

ITALIAN VILLAGE SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES

Tuesday, May 13, 2014

1:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room A

Applicants or their representatives must attend this hearing. If applicants are absent it is likely that the application will be continued until the Commission's next hearing. If you have any questions please call Connie Torbeck (645-0664) in the City's Historic Preservation Office. A Sign Language Interpreter, to "Sign" this meeting, will be made available for anyone with a need for this service, provided the Historic Preservation Office is made aware of this need at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the scheduled hearing time. To schedule an interpreter, please call 645-8620 or TDD 645-3293.

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke (left at 1:41 p.m.), Ben Goodman (arrived 1:24 p.m.), Rex Hagerling, Joshua Lapp, Jason Sudy, Charmaine Sutton

Commissioners Absent: David Cooke (absent at the time of the vote)

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

Applicants Present: George Berardi, Jeff Baur, Lori Steiner, Doug Borrer

- I. CALL TO ORDER (1:09 p.m.)
- II. SWEARING IN OF CITY STAFF
- III. IDENTIFICATION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- IV. SPECIAL MEETING IN ACCORDANCE WITH CITY CODE AND COMMISSION BYLAWS

City Code Chapter 3119.33 Italian Village Commission Organization

As soon as convenient, after the members are appointed by the mayor, the commission shall meet and organize by the election of a chairman and secretary. The commission shall adopt bylaws governing its procedure and provide for regular and special meetings. The commission shall take official action only by a vote of a majority of the members voting on the question on the table, during a public meeting at which there is a quorum. A quorum exists when a majority of the members appointed to and serving on the commission are physically present at the meeting. All commission meetings shall be open to the public. A record of proceedings shall be maintained and available for inspection. Notices of all commission meetings shall be published in the City Bulletin. (Ord. 2229-04 § 6 (part).)

Italian Village Commission Bylaws: ARTICLE VII (1): Procedures

The Chairman shall cause an agenda to be developed and available to all members five days in advance of each meeting. The agenda shall include each application for a Certificate of Appropriateness listing the applicant's name, address of the property in question and the nature of the change desired. Other agenda items dealing with demolitions, zoning changes, or other issues which come under the purview of the Commission shall also be listed. Additional items may be added to the agenda at the Chairman's discretion at any time. Applications for Certificates of Appropriateness shall be considered first in order of application at all regular Commission meetings. Other agenda items may be considered in any order, at the Chairman's determination, at Special and Emergency Meetings and at regular meetings after all Applications for Certificates have been considered.

- V. APPROVAL OF SPECIAL MEETING MINUTES: April 8, 2014
MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (5-0-1 [Cooke]) APPROVED
- VI. APPLICATION REVIEW – Demolition and Residential Use Development Project
 1. **13-12-10**
875 Summit Street
Wood Run Partners, LLC/Truberry Custom Homes (Applicant/Owner)
This application was conceptually reviewed at the December 17, 2013, January 21, February 18, and March 18, 2014 IVC hearings. A Special Meeting was held April 8th, at which time, the application was continued to the

April 15th IVC hearing and placed under “Old Business.” On April 15th, a second Special Meeting was scheduled for May 13th.

Demolition

- Demolish the existing ca. 1938 gas station building.

New Construction

- Construct seven (7) new, three-story dwellings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- The first floor of each dwelling unit is designed as parking, providing two (2) parking spaces for each unit.
- Primary access to be from First Avenue at the north side of the site with a 20’ drive lane extending to the south, connecting to the existing alley, and exiting onto Summit Street.

Following the presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy called all those wishing to speak in order of speaker slip received.

<u>Name, Address, Affiliation:</u>	<u>Issues/ Comments:</u>
Andrew Otey 105 E. First Ave. Columbus OH Neighboring property owner	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mr Otey submitted a list of his concerns regarding the proposed project. On file at Historic Preservation Office. • Concerns about a mature tree on the property line. • Has questions about any easement for the alley. • Concerns about the garbage area. • Would like to see a nice, pedestrian friendly walkway.

Following further presentation by the Applicants, Acting Chairperson Sudy opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Now, since the footprint is farther from First Avenue, will need to focus more on that edge with landscaping and fencing.
- Will also need details on the landscaping and fencing at the alley.
- The sidewalks will need to be replaced, and will need information on street trees.
- Not sure about the sun shades.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks that 2.5 story townhomes would have been considered at this site historically.
- Does not think it is necessary to always replicate historic architecture, as it may be creating a faux history.

David Cooke:

- Still thinks the proposed design is too much for the lot.
- The context of the neighborhood needs to be taken into consideration.
- The black and whiteness of the project stresses the massiveness.
- Thinks it comes to far north on First Avenue.
- Would prefer to see three single family houses on the lot.
- Individual modules compatible with neighboring rooflines and scale needs to be considered.

Rex Hagerling:

- Would love to see individual houses on the site, but understands that he has not taken that position from the beginning.
- Appreciates the lowered height, which is partially in the ground.

- Thinks that, whether traditional or contemporary, the building needs to have the feeling of other existing, long townhouse buildings of the area.
- The lower windows should be less basement-like. Possibly enlarged and lowered. It may help to expand the steps into a base band and water table around the building.
- The proposed alternating materials/colors may be too contrasting.
- Concerned about the view along First Avenue from the west to east.
- Also interested in the tree mentioned by the neighbor.

Ben Goodman:

- No issue with introducing a modern vernacular at this site. Not opposed to new window types or shades, but should not be arbitrary.
- Balconies can be nice, but can also lead to clutter.
- Has been an advocate for the rhythm and the color that has been introduced, but it may be appropriate to give each unit its own character.
- The light color forms establish a rhythm of homes along the streetscape, but they seem to lose something when the color does not extend to the ground.
- Has come to terms with three stories, but would like to see it pushed down a bit farther.
- Appreciates that a sense of entrance has been provided on First Avenue, but not sure of the right solution.
- A fence line may not be the right solution to connect with the neighboring historic house.
- Thinks the rhythm would feel more natural with fewer than six units, but the bigger issue is how it meets First Avenue.
- It needs to feel like it nestles in well. The current proposal is getting close to a place he could approve, but not there yet.
- If a bit of space could be removed from each unit, more buffer space could exist on the south end.
- The notion of an entrance on First Avenue could be solved by thinking of it as a back door or side entrance as a way to express the pedestrian relationship to First Avenue.

Todd Boyer:

- Thinks turning the end unit F toward First Avenue is successful. A bit nervous how it ends in the view up First Avenue where the back side and garages are seen.
- Likes how the scale has been broken down on First Avenue.
- Has concerns about the balconies and their relationship to the entrances.
- The live/work space gets buried, resulting in a rather squatty, basement type window.
- Struggles with the pedestrian response. The balconies and/or stoops somehow create an awkward relationship.

Following the Commissioners' comments and additional presentation by the Applicants, Application #13-12-10 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. The following motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

13-12-10a

Demolition

Approval for the demolition of the circa 1938 gas station at 875 Summit Street is hereby granted. Based on seven (7) cumulative conceptual reviews and the site plan and drawings submitted for the May 13, 2014 special meeting, it is the assessment of the Commission that the Applicant has met the requirements of CC3116.14 "Standards for Demolition".

Additional Reasons for Approval:

- 1) Based on a review of Preservation Brief # 46, "The Preservation and Reuse of Historic Gas Stations," and comparison with other existing gas stations in the Italian Village Historic District, this particular station does not possess distinctive architectural features or embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction.
- 2) Due to modifications, the building does not retain integrity or convey its historic character.

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (5-1-0 [Sutton]) DEMOLITION APPROVED

New Construction

- Construct seven (7) new, three-story dwellings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- The first floor of each dwelling unit is designed as parking, providing two (2) parking spaces for each unit.
- Primary access to be from First Avenue at the north side of the site with a 20' drive lane extending to the south, connecting to the existing alley, and exiting onto Summit Street.

13-12-10b

New Construction

Upon review of the site plan and renderings dated 05/06/2014, Conditional Approval of new construction is granted for Application # 13-12-10, 875 Summit Street, for the overall concept, height, massing, and number of units.

- A buffer space of two-to-four feet (2'-4') is to be added on the south end between the alley and the building.
- The building is not to be shifted northward from the current site plan.

MOTION: Lapp/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

VII. OLD BUSINESS

VIII. NEW BUSINESS

IX. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Lapp/Goodman (6-0-0) ADJOURNED (1:56 p.m.)