

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, November 18, 2014

6:15 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp (left 10:30 p.m.),
Jason Sudy

Commissioners Absent: Charmaine Sutton

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

I. CALL TO ORDER (6:15 p.m.).

II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, December 9, 2014
– 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.

III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, December 16, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor,
Conference Room B.

IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF

V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, October 21, 2014.
MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (4-0-2 [Cooke/Boyer]) APPROVED

VI. STAFF APPROVALS

The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record.
Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

VII. PUBLIC FORUM

• Nelson Nygaard Parking Study – Synopsis and Comments

Upon review of the Columbus Short North Parking Study (dated October 15, 2014), the Italian Village Commission moves to support the proposed recommendations and strategies listed below, as follows:

High Street Corridor and Potentially Fourth Street Corridor

- The use of demonstration pilot projects as an introduction to parking modifications.
- Maximize on-street capacity, including reducing parking stall dimensions at meters, decreasing some crosswalk clearances, consolidating COTA bus stops and valet stations, and consolidating and changing regulations for loading zones, with an opportunity for the Italian Village Commission and Victorian Village Commission to play a role in designating the location of valet stations.
- Update the zoning code.
- Work with developers to generate a greater public parking supply to proposed developments.
- Shared Parking – Leasing private parking for public use to create a greater public parking supply.
- Pedestrian and bicycle improvements, including better lighting and way-finding signage for easier and safer access from remote areas.

Regarding Broadening areas of Permit Coverage, the Commission supports the following standards:

- Standardization
- Performance based pricing policy with adjusted rates based on data collection.
- Adjusted rate parking meters.

Comments/Concerns

- The Commission has concerns about the implementation and phasing of introducing visitor parking onto residential streets, and would like the opportunity to provide feedback as progress is made.
- Including information about how to link with existing downtown garages should be considered.

MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

• **14-11-10**

Request for Recommendation to the Department of Public Service

- RGB, LLC has contacted the Department of Public Service regarding the possible sale of a portion of the Hull Alley right-of-way north of Warren Street between High and Pearl Streets, per the submitted site plan.

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, the following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of RGB, LLC., continue Application # 14-11-10, to allow additional time to submit a site plan and drawings for a proposed new building, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) CONTINUED

With the understanding that RGB, LLC has requested a continuation of their application to the Italian Village Commission and that any objections have been requested within thirty (30) days from the date the notice was submitted on October 27, 2014, the Italian Village submits the following comments by unanimous approval:

Commissioner Comments:

- Hull Alley is part of the historic street pattern of Italian Village. Elimination of the alley could set a precedent that would negatively impact the entire Village.
- All of the neighborhood alleys provide a viable function for vehicular, and even more so for pedestrian access.
- With no further information at this time, the Commission would not be supportive of the disposal of a portion of Hull alley.
- The Commission would be hesitant to support the disposal of any right-of-way connecting to High Street without a much larger scale plan for the entire corridor.
- Hull Alley is currently heavily used for valet access, and should not be eliminated before decisions are made regarding consolidation of valet stations as part of the Short North Parking Study.
- The Commission has concerns about access for emergency vehicles.
- The Commission would strongly request that a final decision not be made until a complete application has been made allowing for an informed judgment.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

CONTINUED APPLICATIONS

1. 14-6-7

995 North Fourth Street

John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)

In accordance with Italian Village Commission policy, following three consecutive absences by the Applicant, remove Application # 14-6-7 from the Italian Village Commission hearing agenda and refer the application back to the Code Enforcement Division. Submission of a new application will be required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

2. 14-10-14

1049-1051 North Fourth Street

Jared Williamson (Applicant)

Kevin Lykens (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-10-14, to allow for additional time to submit revised signage drawings, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

3. 14-10-16 (Variance Recommendation)

920 North High Street

Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)

Emerald Light Ltd. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-10-16, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

NEW APPLICATIONS

4. 14-11-11

1024 North High Street (Fireproof Building)

Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham/Fireproof Partners, LLC. (A)

Fireproof Partners, LLC. (O)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-11, 1024 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Plaque

- Install a new plaque, per the submitted rendering, to replace the original “Fireproof Warehouse and Storage Co.” plaque, located at the west corner of the south elevation.
- New, cast aluminum plaque to measure 42” W x 28.25” H.
- Background is recessed with raised text and underscore.
- Border and graphics have brushed satin aluminum finish.
- Plaque to be mounted flush to exterior wall with concealed studs.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

5. 14-11-12

1014 North High Street (Fireproof Building Addition)

Tai Lieu (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-11-12, to allow for additional time to submit revised signage drawings, and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

- The entire face of the sign may not be illuminated, but may be similar to the previously approved “Pies & Pints” sign.
- The Applicant should submit any proposed window and door signs/decals. Signage should be either on the awning or on the windows, not both.
- Some Commissioners voice concerns about the inclusion of the bamboo detail on the bracket.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

6. 14-11-13

783 Kerr Street

M. Jonathan Will (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-13, 783 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Front Porch Repair

- Remove the existing vinyl and aluminum wrap on the porch ceiling, soffits, and fascia that was installed prior to review and approval. Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave, soffit, and fascia on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.
- All work is to be completed no more than two (2) years from the November 18, 2014 date of approval (November 18, 2016).

Note: The Commission encourages the Applicant to contact staff upon removal of all or part of the vinyl and aluminum wrap, to conduct a site visit and determine the appropriate approach for repair and/or replacement of any materials beneath the wrap.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

7. 14-11-14

850 North Fourth Street

Carrie Lierl/Columbus Growing Collective (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #14-11-14 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-11-14a

New Signage/Temporary

Approve Application #14-11-14a, 850 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

- Retain the two (2), new, temporary post/ground signs, which have been installed to announce the upcoming community farm, per the submitted site plan.
- New wood signs to measure 30" x 42", painted white with black lettering, per the submitted drawing and photographs.
- Temporary signs to remain in place no later than June 1, 2015.

Note: Reasons for approval of post/ground signs are as follows: 1) The signs are associated with an out of the ordinary, temporary use that requires annual approval; 2) The garden use does not include a building on which a sign could be posted.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-11-14b

New Signage/Permanent & Information Kiosk

Continue Application #14-11-14b, 850 North Fourth Street, to allow additional time for the Applicants to submit revised drawings and additional information regarding the layout and operations of the garden. Additional information should include any water sources, lighting, toilet facilities, equipment storage, animals, etc. The Commission encourages a more urban, art type of approach to the information kiosk.

Note: The temporary, private garden was approved at this location for a period of one year from the January 14, 2014 date of approval. Submission of a new application will be required for approval of the garden beyond January 14, 2015.

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) CONTINUED

8. 14-11-15

806 Hamlet Street

Lisa G. Swartzwelder (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, remove Application # 14-11-15 from the Italian Village Commission hearing agenda. Submission of a new application will be required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) REMOVED FROM AGENDA

9. 14-11-16

819 Summit Street

Christopher Hetzer (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-16, 819 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Platform Deck

- Install a new 10' x 10' wood platform deck at the rear of the house, per the submitted site plan.
- New platform deck to measure approximately 14" above grade.
- No railings, posts, or canopies to be installed.
- A revised drawing, including dimensions and height, is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

10. 14-11-17

674 North High Street

Dana Depew/NorthCoast Sign Inc. (Applicant)

John Allen/Short North Tavern (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Application #14-11-17 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

14-11-17a

New Wall Sign

Approve Application #14-11-17a, 674 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

- Install one (1) new, wall sign consisting of three separate sections, including the business name, "SHORT" "TAVERN" and "NORTH."
- The sign will be composed of individual, five (5) inch deep, aluminum channel letters, and an individual five (5) inch deep, aluminum "Tavern" banner sign cabinet, all lit internally with low voltage LEDs. Letter and banner sign cabinet returns and trim cap to be "black".
- Letter faces to be "Ivory", blockout/opaque vinyl, with one-quarter inch thick, cut, black, opaque letters offset one-half inch on top of the "Ivory", blockout/opaque vinyl faces to give a halo effect.
- The face of the individual, five (5) inch deep, aluminum "Tavern" banner sign cabinet to be "Ivory", blockout/opaque vinyl, allowing light to shine through side gap only.
- The "TAVERN" letters on the individual banner sign cabinet to be one-quarter inch thick, cut, black, opaque letters offset one-half inch on top of the "Ivory", blockout/opaque vinyl face.
- Individual letters and "Tavern" sign cabinet to be mounted on 1.5 sq. in. rails painted to match the existing brick as closely as possible.
- Overall sign area to measure 154" W x 22" H (total 23.52 sq. ft.).
- Applicant is to submit a revised drawing and section drawing to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

14-11-17b

New Projecting Sign

- Continue Application # 14-11-17b, for installation of a new projecting sign, to allow time for the Applicant to submit revised drawings for a design without face illumination, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda..

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) CONTINUED

11. 14-11-18

263 Detroit Avenue

Arch City Realty Group, LLC (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-18, 263 Detroit Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Non-Contributing Aluminum Siding and Trim

- Following the removal of a section of the existing, non-original, inappropriate aluminum siding, Applicant is to consult with Historic Preservation Office staff to determine the condition of the original, underlying wood siding, and whether repair or overall replacement of the original wood siding is the most appropriate approach.
- Following review of the test patch, remove all non-original, non-contributing, aluminum siding from all elevations, and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Following the removal of the aluminum siding, repair and/or replace all deteriorated, damaged, and missing original wood siding with new wood siding, as necessary. All new wood siding to match the dimension, style, and profile of the original wood siding exactly; like-for-like.
- All exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the aluminum siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches. All trim to project ½” to ¾” above the surface of the new siding.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Note: No exterior alterations are to be made to any existing exterior openings until new evidence is revealed that the original door and window openings were in a different location prior to the residing of the structure with the existing non-contributing siding.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

12. 14-11-19

1101 Say Avenue

Blostein/Overly Architecture (Applicant)

Matthew Brackman & Joe Benner (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-19, 1101 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Construct New Dormer

- Modify the existing roof, including the construction of new dormers on the south and north elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- New, wood rafter tails to match the profile of existing rafter tails.
- Remove existing asphalt shingles and install new asphalt shingles and ridge vent. Cut sheet for new shingles to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Repair existing stuccoed chimney, as needed.

Remove Aluminum Siding and Install New Siding

- Remove the existing aluminum siding, and install new, wood siding to match the original wood siding, per the submitted specifications.
- New siding to be installed vertically and horizontally, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new, wood corner boards, window trim, and door trim, per the submitted drawings and specifications.

New Windows & Doors

- Remove the existing deteriorated and non-original windows and doors, and install new wood windows and doors, per the submitted drawings.
- Realign the first floor windows on the south elevation to align with the new dormer, per the submitted drawings.
- Cut sheets for new windows and doors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Front Porch

- Remove the existing front porch roof, floor, and columns, and construct a new front porch, per the submitted drawings and specifications.

Landscaping

- Install new patio and parking area paving, per the submitted site plan.
- Modify the existing sidewalk by relocating the front steps and extending the brick sidewalk to the foundation wall, per the submitted site plan.
- Paving materials to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Remove the existing chain link fence and install new wrought iron fence, per the submitted site plan. Cut sheet for new fence to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Install new planter boxes on the west elevation, per the submitted drawing.

MOTION: Goodman/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

13. 14-11-20

1167 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Moe Hassan & Romeo Issa (Applicants)

Debora Czech & Roman Czech (Owners)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Continue Application # 14-11-20, concerning the existing patio structure, to allow time for Applicants to work with Building and Zoning Services and to submit revised design ideas, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the December 16, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Note: The Commission encourages the Applicant to develop a more seasonal structure.

MOTION: Goodman/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

14. 14-11-21

1059 Say Avenue

Jim Saltz (Applicant)

Chris Perry (Owner)

Two Story Addition

- First conceptual review of exterior improvements to the existing dwelling, and construction of a two-story addition, per the submitted drawings.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Would be reluctant to consider an attached garage onto an existing historic structure. The scale, as a non-auto oriented addition seems like a better direction. One or two story as living space would appear to be appropriate.

Todd Boyer:

- The balcony, as proposed, seems a bit foreign. Would consider a sleeping porch look with windows.
- Has no objections to any other aspects of the current proposal.

Rex Hagerling:

- Agrees that a sleeping porch could work if designed appropriately.

David Cooke:

- Agrees with Commissioners Boyer and Hagerling that a sleeping porch could be appropriate.

Ben Goodman:

- A sleeping porch addition should be on the rear of the building rather than on the front.

NO ACTION TAKEN

15. 14-11-22

Jeffrey Park/Waldron Street (former Jeffrey Mining site)

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)

Construct New Apartment Building/Building “K”

- First conceptual review for construction of a new 219 unit, five-story apartment building, as part of the overall Jeffrey Park Development.
- Development to include 92 surface parking spaces and 238 parking garage spaces.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Will want to look closely at the use of pole lights on the parking deck.
- There needs to be a good mix of architectural styles through the overall development.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks that the more mixed use the better.
- An alley with parallel parking on both sides could be more appropriate than just a big open parking lot.

Rex Hagerling:

- Agrees ????

Ben Goodman:

- Utilizing alleys, or rethinking the way alleys work in a new development would be a positive approach.
- Alleys are an interesting characteristic of the neighborhood. Smaller streets could feel appropriate in a new development.

NO ACTION TAKEN

16. 14-10-18

126-140 Greenwood Avenue/Burwell Court

Karrick Sherril/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Burwell Investments LLC (Owner)

Construct Townhomes

- New construction of 3-story townhomes with a total of 8 units collectively referred to as “Burwell Court” with frontage on Greenwood Avenue.
- Units to include 1 garage parking space each

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Mike Maloof 2362 N. High Street Neighboring Property Owner	Noted that he is not opposed to the building but still has issues with the limited access for all residents, deliveries, trash, and customers.

Following the public speakers, and further presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Thinks it is important to understand the future plan for the overall development regarding the street (Greenwood Avenue). For example, will there be future widening of Greenwood Avenue required as the development goes forward, and would that be to the south, to the north, or both? Street trees seem like a good idea now, but will they need to be removed in the future as the development goes forward? Will Greenwood Avenue be one way or two way? Will there be a curb?

At the request of the Applicant, direct Historic Preservation Staff to schedule a special meeting for the review of 126-140 Greenwood Avenue/Burwell Court, to take place at 1:00 p.m. on Tuesday, December 9, 2014, immediately following the regular noon business meeting.

MOTION: Lapp/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

17. 14-11-23 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION)

97 East Fifth Avenue

Jack Reynolds/Smith & Hale (Applicant)

Burwell Investments LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-11-23, 97 East Fifth Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Recommendation for Variances

1. 3356.03(C-4) – variance to allow residential use on 1st floor
2. 3309.142(a) height (35') – variance to allow building to be 72' tall (variance of 37')
3. 3332.039 (R-4) variance to allow commercial use on the residential property
4. 3349.12(c) Parking spaces – to reduce the required number of parking spaces from 138 to 102 (a reduction of 36 spaces)
5. 3312.13 Driveway width – to reduce the required driveway width from 20' to 15' (a reduction of 5')
6. 3312.21(c) – Screening – to omit screening along the west side of the ramp area
7. 3332.21 Setback (25') – to reduce the building setback from 25' to 0' (variance of 25')
8. 3332.25 Maximum sideyard (16') – to reduce the maximum sideyard to 0' (variance of 16')
9. 3332.26 Minimum sideyard (5') – to reduce the minimum sideyard from 5' to 0' (variance of 5')
10. 3332.18 lot coverage (50%) – to allow 100% lot coverage
11. 3332.27 Rearyard (25% of lot) to omit rearyard area
12. 3332.29 Height (35') variance to allow building to be 72' tall (variance of 37')
13. 3312.21 Landscaping – to omit tree requirement on surface parking lot (3 trees to 0)

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) The proposed variances are typical and consistent for the district regarding lot coverage, setbacks, sideyards, conversion of an R4 property to commercial use; etc.; 2) The property is adjacent to other existing commercial properties and properties that would be appropriate for development.

Note: The Commission's recommendation for approval of this variance package does not constitute approval of any specific building, building footprint, height, use, etc.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

18. 14-10-19

174 Detroit Avenue

Karrick Sherril/Shremshock (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

Exterior Building Alteration

- Rehabilitate existing, two (2) story, brick building for use as eighteen (18) single bedroom units.
- Restore existing, bricked in window openings and install new aluminum windows.
- Remove existing awning.
- Infill existing front door with exterior cladding and window unit, and relocate entrance from Detroit Avenue to Hamlet Street.
- Remove a portion of the existing roof to create an open area well with new courtyard.

Demolition

- Demolish adjacent metal storage building and loading dock.

New Construction

- Build new 3.5 story wood frame building with thirteen (13) single bedroom units at location of existing metal storage building.
- Build new, partially below grade parking with thirty-one (31) spaces to serve both buildings.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Likes the idea of the courtyard, but not sure that it is the right thing for this particular project.
- Thinks the south elevation could be a success only if the addition is allowed to connect with the existing building, or the facade is pulled out to be on the same datum as the existing building.
- Thinks the whole area of the entrance and garage entrance could benefit with some simplification.
- If there is any kind of green space available, it should be a buffer between the proposed project and the existing house to the east.
- Thinks that the north elevation is more successful because it is simpler. Even though it is of greater height than the existing building, it seems of a vernacular that could exist in the area.
- Has concerns about the ramp and terrace entrance feature on the west elevation. The ramp does not feel integrated into the building, and the ramp does not seem to integrate with the streetscape.
- There seems to be too many large openings on the south elevation.

Todd Boyer:

- Thinks there is just too much going on with the new addition. It feels like it is fighting the existing building. Thinks that what is already there could be utilized to get a successful project, although it would not allow as much density.
- The scale of the two story piece could integrate into the existing building better if the three story section to the rear was gone behind it.
- The terraces on the east side do not seem appropriate.
- Would prefer to see the existing building renovated as the gem of the project, with the adjacent lot being used just for parking.

David Cooke:

- Shocked at the density of the proposal.
- Thinks the overall scale of this project and the proposal on the south side of Hamlet Street need to be looked at in the same context.
- Does not think that these lots warrant or need the level of density being presented.

Josh Lapp:

- No comments.

Rex Hagerling:

- Has nothing to add at this time.

Jason Sudy:

- Has concerns about the garage wall next to the existing historic house.

NO ACTION TAKEN

19. 14-10-20

No Address (formerly 1066-1068 Hamlet/SE Corner of Detroit and Hamlet)

Karrick Sherril/Shremshock (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

New Construction

- Build new 2.5 and 3 story wood frame building for use as 2 and 4 townhomes, respectively.
- Build new partially below grade parking below 4 townhomes fronting on Detroit Avenue.

Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Could this just be a project with two or three units with ample parking? That would be a more natural kind of density and lot coverage for the area.
- Thinks this proposal is too much density for this particular site.

David Cooke:

- Does not think it is appropriate to place as many units on this lot as there are houses on the entire rest of the block.
- Thinks the building is too high out of the ground.

Rex Hagerling:

- Has concerns about the density for this lot. Could be more comfortable with an addition to the existing industrial building on the north side of the street, but it seems like too much density proposed for this site. Especially in the context of the street, which is lined with rather small scale houses.

Jason Sudy:

- Consider parking four cars on a surface lot with two cars parked elsewhere. Six units could still be used with the scale being brought down.

NO ACTION TAKEN

20. 14-11-24

813 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Michael Casey (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #14-11-24, Commissioner Goodman noted the need to abstain from the proceedings, and exited the room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-24, 813 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Add Dormer to Carriage House

- Add a new shed dormer to the west elevation, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Roof shingles to match existing asphalt shingles on main roof.
- Wood siding to match existing wood siding. Wood trim to match existing.

- Cut sheet for windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
 - Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
 - No exterior repairs or modifications to be made to the existing windows, doors, siding, roofing at this time.
- MOTION: Boyer/Cooke (5-0-1 [Goodman]) APPROVED

21. 14-11-25 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION)

813 Summit Street

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

Michael Casey (Owner)

Upon review of Application #14-11-25, 813 Summit Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.039 R-4 Residential District: To permit the upper level of the existing detached garage to be used as a single unit dwelling (carriage house)
2. 3332.19 Fronting: To permit the carriage house to not front on a public street.
3. 3332.25 Maximum Side Yards Required: To permit the sum of the widths of the carriage house side yards to equal less than 20% of the width of the lot (which would be 10.25') and to equal 7.3'.
4. 3332.26 Minimum Side Yard Permitted: To permit the side yards on a lot more than 40' wide, to be less than 5' and be 2.3' on the north side of the front dwelling and 2.3' on the south side of the carriage house.
5. 3332.27 Rearyard To permit the rearyard of the principal building (carriage house) to be less than 25% of the total lot area and be 0%
6. 312.49 Minimum number of parking spaces: To permit zero off street parking spaces for the carriage house. The front dwelling has two parking spaces provided in the garage.

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) Items # 2, 3, 4, and 5, are related to existing conditions; 2) Items # 1 and 6, allowing for use as a dwelling unit, create a less burdensome parking issue than the commercial use that was previously approved.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (5-0-1 [Goodman]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

22. 14-11-26

955 North Sixth Street (North)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

955 North Sixth Street, LLC (Owner)

New Single Family Dwelling

- Construct a new, two-story, single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings. *Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

David Cooke:

- Would like to see two separate garage doors on one of the garages rather than a combined double door. Preferably for the brick house garage.
- Will need to see light fixtures for the garages.

Todd Boyer:

- The brick house seems a bit wide, but if it fits the scale of the nearby duplexes, could be okay.
- Thinks it would be appropriate to have traditional porch detailing on the brick house.
- Likes the idea of making the board and batten house a bit more contemporary, but would like to see a bit of relief from the board and batten. It loses some scale if completely board and batten.

Rex Hagerling:

- Agrees that the porch of the brick house should have traditional detailing. Also agrees with Commissioner Boyer's comment about the board and batten.
NO ACTION TAKEN

23. 14-11-27

955 North Sixth Street (South)

Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)

955 North Sixth Street, LLC (Owner)

New Single Family Dwelling

- Construct a new, two-story, single-family dwelling, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.

See comments for 955 North Sixth Street (North), above.

NO ACTION TAKEN

24. 14-11-28 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION)

955 North Sixth Street (North & South)

955 N. Sixth St. c/o Jack Reynolds/Smith & Hale (Applicant)

955 North Sixth Street, LLC (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-11-28, 955 North Sixth Street (North & South), the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

<u>Variance Recommendation</u>	<u>Lot 1</u>	<u>Lot 2</u>
1. 3332.15- lot area (5000 sq. ft. minimum)	3426 sq. ft. variance of 1574 sq. ft.	3433 sq. ft. variance of 1567 sq. ft.
2. 3332.05 – lot width (50' minimum)	39' variance of 11'	39' variance of 11'
3. 3312.25-maneuvering (20' minimum)	15' variance of 5'	15' variance of 5'
4. 3312.1213(A)-Driveway (10' minimum)	5' variance of 5'	5' variance of 5'

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) The requested variances are in keeping with the typical surrounding development pattern of the street; 2) The requested variances are in keeping with the variances that the Italian Village Commission traditionally recommends for houses in these urban conditions; 3) The Commission requested that the Applicant utilize a shared driveway to minimize the overall curb cuts on the street; 4) While additional curb cuts are not typically recommended, a curb cut is appropriate at this specific site due to the lack of alley access for driveways, and the wider than usual lot is being used for the development of two units.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

25. 14-11-29 (VARIANCE RECOMMENDATION)

150 Detroit Avenue

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Urban Restorations (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-11-29, 150 Detroit Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.039 R-4 Residential District: To permit one single family dwelling and one dwelling containing three dwelling units on one parcel.
2. 3332.05 Area District Lot Width Requirements: To permit a lot width of 30 feet and not 50 feet.
3. 3332.15 R-4 Area District Requirements: To permit less than 2500 square feet per unit and to permit a lot of 3375 square feet as calculated in accordance with 3332.18(C).
4. 3332.19 Fronting on a Public Street: To permit a single family dwelling to not front on a public street.

5. 3332.21(D) Setback: To permit a building to be less than 10 feet from the front property line and to be 5 feet 11 inches (5' 11").
6. 3332.27 Rear Yard: To permit a rear yard that is greater than the required 25% and is 28% of the total lot area to serve as the rear yard for two structures.
7. 3312.49 Parking Spaces: To permit less than 2 parking spaces per unit and to permit 7 parking spaces.

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) The requested variances for width, square footage, setbacks, and rear yards are typical of recommendations based on the urban character of the neighborhood; 2) Item #4, "Not fronting on a public street," is based on an infill approach that has been taken to deal with the nature of the lot; 3) The proposed parking appears adequate for this urban neighborhood.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (3-2-[Hagerling/Cooke]-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

26. 14-11-30 Variance

60 East Hubbard Avenue

Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)

Connie Klema/Borrer Properties (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Upon review of Application #14-11-30, 60 East Hubbard Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Variance Recommendation

1. 3332.039 R-4 Residential District: To permit two dwellings on one lot comprised of one (1) single family dwelling and one (1) three family dwelling.
2. 3332.15 R-4 Area District Requirements: To have less than 2500 square feet per unit and to have 1871 square feet per unit.
3. 3332.18(D) Basis of Computing Area: To permit dwelling coverage to be greater than 50% and to be 67%.
4. 3332.19 Fronting: To permit the dwelling containing three dwelling units to not front on a public street.
5. 3332.25 Maximum Side Yards Required: To permit the sum of widths of each side yard to not equal or exceed 20 percent of the width of the lot and to equal 0 feet at the north dwelling.
6. 3332.26 Minimum Side Yard Permitted: To permit the minimum side yards at the north dwelling to be 0 feet.
7. 3332.17 Rear Yard: To permit a rear yard to be less than 25% of the total lot area and to be 12% and to serve as the rear yard for the south and north building.

Reasons for an affirmative recommendation:

- 1) The requested variances for area, side yards, and rear yards are typical of recommendations based on the urban character of the neighborhood; 2) Other multi-unit dwellings already exist in this area; 3) The proposed project creates a good transition from the large scale parking garage on the west in the residential area.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

27. 14-11-31

988 North High Street

Laura Wilging (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #14-11-31, 988 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new, double-faced, non-illuminated projecting sign, per the submitted drawing.
- New sign to measure 4' W x 1' 6" H (total 6 sq. ft.). Existing bracket to be used.
- New sign to be ¼" aluminum, painted white, with black, vinyl letters.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

28. 14-11-32

270 East Third Avenue

Jody Dierksheide (Applicant)

The Wood Companies (Owner)

An application, photograph, and drawing have been submitted.

Construct New Garage

- Construct a new, frame garage per the submitted site plan.
- Revised drawings, including exterior cladding materials and roof pitch to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by Commissioner Boyer, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets/specifications for the two (2) overhead garage doors and the one (1) pedestrian door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval by Commissioner Boyer, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Fence

- Install a new six-foot-high (6'H) fence in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan and example photograph.
- Fence to be horizontally applied 1" x 6" cedar boards and 4" x 4" posts, per the submitted example photograph.
- Fence to be double-sided, with no stringers or posts facing neighboring properties. Spacing between the boards to be no wider than one-half inch (1/2").
- Finish to be natural cedar.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (6-0-0) APPROVED

STAFF APPROVALS

• **14-11-1**

809 Hamlet Street

James Hill (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-1, 809 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- 2) Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave, soffit, and fascia on all elevations, as necessary, with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- 3) Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- 4) Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- 5) Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- 6) Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color to match existing.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **14-11-2**

1024 North High Street

Mike Fitzpatrick (Applicant)

Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-2, 1024 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Vents

- Install one (1) new, exterior, 24" vent on the roof of the existing elevator shaft, per the submitted drawing.
- Install new louvered vents on the rear (east) elevation of the exiting Fireproof Building, per the submitted drawing.

- **14-11-3**

772 North High Street

John Wood (Applicant)

Woods High Street (The Wood Companies) (Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-3, 772 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rubber Roof

- Remove any/all asphalt shingles or rolled roofing on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Examine all structural members of the flat roofing system from the square (i.e. top plate) to determine condition. Make any/all necessary structural repairs as needed in accordance with standard building practices and all applicable Columbus Building Codes.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing/decking with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Replace any/all deteriorated and damaged wood fascia with new wood of same dimension as necessary. Prime and finish coat all wood fascia prior to the installation of all new gutter and down spouts; color to match the existing trim color. Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff.

- **14-11-4**

78 East Lincoln Street

Punch Out Plus, LLC(Applicant)

Brian Yarbrough (Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-4, 78 East Lincoln Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave sub-fascia on west elevation as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

Reinstall Existing Gutters

- Following all eave repair/replacement, priming, and finish coating, reinstall all existing metal gutters and metal down spouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **14-11-5**

1046-1048 North Hamlet Street

Christopher Hammer (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-5, 1046-1048 North Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Wood Siding & Trim

- Repair/replace any rotten or damaged original, existing wood siding and trim with new wood siding and trim to match the original wood siding profile and dimension exactly; like-for-like.
- Dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Prepare all existing wood siding and trim surfaces using the appropriate hand tools.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Replace Gutters & Downspouts

- Replace existing rain carriers, downspouts, and gutters to match existing profiles and dimensions; like-for-like.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

- **14-11-6**

53-57 East Russell Street

Glenn Skinner II (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-6, 53-57 East Russell Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Box Gutters

- Examine all box gutters on the building and make any repairs and/or replace the existing box gutter system on all elevations with new materials of appropriate dimension and profile.
- Reline with new copper, terne metal, galvanized metal, or E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes.
- Install new, round, galvanized metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color to be Glidden Professional Fortis 350 "Special Night Owl", matching existing manufacturer and color used since 1978.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on existing elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-11-7**

81 Warren Street

Robert Dennison Jr. (Applicant)

JoAnne Dennison (Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-7, 81 Warren Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Front Porch

- Remove all existing, deteriorated slate on the front porch roof down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Paint Exterior Trim

- Prime and finish coat wood trim as needed; color to match the existing trim color.

• **14-11-8**

682 N. Pearl Street

Giannopoulos Properties Ltd. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-8, 682 N. Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Spot Tuck Point—(East Elevation Complete)

- Check all mortar joints on east elevation for soundness—north to south /ground-to-top of parapet complete.
- All sound mortar to remain in place. Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4", moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the brick, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the brick. **Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content.** (Refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings".)

Re-Install Metal Security Gates

- Upon completion of the east wall tuck pointing, re-install the metal gate system between the 682 N. Pearl Street building and the neighboring property garage at the north and south openings.
- All lags and bolts to be installed into the mortar joints only per industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Finish metal gate paint color to be submitted to the H. P. O. staff for inclusion in the property file.

• **14-11-9**

974, 978, 982, 986, 990, 994 Summit Street

Land Use Plan, Ltd. (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 14-11-9, 974, 978, 982, 986, 990, 994 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Temporary Construction Signage

- Install one temporary post sign at the intersection of Summit Street and Second Avenue, per the submitted rendering.
- Temporary sign will be removed after the final/sixth house has been completed, or after no construction has taken place for eight (8) months. If the sign is removed, and construction is to begin again, a new application will be required.

IX. OLD BUSINESS

X. NEW BUSINESS

XI. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) 10:40 p.m.