install new, wood balusters and new, wood top and bottom rails and hand rails, per the submitted specifications and photo example.
- Balusters to be 1½” square, with spaces between the balusters to equal [not to be greater than] the width of the balusters.
- Paint color for new railings to match existing.
- The three (3) existing, chamfered roof support posts are to remain.

- **14-3-4**

42-48 East Fourth Avenue

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Brad Howe/Burwell Investments, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 14-3-4, 42-48 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install a new wood, six-foot-high (6'H), double-sided, board-on-board privacy fence along the east property line of the newly constructed four-plex, per the submitted site plan.

Note: COA #14-3-4 modifies the previously approved metal fence along the east elevation only (COA # 13-2-7/February 19, 1013).

- **14-3-14**

179-181 East First Avenue

Katherine Sweat (Applicant)

Katherine Sweat & Suzanne Barker (179) Eric Nutt & Julie Stoehr (181) (Owners)

Approve Application 14-3-14, 179-181 East First Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications as indicated:

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing section of shadow box fencing dividing the rear yards of 179 and 181 East First Avenue.
- Remove the existing brick walkway dividing the rear yards of 179 and 181 East First Avenue.
- Install new six-foot-high (6'H), wood privacy fence, dividing the rear yards of 179 and 181 East First Avenue from the house to the existing garage, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new six-foot-high (6'H), wood privacy fence, with gates, from the northwest and northeast corners of the garage, running parallel to the alley, to the west and east property lines, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

Install New Gate

- Install new board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood gate across sidewalk along west side of 179 East First Avenue, per the submitted site plan.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. ADJOURNMENT