

**ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION  
MINUTES**

**Tuesday, September 16, 2014**

**6:15 p.m.**

**50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B**

**Commissioners Present:** Todd Boyer, Ben Goodman, Rex Hagerling, Jason Sudy

**Commissioners Absent:** David Cooke, Josh Lapp, Charmaine Sutton

**City Staff Present:** Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:18 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, October 14, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:15 p.m., Tuesday, October 21, 2014 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1<sup>st</sup> Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, August 19, 2014.  
MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED
- V. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Special Meeting, Tuesday, September 9, 2014.  
MOTION: Goodman/Hagerling (2-0-2 [Sudy-Boyer]) APPROVED
- VI. PUBLIC FORUM
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS  
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items into the formal record. Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.  
MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

**CONTINUED APPLICATIONS**

**1. 14-6-7**

**995 North Fourth Street**

**John Ryan Kern/995 N. Fourth St., LLC. (Applicant/Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

- Continue Application #14-6-7, 995 North Fourth Street, to allow the Applicant time to resolve Zoning issues and submit a site plan and landscaping plan, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 21, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) CONTINUED

**2. 14-8-13**

**1006 North High Street (Fireproof Building/new construction)**

**Andrew Bacher/DaNite Sign Co. (Applicant)**

**Fireproof Partners, LLC. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

- In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #14-8-13, 1006 North High Street, to allow the Applicant time to submit revised signage drawings, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 21, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) CONTINUED

**3. 14-8-17b**

**680 North High Street**

**GRAD Architects (Applicant)**

**The Wood Companies (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-17b, 680 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Storefront Renovations

- Remove the existing, wood storefront (the southernmost of the building's eight existing storefronts).
- Install a new, wood storefront, per the submitted drawings. New upper transom glass to be single pane, not divided light (no muntins).
- Replace the existing solid panel trim work/header beneath the transom with glass. If the Applicant chooses to explore the use of a different type of glass within the header area, (e.g., frosted or opaque), the glass must first be tested in place, with review and approval by Historic Preservation Office staff, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.
- Install new wood and glass entrance door.
- Paint/stain color for storefront and door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint/stain.
- Remove the existing fabric awning over the front entrance.
- No signage or framework for future signage is approved at this time.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

NEW APPLICATIONS

**4. 14-9-7**

**1026 North High Street (Fireproof Building)**

**J. Carter Bean Architect (Applicant)**

**Elford Development (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-9-7 was divided into Items 'a', 'b', and 'c' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-7a, 1026 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

**14-9-7a**

Continue Application #14-9-7a, for installation of a new storefront and awnings, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 21, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

Commissioner Comments

Ben Goodman:

- Need to have clarification regarding the massive appearance of the casework/surround area of the proposed windows. If the heavy appearance is because the windows are removable, need to figure out how to utilize a removable window but maintain the original appearance of the existing casework.
- Would be supportive of the use of hinged windows rather than NanaWalls in the window openings. May consider full-light openings in the doorway, if revised drawings show a more appropriate profile.

Jason Sudy:

- Previously approved NanaWalls have retained the existing knee walls of storefronts. Removal of the knee wall would negatively impact the character of the storefront.
- Would be in support of replacing the existing wood storefronts with new Mahogany, wood storefronts, with narrower Mullions and hinged windows, but not of full-height windows or fully opening or removable windows.

Rex Hagerling:

- This is a very significant storefront with original doors and windows. The Commission is charged with preserving original historic fabric of buildings, so has concerns about removing all of the original storefronts. Thinks the

existing, original, wood windows could be repaired, but could support the replacement of the windows with new, Mahogany windows, if appropriate detail drawings are submitted.

- Does not think NanaWalls are appropriate for this specific building.
- In favor of replacing the existing original and non-original doors with new, wood, full-light entrance doors.
- Need to have detail, measured drawings for all windows/doors/surrounds.

Todd Boyer:

- Could be supportive of duplicating the existing windows, like-for-like, with wood of the appropriate profile.
- Not in favor of full-height glazing to the floor for the northern door opening. It seems too contemporary.
- Not in support of the NanaWall system.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) CONTINUED

#### **14-9-7b**

Approve Application #14-9-7b, 1026 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage

- Install new sign faces on the previously approved projecting sign frame.
- COA # 14-9-7b modifies COA # 14-2-10a as follows: 1) One (1) sign, rather than two (2) signs will be installed; 2) The previously approved upper bracket and the address box are removed; 3) The one (1) projecting sign will be located directly beneath the historic “Fireproof Warehouse and Storage Co.” sign.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

#### **14-9-7c**

Continue Application #14-9-7c, for installation of any awning, window, and/or door graphics, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 21, 2014 Italian Village Commission hearing agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) CONTINUED

### **5. 14-9-8**

#### **1108 North High Street**

**Signcom, Inc. (Applicant)**

**Volos Properties, Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-8, 1108 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Signage/Projecting Sign

- Install one (1) new, externally illuminated, sandblasted, high density urethane (HDU), projecting sign on a bracket which extends no more than 48” from the façade of the building.
- Final dimensions of the sign to be compatible with the length of the bracket, and not to exceed twelve square feet (12 sq. ft.).
- Sign to include business name, logo and proprietor’s name (not to include phone number).
- Revised drawing for the projecting sign to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- External lighting to include one (1) fixture per side, or two (2) per side if significantly reduced in size from the proposed fixture.
- Cut sheet/specifications for the light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Signage/Door Graphic

- Install new, vinyl, “Good Hands” logo window graphic, contact information and store hours in the front entrance door.
- Revised drawing for the door graphic to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

**6. 14-9-9**

**15 East Second Avenue**

**Steve Schwope/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)**

**The Wood Companies (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-9, 15 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Storefront/Second Avenue

- Renovate the existing concrete block building for use as a bakery/café.
- Remove the two (2), existing, single-light, fixed windows on the north elevation.
- Install new, wood storefront windows and trim, flanking the existing central doorway, per the submitted elevation drawings.
- Section drawing for the storefront system to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Signage

- Install new, externally illuminated wall sign consisting of individual letters reading, “Laughlin’s Bakery,” per the submitted drawing. Cut sheet for light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Install new storefront window and door line-graphics, per the submitted drawing.
- The Commission suggests scaling down the wall signage and window graphics to more appropriate fit the small scale of the building.
- Final drawing for signage to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Install New Awning

- Install a new fabric awning on the existing frame, per the submitted rendering. Building address to be printed on the front flap of the awning.

Remove Overhead Garage Door/Pearl Street

- Remove the existing, wood overhead garage door on the east elevation.
- Infill the existing vehicular door opening, and finish, flush, with stucco to match existing.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

7. **14-9-10**

**944 North Fourth Street**

**Steve Schwoppe/New Avenue Architects (Applicant)**

**Quinn Fallon (Owner)**

*Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-10, 944 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Rooftop Patio

- New patio to be supported by new steel members clear-spanning the existing bearing walls.
- Access to the patio will be via a fire-rated stair enclosure penetrating the existing roof structure, and opening onto a new penthouse structure on the roof, per the submitted drawing.
- Penthouse enclosure to consist of steel stud framing clad with vertical standing-seam metal siding and trim and finished "Charcoal Gray." Roofing material to match.
- New 42" high, black, wrought iron guardrails to fully enclose the roof top.
- The street facing sides of the benches/guard rail to be screened with vertical standing-seam metal siding and finished "Charcoal Gray."
- Floor to be composite decking on painted steel framing.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Paint Entrance Doors

- Prepare the two (2) existing entrance doors on North Fourth Street and East Second Street for painting. Finish coat to match existing green trim.

Note: this rooftop deck is being approved at this specific location for the following reasons:

1) The business is a one-story, flat-roofed, commercial building located on a corner of a busy commercial corridor; 2) The deck is limited to the street side areas of the roof; 3) The building/deck is lower than adjacent buildings; 4) An interior stair tower is being installed and is largely screened from the street by a high parapet.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

8. **14-9-13 (should be 14-5-20) clt 10-11-2014**

**920 North High Street**

**Mike Fitzpatrick & Jeff Meacham (Applicants)**

**Emerald Light Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

- In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #14-9-13, 920 North High Street, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the October 21, 2014 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Boyer/Sudy (4-0-0) CONTINUED

CONCEPTUAL REVIEW

9. **14-9-11**

**1101 Say Avenue**

**Blostein/Overly Architects (Applicant)**

**Matthew Brackman & Joe Benner (Owner)**

Exterior Alterations

- Exterior alterations, including residing; install new windows and doors; install new roof; modify roof and add dormers; install new landscaping.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- The overall approach of extending with a double gable seems a respectful way to change the volume of the house.

- The proposed design of the alley facing dormers seem less typical for the size of the house and the neighborhood.
- Any replacement windows would need to be would to comply with the Italian Village guidelines.

Todd Boyer:

- Is supportive of the proposal in general.
- The dormers seem a bit large at this point, but further study may prove the scale to be appropriate. Will just need to see more details.
- It is a simple house, so a simple shed dormer could also work.

Rex Hagerling:

- Removal of the existing aluminum siding is good. The existing siding beneath the aluminum siding should be evaluated by Historic Preservation Office staff before deciding whether any wood siding should be replaced and with what material.
- Excited to see improvements proposed for this house. Understands the desire to reframe the roof in order to maximize space in this small house.
- The details of the double gable and the dormers will need further discussion, but appear appropriate conceptually.

Ben Goodman:

- Will need to see all materials (siding, trim, roofing, windows, etc.) for all elevations.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**10. 14-9-12**

**282 East Third Avenue**

**Urban Order Architecture (Applicant)**

**Angie & Eric Tabor (Owner)**

New Construction

- Construct a new, single-family, brick, two-story dwelling, on three parcels, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawing.
- Construct new pool and garden shed.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- The block has been largely vacant for a long time. Expected there would eventually be several, more narrow houses built here, but we are starting with a clean slate and creating the setbacks, etc. as we go.
- There will need to be careful consideration and reasoning for any approval of an attached garage, which, in general, is a suburban feature. These lots face onto two alleys and next to a long time industrial use impacts the way the site is used.
- Very happy to see more infill in this area.

Todd Boyer:

- A proposed attached garage is an unusual condition but this is an unusual site. This may be one specific location where it could work.
- Would like to see the garage appearing like more of a separate piece.
- Likes the variety of materials.

Rex Hagerling:

- This is an unusual location. Based on the lot size and location, thinks an argument could be made for an attached garage at this specific location.
- Conceptually, is supportive of the overall proposal.

Ben Goodman:

- In general, appears to be a nice proposal.
- The way the porch is scaled brings the house down and fits into the scale of the community.
- Likes the play of different materials in the recessed areas.
- Agrees that it would be good to show some separation of the garage, with recesses, materials, etc.

- Likes how different sections of the building are broken apart. Makes it seem more homey.
- No problem with the recessed balcony.

NO ACTION TAKEN

## 11. 14-9-14

### 307 East Fifth Avenue

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**New Victorians (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #14-9-14, Commissioner Sudy noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the hearing room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #14-9-14 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b', for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

#### 14-9-14a

Approve Application #14-9-14a, 307 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

#### New Construction/Commercial & Residential Building

- Construct a new 2 ½ story, frame building at the Fifth Avenue frontage with commercial first floor and two residential units on the second floor.
- The following final details to be reviewed and approved by Commissioners Hagerling and/or Boyer: 1) The wrapping of the brick from the façade to the side elevations; 2) location of light fixtures; 3) all siding materials; 4) scupper/downspout location; 5) rear door canopy and stoop; 6) water table details; 7)
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with Commissioners Hagerling and/or Boyer, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all siding materials, roofing materials, windows, doors, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Any/all signage to return to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Boyer/Goodman (3-0-1 [Sudy]) APPROVED

#### 14-9-14b

Approve Application #14-9-14a, 307 East Fifth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

#### New Construction/Carriage House

- Construct a new 2 ½ story carriage house at the Greenwood Avenue frontage with one residential unit on the second floor, per he submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Existing paved surface parking to be reconfigured and re-stripped, per the submitted site plan.
- Revised drawing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Cut sheets/specifications for all siding materials, roofing materials, windows, doors, and light fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (3-0-0 [Sudy]) APPROVED

**12. 14-8-19b**

**94 East Third Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Urban Restorations (Owner)**

*Prior to review of Application #14-8-19b, Commissioner Sudy returned to the table and rejoined the proceedings. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-8-19b, 94 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Construct New Garage

- Construct a new, five car garage with second story living space in the rear yard of the existing building, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Cladding to be HardiePlank with 4-inch exposure; flat roof to have membrane covering; foundation to be concrete block.
- The masonry section at the southwest corner of the garage (bays 1 and 2) to be brick in a color contrasting the red brick of the house. Final brick sample to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad, wood four-light casements.
- Pedestrian doors to be full-light single and French doors.
- Overhead garage doors to be aluminum.
- The roof cap/coping to be glazed tile.
- The exterior cladding for the west elevation of the screening wall located on the terrace to be a contrasting material to the first floor brick.
- Cut sheets for cladding materials, windows, pedestrian doors, overhead doors, and exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Goodman/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

**13. 14-9-15**

**150 Detroit Avenue**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Urban Restorations (Owner)**

New Construction

- Third conceptual review of proposed new construction to include a two-story, two-unit residential building and a warehouse style carriage house with two residential units above, per the submitted site plan.
- Review of preliminary list of variances.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Rex Hagerling:

- This is a wonderful block of mostly single-family dwellings. The little commercial building on the corner fits in very well. Based on the scale and mass and proportion of the overall street, thinks a single family house should be on this lot.
- A single-family house with a garage or carriage house with second floor living space would work well, but cannot see the entire lot being filled, front to back.
- Not in favor of the project, as proposed.

Jason Sudy:

- It's hard to make this proposal fit on this street. The existing multi-family dwellings are very traditional. The whole block has a traditional feel.
- The safe approach in this location would be a more traditional design. Not completely opposed to modern, but does not feel that the photo shown at the first conceptual review reflects the proposed design. That photo had a



lighter, more open feel. There is a lot of mass with very little openings in the proposed. Needs to be a bright, light feeling.

- Less concerned about the larger, unusual footprint on this unusual, angled lot with double alleys. More concerned about the front mass along Detroit Avenue.

Ben Goodman:

- The forms on the front seem a bit clunky at this point, and don't reflect the lightness of the photo example shown in July.
- The form and mass of the adjacent buildings, the proposed has a lot of shoulder and girth. Would there be less of an impact if the center piece of the façade is more dominant in height, with the brick parts falling off a bit.
- The balconies seem somewhat heavy and unrelated at this point.
- The shape of the windows needs to really fit a modern structure.
- There still needs to be more sensitivity to the scale, materials, and proportion of the area.

Todd Boyer:

- In general agreement with Commissioner Goodman'
- Having an open façade on the street is something that was stated as important to the neighbors. Would like to see more of a lightness and openness, which ties back to the window proportion.
- There needs to be a residential quality at this site and less toward a commercial building.
- The balconies seem too attached at this point.
- Does not have issues with the scale of the back portion.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**14. 14-9-16**

**955 North Sixth Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Mulberry Ltd. (Owner)**

New Construction

- First conceptual review for construction of two new single family residences on adjacent lots.
- New curb cut on Sixth Street to provide shared access to rear garages.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- In general, is not in support of new curb cuts, but, the proposed curb cut seems appropriate for this specific location because the lots have not alley access.
- Sharing the driveway is a big step in the right direction.
- Encourages the Applicant to talk to the neighboring property owner at 246 E. Second Avenue regarding their current rear yard access.

Rex Hagerling:

- Has generally been in support of curb cuts for driveways when the property is land locked. Sharing the drive for two houses is a good solution.

NO ACTION TAKEN

**15. 14-9-17**

**1089 Summit Street**

**Juliet Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**1081-1089 Summit St., LLC. (Owner)**

New Construction

- First conceptual review for lot split and construction of two new single family residences, per the submitted site plan.
- Solar panels on flat roof.
- Review of preliminary list of variances.

*Following presentation by the Applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.*

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- It is an unusual site with odd access issues. Will need to go look at this and surrounding lots to have a better understanding.
- Take a close look at the grade change issues with this and surrounding lots.

Rex Hagerling:

- There are potentially a lot of issues that will need to be addressed, such as access, distances from property lines, easements

NO ACTION TAKEN

**STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS**

**16. 14-9-18**

**Multiple Locations**

**Short North Alliance (Applicant)**

**City of Columbus (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-18, Multiple Locations, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install Holiday Banners

- Install banners on the seventeen (17) Short North Arches within the Italian Village Historic District and the Victorian Village Historic District. Four (4) will be installed on each arch, two (2) on each side of the street (68 total banners.)
- Each double-faced, vinyl banner to measure 54" H x 18" W, and to be hung on custom aluminum poles, painted black, and screwed into existing holes on each arch. Poles to be removed when not in use.
- Bottom of banners to be secured by a fiberglass, mast arm brackets and stainless steel bands, per the submitted drawing.
- Banners to be installed during the winter holiday season. Any new banner designs to return to Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

MOTION: Boyer/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

**17. 14-9-19**

**737-741 Kerr Street**

**Will Lehnert/Outdoor Space Design (Applicant)**

**Paula Berry (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-19, 737-741 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Replace Sidewalks

- Remove the existing concrete sidewalks on the south and east elevations. Remove the existing brick within the tree lawn on the east elevation.
- Install new sand mold clay brick in same location as existing sidewalks, per the submitted site plan.
- Existing stone curb is to remain, except as needed for installation of ADA ramps.
- All work to be completed in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Codes and industry standards.

Install New Plantings and Street Trees

- Install new planting beds along the east and south elevations of the house, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new street trees on the east elevation, per the submitted site plan. The Commission suggests the use of a good quality street tree with more height than the proposed Tree Lilac, as approved by the City Forester, noting that no overhead wires are present on this street. Final choice of tree species to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for placement in the file.

Fence and Fireplace

- Install new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood privacy fence/gate and 48" trellis on north and west elevations, per the submitted site plan and detail drawings.
- Install new stone patio and plantings in rear yard, with a 7'6" stone fireplace, per the submitted site plan and detail drawing.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED

**18. 14-9-20**

**153 East Third Avenue**

**Julie Bullock Architects (Applicant)**

**Richard Long/RA Long Properties, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-20, 153 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Parking Pad

- Install a new parking pad in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Permeable pavers to be installed in accordance with all City Building Code requirements and industry standards, to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties.
- Permeable paver to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Install a new, six-foot-high (6' H), wood, privacy fence in the rear yard, per the submitted site plan.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence-finished side out facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1" x 6" boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6' H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4" x 4" wood posts.
- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Location and dimension of all gates to be submitted

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (4-0-0) APPROVED

**19. 14-9-21**

**658-660 North High Street**

**John Ingwersen, Architect (Applicant)**

**Giannopoulos Properties, Ltd. (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*

Approve Application #14-9-21, 658-660 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Retain Existing Patio for Outdoor Seating

- Retain the existing patio for outdoor seating, located at the rear of the building, including the existing pavers, plantings, fencing, and furniture.

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED

**20. 14-9-22**

**772 North High Street**

**Laura Harter/Piece of Cake (Applicant)**

**Wood Companies (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*  
Approve Application #14-9-22, 772 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Reface Existing Ground Sign

- Retain and reface the existing, 74" x 34", metal ground sign, to include signage for all suites that face Warren Street on the ground floor level, including Suite 102 (Mizzen + Main), Suite 104 (Piece of Cake), and Suite 106 (L'Antibes).

Note: Approval of the refacing is being granted at this specific location because the ground sign is an existing condition. A ground sign may not be appropriate for other locations.

Install New Canopies/Suite 104 ( Piece of Cake)

- Retain the two (2) existing canopy frames, and install new, canvas awnings with new logo, per the submitted rendering. Awning color to be blue-green with black logo.

Install New Window Graphics/Suite 104 ( Piece of Cake)

- Install one (1) 60" W x 8" H, blue-green vinyl strip in each of the two storefront windows, per the submitted rendering.
- Install one (1) new, 20" W x 12.5" H, vinyl logo with store hours and one (1) 25" W x 8" H, blue-green vinyl strip in each of the two storefront doors, per the submitted rendering.

Neon Signage

- Remove the existing, interior, "BAKERY," and "OPEN," neon signs.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

**21. 14-9-23**

**959 Mt. Pleasant Avenue**

**Priestas Brothers Builders (Applicant)**

**Amelia Dunlap (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*  
Approve Application #14-9-23, 959 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted..

Construct New Garage

- Build new 22' H x 22' W, frame garage, per the submitted site plan and elevation drawings.
- Roof pitch to be 6/12.
- Overhang to be eight inches (8") on all elevations.
- Cladding to be smooth, Hardi Plank siding with 6" reveal. Colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Overhead door to be eighteen-foot-wide-by-7-foot-high (18'W x 7'H), steel, raised panel door, per the submitted cut sheet.
- One (1) service door to be located on the elevation facing the house. Cut sheet for service door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Cut sheet and location for any/all lighting fixtures to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.

Note: A single overhead garage door is being approved at this specific location due to the narrow width (16') of the alley, which limits the turning radius.

MOTION: Goodman/Sudy (4-0-0) APPROVED

**22. 14-9-24**

**1024-1026 North High Street**

**Mike Fitzpatrick (Applicant)**

**Fireproof Partners, LLC (Owner)**

*Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.*  
Approve Application #14-9-24, 1024-1026 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install New Sidewalks

- Install new, concrete sidewalks at the new construction along North High Street and East Second Avenue, per the submitted site plan and photographs.

*NOTE: 1) Approval of this application is being granted based on the current Short North Design Guidelines; 2) In anticipation of the approval of the High Street Corridor Plan, this application is being approved on the condition that the Applicant will return to an Italian Village Commission hearing within sixty (60) days following final approval of the High Street Corridor Plan, for any necessary additional review based on that plan; 3) The Commission does not oppose the release of a Drawer E permit based on the submitted Fireproof Building Streetscape Plan, dated 02-04-2014, as reviewed at the September 16, 2014 IVC hearing.*

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) APPROVED

## **STAFF APPROVALS**

### • **14-9-1**

#### **1085 Summit Street**

##### **Marc Moldovan (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application 14-9-1, 1085 Summit Street, for renewal of expired COA # 13-3-1 (Expired: February 22, 2014), and COA # 13-5-26 (Expired: May 21, 2014) exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

##### New Construction (COA #13-3-1)

- Construct new two-and-one-half-story, single-family dwelling on vacant parcel, per submitted drawings dated 1-4-2013.
- Dwelling to be wood frame construction with full basement.
- Dwelling and garage exterior cladding to be smooth, fiber cement siding.
- Windows to be Anderson, double-hung, aluminum-clad. Cut sheet for windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Three-foot high (3'H), ornamental fence to be installed in front yard, per the submitted site plan. Detail drawing/cut sheet of ornamental fencing to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- Six-foot high (6'H), board-on-board, wood privacy fence to be installed in rear yard, per the submitted site plan. Fence style to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.
- New one-and-one-half-story, hip-roof garage with south alley access to provide two (2) parking spaces, per the submitted drawings and site plan.
- Any/all paint colors to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to application.

MOTION: Cooke/Lewis (6-0-0) APPROVED

##### Revision to Previously Approved Plans (COA #13-5-26)

- Due to egress requirements, modify the previously approved window size (COA # 11-8-7, issued 8-16-2011) as follows:
- Increase second floor window size 2" in width and 2" in height to satisfy required egress specifications and to maintain proportions.
- Increase first floor window size 2" in width and 2" in height to maintain consistent appearance with second floor windows.
- Third floor windows to be casements with a mullion to maintain consistent appearance with first and second floor windows.

MOTION: Clark/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED

### • **14-9-2**

#### **870-872 North Pearl Street**

##### **Cindy Dunigan (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #14-9-2, 870-872 North Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys. All existing chimneys to remain, as is.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

<u>Manufacturer:</u>	<u>Style:</u>	<u>Color:</u>
<input type="checkbox"/> CertainTeed	Carriage House (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> Stonegate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Slateline (dimensional)	<input type="checkbox"/> English Gray Slate <input type="checkbox"/> Weathered Slate
<input type="checkbox"/> Certain Teed	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> GAF	Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Nickel Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Owens Corning	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Estate Gray
<input type="checkbox"/> Tamko	(standard 3-tab)	<input type="checkbox"/> Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted "gray" or "Tinner's Red."
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Eave Soffit & Fascia Repair:

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Repair/Replace Downspouts

- Examine all existing, metal, ogee (k-style) gutters on the house and make any repairs and/or replace the existing gutter system on all elevations with new metal, ogee (k-style) gutters.
- Install new, corrugated metal downspouts in the appropriate locations to assure proper drainage.
- Examine the existing storm water drainage system for soundness and proper function. Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing storm sewer tile system to assure proper drainage away from the foundations of this and neighboring properties. If deemed necessary, install a French drain system or similar, appropriate drainage system in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.

• **14-9-3**

**864 Summit Street**

**Ivan Amy (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #14-9-3, 864 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Repair of Enclosed, Two-Story Porch

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements and panels, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, wood, fifteen-light door, and install a new, wood, fifteen-light door, like-for-like. Cut sheet for the new door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the porch for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to match existing.

Remove Existing Sidewalks and Install New Sidewalks

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated, concrete public and service sidewalks, and concrete steps, and dispose of all debris in accordance with Columbus City Code.
- Install new concrete in the exact same location and of the exact same dimensions.
- All work to be in accordance with industry standards and all applicable City Building Codes.
- Maintain any/all existing sandstone curbs, and repair, as necessary, in accordance with all applicable industry standards, and/or replace with like sandstone curbing.

- **14-9-4 [Goodman]**

**834 Summit Street**

**Michael Linsker (Applicant/Owner)**

Approve Application #14-9-4, 834 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Front Porch Rehabilitation

- Remove any/all damaged and deteriorated wooden porch flooring.
- Repair and/or replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing floor joists with new wooden floor joists of the appropriate dimension and in accordance with all applicable City Building Codes and industry standards.
- It is recommended that all new, tongue and groove, porch flooring be primed on all sides with porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications prior to installation in order to extend its useful life.
- Install new, tongue and groove wooden, porch flooring.
- Following installation of the new, wooden flooring, apply no less than one (1), complete, finish coat of the same exterior porch floor enamel thinned with the appropriate material according to manufacturers' specifications; paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Commission.
- Restore the front porch privacy panels, columns, fascia, and trim, as needed, with like material of exact same dimension and profile as the existing, original; like-for-like.

Replace Front Porch Ceiling

- Remove and dispose of existing porch ceiling, pull all nails from, and inspect condition of, existing rafters to insure structural integrity.
- Install a new porch ceiling nailed with galvanized finish nails.
- New material to be [ ] 1" x 3", tongue and groove, yellow pine, bead board or [ ] 4' x 8' Georgia-Pacific "Classic" style Ply-Bead panels; prime exposed surface complete.
- Paint/stain color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval in consultation with the Italian Village Commission.

Repair/Replace Soffit & Fascia/Main Roof

- Remove and properly dispose of all existing, deteriorated soffit, as needed, and replace with new material indicated below (conventional exterior plywood is not acceptable). Galvanized nails of appropriate size and type required.

[ ] Like-for-like      [ ] Tongue and Groove 1" x 3" pine      [ ] Georgia-Pacific Ply-Bead, Traditional

- Repair and or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood eave soffit and fascia on all elevations as necessary with new wood of exact same profile and dimension; like-for-like.

Exterior Painting

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement

wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.

- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be Valspar "High Speed Steel" and "Vintage Gray."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone sills, lintels, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

#### Rear Exterior Stairs & Landings

- Repair/replacement of the existing, wooden, exterior stairs and landings is not approved at this time. All final details for repair/replacement of wood floors, handrails, and balusters to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to commencement of work.

#### • 14-9-5

##### **659 Kerr Street**

##### **Daniel Turi & Tamara Maynard (Applicants/Owners)**

Approve Application #14-9-5, 659 Kerr Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

#### Front Porch

- Remove all existing, non-original lattice-work from the front porch (gable, railings, skirt, fascia).
- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.

#### Front Entrance Door

- Remove the existing, non-original door, and install a new three-quarter-light, wood door, per the submitted product cut sheet/specifications.

#### Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the house roof with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

#### Exterior Painting – House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer's specifications. Paint colors to be as follows: Body – SW "Peppercorn;" Trim – SW "Pure White;" Accent/Door – SW "Nankeen."
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick walls; stone sills, lintels, foundation, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

#### Install New Fence Gate

- Replace the existing fence gate with new wood materials to match the existing wood fence, per the submitted photos and site plan.



- **14-9-6**

**1204-1206 North High Street**

**Christopher Bruzzese/Berardi Partners (Applicants)**

**Community Housing Network (Owner)**

Approve Application 14-9-6, 1204-1206 North High Street, for renewal of expired COA # 13-9-7 (Expired: September 5, 2014), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Rear Parking Area

- Remove all existing concrete walkways, ramp, and retaining wall on rear/east side of building, per submitted drawing, and install new concrete walkway, ramp, and retaining wall.
- Permanently remove concrete steps at southeast corner of retaining wall.
- Remove all existing asphalt parking area, install new asphalt; restripe and install new concrete bollards, per submitted drawing.
- Install new handrail along ramp and top of retaining wall.

Windows

- Remove existing wood windows and frames, and install new, all wood (not exterior clad) windows, on all elevations.
- Remove one (1) below grade window on east elevation and install new exhaust fan.
- Pending the investigation of materials beneath the existing window trim wrap, final details for window trim restoration or replacement is to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission before installation of the new windows.

Doors

- East/rear elevation, second and third floors – remove existing doors at fire escape and install new doors, per the submitted door schedule.

Lighting

- Remove existing exterior lighting and install new exterior lighting, per the submitted cut sheets.
- Cut sheet for the exterior light next to the existing door on the north elevation to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation.

Signage Band/Decorative /Spandrel Panels

- Applicant is to notify Historic Preservation Office staff before any exploratory work begins on the signage board, spandrel panels, arched window heads or other window trim.
- Carefully remove exploratory sections of the existing metal wrap on the signage band between the first and second floor windows of the façade (west) and north elevations, the decorative spandrel panels between the second and third floor windows, and the arched window heads and other window trim on the façade to determine whether any original and/or significant materials are extant beneath, and submit those findings, including photographs, to Historic Preservation Office staff.
- Based on the exploratory findings, Applicant is to submit specifications for restoration of any original and/or significant materials, and design drawings for a new sign band and/or spandrel panels.

Terraces/South Elevation

- At second and third floor terraces, remove existing aluminum siding and install new HardiPlank siding.
- At second and third floor terraces, remove existing and install new brick mold around windows and doors.
- Remove existing, second floor, wood terrace deck, and replace the existing roofing material of the flat roof beneath the terrace with new E. P. D. M. rubber in accordance with all applicable industry standards, manufacturer's specifications, and Columbus Building Codes regarding installation of flat roof coverings.
- Install new decking on second and third floor terraces.
- Final material for the terrace decks to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, in consultation with the Italian Village Commission, prior to installation. New material should be either wood or some type of industrial metal material.

Spot Tuck Point

- Check all mortar joints on all elevations for soundness. All sound mortar to remain in place.

- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of 3/4".
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- "Repointing Mortar in Historic Brick Buildings"(<http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs.htm>).

**Note:** The installation of HardiePlank siding on the terrace walls is approved in this particular application because the existing aluminum siding needs to be removed to complete structural repairs behind it, and the terraces are not visible from the street or alley.

**Note:** The Applicant withdrew the specification for sealing the brick with a transparent, breathable silane/siloxane water repellent. The application of any sealant is not approved at this time.

MOTION: Cooke /Baker (5-0-0) APPROVED

**IX. OLD BUSINESS**

**X. NEW BUSINESS**

**XI. ADJOURNMENT**

MOTION: Sudy/Goodman (4-0-0) ADJOURNED (9:47 p.m.)