

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**Tuesday, October 21, 2014**

**6:15 p.m.**

**50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B**

**Commissioners Present:** Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Josh Lapp (left 10:50 p.m.), Jason Sudy (arrived 6:19 p.m.),  
Charmaine Sutton (left 8:23 p.m.)

**Commissioners Absent:** Todd Boyer, David Cooke

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:15 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, November 11, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, November 18, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, September 16, 2014.  
MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (3-0-1 [Sutton]) APPROVED
- V. PUBLIC FORUM
- VI. STAFF APPROVALS  
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**1. 14-6-7**

**995 North Fourth Street**

**John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

- Continue Application #14-6-7, 995 North Fourth Street, to allow the Applicant time to resolve Zoning issues and submit a site plan and landscaping plan, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 18, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

*Note: Work was completed prior to review and approval. A code order has been issued. A certificate of zoning clearance is also required. This application was continued from the June 17 and July 15, 2014 IVC hearings, in the absence of the Applicant, to allow the Applicant time to work with Building & Zoning Services. The Applicant attended the August 19<sup>th</sup> IVC hearing to provide a status update, and the application was continued to allow the Applicant time to submit a landscape plan. At the September 16<sup>th</sup> and October 21<sup>st</sup> hearings, the application was continued in the absence of the Applicant. It is the policy of the Italian Village Commission to remove an application from the agenda following three absences by the Applicant. Should the Applicant not be prepared to attend the November 18<sup>th</sup> IVC hearing, the application will be removed from the agenda and reverted to Code Enforcement.*

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED

2. **14-8-13**

**1006 North High Street (Fireproof Building/new construction)**

**Andrew Bacher/DaNite Sign Co. (Applicant)**

**Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, remove Application # 14-8-13 from the Italian Village Commission agenda. Submission of a new application will be required to be placed on a future IVC agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (5-0-0) APPLICATION REMOVED FROM AGENDA

3. **14-9-7a**

**1026 North High Street (Fireproof Building)**

**J. Carter Bean Architect (Applicant)**

**Elford Development (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-9-7a was divided into Items 'a' and 'c' for clarity of action (14-9-7b previously issued). Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

**14-9-7a**

Approve Application #14-9-7a, 1026 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Storefront

- Remove the two (2) existing, wood, tripartite storefront windows and the two (2) existing, wood, tripartite storefront entrances.
- Replicate existing, and install new, mahogany framing and trim and glazing, to include one (1) entry door, to fit the existing openings, to match existing, like-for-like.
- Storefronts to include fixed and casement windows, per the submitted drawings.
- Final drawings to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Approval for the replication of the existing windows is based on 1) Historic Preservation Office staff site visit to examine the condition of the interior and exterior of the existing, wood, window and door surrounds; 2) One existing door is not original; 3) The one set of original, double doors is not feasible for daily use on a modern business.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED

**14-9-7c**

Approve Application #14-9-7c, 1026 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Awnings

- Install four (4) new, black, fabric awnings, on the front/west elevation, beneath the existing glazed terra cotta panels, per the submitted drawing and rendering.
- Awnings to include the business name, "Pies & Pints" flanked by horizontal graphic lines, per the submitted renderings.

Install New Window Graphics

- Install new window graphic in the center pane of the three tripartite storefront windows, per the submitted rendering.
- Graphic to include the business logo and name, "Pies & Pints," per the submitted rendering.

Install New Door Graphics

- Install new window graphic in the front entrance door.
- Amount of text to be reduced from the originally submitted rendering, with final drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Reasons for approval of the awning graphic in addition to window graphics: 1) The awning flap is narrow, and the graphic is minimal and subtle, i.e., a decorative accent as opposed to awning signage.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED

## **NEW APPLICATIONS**

### **4. 14-10-12**

#### **1010 North High Street (Fireproof Building/new construction)**

**Wright Patt Credit Union (Applicant)**

**Elford Development (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-12, 1010 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

#### **Install New Signage/Wall Sign**

- Install one (1) new, 115” wide by 31” high wall sign, per the submitted drawings. (Total 24.75 sq. ft.).
- New sign to consist of reverse halo lit (LED) channel letters “Wright-Patt” and “CREDIT UNION, INC.” and logo on painted, brushed aluminum cabinet, per the submitted drawing.

#### **Install New Signage/Projecting Sign**

- Install one (1) new, double-faced, aluminum projecting sign, per the submitted drawings. (Total 11 sq. ft.).
- New sign to consist of a two-inch deep (2” D), round, aluminum cabinet with an applied, .25” acrylic Wright-Patt logo.
- Aluminum cabinet to be painted “Blue/Pantone 540C” and logo to be painted “Yellow/Pantone 124C.”
- Metal bracket to measure 48” long, per the submitted drawing.
- Sign to be externally illuminated with one spotlight on each side, per the submitted drawing.

#### **Install New Window and Door Graphics**

- Install new window and door graphics, including business name, address, and business hours, per the submitted rendering.

MOTION: Goodman/Sutton (5-0-0) APPROVED

### **5. 14-10-13**

#### **1010 North High Street (Fireproof Building/new construction)**

**Wright Patt Credit Union (Applicant)**

**Elford Development (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-13, 1010 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

#### **Install New ATM**

- Install one (1) new automated teller machine (ATM) on the south wall of the Fireproof Building, per the submitted drawings.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED

### **6. 14-10-14**

#### **1049-1051 North Fourth Street**

**Jared Williamson (Applicant)**

**Kevin Lykens (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-10-14 and direct Historic Preservation Staff to place on the November 18, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) CONTINUED

7. 14-10-15

**1038 North High Street**

**Mike Sorboro (Applicant)**

**Mike Maloof (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-15, 1038 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install Signage

- Install one (1) new, six-foot-high by two-foot-eight-inches wide (6' H x 2' 8" W), projecting sign, per the submitted drawings.
- New sign to consist of an aluminum sign box with flat decorated graphics and neon tubing. (Total approx. 8.5 sq. ft.).
- Edge neon to be 15mm tubing; lettering to be 10mm tubing.
- The word "ODDFELLOWS" on the High Street facing side of the sign is not to be outlined with neon. The Applicant has the option of illuminating this side externally, with cut sheet for fixture to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Sign to be mounted on 1/2" plate with 2" x 2" x 1/4" square extrusions.
- All fasteners to be inserted into mortar, not into the face of the brick.
- Sign to be mounted with 10' clearance from sidewalk.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED

7B. 14-10-27

**152 East Second Avenue**

**Matt Canterbury (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-27, 152 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Non-Contributing Vinyl Siding and Trim

- Following the removal of a section of the existing, non-original, inappropriate vinyl siding, Applicant is to consult with Historic Preservation Office staff to determine the condition of the original, underlying wood siding, and whether repair or overall replacement of the original wood siding is the most appropriate approach.
- Following review of the test patch, remove all non-original, non-contributing, vinyl siding from all elevations, and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Following the removal of the vinyl siding, repair and/or replace all deteriorated, damaged, and missing original wood siding with new wood siding, as necessary. All new wood siding to match the dimension, style, and profile of the original wood siding exactly; like-for-like.
- All exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the vinyl siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches. All trim to project 1/2" to 3/4" above the surface of the new siding.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color schedule to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

**Note: No exterior alterations are to be made to any existing exterior openings until new evidence is revealed that the original door and window openings were in a different location prior to the residing of the structure with the existing non-contributing siding.**

Demolition

- Demolish the non-original, non-contributing covered stairway addition on the east elevation.

Note: Demolition of the addition is approved based on submitted interior photos documenting that the addition was built as an exterior stairway enclosure and did not serve as a sleeping porch.

Landscaping/Fencing

- Following demolition of the stairway enclosure, extend the existing fence to the east elevation of the house, maintaining existing profile.
- Install new, low landscaping in location of the stairway enclosure, following demolition.
- Final landscaping plan to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (5-0-0) APPROVED

**8. 14-5-20**

**920 North High Street**

**Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)**

**Emerald Light Ltd. (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Applications #14-5-20 and 14-10-16, Chairman Hagerling noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Commissioner Sudy assumed the duties of the Chair. Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-5-20 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

**14-5-20a**

Approve Application #14-5-20a, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

New Construction

- Construct new two-story commercial building, per the submitted site plan.
- Final drawings, materials, and colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review by a sub-committee of Commissioner Boyer and Commissioner Sutton.
- Any/all signage, landscaping, parking lot lighting, and details for the exterior grain bin to return to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (3-1 [Goodman] -1 [Hagerling]) APPROVED

**14-5-20b**

Approve Application #14-5-20b, 920 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing, non-contributing, 1994, brick commercial building.

Reasons for Approval of Demolition

- 1) The footprint and height of the existing 1994 building do not present the best design solution for a large, prominent, urban site.
- 2) Removal of the existing commercial building allows for the removal of a large, inappropriate curb cut on High Street (SNDG 3.31).
- 3) The drive-thru pickup window is an existing condition. Replacement of the existing, non-contributing commercial building with the proposed new commercial building provides for a drive-thru and reduced parking area that are not visible from the public right-of-way.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (4-0-1 [Hagerling]) APPROVED

**9. 14-10-16 (Variance Recommendation)**

**920 North High Street**

**Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)**

**Emerald Light Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

At the request of the Applicant, continue Application # 14-10-16, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the November 18, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Sutton/Goodman (4-0-0) CONTINUED

**10. 14-10-17 (Variance Recommendation)**

**658-660 North High Street**

**John Ingwersen (Applicant)**

**Giannopoulos Properties Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Upon review of Application #14-10-17, 658-660 North High Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- The current use as a restaurant is a permitted use.
- Section 3312.49 – Required Parking – To reduce the required (59) automobile parking spaces and the required two (2) bicycle parking spaces for the existing restaurant to zero (0).

Note: Upon making an affirmative recommendation for the proposed variance, the Commission notes the following history:

- The restaurant at 660 N. High Street and has been in use since approximately 2003. The restaurant expanded into 658 N. High Street in 2010, and the patio was added behind 658 N. High Street in 2011. Prior to conversion of 658 N. High Street from retail to restaurant use, a variance for change of use was not obtained. A variance is now required for clarification of the record.
- The longevity of the current use precludes any further analysis of this parking variance request.
- The Commission recommends that a bicycle rack be installed at the rear of the property by the business or property owner.

MOTION: Sutton/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

**11. 14-10-18**

**No Address (formerly 89 thru 117 E. Fifth Ave./SW corner of Summit Street & Fifth Ave.)**

**Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)**

**Burwell Investments LLC (Owner)**

Construct Townhomes

- New construction of 3-story townhomes with a total of 8 units collectively referred to as “Burwell Court” with frontage on Greenwood Avenue.
- Units to include 1 garage parking space each.

*Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.*

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Mike Maloof 2362 N. High Street Neighboring Property Owner	Has a concern that the overall ingress and egress for the overall development will be through Greenwood Avenue, which currently serves as an alley. Trash trucks, delivery trucks, etc. will need to be considered.

*Following the public speakers, and further presentation by the applicants, Chairman Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Josh Lapp:

- Voiced concerns about obstructions, such as telephone poles, within the sidewalk.
- Would feel comfortable with eliminating the element at the far right/east end of the mansard section that refers to the center section of the building.

Jason Sudy:

- A new street frontage is being created along Greenwood Avenue, which has been treated as an alley. Prior to approval, the Commission needs to clearly understand more about the improvements to Greenwood, i.e., How

wide will the street be?; Will the poles be relocated or the lines buried?; Will the street be one-way?; How will the curbs and sidewalks be detailed?

- Will comment further on the architecture when the street details are figured out.
- This is the first phase of a much larger project. The Commission needs to understand how both vehicular and pedestrian access and egress is going to be provided for the multi-phase project.

Rex Hagerling:

- Is in agreement with Commissioner Sudy's comments regarding improvements to Greenwood Avenue.
- In general, is okay with the proposed architecture. The changes to the mansard roof are an improvement. Would like to see more details and an elevation, focusing on historical elements of a mansard roof.
- Would like more detail on the sloped porch roofs.
- A section of the area between the second and third floors would be helpful.
- Likes the detail of the upper left hand corner. How the cornice is being expressed is working well. It would help to move some of those details into the upper right corner.

Ben Goodman:

- The awning porch roof seems a bit out of context with the rest of the architecture. Consider looking at a flat or hipped roof.
- Appreciates the elimination of the mansard from the left/west side.
- Would like to see more trim details of the wall dormer type windows on the mansard roof.
- Would like to see a section drawing of the mansard roof and porches.
- The clerestory windows on the third story are a nice touch.
- Will be interested in seeing details of the handrails and fence, which will be significant elements of the streetscape view.
- The space between the edge of pavement and doorstops is tight. Consider ways to provide an architectural response that will allow for more space into the entranceway.

NO ACTION TAKEN

## CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

### 12. 14-10-19

#### 174 Detroit Avenue

**Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock (Applicant)**

**Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)**

#### Exterior Building Alteration

- Rehabilitate existing, two (2) story, brick building for use as eighteen (18) single bedroom units.
- Restore existing, bricked in window openings and install new aluminum windows.
- Remove existing awning.
- Infill existing front door with exterior cladding and window unit, and relocate entrance from Detroit Avenue to Hamlet Street.
- Remove a portion of the existing roof to create an open area well with new courtyard.

#### Demolition

- Demolish adjacent metal storage building and loading dock.

#### New Construction

- Build new 3.5 story wood frame building with thirteen (13) single bedroom units at location of existing metal storage building.
- Build new, partially below grade parking with thirty-one (31) spaces to serve both buildings.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Would be open to lowering the sill height to match the height from the ground of the other existing windows if it appears period correct. It would depend on the type of window sash proposed.
- Not opposed to increasing or adding a new entrance way if it provides a quality pedestrian entrance/lobby.
- The mock balcony over the central entrance seems out of place. Perhaps a punch in instead of a walk-out.
- Does not have an issue with the stepping down of the parking garage roof from the alley toward Detroit Avenue. Will need to discuss the garage openings as seen from the east.
- The façade of the new construction is not currently cohesive with the existing building. It appears a bit blocky, with too many components going on.
- Not sure about the expression of the colonnades as separate from the elevation itself.

Rex Hagerling:

- There is a symmetry of the windows that wraps around from the front to the west elevation that is kind of interesting. Would need to think further about the possibility of lowering those sills.
- Would like to see the current entrance continue to be expressed as an entrance.
- Will need to clearly understand the requirements of placing a parking garage so close to an existing dwelling.
- Would like to see the central entrance pulled back, not projecting, from the façade.
- Would like to see the grilled openings at the southeast corner of the parking structure expressed in a different material, with only the grilled garage door on Detroit Avenue reading as a parking structure.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks that the stepping down of the garage addition from the alley toward Detroit Avenue can be representative of the way some historic industrial buildings were built.
- Would like to see a more cohesive design for the façade of the parking structure.

Jason Sudy:

- In general agreement with Commissioners Goodman and Lapp regarding the design of the new parking structure. As presented, the rear elevation of the parking structure seems a more successful representation of an industrial use than the façade does.
- Not supportive of the proposed center entrance. It does not seem committed to the historic structure or to the new design.
- Consider the possibilities of making the front entrance less prominent, with legitimate frontage on Detroit Avenue with actual units.
- Will need to consider the large, exposed openings on the east elevation in relation to the existing, adjacent house.
- Noted that there is already a large curb cut access onto the property from Detroit Avenue.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**13. 14-10-20**

**No Address (formerly 1066-1068 Hamlet/SE Corner of Detroit and Hamlet)**

**Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock (Applicant)**

**Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)**

New Construction

- Build new 2.5 and 3 story wood frame building for use as 2 and 4 townhomes, respectively.
- Build new partially below grade parking below 4 townhomes fronting on Detroit Ave.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Rex Hagerling:

- Has concerns about the amount of building being proposed on the site.
- Would like to see a site plan showing more detail of the relationship to the existing historic dwelling.
- Would like to see elevations showing the relationship of the proposed building with existing, adjacent buildings.



- The expression of a large building as townhouses seems appropriate.
- Noted that three Commissioners are not present to provide their comments.

Jason Sudy:

- Consider reconfiguring the parking, so that the entire first floor isn't needed just to supply six parking spaces.
- Has concerns about having a garage entrance, windows looking onto a parking garage, and maintaining a curb cut just to provide six parking spaces. Consider an option of removing a unit from the end to get four head-in spaces off of the alley, and possibly getting a variance for the other two spaces or an easement for parking across the street.

Ben Goodman:

- Commends the applicant on the sense of rhythm of streetscape expressed by this larger building.
- Not sure the garage entrance onto Detroit Avenue is appropriate.
- Does not have an issue with the roofs sloping toward Detroit, but will need more discussion about the change in roof massing at the corner.
- Would like to see a stronger commitment in design at the cornice line.
- Would not be supportive of the use of EIFS.

Josh Lapp:

- At first glance, is feeling good about where the design is going. Is pleased to see the porches that are in the traditional vein of townhouses. The parking is accommodated, and the curb cuts are at least minimal.
- A terrace over the garage exit helps to break it up.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**14. 14-9-15**

**150 Detroit Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Urban Restorations (Owner)**

New Construction

- Third conceptual review of proposed new construction to include a two-story, two-unit residential building and a warehouse style carriage house with two residential units above, per the submitted site plan.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- The changes that have been made since the last review are in the right direction.
- This proposal fits the scale of the street better.
- Appreciates the reduction in size.
- The carriage house is still very massive, but it has been broken down a lot better.
- The site plan is much improved.

Josh Lapp:

- Feeling good about the proposal.
- Did not have an issue with the density before.
- The parking pad is a good idea. It provides flexible space.

Rex Hagerling:

- The proposal is much improved from the previous conceptual review.
- Would prefer to see a single-family dwelling with a carriage house on this particular site.
- It has been greatly improved by opening up some space, so it doesn't cover the entire site.
- Noted that three Commissioners are not present to provide their comments.

Ben Goodman:

- Would like to see some articulation of a basement, such as a water table.
- Thinks the cornice could be scaled down a bit to fit into the streetscape better.

- The applicant has provided some breaks in the west elevation, as requested.
- Will be interested in the details of the entrances on the west and south elevations.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**15. 14-10-21**

**285 East Fourth Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**New Victorians (Owner)**

Convert Church to Residential Units

- First conceptual review to convert an abandoned church into eight (8) residential units.

New Construction

- First conceptual review for construction of fourteen (14) residential townhouse units.

*Prior to review of Application #14-10-21, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Relating to the overall project, thinks it is appropriate to provide straight-line alleys, rather than a “knuckle” within the proposed development site.
- Thinks the new building will need to come down a level in order to properly relate to the church. The penthouse could be to the peak of the church roof, or the tower at most.
- If it is not going to be an industrial style building, the applicant will need to consider how the projection of form and shadow contributes to establishing a rhythm, similar to a traditional streetscape of single-family homes.
- Single-family homes could also work on this site, but, if not, a larger building would need to present some of the rhythm of a single-family home streetscape.
- There are some larger, single-family homes starting to be built in this area. That possibility could be considered also.

Rex Hagerling:

- Loves that the church is being restored.
- Noted that three Commissioners are not present to provide their comments.
- Would prefer to see single-family homes on this site, but would not necessarily oppose a townhome development.
- Would like to see a bit more expression of the rhythm of the street for the façade. Modern or traditional could work, but not overly contemporary, based on the surrounding, existing houses.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks there is a difference between creating a curb cut for a new development (e.g., onto Fourth Avenue) and creating a curb cut for a new, functioning alley. It becomes a part of the street grid.
- Happy to see the church renovated.
- Thinks the architecture for this site needs to be something special, because it will set the tone for the whole area.
- Could be supportive of modern architecture.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**16. 14-10-22**

**782 North High Street**

**Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)**

**RGB, LLC. (Owner)**

New Construction/Addition

- Construct a new, four-story addition to the rear of the existing building, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- New addition to include a recessed area to accommodate the on-site dumpster.

*Prior to review of Application #14-10-22, Commissioner Sudy returned the table. Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Would like to see this alley become more than an alley. The Commission has been encouraging business owners to move the trash off of the alley and provide screening.
- Moving the dumpster off of the alley is a positive, but a screening wall would be helpful.
- Consider possibilities other than a fixed masonry wall for screening a dumpster, e.g., a wall/fence that pivots out on a wheel, allowing for greater access and maneuverability.
- Could be interesting to express any steel elements of the cantilever.

Rex Hagerling:

- If applied well, stucco could be appropriate.
- A tall, narrow addition could be interesting, but has concerns about the exterior cladding. The height variation from the existing building will make the addition noticeable and visible from a distance.
- Consider looking at a brick exterior cladding. Addition does not need to match the exterior cladding of the existing building. Would prefer not to see four stories of block exterior.
- Will need to be aware of any rooftop mechanicals.

Jason Sudy:

- Suggests looking into whether extending the wall down, without the cantilever, would work with the site triangle issue.
- Questions the use of stucco on a frame building. Concrete block seems more appropriate for a warehouse type building.

Josh Lapp:

- Suggests looking into rolling the trash in and out of the building, rather than a full-size dumpster, and a more frequent trash pick-up.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**17. 14-10-23**

**782 North High Street**

**RGB LLC/Jack Reynolds – Smith & Hale LLC (Applicant)**

**RGB, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Upon review of Application #14-10-23, 782 North High Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variances, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 3312.49(c) - Request for variance to reduce the number of required parking spaces from seven (7) to zero (0) for a new, four-story addition to be added to an existing building.

Reasons for an Affirmative Recommendation:

- 1) Four (4) of the spaces are for the expansion of storage space for the restaurant, which will not add any additional seating space for customers within the restaurant; 2) Three (3) of the spaces are for the three (3) stories of restaurant office space, which will be daytime oriented, and will not compete with the demand for high-peak, evening time activities; 3) The building is in close proximity to a parking garage.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (4-0-0) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

**18. 14-10-24**

**60 East Hubbard Avenue**

**Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)**

**Connie Klema/Borror Properties (Owner)**

Demolition and New Construction

- Demolish the existing, one-story, rear addition.
- Renovate the existing, two story dwelling.
- Construct a new, warehouse type, three-unit residential condominium at rear of property, with eight (8) interior parking spaces.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Thinks the approach is smart and well thought out. Appears to solve an issue for the neighboring house that was created by the approval and construction of the parking garage. It somewhat screens the effect of the garage.
- The architectural style is creative. Likes the penthouse.
- Makes sense not to have too many windows on the addition facing onto the parking garage or onto the neighboring yard to the east.

Josh Lapp:

- The existing one story additions are not contributing elements of the property.
- The design is a good step-down from the parking garage.

Rex Hagerling:

- The proposed renovation and addition are an improvement to the property.
- Has some initial concerns about the penthouse. Just needs a bit more work, but there is a lot of potential.

Ben Goodman:

- Will need to see details on trash storage and removal.
- Likes the project overall.
- Would like to see some pedestrian space on the alley and/or around the building.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**19. 14-10-25**

**Jeffrey Park Community Center & Walk-Ups (E. First Ave. & N. Fourth St./Jeffrey Manufacturing Site)**

**Rob Harris (Applicant)**

**Jeffrey New Day, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-25, Jeffrey Park Community Center & Walk-Ups (E. First Ave. & N. Fourth St./Jeffrey Manufacturing Site), as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Jeffrey Park Community Center- Modify Previously Approved West Elevation

- Modify one (1) bay on the west elevation of the Community Center building to match the adjacent bay, per the submitted elevation drawing.

Jeffrey Park Walk-Ups – Modify Previously Approved Railings

- Modify the material and design of the railings of all walk-up pods, per the submitted site plan. Drawings for final railing designs to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioner Cooke.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

**20. 14-10-26**

**624 North High Street (Joseph Hotel)**

**Wayne Schick/Cameron Mitchell Restaurants (Applicant)**

**Pizzuti Short North Hotel, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-26, 624 North High Street (Joseph Hotel), as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage

- Install one (1) new sign consisting of channel fabricated aluminum “open face” letters, including the business name, “THE GUILD HOUSE,” per the submitted renderings and drawing. (Total 24.5 sq. ft. / 27.1 including spaces).
- Interior of letters to be painted “Metalic Gold.”
- Exterior of letters to be painted “Grey.”
- Neon tubes to be “Gold II neon” (exposed single stroke).
- Exterior mini raceway to be fabricated aluminum, painted “Grey.”

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (5-0-0) APPROVED

**STAFF APPROVALS**

• **14-10-1**

**163-165 East Fourth Avenue**

**Ryan Gale (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-1, 163-165 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the concrete block garage, and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-10-2**

**164 East Third Avenue**

**Greg Smith (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-2, 164 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Tree & Shrub Trimming & Removal

- To avoid additional damage to the existing carriage house, trim the existing Hawthorne tree adjacent to the carriage house, as needed.
- To avoid damage to the cobblestone wall and driveway, remove the large shrub and roots located immediately adjacent to the wall on the north side of the driveway.
- Remove any additional scrub trees and brush, as needed.

Carriage House Repair

- Remove existing concrete slab floor, and install a new concrete floor, in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- Remove any/all existing plywood siding and deteriorated wood siding, and install new wood siding to match existing, like-for-like.
- Window openings may be walled over on the interior, but all existing openings are to remain visible on the exterior.
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary.  
All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the carriage house for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Finish color of body and trim to be "white."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., stone foundation, walls, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof / Carriage House

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the carriage house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Install new Certain Teed, "Nickel Gray," standard 3-tab, asphalt shingles, to match existing shingles on house.
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red" to match house.
- Remove the existing, non-original, overhead garage door, and install a new, steel, overhead door to resemble carriage doors. Cut sheet for new overhead door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Note: A single garage door is being approved at this specific location because the proposed new door will be detailed to have the appearance of two doors.

- **14-10-3**

**825 North Fourth Street**

**Kramer Place Condominiums (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-3, 825 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Relocate Way-Finding Sign

- To allow for the enclosing of the interior ceiling to prevent freezing of pipes, install an additional eight-inches (8") of matching, bronze sheet metal across the top of the door, and lower the garage door motor eight-inches (8"), per the submitted photograph.
- Reinstall the existing lettering to mark the entrance and clearance height.

- **14-10-4**

**1158 Say Avenue**

**Kevin Lykens (Applicant)                      LS Development Systems, LLC (Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-4, 1158 Say Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove Asphalt Siding

- Remove all non-original asphalt shingle siding from all elevations and dispose of in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Following completion of asphalt shingle removal on the main house, repair and/or replace all deteriorated, damaged, and missing original wood siding as necessary. All new wood siding to match the dimension, style, and profile of the original wood siding exactly; like-for-like.
- All wood trim to be either: a) Repaired/restored as necessary, if still in place; or b) Install new trim that matches the dimensions illustrated by the exiting shadow lines revealed upon removal of the non-original siding
- Note: No exterior alterations are to be made to any existing exterior openings until new evidence is revealed that the original door and window openings were in a different location prior to the residing of the structure with asphalt material.
- All exterior trim elements (i. e. window & door trim, corner boards, eave soffit & fascia, crown moldings, etc.) to be restored to the original profile and dimension as determined by any/all existing, original trim and/or shadow lines following the removal of the asphalt shingle siding and any/all non-original trim repair patches.

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on all elevations of the building using the appropriate hand tools. Solid prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Owner to submit finish color schedule to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

- **14-10-5**

**636 North High Street**

**Lisa Palmore/Clover on High (Applicant)**

**New Victorians (Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-5, 636 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Sign

- Remove the existing "Emperor's Newest Clothes" sign, and crop the scrolled corners to a rectangular shape.
- Reface the sign with new "Clover on High" name and logo, per the submitted renderings, using the existing sign bracket and lighting fixtures.

- **14-10-6**

**769-771 Summit Street**

**Marion Risberg (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-6, 769-771 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings" <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

- **14-10-7**

**808-810 Summit Street**

**Marion Risberg (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-10-7, 808-810 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

- **14-10-8**

**1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue**

**Jason Kentner & Karen Lewis (Applicants)**

**Rhome Ruanphae (Owner)**

Approve Application #14-10-8, 1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

- Renew COA#13-5-14, 1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, exactly as previously approved for a period of one (1) year. Expired: 5-24-14.

*Approve Application 13-5-14, 1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:*

Renovate Building for New Use

- *Complete exterior renovations to convert the existing garage building for use as a design studio.*
- *Remove two (2) existing garage doors and install new, glass garage doors, per the submitted rendering.*
- *Install new bi-fold security doors over the new, glass garage doors.*
- *Remove existing windows, and re-open two (2) existing openings on the north elevation, and install new glass block windows, per the submitted rendering.*
- *Install new, exterior lighting on front and west elevations, per the submitted rendering.*
- *Install new wall-mounted mail box on front elevation, per the submitted rendering.*

- *Paint existing service door gray.*

Landscaping

- *Landscape Mt. Pleasant Avenue frontage, including tree, shrubs, pavers, and wood at door, per the submitted rendering.*

*MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (6-0-0) APPROVED.*

- **14-10-9**

**688 Kerr Street**

**Naylor Roofing and David & Christy Thorp (Applicants)**

**CMT Kerr Street, LLC. (Owner)**

Approve Application #14-10-9, 688 Kerr Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof/Main Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:

[ ] CertainTeed

[ ] GAF

[ ] Certain Teed

[ ] GAF

[ ] Owens Corning

[ ] Tamko

Style:

Carriage House (dimensional)

Slateline (dimensional)

(standard 3-tab)

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

(standard 3-tab)

Color:

[ ] Stonegate Gray

[ ] English Gray Slate

[ ] Weathered Slate

[ ] Nickel Gray

[ ] Nickel Gray

[ ] Estate Gray

[ ] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Remove and Install New Membrane Roof/Porch Roof

- Remove the existing roofing materials and install new, Flintastic membrane roof, per the submitted specifications and according to manufacturer's specifications.

- **14-10-10**



**1078-1080-1082-1084 Mt. Pleasant Street**

**Keith L Brown / B & A Realty (Applicant)**

**Perkinswood Ltd. (Owner)**

Approve Application #14-10-10, 1078-1080-1082-1084 Mt. Pleasant Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, as needed, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete sidewalks, per the submitted site plan to provide access from existing rear parking to rear entrances.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.

Install New Plantings

- Install new Pyracantha bushes at the edge of the existing parking area and at the rear elevation of the building, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new Barberry shrubs at the front elevation of the building, per the submitted site plan.

• **14-10-11**

**966 North Sixth Street**

**G. Scott Guiler (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #14-10-11, 966 North Sixth Street, as submitted with any/all clarifications noted:

Paint Aluminum Siding

- Following any/all necessary repairs to the aluminum siding and trim, prepare all aluminum siding for painting in accordance with all applicable industry standards and manufacturers' specifications. Power wash all metal surfaces with a maximum pressure of 300 lb./p. s. i. and broad fan tip nozzle.
- Apply the appropriate exterior paint for aluminum surfaces, in accordance with industry standards and manufacturers' specifications. Color to be PPG #522-5, "Earl Gray."

**VIII. OLD BUSINESS**

• **14-10-28**

**875 Summit Street**

**Wood Run Partners, LLC (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicants, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-10-28, 875 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Previous Approval

- Request removal of the previously approved brick walled planters around the proposed planting areas, as previously approved (COA # 14-7-9, approved July 15, 2014). The building location and planting areas, as approved by the Commission, will not be changed.
- The Applicant is to return to a future Italian Village Commission hearing to present a landscape plan, including all elements within and outside of the new seven-foot (7') easement, recognizing that any planting structures will be required to be located outside of the new easement.
- It is understood that the new easement is a variable width easement, around the steps/stoops, as per the submitted site plan.
- It is expected that additional low walls will be installed, outside of the new easement, near the steps/stoops.

*Note: Construction of six (6) new, attached, three-story dwellings was approved July 15, 2014 (COA # 14-7-9), with final landscape plan, including sidewalk materials and dimensions, planter walls and fence materials, to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.*

*Note: The City of Columbus Traffic Department and Recreation and Parks Department made a determination that it wants to assure and preserve the green space along the Summit Street R-O-W. The City has requested the owner grant a landscaping easement to the City that will serve to assure preservation of that green planting area and will give the*

*City the right to enter the landscaping strip and restore it in the event the owner(s) do not maintain it. The City also requests that the tree and planting areas proposed along the Summit Street R-O-W, located between the building façade and Summit Street, be constructed without the brick, walled planters surrounding them so that the plantings are ground level. They request this to assure green open areas and safety for pedestrians walking on the sidewalks. The owners have agreed to grant the easement and develop the landscaping on the condition that the Italian Village Commission approves the tree and planting areas without the brick, walled planters.*

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (2-1-0) APPROVED

**IX. NEW BUSINESS**

**X. ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (3-0-0) ADJOURNED (11:18 p.m.)